

**Difficult Knowledge and Uncomfortable Pedagogies:
student perceptions and experiences of teaching and
learning in Critical Indigenous Australian Studies**

Marcelle Townsend-Cross
(BA, SCU; MEd, UTS)

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences
University of Technology Sydney

2018

Certificate of Original Authorship

I, Marcelle Townsend-Cross declare that this thesis is submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy in the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences at the University of Technology Sydney. This thesis is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis. This document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

Signature:

Production Note:
Signature removed prior to publication.

Date: 26th February 2018

Acknowledgements

I owe my gratitude to the teachers and students who generously agreed to participate in my research. Their courageous and candid contributions provided rich and compelling insights that positively shaped my research in immeasurable ways. I am very grateful to Dr. Rick Flowers who expertly guided me through the research process with enthusiasm, mindfulness and patience. I am so very grateful and privileged to have been a recipient of the Jumbunna Postgraduate Research Scholarship.

Many people have inspired and encouraged me throughout my candidature – family, friends and colleagues - and I am humbled by your consistent and persistent belief in me, especially during the times when I didn't particularly believe in myself, thank you. Most importantly, I am eternally grateful for the unconditional love, support and encouragement of my husband Chris and the amazing humans who call us Mum and Dad, Nan and Pop and Aunty and Uncle. You, my family, have always been, and will always be, my inspiration.

Dedication

This research is dedicated to the First Australian women and men who have, through their wisdom and acumen since the imposition of colonisation, blazed the scholarly trail that I now humbly tread.

In particular, I dedicate my work to the late Japanangka errol West, an intellectual giant whose leadership, mentorship, love and friendship I was so privileged to experience in my early teaching career and without which I would not have had the confidence to undertake this research project.

Table of Contents

Certificate of Original Authorship.....	iii
Acknowledgements.....	iv
Dedication	v
List of Tables.....	ix
List of Diagrams.....	ix
Abstract.....	x
Chapter 1 Prologue.....	1
Positionality: locating myself in the research	2
Rationale: justifying the research	4
Problematic: research goals and objectives	6
Context: the research site.....	7
Overview: the thesis	7
Section 1: Disciplinary, Theoretical and Epistemological Foundations	7
Section 2: Emergent Themes.....	9
Analytical Synthesis: concluding chapter	10
Appendices.....	11
Terminology.....	11
SECTION 1 DISCIPLINARY, THEORETICAL AND EPISTEMOLOGICAL FOUNDATIONS.....	14
Chapter 2 Teaching Indigenous Australian Studies in Higher Education: a critical appraisal	15
Historical Evolution	15
Contemporary Contexts: the prevalence of liberal approaches	17
Critical Indigenous Australian Studies	21
The Subjects: theoretical and pedagogical framework.....	22
Difficult Knowledge and Uncomfortable Pedagogies.....	26
Chapter 3 Framing Colonialism: anticolonialism and postcolonialism.....	31
Anticolonialism.....	32
The Field of the Postcolonial.....	35
A Guiding Anticolonial Framework.....	42
Critical Anticolonialism.....	43
Chapter 4 Teaching about Racism and Whiteness: antiracism, critical race and whiteness.....	48
The Study of Racism and Whiteness.....	49
Liberal Antiracism	52
Critical Race Theory.....	54
Critical Whiteness Studies	57
Invisibility.....	62
Re-centring whiteness.....	63
Chapter 5 Teaching about Privilege: white privilege and intersectionality	69
The Study of White Privilege	70
The White Privilege Knapsack	72
Knapsack pedagogy	73
Knapsack risks.....	75
Intersectional Privilege Pedagogy.....	83
Scaffolding privilege.....	86
Chapter 6 Ontological and Epistemological perspectives	91
Critical Social Constructionism	92
Poststructural Insights	94
The humanist self.....	96
The socio-cultural subject	97

The structural subject	98
The poststructural subject	99
Critical Hermeneutics	104
Chapter 7 Methodological Approach	107
Critical Ethnography.....	107
Research Context	108
The Subjects: 'Equity & Indigenous Australian Peoples'	109
Research participants	113
Research Methods	113
Interviews.....	114
Classroom observations	115
Student focus groups	116
The Analytic Process	117
Presentation of data	119
Ethical Considerations.....	120
SECTION 2 EMERGENT THEMES	124
Part 1 Teaching and Learning in Theory and Practice: the teacher perspective	125
Chapter 8 Anticolonial Pedagogy.....	125
The Teaching Team.....	126
Team Teaching.....	128
Perceptions of the teachers.....	130
Anticolonial Approaches.....	133
Anticolonial Teaching and Learning Strategies	136
Acknowledgement of Country	136
Teaching and Learning Outcomes: the teachers' perceptions	140
Chapter 9 Affective Learning and Compassionate pedagogy	146
Affective Learning.....	147
Affective pedagogy.....	148
Compassionate Pedagogy.....	156
Wrestling with the 'slap down'	157
Student support	158
Chapter 10 - Safe Learning Environments: focus on evidence, outcomes and systems	164
Safe Learning Environments?.....	165
Silence and Reluctance	168
Anonymity.....	170
Focus on Evidence, Outcomes and Systems: 'I'm entitled to my opinion!'	178
Part 2 Subjective Perceptions: the student experience	185
Chapter 11 Learning about Colonialism: First Australian content	185
Student Research Participants	186
Prior Learning	189
Perceptions about Teaching.....	191
Perceptions about Learning	195
Silence and Reluctance	205
Anxiety	205
Emotional distress	209
Discourses of Domination	213
Cultural deficit discourse: pathologisation	214
Cultural appropriation discourse: fetishisation.....	217
Chapter 12 Learning about Race, Racism and Antiracism	224
Conceptualising Race	225
Conceptualising Racism	228

Defending Racism: discourses of domination	231
Conceptualising Antiracism.....	239
Chapter 13 Learning about Whiteness and Privilege	247
New and Confronting Learning Experiences	248
Racialising Whiteness	249
Don't call <i>me</i> white!	250
I'm <i>not</i> white, I'm brown!.....	252
I can't <i>help</i> being white!.....	253
Excavating Privilege.....	258
I really <i>am</i> privileged.....	262
Privilege defines <i>who</i> I am.....	264
I'm not as privileged as I <i>should</i> be.....	265
Valuable Lessons	267
I'll remember how I <i>felt</i>	268
ANALYTICAL SYNTHESIS	272
Chapter 14 Teaching and Learning at the affective intersection.....	272
Engaging Subjective Identities	274
Uncomfortable Pedagogies and Difficult Knowledge.....	275
The Affective Intersection.....	276
Managing Affectivity.....	279
Compassionate Pedagogy.....	282
Compassionate anonymity.....	286
Compassionate scaffolding.....	288
Translating Learning into Practice.....	294
Discursive practice	295
Mobilising knowledge for practice	296
Epilogue.....	298
Appendix 1	300
Syllabus Synopses: topics, themes and teaching and learning materials.....	300
Topic 1 - Welcome and Introduction	300
Topic 2 - Diversity: peoples, places & contexts.	303
Topic 3 - The Facts: colonisation, dispossession & resistance.	307
Topic 4 - Equity: the struggle for human rights.....	309
Topic 5 - Privilege: race, racism and whiteness.....	313
Topic 6 - Ideology: racism, assimilation/ism & neoliberalism	320
Topic 7 - Professional Practice Context: media, policy & legislature.....	325
Topic 8 - Professional Practice Frameworks: critical approaches to practice.....	329
Topics 9, 10 & 11 - Sites of Professional Practice.....	331
Appendix 2	334
Assessment Details.....	334
Undergraduate assessments	334
Postgraduate assessments	335
References.....	340

List of Tables

Chapter 5

Table 1	McIntosh's white privilege audit	p. 73
Table 2	Knapsack facilitator notes	p. 74

Chapter 7

Table 3	The Subjects: description, aims and objectives	p. 110
Table 4	The Subjects: assessment	p. 111
Table 5	Enrolments across Subjects and mode	p. 111
Table 6	Syllabus topics	p. 112
Table 7	Staff distribution of responsibilities	p. 113
Table 8	Fieldwork schedule	p. 114

Chapter 10

Table 9	Anonymous poll questions and results	p. 171
Table 10	Systems of domination: evidence and sites of resistance	p. 183

Chapter 11

Table 11	Student participant details	p. 187
Table 12	Interview and focus group schedule	p. 188

Chapter 14

Table 13	Pedagogy for the Privileged scaffolding sequence	p. 293
----------	--	--------

List of Diagrams

Chapter 2

Diagram 1	Subjective identity and social structure	p. 28
-----------	--	-------

Chapter 7

Diagram 2	Analytic process	p. 118
Diagram 3	Research design	p. 123

Chapter 14

Diagram 4	Subjective Affectivity Spectrum	p. 277
-----------	---------------------------------	--------

Abstract

This research presents a grounded interrogation of students' perceptions and experiences of teaching and learning in two mandatory stand-alone Critical Indigenous Australian Studies subjects at an Australian university. The study proffers rare empirical insight into the student experience of teaching and learning about colonialism, racism, whiteness and privilege. It contributes to building a better understanding of the complexities, opportunities, challenges and risks of four specific pedagogical approaches: critical anticolonialism, critical race theory, critical whiteness and intersectional privilege studies. The research was conducted by way of a critical ethnographic process involving in-depth interviews with students and teachers, focus group discussions with students and classroom observations. The research design was built on critical social constructionist foundations informed by poststructural and critical hermeneutical theoretical perspectives.

The study produced two key findings. The first is that learning in Critical Indigenous Australian Studies is inherently affective. Affectivity plays a determinant role in the opportunities, challenges and risks of teaching about colonialism, racism, whiteness and privilege. This finding signposts the need to take into serious consideration the emotionally onerous task of teaching and learning in Critical Indigenous Australian Studies and the need for compassionate pedagogical approaches and strategies that can productively navigate and manage affectivity. The second key finding is that if Critical Indigenous Australian Studies is to inspire and motivate students to act for social justice and social change, teaching and learning must focus equally on both the 'know-what' and the 'know-how'. Knowing what the urgent matters are without the cultivation of practical skills to engage in social change action falls short of meeting teaching and learning objectives. A dedicated and substantive focus on cultivating practical social change skills such as discursive counter-narrative skills is a pedagogical pathway toward empowering, inspiring and motivating students to act for social change.