Assessing the vulnerability of a habitat forming macroalga to climate warming: Roles of physiology, ecology and evolutionary processes in determining resilience



Jennifer S. Clark

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Science, Climate Change Cluster (C₃), School of Life Sciences, University of Technology Sydney September 2016 **Supervisors:** Assoc Prof Martina A. Doblin (UTS) Assoc Prof Alistair G.B. Poore (UNSW) Dr Melinda A. Coleman (NSW Department of Industries) Prof Peter J. Ralph (UTS)

CERTIFICATE OF ORIGINAL AUTHORSHIP

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as part of the collaborative doctoral degree and/or fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Student:

Date: September 9th 2016

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

What a journey this has been! I am immensely grateful to the many people who have helped me along the way. I would first and foremost like to thank my supervisors, Martina Doblin, Alistair Poore, Melinda Coleman and Peter Ralph for their endless knowledge, guidance, support and encouragement throughout my candidature and for helping me develop into the scientist I am today. I have learnt so much from you individually about science, about being a researcher as well as about life. I would also like to thank Alecia Bellgrove and Aimee Hauser for showing me the ropes in the molecular world as well as Anthony Van Rooyan for helping me with the microsatellite work. I would also like to thank Chris Evenhuis for his help with data analysis.

I would like to thank the UTS Australian Postgraduate Award, for supporting me during my PhD candidature as well the School of Life Sciences and Climate Change Cluster (C₃) for their generosity in funding my project.

Thank you to the members of the Climate Change Cluster (C₃), for your support as well as the technical staff Paul Brooks and Gemma Armstrong for technical support, keeping me safe in the lab and in the field as well as for the many laughs during our mid-hallway conversations. Thank you so much to the members of the Coastal Oceanography and Algal reSearch Team (COAST) for their support and friendship over the years. I also want to thank Jessica Tout, Lauren Messer, Allison McInnes and Michaela Larsson for your friendship over the years. You have been more than just colleagues at UTS, but life-long friends. We have had a lot of laughs and memories together and I thank you for always being there for me, through the thick and the thin.

To all the volunteers I have had over the years, I am grateful for your help within the field. Thank you, Daniel Lewis, Caitlin Lawson, Margarita Albas, Charlotte Robinson (that time when it was storming...) Madeline Ross, Sanjana Saxena, Kirralee Baker and Lisa Roberts.

Finally, I would like to dedicate this thesis to my husband Dan and our families. I want to thank my husband Dan (and best field assistant ever) for his love, support and encouragement throughout this journey. You are my rock. You believed in me, when I didn't believe in myself. You saw me through the good, the bad and the ugly and you kicked my butt when I needed it. Thank you, for your patience, for looking after me and for being there with me every step of the way. To our families, thank you for all your love and support over the years. To my brothers, Jason and Jonathan, thank you for your support and thoughtful conversations over cyber space and for all your silly antics that brought a smile to my face, even oceans apart. To my parents, Jeff and Nina, thank you for teaching me to follow my heart -even if it means to the opposite end of the world, for teaching me to love the natural world around me and for all your love and encouragement. To my dad, the green warrior, thank you for inspiring me to love science, for our endless conversations about the natural world, and for teaching me to look after our best investment – our environment.

Table of Contents CERTIFICATE OF ORIGINAL A	UTHORSHIP i
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	ii
LIST OF FIGURES	viii
LIST OF TABLES	xii
ABSTRACT	xiv
Chapter 1: General Introduction a	nd Thesis Outline1
1.1. INTRODUCTION	2
1.2. Variation in thermal toleran	ce of intertidal algae5
1.3. Physiological tolerances of in	dividuals6
1.3.1. Morphology and physiolo	gy7
1.3.2. Regional scale variation	
1.3.3. Small scale variation	
1.4. The effects of genetic diversi	ty and gene flow on determining vulnerability to
climate change	
1.4.1. Genetic variation within a	population and the potential for adaptation11
1.4.2. Gene flow between popul	ations12
1.5. Potential for transgeneration	al effects13
1.5.1. Life history stages	
1.5.2. Transgenerational effects	
1.6. Study organism	
1.7. Thesis outline	
Chapter 2 Shaping up for stress: Pl	hysiological consequences of variation in morphology
of an intertidal alga	
2. ABSTRACT	
2.1. INTRODUCTION	
2.2. METHODS	

2	.2.1.	Sample collection and study sites	24
2	.2.2.	Thallus and vesicle morphology	.24
2	.2.3.	Relative water content and photosynthetic efficiency during desiccation and re-	
iı	mmersi	on	25
2	.2.4.	Statistical analyses	.26
2	.2.5.	Predicting function from morphology	.27
2.3.	RE	SULTS	.28
2	.3.1.	Thallus and vesicle morphology	.28
2	.3.2.	Relative water content and photosynthetic efficiency during desiccation and re-	
iı	mmersi	on	33
2	.3.3.	Predicting function from morphology	.42
2.4.	DIS	SCUSSION	.42
2	.4.1.	Local scale differences in morphology and the effects on relative water content	
a	nd pho	tosynthetic efficiency of PSII	.43
2	.4.2.	Regional scale differences in morphology and the effects on relative water conte	nt
a	nd pho	tosynthetic efficiency of PSII	.45
2	.4.3.	Conclusions	48
2.5.	SU]	PPLEMENTARY FIGURES AND TABLES	50
Cha	apter 3	: Thermal variation experienced at different spatial scales reveals sensitivity	,
to v	varmir	ig in a habitat-forming macroalga at the warm-edge of its distribution	54
3.	ABST	TRACT	.55
3.1.	INT	FRODUCTION	56
3.2.	ME	THODS	.60
3	.2.1.	Study sites and collection of samples	60
3	.2.2.	Effects of temperature on embryo growth and ontogenesis	61
3	.2.3.	Effects of temperature on photophysiological traits	.62
3	.2.4.	Statistical analyses	.64
3.3.	RE	SULTS	.64

3.3	.1.	Temperature regimes	64
3.3	.2.	Effects of temperature on embryo growth and ontogenesis	66
3.3	.3.	Effects of temperature on photophysiological traits	73
3.4.	DIS	CUSSION	77
3.4	.1.	Regional scale variation in thermal tolerance	77
3.4	.2.	Local scale variation in thermal tolerance	80
3.4	.3.	Organismal scale variation in thermal tolerance	82
3.4	.4.	Further considerations for predicting Hormosira banksii response to warming	83
3.4	.5.	Conclusions	84
3.5.	SUI	PPLEMENTARY FIGURES	86
Chap	ter 4	: Genetic structure of a habitat-forming macroalga at multiple spatial scale	es.
•••••	•••••		90
4. <i>A</i>	ABST	RACT	91
4.1.	INT	RODUCTION	92
4.2.	ME	THODS	96
4.2. 4.2	ME .1.	THODS	96 96
4.2. 4.2 4.2	ME .1. .2.	THODS	96 96 97
4.2. 4.2 4.2 4.2	ME .1. .2. .3.	THODS	96 96 97 99
 4.2. 4.2 4.2 4.2 4.3. 	ME .1. .2. .3. RE	THODS Study species Collection of samples and microsatellite amplification Estimates of genetic diversity and structure SULTS	96 96 97 99 102
 4.2. 4.2 4.2 4.2 4.3 	ME .1. .2. .3. RE .1.	THODS	96 96 97 99 102 102
 4.2. 4.2 4.2 4.2 4.3 4.3 4.4. 	ME .1. .2. .3. RE .1. DIS	THODS	96 96 97 99 102 102 109
 4.2. 4.2 4.2 4.2 4.3 4.3 4.4 	ME .1. .2. .3. RES .1. DIS	THODSStudy species	96 97 99 102 102 109 114
 4.2. 4.2 4.2 4.2 4.3 4.3 4.4. 4.4 4.5. 	ME .1. .2. .3. RE .1. DIS .1. SUI	THODS Study species Collection of samples and microsatellite amplification Estimates of genetic diversity and structure SULTS Genetic diversity and structure CUSSION Conclusions PPLEMENTARY TABLE	 96 97 97 102 102 109 114 116
 4.2. 4.2 4.2 4.2 4.3 4.3 4.4 4.5. Chap 	ME .1. .2. .3. RE .1. DIS .1. SUI	THODS Study species Collection of samples and microsatellite amplification Estimates of genetic diversity and structure SULTS Genetic diversity and structure Genetic diversity and structure CUSSION Conclusions PLEMENTARY TABLE : Is bigger better? Reproductive investment and maternal effects on the	96 97 97 102 102 114 114 116
 4.2. 4.2 4.2 4.3 4.3 4.4 4.5 Chapperform 	ME .1. .2. .3. RE: .1. DIS .1. SUI oter 5	THODS Study species Collection of samples and microsatellite amplification Estimates of genetic diversity and structure SULTS Genetic diversity and structure CUSSION Conclusions PPLEMENTARY TABLE : Is bigger better? Reproductive investment and maternal effects on the nee of early life stages of a habitat-forming macroalga	 96 97 99 102 102 1109 114 116 117
 4.2. 4.2 4.2 4.2 4.3 4.3 4.4. 4.5. Chapperformation 5. An and the second second	ME .1. .2. .3. RE .1. DIS .1. SUI oter 5 orman	THODS Study species Collection of samples and microsatellite amplification Estimates of genetic diversity and structure SULTS Genetic diversity and structure Genetic diversity and structure CUSSION Conclusions PPLEMENTARY TABLE : Is bigger better? Reproductive investment and maternal effects on the nee of early life stages of a habitat-forming macroalga RACT	96 97 97 102 102 109 114 116 117 118
 4.2. 4.2 4.2 4.3 4.3 4.4 4.5. Chapperfor 5. A 5.1. 	ME .1. .2. .3. RE .1. DIS .1. SUI oter 5 ormai ABST INT	THODS Study species Collection of samples and microsatellite amplification Estimates of genetic diversity and structure SULTS Genetic diversity and structure Guestion CUSSION Conclusions PPLEMENTARY TABLE : Is bigger better? Reproductive investment and maternal effects on the nee of early life stages of a habitat-forming macroalga RACT RODUCTION	 96 97 102 102 103 114 116 117 118 119

5.2.1.	Sample collection and variation in reproductive investment	121
5.2.2.	Temperature effects on egg fertilisation and embryo growth	122
5.2.3.	Statistical analysis	127
5.3. RE	SULTS	127
5.3.1.	Variation in reproduction investment	127
5.3.2.	Temperature effects on embryo growth	130
5.4. DIS	SCUSSION	135
5.4.1.	Reproductive investment	135
5.4.2.	Relationship of egg size with embryo development	136
5.4.3.	Effect of egg size on embryo metrics at variable temperatures	138
5.4.4.	Conclusions	139
Chapter 6	General Discussion and Conclusions	140
6. Over	view	141
(11		
6.1.1.	What scale of exposure is more physiologically important in populations of	H.
6.1.1. banksii?	What scale of exposure is more physiologically important in populations of	H. 141
6.1.1. banksii? 6.1.2.	What scale of exposure is more physiologically important in populations of What are the physiological tolerances of H. banksii at different spatial scales	H. 141 s?144
6.1.1. banksii? 6.1.2. 6.1.3.	What scale of exposure is more physiologically important in populations of What are the physiological tolerances of H. banksii at different spatial scales Does the life history of H.banksii make it more vulnerable to climate warmi	H. 141 s?144 ng? 148
6.1.1. banksii? 6.1.2. 6.1.3. 6.1.4.	What scale of exposure is more physiologically important in populations of What are the physiological tolerances of H. banksii at different spatial scales Does the life history of H.banksii make it more vulnerable to climate warmi What is the adaptive capacity of H. banksii to global warming?	H. 141 s?144 ng? 148 151
 6.1.1. banksii? 6.1.2. 6.1.3. 6.1.4. 6.2. Imj 	What scale of exposure is more physiologically important in populations of What are the physiological tolerances of H. banksii at different spatial scales Does the life history of H.banksii make it more vulnerable to climate warmi What is the adaptive capacity of H. banksii to global warming?	H. 141 s?144 ng? 148 151 154
 6.1.1. banksii? 6.1.2. 6.1.3. 6.1.4. 6.2. Imp 6.2.1. 	What scale of exposure is more physiologically important in populations of What are the physiological tolerances of H. banksii at different spatial scales Does the life history of H.banksii make it more vulnerable to climate warmi What is the adaptive capacity of H. banksii to global warming?	H. 141 s?144 ng? 148 151 154 155
 6.1.1. banksii? 6.1.2. 6.1.3. 6.1.4. 6.2. Imj 6.2.1. 	What scale of exposure is more physiologically important in populations of What are the physiological tolerances of H. banksii at different spatial scales Does the life history of H.banksii make it more vulnerable to climate warmi What is the adaptive capacity of H. banksii to global warming?	H. 141 s?144 ng? 148 151 155 158
 6.1.1. banksii? 6.1.2. 6.1.3. 6.1.4. 6.2. Imp 6.2.1. APPEND List of S 	What scale of exposure is more physiologically important in populations of What are the physiological tolerances of H. banksii at different spatial scales Does the life history of H.banksii make it more vulnerable to climate warmi What is the adaptive capacity of H. banksii to global warming? plications of this study Suggestions for management of H. banksii in Australia and future directions IX A	H. 141 s?144 ng? 148 151 155 158
 6.1.1. banksii? 6.1.2. 6.1.3. 6.1.4. 6.2. Imp 6.2.1. APPEND List of S APPEND 	What scale of exposure is more physiologically important in populations of What are the physiological tolerances of H. banksii at different spatial scales Does the life history of H.banksii make it more vulnerable to climate warmi What is the adaptive capacity of H. banksii to global warming? plications of this study Suggestions for management of H. banksii in Australia and future directions IX A Supplementary of Figure and Table Captions	H. 141 s?144 ng? 148 151 155 158 158 158

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.2: Conceptual diagram of *Hormosira banksii* life cycle of and processes which climate change may act upon......14

Figure 2.4: Mean (\pm SD) relative water content (%) of thalli collected from a) two heights on the shore and b) four locations at two time points: the end of the desiccation (4 h) and the initial measurement of recovery 30 minutes after thalli were resubmerged......35

Figure 4.2: Patterns of isolation by distance (pairwise genetic differentiation F_{ST} estimates relative to geographic distances) at multiple spatial scales: a) over all locations and shoreheights as well as b) between locations within a region......106

Figure 5.1: Example of embryo development at 22 °C over 7 days post-fertilisation. Images were captured using a high content analyser (Incell Analyzer 2200, GE Healthcare)

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.4: Results of analysis of variance (ANOVA) for photosynthetic yield of *H. banksii* for three treatments, 20 °C, 30 °C and control at 6 times points: before the treatment commenced, after 1 hour of desiccation, at the end of the desiccation period (4 h), initial recovery after thalli were submersed (30 min), recovery after 2 h, and at the end of the recovery period (after 14 h submersed). Location factor had planned regional contrasts between marginal (ANG, MW) and central populations (PB, BB). *P*-values were calculated from 999 permutations under a reduced model with a significance level of 0.05. (n = 6)

ABSTRACT

Anthropogenically mediated climate change is having profound impacts on the distribution, abundance and functioning of species worldwide. Marine macroalgae are important foundation species due to their role in facilitating biodiversity through provision of resources and moderating stress. Accurate predictions of how macroalgae will respond to global warming require a better understanding of factors that lead to the vulnerability of species. This thesis aimed to examine the exposure and underlying biological traits that explain the sensitivity and resilience to warming in a dominant and endemic intertidal macroalga, *Hormosira banksii*, with the ultimate goal of assessing its vulnerability to changes in climate regime.

H. banksii populations inhabiting two spatial scales, regional (central (cooler) and marginal (warmer)) and local (between tidal heights) were sampled. At each spatial scale, the performance of *H. banksii* was assessed to determine whether morphology influences function (relative water content and photosynthetic efficiency of PSII) in adults while the traits (growth and photosynthetic efficiency) of early life history stages (< 5 days old) were assessed to determine thermal niche. Adults in marginal populations had smaller thallus and vesicle size, which affected the ability of *H. banksii* to recover photosynthetically from thermal and desiccation stress. Distinct thermal performance curves of growth and photosynthetic efficiency of early life history stages revealed the marginal population had lower thermal safety margins and lower thermal optima. The genetic structure was characterised among regions, locations and tidal heights to test the hypothesis that genetic diversity would decrease towards distribution limits and differ between tidal heights. Marginal populations had lower estimates of genetic diversity than central populations, and

there was evidence of isolation by distance – i.e., limited gene flow over long distances (~500 km). Genetic differentiation was not found between tidal heights, suggesting gene flow is not restricted by reproductive strategies of *H. banksii*. Furthermore, maternal provisioning of eggs did not indicate advantages in performance such as faster growth rate of early life stages, which would aid in recruitment. Physiological tolerances of adults and embryos, population genetic structure, inbreeding and limited gene flow all suggest that the warm marginal populations of *H. banksii* are vulnerable to changes in temperature regime. Local habitat effects such as topography and tidal cycles, however, are potentially more important in governing the physiology of *H. banksii* and can buffer the full extent of climate change occurring at the regional scale. In view of this, changes in the distribution and abundance of some populations of *H. banksii* support may be observed in the near future.