THE ECONOMIC IMPACT
OF
CHILDHOOD DEVELOPMENTAL LANGUAGE DISORDER

Paula Cronin

Submitted to the University of Technology Sydney, Australia
for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Submitted 2017
Certificate of Authorship/Originality

I certify that this thesis has not been previously submitted for a degree, nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree, except as part of the collaborative doctoral degree and/or fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that this thesis has been written by me. Any help I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis, itself, has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Paula Cronin

Date: 16th February 2018
Ethics Approval

All studies used the Longitudinal Study of Australian Children (LSAC). This research was approved through the Centre for Health Economics Research and Evaluation’s (CHERE) program ethics approval UTS HREC REF NO. 2015000135.
Acknowledgements

I would like to express my appreciation to all those who have helped to make the completion of this thesis possible. First, my thanks go to my panel of supervisors, Professor Stephen Goodall, Professor Rosalie Viney, Dr Rebecca Reeve and Dr Tricia McCabe. I am grateful to Stephen for all his guidance and ongoing daily support. Rosalie, with her depth of experience and health economics knowledge, helped me to stay on track and see the big picture in the development of my thesis. Rebecca’s knowledge in econometrics and Tricia’s knowledge on the clinical relevance and application of the thesis were both invaluable.

I would like to acknowledge the financial support that I have received from the Research Training Program Stipend Scholarship (formerly Australian Postgraduate Awards) for my PhD research. Additional support was granted by the Centre for Health Economics Research and Evaluation (CHERE), the University of Technology, Sydney (UTS), the UTS Business School, and the UTS Vice-Chancellor Fund for the conferences I attended during my candidature, all of which I am thankful for. I am also grateful to Wendy Monaghan, Publications Editor (www.wendymonaghan.com.au), who copy edited the thesis, with editorial intervention restricted to Standards D and E of the Australian Standards for Editing Practice, as stipulated by the Guidelines for Editing Research Theses.

I am also indebted to some friends and staff members from CHERE, who were involved in the many issues relating to my study and who provided feedback on my various seminar presentations. In particular, I would like to thank Dr Richard De Abreu Lourenco for his ongoing support and Dr Tom Longden for our discussions around various econometrics issues. Huge thanks go to Liz Chinchen for her assistance in searching for the literature used for this thesis and for helping with Endnote and the bibliography and to the CHERE PhD group, who listened to all of my ‘practice stage presentations’. I also thank Professor Denzil Fiebig, who allowed me to attend courses at the University of New South Wales. The econometrics courses proved to be very important for my research.
Most importantly, a very special thanks to my husband, Damien Cronin, and my children, Henry and Alice, for their unconditional support, understanding and patience. They proved to be my motivation, as did my gorgeous friends (too many to mention but you know who you are) who managed to cheer me up when the going got tough.
Table of Contents

Certificate of Authorship/Originality ................................................................. ii
Ethics Approval ................................................................................................. iii
Acknowledgements ............................................................................................. iv
Table of Contents ................................................................................................. vi
List of Figures ........................................................................................................ vii
List of Tables ......................................................................................................... x
List of Abbreviations ............................................................................................ xvi
Abstract ................................................................................................................. xviii

Chapter 1: Background ........................................................................................ 1
  1.1 Introduction ................................................................................................... 1
  1.2 Theoretical framework .................................................................................. 4
  1.3 Existing literature ........................................................................................ 7
   1.3.1 Communication impairment research ................................................... 8
  1.4 Disability policy: background ..................................................................... 10
   1.4.1 Measurement of disability .................................................................... 11
  1.5 The Australian policy context ..................................................................... 12
   1.5.1 Policy settings to address developmental language disorder ...................... 13
       1.5.1.1 Health and welfare ................................................................. 13
       1.5.1.2 Education ............................................................................. 14
       1.5.1.3 Disability policy reform ......................................................... 15
       1.5.1.4 National Senate inquiry ......................................................... 16
  1.6 Aims and outline of this thesis .................................................................... 16

Chapter 2: Data and Key Variables ................................................................... 20
  2.1 The Longitudinal Study of Australian Children ............................................. 20
     2.1.1 Measures used to assess language ....................................................... 21
  2.1.2 Defining developmental language disorder ............................................... 24
  2.1.3 Early identification and persistence .......................................................... 25
  2.1.4 Other data limitations ............................................................................ 28
    2.1.4.1 Attrition ...................................................................................... 28
  2.1.5 Modelling approach in each chapter ....................................................... 29

Chapter 3: Health Utilisation and Health Expenditure ................................... 32
  3.1 Introduction .................................................................................................. 32
  3.2 Existing evidence ......................................................................................... 32
  3.3 Methods ....................................................................................................... 34
     3.3.1 Data and sample .................................................................................. 34
         3.3.1.1 Measures used to assess language ........................................... 34
  3.4 Descriptive statistics ................................................................................... 34
  3.5 Health utilisation model ............................................................................... 37
     3.5.1 Econometric framework ...................................................................... 37
     3.5.2 Results .................................................................................................. 40
         3.5.2.1 Descriptive results ..................................................................... 40
         3.5.2.2 The effects of language difficulties on health utilisation: B cohort .......... 41
Chapter 4: Education ........................................................................................................... 87

4.1 Introduction.................................................................................................................. 87

4.2 Existing evidence ......................................................................................................... 89

4.2.1 Education policy in Australia .................................................................................. 89

4.2.1.1 Education provision .......................................................................................... 90

4.2.1.2 Policies relevant to children with developmental language disorder ......... 91

4.2.1.3 Other predictors of success ............................................................................. 93

4.2.2 Communication impairment research .................................................................... 94

4.3 Methods ....................................................................................................................... 95

4.3.1 Data and sample ....................................................................................................... 95

4.3.1.1 NAPLAN and My School ............................................................................... 95

4.3.1.2 Measures used to assess language ................................................................... 96

4.3.2 School academic achievement measure ............................................................... 97

4.3.2.1 School academic achievement coefficients ..................................................... 100

4.3.2.2 Interactions with time and lagged health ......................................................... 74

4.3.2.3 Missing observations ...................................................................................... 79

4.3.2.4 Attrition ....................................................................................................... 82

4.3.3 Summary of findings ............................................................................................... 85

4.4 Econometric framework ............................................................................................. 103

4.4.1 Modelling approach ............................................................................................... 103

4.4.2 Final equations ........................................................................................................ 105

4.4.2.1 Cognitive skills ............................................................................................... 105

4.4.2.2 Non-cognitive skills ....................................................................................... 106

4.4.2.3 Parents’ expectations for education ................................................................. 107

4.4.2.4 Child’s expectations for education ................................................................. 109

4.4.2.5 NAPLAN Attendance .................................................................................. 109

4.5 Results ......................................................................................................................... 110

4.5.1 Initial variance components ................................................................................. 110

4.5.2 Descriptive statistics ............................................................................................. 112

4.5.3 Literacy and numeracy results .............................................................................. 120
Chapter 6: Cost of Illness ................................................................. 211
6.1 Introduction .............................................................................. 211
6.2 Methods ................................................................................... 212
  6.2.1 Definition of the condition ..................................................... 213
  6.2.2 Epidemiological approach ...................................................... 213
  6.2.3 Perspective ........................................................................... 214
  6.2.4 Estimating resource consumption ........................................... 214
  6.2.5 Valuing indirect costs .............................................................. 215
6.3 Modelling framework ............................................................... 215
  6.3.1 Health utilisation costs associated with language difficulties .... 216
  6.3.2 Individual forgone income associated with uncorrected language
difficulties ................................................................................. 220
    6.3.2.1 Extrapolating cognitive skills to labour force outcomes ........ 221
    6.3.2.2 Systemic school academic achievement .............................. 226
  6.3.3 Maternal labour force penalties associated with language difficulties 228
6.4 Results: calculating societal results ........................................ 237
6.5 Subgroup analysis related to language definitions and school achievement. .....242
6.5.1 Persistence and timing of identification of language difficulties .................242
6.5.1.1 Subgroup analysis .................................................................................242
6.5.1.2 Threshold analysis ................................................................................247
6.6 Discussion ...........................................................................................................247
6.7 Conclusion ...........................................................................................................251

Chapter 7: Key Messages ..........................................................................................252
7.1 Healthcare policy ..............................................................................................252
7.2 Education policy ..............................................................................................253
7.3 School academic achievement ..........................................................................253
7.4 Cost of illness ...................................................................................................254
7.5 Early intervention .............................................................................................255
7.6 Non-cognitive skills ..........................................................................................255
7.7 Labour force policy ...........................................................................................256
7.8 Implications for the cost-effectiveness of effective intervention ......................257

Appendix A: Human Capability Framework ...........................................................259
Appendix B: Definitions of Common Communication Impairments .......................260
Appendix C: Publication ..........................................................................................261
Appendix D: Full Estimation Results – Health Expenditure ...................................272
Appendix E: Data- Chapter 4 ..................................................................................278
Appendix F: Prevalence Snapshot of Analytical Sample .........................................280
Appendix G: Variable Definitions ...........................................................................282
Appendix H: Approach to Multilevel Modelling ....................................................287
Appendix I: Educational Quasi-Markets ...............................................................301
Appendix J: Equation Specification .......................................................................303
Appendix K: Maternal Employment Participation in Australia – K Cohort ..............305
Appendix L: Data- Chapter 5 ..................................................................................313
Appendix M: Subgroup Analysis (NESB, Siblings, Household structure) ...............320
Appendix N: Threshold Analysis – Chapter 6 ........................................................323
Appendix O: (DRAFT unpublished publication) used for extrapolation .................325
Appendix P: Robustness check – Conditioning on mean WAI scores ....................339
References ............................................................................................................344
List of Figures

Figure 1: Prevalence of SLCN ........................................................................................................... 2
Figure 2: Household production and labour force participation of mothers with children with DLD ........................................................................................................... 6
Figure 3: Accumulation of human capital for children with DLD ............................................. 7
Figure 4: World Health Organization’s Model of the International Classification of Functioning, Disability and Health for Children and Youth ........................................... 12
Figure 5: Emotional and behavioural health (scores) ............................................................. 129
Figure 6: Parents’ expectations for education by language, school academic achievement and time (probability) ................................................................. 133
Figure 7: Parents’ expectations for education by language, school academic achievement and SEP (probability) ................................................................. 134
Figure 8: NAPLAN attendance by school academic achievement (probability) ................. 139
Figure 9: Labour force participation of mothers of children with DLD ................................ 148
Figure 10: Mothers’ accumulation of human capital .............................................................. 150
Figure 11: Societal costs per child per annum ..................................................................... 241
Figure 12: Societal costs per child per annum (early and late identification) .................... 243
Figure 13: Societal costs per child per annum (persistence) .................................................. 246
Figure 14: Ranking of literacy scores by individuals in schools ........................................... 291
Figure 15: Ranking of literacy scores by individuals in schools (by school type) ........... 291
Figure 16: Ranking of PSDQ scores by individuals in schools ............................................ 291
Figure 17: Ranking of PSDQ scores by individuals in schools (by school type) and by Socioeconomic position (SEP) ...................................................... 292
List of Tables

Table 1: Measures used to assess language difficulties .................................................. 23
Table 2: Language difficulties – Definition 1 .................................................................. 25
Table 3: Language difficulties persistence and timing – Definition 2 ............................. 26
Table 4: Proportion of children with language difficulties who are eligible for carers’ benefit (B and K cohorts) .............................................................................. 28
Table 5: Language difficulties – measures and approaches by chapter .......................... 29
Table 6: Prevalence of language difficulties – Australia 2004 ..................................... 31
Table 7: Summary statistics .......................................................................................... 36
Table 8: Cross-tabulation of health utilisation (MBS, PBS), child’s language and other measures by cohort (counts) ................................................................. 41
Table 15: Funding of medical, pharmaceutical and hospital services ............................. 55
Table 16: Calculation of total service fees and co-payments ........................................... 57
Table 17: Examples of calculation of total service fees .................................................... 58
Table 18: Cross-tabulation of health expenditure and out-of-pocket (total medical services + pharmaceuticals + hospital) against child’s language, by cohort ($) ........................................................................................................ 60
Table 40: Gains in literacy and numeracy between 6 to 7 years and 14 to 15 years
(school academic achievement effect) (Z-scores) ........................................ 126
Table 41: Parents’ and child’s expectations for education, 6 to 7 years to 14 to 15
years (probability) ........................................................................................................ 131
Table 42: Means of key variables by language difficulty and NAPLAN attendance
(percentage unless otherwise stated) ................................................................................ 137
Table 43: NAPLAN attendance – cross-sectional and nested results (probability) .......... 138
Table 44: Weighted and unweighted OLS (Z-scores) ................................................ 141
Table 45: Language difficulties persistence and timing – Definition 2 ...................... 154
Table 46: Baseline characteristics .............................................................................. 165
Table 47: Cross-tabulation of mothers’ labour supply and other conditions .......... 169
Table 48: Cross-tabulation of mothers’ labour supply and language difficulties .... 170
Table 49: Wages – B cohort (OLS) (log wages) ........................................................... 172
Table 50: Wages – B cohort (Heckman) (log wages) ................................................. 173
Table 51: Wages – B cohort (dynamic random effects) (log wages) ...................... 175
Table 52: Participation in work – B cohort (probability) .............................................. 178
Table 53: Participation in work – B cohort (Heckman) (probability) ......................... 180
Table 54: Participation in work – B cohort (dynamic random effects) (probability) .. 182
Table 55: Hours of work – B cohort ............................................................................. 184
Table 56: Hours of work – B cohort (Heckman [WAGEFIT]) ...................................... 186
Table 57: Hours of work – B cohort (dynamic random effects) ................................ 188
Table 58: Wages – K cohort (OLS) (log wages) ........................................................... 190
Table 59: Wages – K cohort (Heckman) (log wages) ................................................. 191
Table 60: Wages – K cohort (dynamic random effects)(log wages) ......................... 193
Table 61: Participation in work – K cohort (probability) ............................................. 195
Table 62: Participation in work – K cohort (Heckman) (probability) ......................... 197
Table 63: Participation in work – K cohort (dynamic random effects) (probability) ... 199
Table 64: Hours of work – K cohort ............................................................................. 201
Table 65: Hours of work – K cohort (Heckman [WAGEFIT]) ...................................... 203
Table 66: Hours of work – K cohort (dynamic random effects) ................................ 204
Table 67: Predicted biennial healthcare expenditure and out-of-pocket costs .............. 216
Table 68: Proportion of children with language difficulties who meet the eligibility
criteria for carers’ benefits (B and K cohorts) ............................................................ 217
Table 69: Calculation of biennial costs – B cohort ....................................................... 218
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABS</td>
<td>Australian Bureau of Statistics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACARA</td>
<td>Australian Curriculum, Assessment and Reporting Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADHD</td>
<td>Attention deficit hyperactivity disorder</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIC</td>
<td>Akaike information criterion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIFS</td>
<td>Australian Institute of Family Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AIHW</td>
<td>Australian Institute of Health and Welfare</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMA</td>
<td>Australian Medical Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASD</td>
<td>Autism spectrum disorder</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ATC</td>
<td>Anatomical Therapeutic Chemical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B cohort</td>
<td>Birth cohort – Longitudinal Study of Australian Children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDI</td>
<td>Communicative Development Inventory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHERE</td>
<td>Centre for Health Economics Research and Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CI</td>
<td>Confidence interval</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COI</td>
<td>Cost-of-illness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSBS</td>
<td>Communication and Symbolic Behavior Scales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSRI</td>
<td>Client Service Receipt Inventory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DLD</td>
<td>Developmental language disorder</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eq.</td>
<td>Equation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMSN</td>
<td>Extended Medicare Safety Net</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FE</td>
<td>Fixed effects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FTE</td>
<td>Full-time equivalent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GDP</td>
<td>Gross domestic product</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GLM</td>
<td>Generalised linear model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GP</td>
<td>General practitioner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICF</td>
<td>International Classification of Functioning, Disability and Health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICF-CY</td>
<td>International Classification of Functioning, Disability and Health for Children and Youth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICSEA</td>
<td>Index of Community Socio-Educational Advantage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>Instrumental variable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Definition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K cohort</td>
<td>Kindergarten cohort – Longitudinal Study of Australian Children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LFP</td>
<td>Labour force participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LR</td>
<td>Log-likelihood ratio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LSAC</td>
<td>Longitudinal Study of Australian Children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MBS</td>
<td>Medicare Benefits Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MLE</td>
<td>Maximum likelihood estimation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAPLAN</td>
<td>National Assessment Program of Literacy and Numeracy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NB</td>
<td>Negative binomial</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NESB</td>
<td>Non-English speaking background</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NDIS</td>
<td>National Disability Insurance Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OECD</td>
<td>Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OLS</td>
<td>Ordinary least squares</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OOP</td>
<td>Out-of-pocket</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PBS</td>
<td>Pharmaceutical Benefits Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEDS</td>
<td>Paediatric quality of life scores</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PIAC</td>
<td>Programme for the International Assessment of Adult Competencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPVT-III</td>
<td>Peabody Picture Vocabulary Test – Third Edition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSDQ</td>
<td>Parental Strengths and Difficulties Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RE</td>
<td>Random effects</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REML</td>
<td>Restricted Maximum likelihood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>Standard deviation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDQ</td>
<td>Strengths and Difficulties Questionnaire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SE</td>
<td>Standard error</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEP</td>
<td>Socioeconomic position</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SES</td>
<td>Socioeconomic status</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLCN</td>
<td>Speech language and communication needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UK</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>United States of America</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abstract

This thesis examines the economic impact of childhood developmental language disorder (DLD) on individuals, families and society, using a national Australian panel data set of 10,000 children—the Longitudinal Study of Australian Children (LSAC).

The thesis comprises four studies. The first study investigates healthcare consumption decisions of families with a child with DLD. This study demonstrates a consistent positive relationship between a child’s language difficulties and their increased medical services utilisation and expenditure. These children seek more general practitioner services, and this is observed in conjunction with higher referral rates to paediatricians, speech pathologists and other specialists. Healthcare utilisation makes up a relatively small portion of the overall costs of language difficulties. However, language difficulties are likely to place an increasingly larger burden on the health and welfare system as these children move through school and after they leave school.

The second study examines the effects of DLD on future human capital and economic success. The results provide strong evidence of the impact of language difficulties on future earning potential, as a result of low levels of literacy and numeracy. This effect is greater than the effect socioeconomic disadvantage alone. Although many of these children are behind when they start school, there is some evidence that a school of high academic achievement mitigates the effects of this impairment on academic achievement. The results also demonstrate that early identification and intervention exerts a positive effect on cognitive and non-cognitive skills.

In the third study, the labour force decisions of families with a child with DLD are explored by measuring the indirect costs associated with reduced maternal labour force participation. This study highlights that the impact of language difficulties on labour force participation is considerable and represents the largest proportion of overall costs. The results show that carers of children with language difficulties substitute paid for unpaid work by working fewer hours. When their child’s condition is severe or persistent, mothers are less likely to be employed, and when the child is older, mothers receive a wage rate premium to remain in the workforce. For these carers, the
substitution, respite and income effect are equally important.

The final study uses estimates from the three preceding studies to calculate the societal costs of DLD in Australia. The total cost to society of language difficulties is estimated to be between $1.362 billion per year and $3.308 billion per year (based on a prevalence range 7 to 17 per cent). The annual cost per child with language difficulties is estimated to be $4,353. Productivity losses account for the largest proportion of this cost, with 42% attributable to productivity losses of the child’s mother, 30% attributable to productivity losses of the child and 28% attributable to costs borne by the health and welfare system.

While the individual costs associated with DLD are not as high as other childhood conditions such as autism spectrum disorder (ASD) and attention deficit hyperactivity disorder, its high prevalence and broad impact has made DLD an important public health concern. The total cost to society of language difficulties could be similar to the cost of asthma ($3.6 billion per year)\(^1\) and ASD ($5.5 billion per year).

The costs associated with DLD have important implications for intervention of language disorders. This study provides decision makers with a picture of the global burden of DLD and more importantly, of the major cost components and the areas where cost containment policies would have the greatest impact and should therefore be prioritised. These estimates can be used to inform cost-effectiveness models of effective interventions for children with DLD.