Adult Basic Education in NSW 1970–2018: Official stories and stories from practice

Pamela Osmond

Master of Education (Research) Thesis
University of Technology Sydney
Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences

2018

CERTIFICATE OF ORIGINAL AUTHORSHIP

I, Pamela Osmond declare that this thesis, is submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Master of Education, in the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences at the University of Technology Sydney.

This thesis is wholly my own work unless otherwise reference or acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

This document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

Signature:

Production Note:

Signature removed prior to publication.

Date: 1/8/18

Acknowledgements

For a number of years in the 1980s and early 1990s, the field of adult basic education that had been created in Australia had earned a reputation as a global leader. This study was undertaken partly to document and honour that era of provision in NSW in particular, and to suggest some ways in which present practitioners might attempt to regain something of that earlier reputation.

No thesis is the product of one person alone and this one in particular is a distillation of the ideas of many people over many years. I acknowledge therefore the influence of my colleagues in the vibrant adult basic education community of practice that we shared. The sharing of professional practice knowledge that was integral to that community of practice has helped to shape my views, so that the ideas herein represent, in a very real sense, a coproduction. I acknowledge particularly the many professional conversations with friends and colleagues during the writing of this thesis that have informed and helped further distil my thinking as the writing progressed.

In particular, I thank the interview participants, not only for the time that they freely gave in otherwise busy lives, but for the insightful reflections on their 'stories from practice'; reflections that have given life to the narrative of the thesis. I regret that I could not have used more of these verbatim comments to do justice to their thoughtful contributions. They are indeed co-constructors of the narrative.

I am indebted to the staff of UTS for helping to shape the development of the thesis: to Dr Ross Forman for his meticulous reading of and invaluable feedback on early drafts, to Drs Nick Hopwood and Ros Appleby for guidance in the design of the study, and to Drs Marie Quinn and Ros Appleby for feedback on the later draft. My thanks also to Dr Stephen Black for his invaluable feedback.

My particular thanks are due to Dr Keiko Yasukawa, my principal supervisor for her encouragement and continued interest in the project, for her generosity with her time and for sharing with me her vast knowledge of the field. I am grateful for her guidance and for her insightful feedback on my many drafts of the thesis. I was indeed fortunate in having her support and I will miss our discussions.

Thanks are due to my family also, for their sustained support, enthusiasm and encouragement in this supposedly un-grandmotherly venture; support that included many helpful scholarly conversations over cups of tea.

Table of Contents

| Certificate of Original Authorship | |
|---|----|
| Abstract | |
| Acronyms and Abbreviations | xi |
| SECTION 1 – BACKGROUND TO THE STUDY | 1 |
| Chapter 1 - Introducing the Study | 2 |
| Background | 2 |
| Rationale | 4 |
| Framing the research question | 6 |
| Terminology | 7 |
| What is literacy? | 7 |
| A historically situated term | 9 |
| The 'field' | 10 |
| Who are the students? | 11 |
| Is there still a need? | 12 |
| Boundaries of the study | 14 |
| Methodology | 14 |
| My professional identity | 15 |
| Overall structure of the thesis | 17 |
| Chapter 2 - The Theoretical Framework — A Literature Review | 20 |
| Actor Network Theory | 21 |
| Discourse theory | 23 |
| The policy discourse | 24 |
| Discourses surrounding 'literacy' | 25 |
| What is literacy? | 25 |
| The cognitive or autonomous view | 26 |
| The ideological view | 26 |
| Functional literacy | 27 |
| The social practice view | 29 |
| The value of literacy | 32 |

| Professional Practice Knowledge | 32 |
|---|--|
| G | 39 |
| Chapter 3 - Methodology | 43 |
| Rationale for choice of methodology | |
| The emic researcher and the interviewer effect | |
| Data Collection | |
| a) Documentary and artefact analysis | |
| b) Semi structured interviews with selected practitioners | |
| Selection of interviewees | |
| The interviews | |
| Data analysis | |
| Transcription | 51 |
| Coding procedures | 51 |
| Constructivist approach – emerging codes | 53 |
| Quality Criteria | 54 |
| Conclusion | 57 |
| | |
| CECTION 2 OFFICIAL CTORIES AND STORIES FROM RRACTIOS | |
| SECTION 2 - OFFICIAL STORIES AND STORIES FROM PRACTICE | 58 |
| | |
| Chapter 4 - The Early Years: Before 1975Socio-political background | 59 |
| Chapter 4 - The Early Years: Before 1975 | 59 60 |
| Chapter 4 - The Early Years: Before 1975 Socio-political background | 59 60 |
| Chapter 4 - The Early Years: Before 1975 Socio-political background The international scene | 59 60 60 |
| Chapter 4 - The Early Years: Before 1975 Socio-political background The international scene UNESCO | 59 60 60 60 |
| Chapter 4 - The Early Years: Before 1975 Socio-political background The international scene UNESCO Social justice | 59 60 60 60 62 |
| Chapter 4 - The Early Years: Before 1975 Socio-political background The international scene UNESCO Social justice Human capital | 59 60 60 62 63 |
| Chapter 4 - The Early Years: Before 1975 Socio-political background The international scene UNESCO Social justice Human capital Emergence of adult literacy provision in UK | 59 60 60 62 63 64 |
| Chapter 4 - The Early Years: Before 1975 Socio-political background The international scene UNESCO Social justice Human capital Emergence of adult literacy provision in UK The Australian socio- economic context | 59 60 60 62 63 64 66 |
| Chapter 4 - The Early Years: Before 1975 Socio-political background The international scene UNESCO Social justice Human capital Emergence of adult literacy provision in UK The Australian socio- economic context Australian developments – 'a jigsaw from which many of the pieces are missing' | 59 60 60 62 63 64 66 |
| Chapter 4 - The Early Years: Before 1975 Socio-political background The international scene UNESCO Social justice Human capital Emergence of adult literacy provision in UK The Australian socio- economic context Australian developments – 'a jigsaw from which many of the pieces are missing' Australian Army WII program | 59606062636466 |
| Socio-political background The international scene UNESCO | 5960606263646666 |
| Socio-political background The international scene UNESCO | 596060626364666668 |
| Chapter 4 - The Early Years: Before 1975 Socio-political background The international scene UNESCO Social justice Human capital Emergence of adult literacy provision in UK The Australian socio- economic context Australian developments – 'a jigsaw from which many of the pieces are missing' Australian Army WII program 'No illiteracy in Australia' Election of the Whitlam Government The emergence of the Vocational Education and Training sector | 596060626364666666 |

| The beginnings of a public profile | 72 |
|--|-----|
| Paulo Freire | 74 |
| Early development of the field in NSW | 74 |
| Operation Literacy | 74 |
| Discussion and Conclusion | 76 |
| Student-centred learning | 76 |
| The human capital view | 77 |
| The social context view | 77 |
| The discourse of deficit and the autonomous view | 78 |
| Functional literacy | 78 |
| Chapter 5 - From the late 1970s to late 1980s | 79 |
| Introduction | 79 |
| The International Scene | 79 |
| Adult literacy provision in the UK | 80 |
| Australian National developments | 81 |
| The emergence of advocacy groups | 81 |
| Commonwealth Government involvement | 83 |
| State responses | 84 |
| Development of the field in NSW | 85 |
| Collaboration between statutory bodies | 85 |
| Board of Adult Education | 85 |
| Adult Migrant English Service | 86 |
| TAFE NSW | 86 |
| The TAFE NSW Adult Basic Education Program | 86 |
| The Volunteer tutor program | 89 |
| Class-based tuition | 91 |
| The emergence of tensions | 92 |
| Numeracy | 95 |
| An accredited curriculum | 96 |
| Adult Literacy Information Office | 98 |
| The Community of Practice | 100 |
| Formal tertiary studies | 102 |
| Collaboration | 103 |
| Professional Development | 104 |

| Journals, newsletters and books | 105 |
|--|-----|
| Searching for Saliences | 106 |
| Agency | 107 |
| Underpinning principles | 108 |
| Student-centred | 109 |
| Self-direction | 110 |
| Personal Growth | 111 |
| Participation | 112 |
| Emancipation | 113 |
| Social Capital | 115 |
| Pedagogy | 116 |
| Discussion and Conclusion | 121 |
| Chapter 6 - From the late 1980s to 2000 | 123 |
| Introduction | 123 |
| The socio-political background | 124 |
| The international scene | 124 |
| The Human Capital Ideology and the OECD | 125 |
| Australian National Developments | 128 |
| Microeconomic reform and LLN | 128 |
| The changed nature of government | 130 |
| VET in Australia | 131 |
| Influence of industry | 132 |
| The National Training Reform Agenda (NTRA) | 133 |
| Adult Basic Education in Australia | 135 |
| Australia's 'Literacy Decade' | 137 |
| National Policy on Languages | 137 |
| International Literacy Year (ILY) | 140 |
| Australian Language and Literacy Policy | 142 |
| Jobseekers | 143 |
| Practitioner response to the advent of Jobseeker programs | 144 |
| Workplace | 144 |
| Practitioner response to the advent of workplace literacy and numeracy | 145 |
| Assessment frameworks | 147 |
| Practitioner response to assessment frameworks and reporting systems | 152 |

| NSW Curricula in CBT | 153 |
|---|-----|
| Numeracy | 156 |
| Integration | 158 |
| Literacy/numeracy and VET training | 159 |
| Pedagogy | 160 |
| Systemic Functional Linguistics | 161 |
| Critical Literacy | 162 |
| The Community of Practice | 165 |
| Adult Literacy Information Office (ALIO) | 167 |
| Discussion and Conclusion | 168 |
| Chapter 7 - The New Mullennium | 170 |
| Introduction | 171 |
| International Developments and the OECD | 174 |
| Adult Basic Education in Australia | 177 |
| The ANTA Era | 177 |
| Jobseeker programs | 180 |
| Outsourced foundation skills products | 183 |
| National Foundation Skills Strategy | 185 |
| The Foundation Skills Professional Standards Framework (FSPSF) | 187 |
| NSW's response to national developments | 187 |
| Smart and Skilled | 188 |
| Alternative provision | 190 |
| Community of Practice | 192 |
| The professional discourse | 197 |
| Human capital / social justice | 197 |
| Social capital | 201 |
| Discussion and conclusion | 203 |
| SECTION 3 - CONCLUSION AND IMPLICATIONS | 204 |
| Chapter 8 - Conclusions | 205 |
| Introduction | 206 |
| Revisiting the research questions | 207 |
| The influence of changing socio-political contexts on public policies | 207 |

| Influence of non-human entities | 207 |
|---|-----|
| Transnational influences | 208 |
| Influences on key policy 'moments' | 208 |
| The new assemblage of actors | 209 |
| A new category of actors | 210 |
| The relationship between the professional, and the public and policy discourses . | 211 |
| The emergence of tensions | 211 |
| To what extent have teachers' reports of their pedagogy reflected the rhetoric of professional discourse and the dictates of public and institutional policies? | |
| The rhetoric of the professional discourse | 216 |
| Public and institutional policies | 217 |
| Implications of the study | 218 |
| The role for practitioners | 218 |
| The importance of communities of practice | 219 |
| 'What am I fighting for?' | 220 |
| Re-invigoration of a research base | 220 |
| Re-imagine what the field might look like | 221 |
| Develop associations with other social justice and progressive movements | 221 |
| Contribution to scholarship | 222 |
| Limitations of the study and a suggestion for further scholarship | 223 |
| Concluding remarks | 224 |
| Appendices | 224 |
| References | 227 |

Abstract

This thesis traces the development of adult literacy provision in NSW over its 40 year history, with particular focus on the discursive tensions between policy and practice. A major and overriding theme has been the move away from a philosophy of humanist education and a socio-cultural view of literacy, towards an economically driven, human capital view of literacy.

The study analyses the changing socio-economic background to the development of the field of adult literacy (later called adult basic education) and the ways in which resulting public and policy discourses have impacted the field. In the foundation years, the public discourse of liberal humanism was reflected in the professional discourse. From the early 1990s however, a tension began to emerge as the public and policy discourse moved increasingly towards an instrumentalist, human capital view.

The study illuminates the increasing discursive tensions between policy and practice and between the public and professional discourses that have sought to shape the field. Discourse theory, with its focus on power relations, as developed for example by Foucault (1972), and elaborated by Gee (2015) and Fairclough (2015), informs the analysis of the ways in which these discursive struggles have defined and redefined the field over the period discussed.

Building on this understanding of discourse, the main conceptual resource employed is that of Actor Network Theory (ANT) (Callon 1986; Latour 2005). It is chosen as a useful lens through which to view the multiplicity of 'actors' both human and non-human, that have interacted in a non-linear and fluid fashion to influence the direction of the field. The study uses a number of the concepts described by ANT theorists to illuminate the ways in which some assemblages of actors came to exert power and advance a dominant discourse of literacy, whilst the influence of others declined.

A number of past and present practitioners were interviewed in order to capture the teachers' voices or 'stories from practice', thus informing and giving life to our understanding of the development of the field. Analysis of documentary and archival evidence provides a further perspective on the 'official stories'.

The primary rationale for the study was a wish to commit the narrative to the public memory in order assist present and future practitioners to contextualise their practice. The study concludes with a consideration of some possible implications that it offers to practitioners and activists in their challenge to the present discourse surrounding the field.

Acronyms and Abbreviations

AAAE Australian Association for Adult Education

ABE Adult Basic Education

ACAL Australian Council for Adult Literacy

ACE Adult Community Education

ACOTAFE Australian Committee on Technical and Further Education

ACTU Australian Council of Trade Unions

ACSF Australian Core Skills Framework

ALAC Adult Literacy Action Campaign

ALAN Adult Literacy and Numeracy Competency Scales

ALIO Adult Literacy Information Office

ALLP Australian Language & Literacy Policy

ALLS International Adult Literacy and Life Skills Survey

ALT Adult Literacy Teaching

AMES Adult Migrant Education Service

ANT Adult Numeracy Teaching

ANT Actor Network Theory

ANTA Australian National Training Authority

BAE Board of Adult Education

CABE Certificate in Adult Basic Education

CAFE Certificate in Adult Foundation Education

CBT Competency Based Training

CES Commonwealth Employment Service

CSO Community Service Obligation

CSWE Certificate in Spoken and Written English

DEET Department of Employment, Education & Training

DEETYA Department of Employment, Education, Training and Youth Affairs

DEST Department of Education, Science and Training

DET Department of Education and Training

EAL/D English as an Additional Language or Dialect

ESOL English for Speakers of Other Languages

FSAT Foundation Skills Assessment Tool

FSK Foundation Skills Training Package

FSPSF Foundation Skills Professional Standards Framework

IALS International Adult Literacy Survey

IBSA Innovation and Business Skills Australia

ILO International Labour Organisation

ILY International Literacy Year

ISC Industry Skills Council

ITAB Industry Training Advisory Board

LANT Literacy and Numeracy Training Program

LLN Language, Literacy & Numeracy

LN Literacy & Numeracy

NCVER National Centre for Vocational Education Research

NFSS National Foundation Skills Strategy

NLS New Literacy Studies

NSWALC

NPL National Policy on Languages

NRS National Reporting System

NSWALNC NSW Adult Literacy & Numeracy Council

NSW Adult Literacy Council

NTRA National Training Reform Agenda

OECD Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development

PIAAC Programme for the International Assessment of Adult Competencies

RAWFA Reading and Writing for Adults

RTO Registered Training Authority

SCOTESE Standing Council on Tertiary Education, Skills and Employment

SEE Skills for Education & Employment Program

SIP Special Intervention Program

TAE Training and Education Training Package

TAFE Technical and Further Education

TESOL Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation

UTS University of Technology Sydney

VALBEC Victorian Adult Literacy & Basic Education Council

VET Vocational Education & Training

WELL Workplace English Language and Literacy