

Examining the social construction of childbirth in Australia: The politics of power

Rebecca Coddington

3rd November 2011

Supervised by:

Professor Jennifer Fenwick

Professor Caroline Homer

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
Degree of Bachelor of Midwifery (Honours) at the University of Technology, Sydney

CERTIFICATE OF AUTHENTICITY

I hereby certify that this thesis has not already been submitted for any degree and is not being submitted as part of a candidature for any other degree.

I also certify that this thesis has been written by me and that any help I have received in preparing this thesis, and all its sources used, have been acknowledged.

Signature of Candidate

Date

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF COUNTRY

I would like to acknowledge the traditional custodians of the Sydney region on which the University of Technology, Sydney stands – the people of the Eora nation. The Eora people are the traditional owners of this land and are part of the oldest surviving continuous culture in the world. I pay my respects to the spirits of the Eora people. I honour the ongoing cultural and spiritual connections to this country and endeavour to act with respect for the cultural heritage, customs and beliefs of all Indigenous people.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to begin by acknowledging the role played by my family in enabling me to undertake this Honours thesis. My beloved husband Ben has spent many patient hours proof-reading draft chapters, entertaining and caring for our son, and enduring my endless rants about all nature of things women, birth, and what's wrong with *the system*. Ben, you have been such a wonderful, loyal supporter and a tirelessly generous provider. Thankyou for sharing this journey with me.

I must also give thanks to our gorgeous son Charlie, who has spent many hours entertaining himself, allowing me to sneak away to work at my desk until he would eventually come and take me by the hand saying "Mumma, I want you to hop up off that work chair". Thankyou, my darling, for helping me keep it all in perspective and remember to have fun.

Thankyou to my amazing and inspirational parents Julia and Dave Herman who raised me up to be the strong, warm and soft woman that I am and have provided financial and practical assistance to me wherever possible. Thanks also to my gorgeous brother, Daniel, who always offers me such kind words of wisdom and encouragement. I love you all dearly.

Last but not least, deepest gratitude goes to my wonderful supervisors, Jenny Fenwick and Caroline Homer, whose guidance on this journey has been absolutely superb. You have provided me with just the right amount of support; allowing me to truly make this project my own, yet always delivering assistance and encouragement when I needed it. Jen, you have offered me many sage words in moments of doubt and I am so grateful to you for your continuing support and friendship.

Rebecca Coddington

I would also like to acknowledge Rachel Smith who encouraged me to go on the Honours journey in the first place and has been a wonderful mentor to me over the years.

I dedicate this work to all the childbearing women I have ever encountered, those who I am yet to meet, and to all the care providers who are working tirelessly to serve them. May we live and work with grace and with our eyes open.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS	V
LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES	VIII
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	IX
GLOSSARY OF TERMS	X
ABSTRACT	XII
CHAPTER ONE - INTRODUCTION	1
PERSONAL UNDERSTANDINGS AND EXPERIENCES	1
AIMS AND OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY	3
CONTEXT: MATERNITY SERVICES IN AUSTRALIA	4
<i>Overview</i>	5
<i>Australian healthcare system</i>	5
<i>Maternity care providers</i>	6
<i>Models of care</i>	8
<i>Birth outcomes</i>	10
BACKGROUND TO THE NATIONAL MATERNITY SERVICES REVIEW	11
THESIS OVERVIEW	13
CONCLUSION	14
CHAPTER TWO - LITERATURE REVIEW	16
INTRODUCTION	16
THE CONSTRUCTION OF CHILDBIRTH	17
HISTORICAL OVERVIEW	18
THE TECHNOCRATIC PARADIGM	22
<i>Technocratic management of birth</i>	24
<i>Technocracy and the mind-body split</i>	28
<i>Risk and control in the technocratic paradigm</i>	30
THE HUMANISTIC PARADIGM	32
<i>Humanism and the mind-body connection</i>	33
<i>The importance of relationships in the humanistic paradigm</i>	35
<i>The importance of women's experience of birth in the humanistic paradigm</i>	37

AUSTRALIAN MATERNITY CARE: A MIXTURE OF BOTH	39
CONCLUSION	42
CHAPTER THREE - METHODS	44
INTRODUCTION	44
METHODOLOGICAL UNDERPINNING	45
<i>Language and maternity care</i>	46
<i>Discourse analysis</i>	48
<i>Introduction to Foucault's theories</i>	49
<i>Foucault's power perspective</i>	51
<i>Critical social theory</i>	53
<i>Feminism</i>	53
<i>Poststructuralism</i>	54
DATA COLLECTION	55
<i>The MSR community consultation process</i>	56
<i>Peak professional bodies and consumer groups</i>	57
DATA ANALYSIS	63
<i>The process of data analysis</i>	64
ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS	66
CONCLUSION	67
CHAPTER FOUR – FINDINGS	68
THE MAINTENANCE AND RESISTANCE OF POWER AND CONTROL	68
INTRODUCTION	68
THE MAINTENANCE AND RESISTANCE OF POWER AND CONTROL	70
MATERNITY SERVICE REFORM: UNNECESSARY OR URGENT?	71
<i>Upholding the status quo</i>	71
<i>Challenging the status quo</i>	77
THE REFORM AGENDA: A WAY FORWARD FOR WHOM?	80
<i>Opportunities for expanded control</i>	80
<i>Opportunities for change: a new vision for the future of maternity care</i>	83
THE POWERFUL DISCOURSES OF RISK AND SAFETY	85
<i>Birth as a medical event: the rhetoric of risk and safety</i>	85
<i>Birth as a normal life event: both significant and safe</i>	88

CONCLUSION	91
CHAPTER FIVE – DISCUSSION	93
THE POLITICS OF POWER	93
INTRODUCTION	93
THE CONSTRUCTION OF CHILDBIRTH: A CLASH OF IDEOLOGIES	97
<i>Turf wars</i>	99
<i>Collaboration</i>	103
<i>Feminist perspectives of maternity care</i>	106
LIMITATIONS	108
THE WAY FORWARD: RECOMMENDATIONS FOR EDUCATION, PRACTICE AND RESEARCH	109
CONCLUSION	113
REFERENCES	116
APPENDIX 1	125
OUTLINE OF PEAK PROFESSIONAL BODIES AND CONSUMER ORGANISATIONS	125
<i>Australian and New Zealand College of Anaesthetists</i>	125
<i>Australian College of Midwives</i>	125
<i>Australian Medical Association</i>	126
<i>Australian Nursing Federation</i>	126
<i>Australian Society of Independent Midwives</i>	126
<i>Homebirth Australia</i>	127
<i>Maternity Coalition</i>	127
<i>Royal Australian and New Zealand College of Obstetricians and Gynaecologists</i>	127
<i>Royal Australian College of General Practitioners</i>	128
<i>Royal College of Nursing Australia</i>	128
<i>Rural Doctors Association of Australia</i>	129

LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

Table 1: How text was highlighted in the AMA submission to the MSR_____63

Table 2: Analysis overview of the ANF submission to the MSR_____64

Table 3: An excerpt from the ACM submission placed in the theme 'challenging the status quo' _____64

Figure 1: The hierarchy of power in the technocratic paradigm of childbirth_____68

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACM - Australian College of Midwives

AIHW - Australian Institute of Health and Welfare

AMA - Australian Medical Association

ANF - Australian Nursing Federation

ANMC - Australian Nursing and Midwifery Council

ANZCA - Australian and New Zealand College of Anaesthetists

ASIM - Australian Society of Independent Midwives

AYF- Australian Youth Forum

DHA - Department of Health and Ageing

EFM - Electronic Fetal Monitoring

GP - General Practitioner

HA - Homebirth Australia

ICM - International Confederation of Midwives

MC - Maternity Coalition

MSR - Maternity Services Review

NHMRC - National Health and Medical Research Council

OECD – Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development

RACGP - Royal Australian College of General Practitioners

RANZCOG - Royal Australian and New Zealand College of Obstetricians and Gynaecologists

RCNA - Royal College of Nursing Australia

RDAA - Rural Doctors Association of Australia

GLOSSARY OF TERMS

Artificial Rupture of Membranes (ARM): An intervention performed by a midwife or obstetrician which involves the intentional breaking of the membranes surrounding the fetus, releasing the amniotic fluid in order to induce or accelerate the progress of labour.

Augmentation of Labour: Accelerating the process of labour through ARM and/or the intravenous administration of an oxytocic drug to increase the frequency and strength of uterine contractions.

Birth Centre: A maternity care setting that offers a home-like environment (in terms of furnishings) but is usually located within or nearby a maternity hospital. This model of care commonly involves a small team of midwives attending the woman throughout her antenatal period, labour and birth. It is offered to women experiencing a low-risk pregnancy who wish to avoid unnecessary intervention in birth. If medical care is required the woman must transfer to regular hospital care.

Caesarean Section (CS): An obstetric operation involving extraction of the fetus from the uterus via an incision made in the abdominal and uterine walls.

Cardiotocography Machine (CTG): An electronic form of external monitoring of the fetal heart rate and maternal uterine contractions via an ultrasound monitor strapped to the woman's abdomen. This provides graphical correlation between fetal heart rate and maternal uterine contractions and is commonly used to assess fetal wellbeing in both pregnancy and labour.

Electronic Fetal Monitoring (EFM): A method of examining the condition of a baby in-utero by noting any unusual changes in its heart rate. EFM can be utilised either externally via CTG or a handheld Doppler, or internally via a fetal scalp electrode attached to the fetal skull.

Homebirth: When a woman plans to give birth at home and is attended by a registered midwife or midwives of her choice. The woman will also receive antenatal and postnatal care from her midwife/midwives at home.

Induction of labour (IOL): An intervention used to initiate the process of labour prior to spontaneous onset. Methods of induction include the use of prostaglandin gel to soften the woman's cervix, ARM, and the intravenous administration of oxytocic drugs to create uterine contractions.

Instrumental birth: The use of an obstetric instrument such as forceps or vacuum extraction by an obstetrician to expedite the process of vaginal birth.

Normal birth: Sometimes used interchangeably with the term *vaginal birth* which simply refers to a fetus being born through the vaginal passage, whether obstetric intervention occurred or not. Truly normal birth only occurs when a woman gives birth without the use of induction, augmentation, instruments, epidural or spinal anaesthesia and without caesarean section.

Ultrasound Scanning (USS): Also known as *ultrasonography*, ultrasound scanning is a radiological technique involving the use of ultrasonic waves directed into the tissues to allow visualisation of the deep structures of the body. Used commonly in obstetrics to confirm pregnancy and estimate gestation, locate the placenta, estimate fetal size, weight and maturity, and identify fetal abnormalities.

ABSTRACT

Background: In 2008, a national review of maternity services was commissioned by the Australian Government. A number of significant reforms to the funding, organisation and delivery of maternity services were proposed with the stated intention of improving women's access to high quality, safe maternity services. A community consultation process was undertaken as part of The Review, inviting interested parties to comment on the proposed reforms. Over 900 individuals and professional organisations responded.

Aim: The aim of this study was to uncover the perceptions, beliefs and meanings associated with childbirth held by the key stakeholders in Australian maternity care.

Methods: Discourse analysis was chosen as the methodology for this project as it enabled examination of the unspoken or hidden messages in the data, paying particular attention to the construction of childbirth and the manifestation of power relations. The data set comprised of 11 submissions from peak professional and consumer bodies to the National Maternity Services Review (MSR).

Findings: The expression of, or desire for, power and control was found to be the major discourse underpinning all of the submissions analysed. In the context of maternity service reform, this discourse confirmed the existence of fundamentally different constructions of childbirth by the key stakeholders. This resulted in diverse opinions on how maternity services should be managed and operationalised. A discourse of risk and safety was used by the peak medical bodies to argue against the majority of proposed reforms. In contrast, peak nursing, midwifery and consumer groups used language that constructed childbirth as a normal life event. As such, submissions from midwifery, nursing and consumer groups demonstrated

strong support for the Government's reform agenda, arguing for a new vision for the future of maternity care that placed the childbearing woman at the centre of care.

Discussion: A clash of ideologies was evident amongst the key stakeholders in Australian maternity care. The fundamentally different constructions of childbirth possessed by obstetricians and midwives (supported by nurses and consumers) support the notion of 'turf wars' in the maternity care system. Whilst midwives and obstetricians already work together collaboratively, it appears that their interactions are often underpinned by the 'politics of power'. The findings of this research raise important issues around power and control in childbearing. They raise questions about women's right to have control over their bodies in childbirth – including decisions about their most suitable care provider, model of care and intended place of birth. As long as the struggle for power underlines the actions of care providers, women will not truly be at the centre of maternity care.

Conclusion: Understanding the different ideologies inherent in the professional and public discourses of childbirth provides insight into how each party can work together more effectively to ensure the delivery of high quality maternity services for Australian women. The encouragement of professional courtesy in practice would go some way in ameliorating the 'politics of power' that underpin maternity care providers' interactions. Changes to the way medical and midwifery students are educated, including greater exposure to normal birth, is required. Further research into the socio-cultural meanings associated with birth is warranted as developing greater awareness of the different constructions of childbirth supports harmonious relationships between maternity care providers.