

University of Technology, Sydney
Faculty of Engineering and Information Technology

**A Framework for Understanding the Role of Business-IT Alignment in
Organisational Agility**

By Charles Crick

Version 2.0

June 2017

Submission for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Information Science

CERTIFICATE OF ORIGINAL AUTHORSHIP

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as part of the collaborative doctoral degree and/or fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Student:

Date: 15 June 2017

Abstract

The modern organisation finds itself in a complex dynamic environment. New forces in the marketplace such as globalisation and the digital economy have increased the need for rapid adaptation just to stay in business. These forces are juxtaposed with regulatory environments of increasing complexity that act to constrain the notion of the free market economy. How organisations respond to these conditions has occupied researchers across multiple disciplines. Then there is the role of technology. Information systems scholars have for a long time sought to understand the concept of business and technology “alignment”, and even if such an idea still has relevance in the fast-moving digital world. What is clear is that virtually all large organisations, that use technology as a core business enabler, face a compelling set of circumstances as they seek to constantly adapt their business models and associated technology underpinnings to new commercial imperatives. How this organisational agility is created and maintained, is the subject of this thesis.

Whereas a wealth of multi-disciplinary research perspectives has created a significant body of extant work, there is a lack of a coherent, granular model of the organisational mechanisms that give rise to (or constrain) agility and particularly one that explicates the role of technology. This presents an opportunity for the development of a novel theoretical artefact that would make a contribution not only in theoretical terms, but also be of practical benefit to business and IT managers.

A theoretical model is developed that provides a conceptual bridge between the exogenous organisational environment that generates a need for change, and the internal organisational “machinery” – the people, the processes and the technology - that need to be reconfigured and redirected to achieve the new organisational imperatives. The timeliness of being able to achieve this change, and the constraints that operate on it, being the essence of the organisation’s agility. A cross-disciplinary approach is taken that draws on from management and organisational science as well as information systems research. These perspectives are used to conceptualise the organisation in terms of socio-technical building blocks that admit a richer human behavioural dimension into understanding how technology is used operationally. The theoretical framework is then evaluated and refined with data drawn from three interpretive empirical case studies, representing three industry sectors.

The implications of the developed framework on understanding the microfoundations of organisational agility are discussed. In particular, by characterising the organisation in terms of an ecosystem of adaptive components, agility can be understood as an emergent phenomenon.

This research project contributes a new theory of organizational agility in two respects. Firstly, it provides a novel multi-level microfoundational model in terms of granular, socio-technical building blocks which specifically recognises the human behavioural role in the macro-level phenomenon of agility. Secondly, by elucidating microfoundational mechanisms, the theory defines a stronger causality model for the explanation of organizational agility phenomena. In addition, the research contributes to managerial practice by framing the “organisational agility problem” in terms of lower level, but familiar, management concepts such as business processes and the role of IT at the process level. By characterising the dependencies and interactions between the adaptive elements of the organisational ecosystem, this perspective provides the opportunity for understanding the consequences of management inventions, including those that might not be intended.

Acknowledgements

I wish to acknowledge my supervisor Professor Eng Chew. His coaching and advice have encouraged me to reflect on my ideas and develop scientific rigor in my thinking. Constructive criticism of work in progress and encouragement to publish have all been crucial to developing and refining the arguments contained in this thesis.

I would also like to thank Jo Patroni for her assistance in gaining access to her employer organisation as one of my case studies, particularly to senior management. And of course to all those who participated in the case study interviews.

I'd like to also acknowledge the flexibility shown by my employer, CSC Australia, in allowing me to pursue this project in a combination of full-time and part-time modes of working.

Finally, thanks to my family, Jane and Stuart, for allowing (and encouraging) me to pursue such an individual and time-consuming endeavour.

Table of Contents

1	Introduction	12
1.1	What is a Framework?	13
1.2	Alignment and Agility	14
1.3	Research Question	15
1.4	Motivation for the Research	15
1.5	Significance of the Research	16
1.6	Organisation of the Thesis	17
2	Literature Review	19
2.1	Introduction	19
2.2	Organisational Building Blocks	19
2.2.1	Resources	20
2.2.2	Organisational Routines	21
2.2.3	Capabilities	23
2.2.4	Business Processes	27
2.2.5	Services	27
2.2.6	Summary	28
2.3	IT and Organisational Agility	29
2.3.1	Organisational Agility	29
2.3.2	Role of IT	32
2.3.3	Organisational Modularity	34
2.3.4	Summary	34
2.4	Business-IT Alignment	35
2.4.1	Definitions of Alignment	35
2.4.2	Strategic Alignment Model	35
2.4.3	Enterprise Architecture	37
2.4.4	Contingency Based Models	38
2.4.5	Systems Theoretic Models	39
2.4.6	Other Perspectives on Alignment	40
2.4.7	Internal versus External Alignment	41
2.4.8	Summary	45
2.5	Conclusions from the Literature Review	45
3	Research Methods	47

3.1	Introduction	47
3.2	Theory-building Using Case Studies	48
3.2.1	Rationale	48
3.2.2	Build-Evaluate Cycle.....	49
3.3	Selection of Case Studies and Participants	50
3.3.1	Case Selection	50
3.3.2	Case Study Organisations	52
3.3.3	Case Study Participants	54
3.3.4	Other Information Sources	55
3.3.5	Case Study Questions	55
3.4	Data Collection and Analysis	56
3.5	Ethical Procedures	58
3.6	Summary	58
4	Initial Theoretical Development	60
4.1	Introduction	60
4.2	Framework Requirements	60
4.3	Design of the Conceptual Model	61
4.4	Microfoundational Research Lens	62
4.5	Foundational Framework Concepts	66
4.5.1	Organisational Capabilities	66
4.5.2	Business Processes.....	68
4.5.3	Technology-in-use.....	70
4.6	Summary	72
5	Case Study One: A Large IT Services Provider	74
5.1	Preface to the Case Studies	74
5.2	Case Study 1 - Organisation	74
5.2.1	Description.....	74
5.2.2	Context.....	75
5.2.3	Organisational Capabilities	75
5.2.4	Business Processes.....	76
5.2.5	Use of Information Technology	77
5.3	Data Analysis	78

5.4	Theoretical Development	98
5.4.1	Mapping of Themes to Framework Conceptual Model.....	99
5.4.2	Assessment of the Conceptual Model	104
5.4.3	Enhancement of the Conceptual Model.....	105
5.5	Lessons Learned	108
5.6	Summary	108
6	Case Study Two – A Global Pharmaceutical Company	110
6.1	Introduction	110
6.2	Case Study Organisation	110
6.2.1	Description.....	110
6.2.2	Context.....	111
6.2.3	Organisational Capabilities	112
6.2.4	Business Processes.....	113
6.2.5	Use of Information Technology	114
6.3	Data Analysis	115
6.3.1	Coding Summary.....	115
6.3.2	Themes.....	116
6.4	Theoretical Development	135
6.4.1	Application of the Framework	135
6.4.2	Insights for Organisational Agility.....	138
6.4.3	Cross-Case Analysis.....	142
6.5	Summary	143
7	Case Study Three – A Retail Company	145
7.1	Introduction	145
7.2	Case Study Organisation	145
7.2.1	Description.....	145
7.2.2	Context.....	145
7.2.3	Research Scope	146
7.3	Data Analysis	149
7.3.1	Coding Summary.....	149
7.3.2	Themes.....	150
7.4	Theoretical Development	165

7.4.1	Application of the Framework.....	165
7.4.2	Insights for Organisational Agility.....	169
7.5	Conclusions from the Case Studies.....	172
7.6	Summary	176
8	Research Publications.....	177
8.1	Introduction.....	177
8.2	Publication Chronology.....	177
8.2.1	Early Conceptual Model.....	178
8.2.2	Initial Empirical Results.....	179
8.2.3	Application to New Problem Domain.....	180
8.2.4	Refinement of Theoretical Model	180
8.3	Summary	181
9	Discussion.....	182
9.1	Introduction.....	182
9.2	Microfoundations of Organisational Agility.....	182
9.2.1	Capability Level.....	182
9.2.2	Business Process Level.....	185
9.2.3	Individual Level.....	187
9.3	Integrated Model	190
9.3.1	Comparison to Other Treatments of Agility	195
9.4	The Framework as a Theoretical Artefact.....	198
9.4.1	Requirements	198
9.4.2	Generalizability.....	199
10	Conclusion and Further Research Directions.....	201
10.1	Conclusion	201
10.2	Further Research Directions	204
11	References.....	207
12	Appendix 1 - <i>Post hoc</i> Summary of Framework Components.....	219
12.1	Introduction.....	219
12.2	Conceptual Model.....	219

12.2.1	Level 0 – Coevolving Organisations	219
12.2.2	Level 1 – Intersecting Fitness Landscapes	220
12.2.3	Level 2 – Business Process as a Socio-Technical Object	221
12.3	Multi-level Microfoundational Model.....	222
12.4	Construct Definitions	222
12.4.1	Organisational Building Blocks.....	222
12.4.2	Relational Constructs.....	222
12.5	Systems Dynamics Model	224
12.5.1	Definition of Behavioural Variables.....	224
13	Appendix 2 - Data Collection Instruments.....	226
13.1	Participant Information Sheet	226
13.2	Sample Interview Questions.....	228
13.3	Initial Letter Soliciting Participation.....	230
13.4	Research Flyer	232
14	Appendix 3 - Causal Loop Diagramming Notation.....	233
15	Appendix 4 - Published Research Papers.....	234

Table of Figures

Figure 1 - Unified Alignment Framework (adapted from Avison et al. 2004) 37

Figure 2 - Case Study-based Research Method 49

Figure 3 - Coleman bathtub diagram illustrating multiple levels of analysis 64

Figure 4 – Organisational Capabilities 68

Figure 5 - Business Process as a Socio-technical Object 71

Figure 6 - Microfoundational levels of analysis 72

Figure 7 – ABC: Empirical data themes mapped to Framework conceptual model 100

Figure 8 - Enhanced Conceptual Model showing candidate additional constructs 106

Figure 9 - Pharma Inc –Coding Summary 116

Figure 10 – Pharma Inc: themes mapped to Framework conceptual model 136

Figure 11 – Framework model of Internal/External Alignment 140

Figure 12 – Gartner’s Retail Agenda Overview 146

Figure 13 – SupaMart: Coding Summary by Theme 150

Figure 14 – SupaMart: themes mapped to Framework conceptual model 166

Figure 15 – Role of Dynamic Capabilities 171

Figure 16 - Common empirical themes mapped to Coleman diagram 173

Figure 17 - Publication Chronology 178

Figure 18 - Adaptive behaviour at the capability level 184

Figure 19 - Scenario showing capability fitness dynamics 185

Figure 20 – Business Process Evolution 186

Figure 21 – Individual Level: Technology Improvisation 189

Figure 22 – Integrated Model 191

Figure 23 - Example of reinforcing and balancing feedback loops..... 233