

Resilient Wireless Sensor Networks

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree

Doctor of Philosophy

from

University of Technology, Sydney Faculty of Engineering and Information Technology

by

Ali Rafiei

Bachelor Science of Engineering, 2004 Master Science of Engineering, 2007 Shiraz University

Sydney, Australia 2017

Statement of Authorship/Originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not been previously submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as a part of the requirements for other degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that this thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research and in the preparation of the thesis itself has been fully acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are quoted in the thesis.

© Copyright 2017, Ali Rafiei

Production Note: Signature removed prior to publication.

Abstract

With the increase in wireless sensor networks' (WSN) applications as the result of enhancements in sensors' size, battery-life and mobility, sensor nodes have become one of the most ubiquitous and relied-upon electrical appliances in recent years. In harsh and hostile environments, in the absence of centralised supervision, the effects of faults, damages and unbalanced node deployments should be taken into account as they may disturb the operation and quality of service of networks. Coverage holes (CHs) due to the correlated failures and unbalanced deployment of nodes should be considered seriously in a timely manner; otherwise, cascaded failures on the rest of the proximate sensor nodes can jeopardise networks' integrity. Although different distributed topology control (TC) schemes have been devised to address the challenges of node failures and their dynamic behaviours, little work has been directed towards recovering CHs and/or alleviating their undesirable effects especially in Large Scale CHs (LSCH). Thus, devising CH recovery strategies for the swift detection, notification, repair and avoidance of damage events are important to increase the lifetime and resiliency of WSNs and to improve the efficacy and reliability of error-prone and energy-restricted nodes for many applications. In this research, the concepts of resiliency, fault management, network holes, CHs, TC schemes and stages of CH recovery are reviewed. By devising new TC techniques, CHs recovery strategies that partially or wholly repair LSCHs and increase the coverage of WSNs are presented such that a global pattern emerges as a result of nodes' local interactions. In this study, we propose (1) CH detection and boundary node (B-node) selection algorithms, which B-nodes around the damaged area self-select solely based on available 1-hop information extracted from their simple geometrical and statistical features. (2) A constraint node movement algorithm based on the idea of virtual chord (v-chords) formed by B-nodes and their neighbours to partially repair CHs. By changing each Bnode's v-chord, its movement and connectivity to the rest of network can be controlled in a distributed manner. (3) Fuzzy node relocation models based on force-based movement algorithms are suitable to consider the uncertainty governed by nodes' distributed and local interactions and the indefinite choices of movements. (4) A model of cooperative CHs recovery in which nodes move towards damaged areas in the form of disjoint spanned trees, which is inspired by nature. Based on nodes' local interactions with their neighbours and their distances to CHs, a set of disjoint trees around the CH spans. (5) A hybrid CH recovery strategy that combines sensing power control and physical node relocation using a game theoretic approach for mobile WSNs. (6) A sink-based CH recovery via node relocation where moving nodes consider the status of sink nodes.

Abstract

The proposed node relocation algorithm aims to reduce the distances of moving nodes to the deployed sink nodes while repairing the CHs. The results show that proposed distributed algorithms (1)-(6) either outperform or match their counterparts within acceptable ranges.

The significances of proposed algorithms are as follow: Although they are mainly designed base on the available 1-hop knowledge and local interactions of (autonomous) nodes, they result in global behaviours. They can be implemented in harsh and hostile environments in the absence of centralised operators. They are suitable for time-sensitive applications and scenarios with the security concerns that limit the amount of information exchange between nodes. The burden of decision making is spread among nodes.

Acknowledgments

First, I would like to express my deepest appreciations to my supervisor, Dr. Mehran Abolhasan who helped me in my research and who has always been supportive and very patient through my studies despite all the difficulties. I would like to thank my co-supervisor, Dr. Daniel Franklin who gave me valuable feedback and comments during my research. I would also like to thank my previous supervisor Prof. Farzad Safaei from University of Wollongong, Australia for all his feedbacks and continuous supervision even after i transferred to University of Technology, Sydney. I am very grateful for the unique opportunity to work with him. I would like express my gratitude to my alternative supervisor, Prof. Robin Braun for all his kindness and help. I would like to thank Dr. Stephen Smith from Macquarie University for his valuable time and feedback on reading my work and accepting to review the drafts version of my thesis.

I would like to thank my beloved parents, Mohammad and Shahla, for their unlimited support during my studies. Without them it was not possible at all to pass through the hard times. I really appreciate their sacrifice and support for me every single day of my life. I would like to thank my brother and my best friend, Dr. Pedram Rafiei from University of Saskatchewan, Canada who always helped me any possible ways he could from the long distance.

Acknowledgments

I would like to thanks people who I co-authored a number of papers for the duration of my studies. Special Thanks to Dr. Yashar Maali from University of Technology, Sydney for his help. I also thank my colleagues especially Dr. Abdullah Alsabbagh for his time and creating enjoyable and cooperative environment for me. I would like to express my special thanks to Dr. Wei Ni from Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation (CSIRO) for his invaluable feedback and comments on my work. It was my pleasure to work with him. I would like to thank my former colleague Dr. Banafsheh Lashkari, from Shiraz University for her comments and feedback at the time of preparing the thesis' draft.

I am in debt to anonymous reviewers of my publications for giving feedback and comments which paved the way for new ideas in my research. I would also like to express my appreciation for Australian Research Council (ARC) discovery research grant No. DP0879507 to support my studies and ease the financial burden.

I would like to express my gratitude to Mr. Amir Hesami, Dr. Mohammad Namazi, Dr. Amirreza Niktash, Dr.Reza Memary, Dr. Alireza Banani, Dr. Alireza Mohammadi, Dr. Mehdi Farrokhrooz and Dr. Mostafa Azizpour among many of my friends for their kind hospitality and support.

I would like to express my sincere appreciation for Ms. Phyllis Agius and Mr. Craig Shuard for all their help and advices. I would like to express my gratitude to Ms. Eryani Tjondrowalujo and Ms. Grandia Agathon for their kindness and help with the thesis submission process.

I would like to thank my thesis examiners for their time and for their valuable comments and feedback.

Last but not least, I would like to dedicate my thesis to all the courageous, brave

Acknowledgments vii

people, and the soldiers of my country which have sacrificed their lives and health to protect my country, my homeland against enemies and made a secure and safe place to grow and prosper. I salute and pray for their souls and respectable families who have suffered drastically from losing their loved ones.

Acknowledgments viii

To my beloved and very dear parents, my true friends Mohammad, and Shahla which have supported me in all aspects and were for me every single moment.

Contents

1	Int	roduction	1
	1.1	Objectives of the Thesis	5
	1.2	Thesis Organisation	6
	1.3	Summary of Contributions and Publications	10
			12
2	Rel	ated Work	13
	2.1	Wireless Sensor Networks	14
		2.1.1 Distributed WSNs	16
		2.1.2 Mobile WSNs	16
		2.1.3 Coverage and Connectivity	18
	2.2		24
		2.2.1 Mobility Classification	24
	2.3	Effect of Localisation	28
	2.4	Network Resiliency	28
		2.4.1 Resiliency in Graphs and Nature	34
		2.4.2 Resiliency in WSNs	36
	2.5		39
			42
			46
			47
			48
		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	50
			51
			60
	2.6		62
			62
			64
			70

CONTENTS	
	X

2.7	Network Recovery
	2.7.1 Recovery Stages
	2.7.2 Coverage Hole Recovery
	2.7.3 Resilience Factors in WSNs
2.8	
	2.8.1 Complex Systems
	2.8.2 Autonomy and Multi-Agent Systems in WSNs
	2.8.3 Emergent Cooperation and Collective Behaviour
2.0	Conclusion
2.0	Conclusion
	overage Hole Detection
	Introduction
3.2	Method and Assumptions
	3.2.1 Nodes and Deployment Area
	3.2.2 Coverage Hole
	3.2.3 Nodes Classification
	3.2.4 Node Selection Algorithms
3.3	B Performance Evaluation
	3.3.1 Performance Metrics
	3.3.2 Results
3.4	Conclusion
1 C	overage Hole Partial Recovery by Nodes' Constrained and
	utonomous Movements Using Virtual α -chords
	Method and Assumptions
	4.1.1 Sensor Node and Coverage Hole Model
	4.1.2 Nodes Classification
	4.1.3 Local Communications Protocol
	4.1.4 Selection Algorithms
	4.1.5 Movement Algorithms
1 6	Performance Evaluation
4.2	4.2.1 Performance Metrics
	4.2.2 Results
1 6	
4.3	3 Conclusion
Fu	zzy Node Relocation Models
	·
5.1	Introduction
	Introduction
	Method and Assumption

CONTENTS	
CONTENTS	xi

	5.3	Fuzzy Logic Relocation Models	— 142
	0.0	5.3.1 Expert Knowledge Fuzzy Relocation Model	
		5.3.2 Tuned Parameter Fuzzy Relocation Model	
		5.3.3 Iteratively Tuned Parameter Fuzzy Relocation Model	
	5.4	Performance Evaluation	
	0.1	5.4.1 Performance Metrics	
		5.4.2 Results	
	5.5	Conclusion	
6	Co	operative Recovery of Coverage Holes in WSNs via Disjoint	
U		anning Trees	166
	_	Introduction	
		Method and Assumptions	
	0.2	6.2.1 Sensor Nodes	
		6.2.2 Coverage Hole	
		6.2.3 Node Types	
		6.2.4 Voronoi Cells	
		6.2.5 Boundary Conditions	
		6.2.6 Disjoint Spanned Tree	
	6.3	Performance Evaluation	
	0.0	6.3.1 Performance Metrics	
		6.3.2 Results	
	6.4	Conclusion	
7	D:a	tributed Hybrid Deservory of Coverage Hele	217
1		stributed Hybrid Recovery of Coverage Hole Introduction	
		Method and Assumptions	
	1.4	7.2.1 Game Theory in Brief	
		7.2.2 Sensor Nodes	
		7.2.2 Gensor Nodes	
		7.2.4 Node Types	
		7.2.5 Proposed Hybrid Recovery Algorithm	
		7.2.6 Coverage Problem Formulation	
		7.2.7 Distributed Payoff-based learning algorithm	
	7 2	Performance Evaluations	
	1.5	7.3.1 Performance Metrics	
		7.3.2 Results	
	7.4	Conclusion	
0			
8		k-Based Recovery Model	243
	8.1	Introduction	. 243

CC	ONTI	TENTS		xii
	8.2	Methods and Assumptions		
	0.2	8.2.1 Sensor Nodes and Area of Deployment		
		8.2.2 Coverage Holes and Node Types		
		8.2.3 Nodes' Communications Protocol		
		8.2.4 Node Movement Decision		
		8.2.5 Effect of Sink Node		
		8.2.6 Movement Toward CHs		
		8.2.7 Proposed Movement Model		
		8.2.8 Condition at Border of Deployment area		
	8.3	Performance Evaluation		
	0.0	8.3.1 Performance Metrics		
		8.3.2 Benchmark Movement Algorithms		
		8.3.3 Results		
	8.4	Conclusion		
9	Cor	ncluding Remarks		266
J		Conclusions		
		Future Research Suggestions		
	Bib	liography		279
\mathbf{A}	Βοι	indary Node Selection Algorithms		303
		Introduction		. 303
		Method and Assumptions		
		Performance Evaluation		
	A.4	Conclusion		. 314
В	Per	formance of DSSA for Large Scale CH		315
		Introduction		. 315
		Method and Assumptions		
		Performance Evaluation		
		Conclusion		
\mathbf{C}	Fuz	zy Logic Movement Model Figures		320

List of Figures

2.1	Stack Diagram of Sections
2.2	Coverage Categories
2.3	Mobility Categories
2.4	Topology Control Scheme Categories
2.5	Node Failure Categories in WSNs
2.6	Network Failure Management and Recovery Stages 70
2.7	Categories of Coverage Holes
2.8	Network Resilience Factors and Indicators
3.1	Coverage Hole
3.2	Node Types
4.1	Coverage Hole and Node Types
4.2	B-Node, its real, virtual neighbors and virtual chord
4.3	Chord movement algorithm (R_c =15, N =600, β =0) 128
4.4	Percentage of Recovery
4.5	Percentage of Connectivity
4.6	Average Movement
5.1	Memberships
5.2	Fuzzy Node Movement Algorithms
5.3	Radial and Angular Membership function
5.4	Fuzzy Node Movement Algorithms, Figure 5.2
5.5	Radial and Angular Membership functions of Node after 50
	Iterations
5.6	Fuzzy Node Movement Algorithms, Figure 5.4
5.7	Percentage of 1-Coverage (100%) for different boundary conditions
	with angular force strategy $A_1 \ldots \ldots$
5.8	Uniformity for different boundary conditions with angular force
	strategy A_1

LIST OF FIGURES xiv

		_
5.9	Average movement for different boundary conditions with angular	
	force strategy A_1	15
5.10	Performance Comparison of Relocation Algorithm for globally and	
		15
5.11	Performance of Different Movement Strategies with Boundary	
	condition B_2 and Angular Force Strategy $A_1 \ldots \ldots \ldots$	16
5.12	Comparison of Performances of Movement Algorithms for	
	$\omega_1 = 0, \omega_2 = 0, \omega_3 = 1 \dots \dots$	16
5.13	Comparison of Performances of Movement Algorithms (FRM) for	1 /
	$(\omega_1, \omega_2, \omega_3) = (1, 0, 0), (0, 1, 0), (0, 0, 1) \dots \dots \dots \dots \dots \dots \dots$	16
6.1	Coverage Hole and Types of Nodes	16
6.2	Specimen of lichtenberg Figure obtained by using a spherical	
	electrode [365]	16
6.3	Disjoint Spanned Trees (DS-Tree) around CH	1
6.4	Block Diagram of the CH boundary detection algorithm and Node	
	types	1
6.5	Block Diagram for Recovery Stages of CH	1
6.6	Block Diagram of the Root Node Selection Algorithm	1
6.7	Block Diagram of the Disjoint Spanned Trees Algorithm	18
6.8	Percentage of 1-Coverage of Relocation Algs. for $N=500$, and radii	
	of $R_{Hole} = (40, 50, 60, 70)m$	18
6.9	Uniformity of Relocation Algs. for $N=500$, and radii of $R_{Hole} =$	
	(40, 50, 60, 70)m	18
6.10	Average Movement of Relocation Algs. for $N=500$, and radii of	
	$R_{Hole} = (40, 50, 60, 70)m \dots \dots$	19
6.11	Efficiency of Movement of Relocation Algs. for $N=500$, and radii	
0.40	of $R_{Hole} = (40, 50, 60, 70)m$	19
6.12	Percentage of 1-Coverage of Relocation Algs. $N=500$, $R_{Hole}=50$	1 /
0.10	and Different participating Nodes	19
6.13	Percentage of 1-Coverage of Relocation Algs. $N=500$, $R_{Hole}=50$	0/
C 1 1	and Different participating Nodes	20
0.14	Uniformity of Relocation Algs. $N=500$, $R_{Hole}=50$ and Different	21
6 1 1	participating Nodes	20
0.14	Uniformity of Relocation Algs. $N=500$, $R_{Hole}=50$ and Different participating Nodes (cont'd)	20
6 15	Average Movement of Relocation Algs. $N=500$, $R_{Hole}=50$ and	∠(
0.10	Average Movement of Relocation Algs. $N=500$, $R_{Hole}=50$ and Different participating Nodes	20
6.15	Average Movement of Relocation Algs. $N=500$, $R_{Hole}=50$ and	ا ک
0.10	Different participating Nodes (cont'd)	20
	Different participating receipt (contrar)	

LIST OF FIGURES xv

6.16	Percentage of 1-Coverage of Relocation Algs. for $N=500$,	_
0.20	R_{Hole} =50 for N_p =Closest X% of U-nodes	207
6.17	Percentage of 1-Coverage of Relocation for Algs. $N=500$,	
		209
6.18	Uniformity of Relocation Algs. for $N=500, R_{Hole}=50$ for	
		211
6.19	Uniformity of Relocation Algs. for $N=500$, $R_{Hole}=50$, N_p =Level L	
		212
6.20		
0.20	9 ,	213
6.21	Average Movement of Relocation Algs. for $N=500$, $R_{Hole}=50$,	
0		214
7.1		225
7.2	k-Coverage of Network $N=400$ Nodes and Random Consecutive	
	Damage Events (Coverage Holes)	235
7.2	k-Coverage of Network $N=400$ Nodes and Random Consecutive	
	Damage Events (Coverage Holes) (Cont'd.)	236
7.3	Algorithms' Percentage of Coverage vs Processing Time, Iterations	
	N = 400 Nodes	237
7.4	Percentage of Avg . Coverage vs Number of Nodes	238
7.5	Algorithm Consumed Energy vs. Number of Nodes	238
7.6	Algorithms' Percentage of Coverage/Energy vs Time, $N=400$ Nodes	239
0 1	Palacetion of Poundamy nodes in Cink based CH Passyony Model	244
8.1 8.2	Relocation of Boundary nodes in Sink-based CH Recovery Model .	
8.3	Coverage Hole, Node Types $N = 500$ nodes, and $R_c = 15 m$	
	Boundary Node and its Undamaged and Damaged Neighbour Nodes	
8.4 8.5	Circle Inversion	
	Sparsity of Network	
8.6	Percentage of Coverage	
8.7 8.8	Avg Distances CHs' Boundary Nodes to Sink Node	
8.9	Min Distances CHs' Boundary Nodes to Sink Node	202
A.1	Coverage Hole	304
A.2	QB (0.5) OB-Node Selection Algorithm applied on B-nodes	
A.3	Cosine Law Boundary Min Distance, Selection Algorithm	
A.4	5 Distribution of Angles (histogram) OB-nodes at (x_{hole}, y_{hole})	
A.5	Average distances from damage area of BNS-algorithms	
A.6	Number of Selected B-nodes of BNS-algorithms	
A.7	Perc-k-RSC of BNS-algorithms	

LIST OF FIGURES	
B.1	Network Hole and Node Types
	Network Deployment Stages in the Recovery, Performed by DSSA on Boundary/Undamaged Nodes
В.3	Network Coverage Stages in the Recovery, Performed by DSSA on Boundary/Undamaged Nodes
C.1	Percentage of 1-Coverage (100%) for different boundary conditions with angular force strategy $A_2 \ldots 321$
C.2	Uniformity for different boundary conditions with angular force strategy A_2
C.3	Average movement for different boundary conditions with angular force strategy A_2 323

List of Tables

2.1	Some definitions of Resilience and Network Resiliency in the
2.2	literature
	behaviour and Cooperation in the literature
	Stage-wise B-node Selection
3.3	(Number of SB-nodes 20-100)
4.1	Performances of Movement Algorithms
5.1	Fuzzy Rules
	Membership Functions
	Percentage of Improvement over DSSA for 1-Coverage (100%) 157
	Uniformity (Difference with DSSA)
5.5	Average Movement (Difference with DSSA)
6.1	Percentage of 1-Coverage of Relocation Algs. Different CH Radius
	$R_{Hole} = (40, 50, 60, 70) \ m, \ N = 500, 1000 \ Nodes \ \dots \ 194$
6.2	Uniformity of Relocation Algs. Different CH Radius
6.2	$R_{Hole} = (40, 50, 60, 70) \ m \ \text{and} \ N = 500, N = 1000 \ \text{Nodes} \ \dots \ \dots \ 195$
0.0	Average Efficiency of Movement of Relocation Algs. Different CH Radius $R_{Hole} = (40, 50, 60, 70) \ m \ N = 500, N = 1000 \ Nodes \dots 196$
6.4	Number of Participating Nodes for $N=500$ Nodes and Coverage
0.1	Hole Radius, R_{Hole} =50 m
7.1	Description of Variables
7.2	Value of Variables
7.3	Value of Stopping Criteria for $N = 200,400$ Deployed Nodes 237

LIST OF TABLES xviii		
7.4 Avg. Coverage and Energy vs. Number of Deployed 7.5 Coverage and Energy vs. Number of Deployed Node		
8.1 Sparsity of Network with Sink Nodes located at (10 Consecutive CHs	00, 100) and 5	
8.2 Percentage of Coverage of Network, with Sink Node (100, 100) and 5 Consecutive CHs	es located at	
8.3 Distances to Sink Nodes located at (100, 100) and 5		

List of Algorithms

3.1	Distance-based Boundary Node Selection Algorithms
3.2	Degree-based Boundary Node Selection Algorithms
	VD Boundary Node Selection
	VA Boundary Node Selection
4.1	Nodes' neighbors selection Algorithms
4.2	Formation of Chord Algorithm
5.1	Iteratively tuned fuzzy logic relocation model
6.1	DS-Tree Movement Algorithm
6.2	Root Nodes Selection Algorithm
6.3	Disjoint Spanned Trees Algorithm
6.4	Chain Node Movement DS-Tree Alg
7.1	Proposed Algorithm
A.1	Boundary Selection Algorithms
A.2	Boundary Node Selection Algorithms (Alg. A.1 Contd.) 307

List of Abbreviations

ADL Absolute Degree Loss

AVD Average Distance from Damaged Area

aM-CSSCMM based on the amplitude

B-B cell B-Node Voronoi Cell Neighbour with B-node Voronoi Cell

B-D cell B-Node Voronoi Cell Neighbour with D-node Voronoi Cell

B-node Boundary Node

BNS-Algorithm Boundary Node Selection Algorithms

CA Cellular Automata

CCP coverage configuration protocol

CH Coverage Hole

CHR Coverage Hole Recovery

CHD Coverage Hole Detour

CI Confidence Interval

CLAvgB Cosine Law Average Boundary

CLMinB Cosine Law Min Boundary

CM Center of Mass

C-Mobility Controlled Mobility

CNF-algorithm Closer Nodes First Algorithm

CP Candidate Parent

List of Abbreviations xxi

CSSCMM Combined SS and CM Movement

D-area Damaged Area

D-event Damage Event

D-node Damaged Node

DHSCL Distributed Homogeneous Synchronous Coverage

Learning Algorithm

dM-CSSCMM M-CSSCMM based on the angle

DN-node(s) Damaged Neighbour Node(s)
DSN Distributed Sensor Network

DSSA Distributed Self-Spreading Algorithm

DS-Tree Disjoint Spanned Tree

DUCM-Algs. DN-nodes and UN-Nodes' Centre of Mass Algorithm

EC Emergent Cooperation

ECE Efficiency of Consumed Energy

FAM Fuzzy Angular Movement

FARM FAM then FRM

FRM Fuzzy Radial Movement

FRAM FRM then FAM

FRNAM FRM and FAM

GPS Global Positioning System

HBD Hole Boundary Detection

LSCH Large Scale Coverage Hole

k-RSC k-redundant sensing coverage

MANETS Mobile ad hoc networks

MAS Multi-Agent System

MaxD-algorithm Maximum Distance Algorithm

MinD-algorithm Minimum Distance Algorithm

List of Abbreviations xxii

MB-node(s) Margin of Boundary node(s)

M-CSSCMM Modified CSSCMM

MWSNs Mobile WSNs N-node Normal Node

NE Nash equilibrium

Perc-k-RSC percentages of k-redundant sensing coverage

PCov Percentage of Coverage

PP Potential Parent

PSO Particle Swarm Optimization

QoS Quality of Service

RBN Random Boundary node

RDL Relative Degree Loss

 R_c Transmission Range

 R_s Sensing Range

RE Residual Energy

ROI Region Of Interest

QB Quantile-based (comparative) Boundary

S-Coverage Spatial Coverage

SB-Node Selected Boundary Node

SS Simple Sink

SSCH Small Scale Coverage Hole

SSM Simple Sink Movement

T-Coverage Temporal Coverage

TC Topology Control

TS Takagi and Sugeno

UAV Unmanned aerial vehicle

U-node Undamaged Node

List of Abbreviations xxiii

UDG Unit Disk Graph

U-Mobility Uncontrolled Mobility

UN-node Undamaged Neighbour Node

V-chord Virtual Chord

V-Hole Virtual Hole

V-node Virtual Node

VA-Algorithm Voronoi Area Algorithm

VarD-Algorithm Variance of Distance Algorithm

VD-Algorithm Voronoi Distance Algorithm

WQB Weighted quantile-based Boundary

WSN Wireless Sensor Network