



Cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort and the role of complementary and alternative medicine in its treatment

Carole Yvonne Fisher

Australian Research Centre in Complementary and Integrative Medicine,
Faculty of Health, University of Technology Sydney

Thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy at the University
of Technology Sydney, February 2019

Certificate of original authorship

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

I would like to acknowledge with gratitude that this research was supported by an Australian Government Research Training Program.

Signature of Student:

Production Note:
Signature removed prior to publication.

Date 6th February, 2019

Statement of contributions to jointly authored works contained in the thesis

The results from this thesis have been submitted for publication in peer-reviewed journals through five articles (one integrative literature review paper and four discrete original articles), presented in Chapter 2, Chapter 4, Chapter 5, Chapter 6 and Chapter 7. For each of these papers, I have been primarily responsible for determining the research question, undertaking the analysis and drafting the manuscript.

Support in all of these areas has been provided by Professor David Sibbritt and Professor Jon Adams, Doctor Louise Hickman and Doctor Jane Frawley.

I take full responsibility in the accuracy of the findings presented in these publications and this thesis.

Published works by the author incorporated into the thesis

The following are the published papers contained within this thesis:-

1. Fisher C, Sibbritt D, Hickman L, Adams J. (2016) A critical review of complementary and alternative medicine use by women with cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort: a focus upon prevalence, patterns and applications of use and users' motivations, information seeking and self-perceived efficacy. *Acta Obstetrica et Gynecologica Scandinavica*. 95(8): 861-871.

2. Fisher C, Adams J, Hickman L, Sibbritt D. The use of complementary and alternative medicine by 7427 Australian women with cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort: a cross-sectional study. *BMC Complementary and Alternative Medicine*. 2016; 16 (1):1-11.

3. Fisher C, Hickman L, Adams J, Sibbritt D. Cyclic Perimenstrual Pain and Discomfort and Australian Women's Associated Use of Complementary and Alternative Medicine: A Longitudinal Study. *Journal of Women's Health*. 2018; 27 (1):40-50.

4. Fisher C, Adams J, Frawley J, Hickman L, Sibbritt D. Western herbal medicine consultations for common menstrual problems; practitioner experiences and perceptions of treatment. *Phytotherapy Research*. 2018; 32(3):531-541.

5. Fisher C, Adams D, Frawley J, Hickman L, Sibbritt D. Is there a role for Western herbal medicine in treating cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort? *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Obstetrics and Gynaecology*. Accepted for publication 23rd July, 2018.

Abbreviations

AE	Adverse event
AUB	Abnormal uterine bleeding
ALSWH	Australian Longitudinal Study on Women's Health
BMI	Body mass index
CAM	Complementary and alternative medicine
CHM	Chinese herbal medicine
CHP	Conventional health practitioner
CI	Confidence interval
CPP	Chronic pelvic pain
CPPD	Cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort
DSM	Diagnostic and Statistics Manual of Mental Disorders
EPO	Evening primrose oil
GABA	Gamma amino-butyrac acid
GP	General practitioner
HMB	Heavy menstrual bleeding
HSR	Health Services Research
HTA	Health technology assessment
ISSP	International Social Survey Program
IUD	Intrauterine Device
NHS	National health service
NHIS	National Health Interview Survey
NICE	National Institute for Health and Care Excellence
OCP	Oral contraceptive pill
OR	Odds ratio

OTC	Over the counter
PCOS	Polycystic ovary syndrome
PH	Public Health
PMS	Premenstrual syndrome
PMT	Premenstrual tension
PMDD	Premenstrual dysphoric disorder
PRACI	Practitioners Research And Collaboration Initiative
RCT	Randomised controlled trial
SSRI	Selective serotonin re-uptake inhibitor
TCM	Traditional Chinese medicine
UK	United Kingdom
USA	United States of America
VAC	<i>Vitex agnus-castus</i>
WH	Western herbalist
WHM	Western herbal medicine
WHO	World health organisation

Acknowledgements

I would like to acknowledge and express my sincere gratitude to my supervisors Professor David Sibbritt, Professor Jon Adams, Dr. Louise Hickman and Dr. Jane Frawley for their steadfast support and guidance throughout the research and recording of my research.

I am also extremely grateful to my whole family who have supported and encouraged me throughout, their belief in me has been a driving force.

Finally, I would like to thank all the women from the Australian Longitudinal Study on Women's Health and Western herbalist members of the Practitioner Research And Collaboration Initiative. Without their willingness to participate in the surveys that is the basis of this research, this thesis would not have been possible.

Abstract

Background

There is a high prevalence of cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort (CPPD) with up to 97% of women experiencing problems such as premenstrual syndrome (PMS) and dysmenorrhoea, during their menstruating years. This can impair women's ability to fully participate in all aspects of life. Conventional medicine has limitations in treating affected women and evidence suggests women are increasingly exploring complementary and alternative medicines (CAMs) for support.

Aims

To determine the associated use of CAM by women with CPPD, their user-rated efficacy and the significance this use may have for public health providers.

Method

A literature review of cross-sectional data provided a baseline of CAM use, and its associated efficacy, reported by women with CPPD. Patterns of CAM use and CPPD prevalence were examined using 2012 data collected from women aged 28 to 33 years in the Australian Longitudinal Study on Women's Health. This cohorts' changes in CAM use and associated CPPD from 2006 to 2012, provided further insights into this association.

Western herbal medicine emerged as one CAM favoured by women with CPPD. Western Herbalists (WHs) were surveyed on their perceptions of their treatment for CPPD regarding its efficacy, costs and duration and the herbs preferred in treating symptoms. An assessment based on clinical evidence was undertaken for the main nominated herbs.

Results

From the literature review, cross-sectional studies of CAM use for CPPD have increased sharply in recent years, however overall data were highly variable. Across studies, CPPD prevalence was high, with a mean prevalence of CAM used as treatment of 32%

and up to 70% user-prevalence of herbal medicine. CAM efficacy was well rated, at between 33%-97%, mostly adopted through self-prescription. At least 41.2% of ALSWH participants experienced CPPD and frequent sufferers of PMS were significantly more likely to consult a naturopath/herbalist (OR = 2.11), or self-prescribe herbal medicines (OR = 1.72) compared to non-sufferers. Over the years 2006 to 2012 the only significant positive association found was for naturopath/herbalist consultations and women suffering PMS.

Between 61% and 84% of WHs rated their treatment of four common CPPD symptoms as 'always effective', this being highest for PMS. WHs' treatment appeared cost-effective and of short duration. However, scientific evidence for the main herbs used in CPPD treatment was limited.

Conclusion

CAM is increasingly being used by women to treat CPPD. Whilst herbal medicine may be an additional, effective and economical treatment, more well-designed, rigorous clinical trials are needed to confirm safety and efficacy before it gains mainstream credibility.

Contents

Certificate of original authorship.....	ii
Statement of contributions to jointly authored works contained in the thesis	iii
Published works by the author incorporated into the thesis.....	iv
Abbreviations	v
Acknowledgements.....	vii
Abstract.....	viii
1. Background.....	1
1.1 Chapter Introduction	1
1.2 Aims and scope of thesis research	1
1.2.1 Aims.....	1
1.2.2 Scope of research questions.....	1
1.3 Research approach	2
1.3.1 A Health Services Research and Public Health approach to CAM	3
1.3.2. Health Services Research, Public Health and CAM	5
1.4. Conventional Medicine Definition	6
1.5 Definition of Complementary and Alternative Medicine	6
1.5.1 Definition of CAM in Australia	8
1.5.2 The Background to CAM	9
1.5.3 The scope of CAM.....	11
1.5.4 The new research paradigm and CAM	13
1.5.5 CAM prevalence.....	14
1.5.6 Demographics of CAM users	21
1.5.7 Types of CAM used	27
1.5.8 Motivations for using CAM	32
1.5.9 CAM use amongst women.....	36
1.6 Menstruation and Cyclic Perimenstrual Pain and Discomfort	42
1.6.1. Definitions of main CPPD symptoms	43
1.6.1.1 Premenstrual Syndrome (PMS) and Premenstrual Dysphoric Disorder (PMDD)	44
1.6.1.2 Dysmenorrhoea	45
1.6.1.3 Heavy menstrual bleeding (HMB)	46
1.6.1.4 Irregular periods	47
1.6.2 Rationale for Cyclic Perimenstrual Pain and Discomfort (CPPD)	47
1.6.3 Prevalence of CPPD	49
1.6.3.1 Prevalence of CPPD in Australia.....	51
1.6.4 Aetiology of CPPD	52

1.6.5 Significance of CPPD	56
1.6.6 Conventional treatment of CPPD	63
1.6.7 CAM use by women with CPPD.....	69
1.6.8 Implications of conventional medical approach to CPPD treatment.....	72
1.7 Chapter summary	74
2. Literature Review	76
2.1 Chapter introduction	76
2.2 Background	76
2.2.1 The scope of Cyclic Perimenstrual and Pain Discomfort in the literature	76
2.2.2 Complementary and Alternative Medicine	77
2.2.3 Complementary and alternative medicine utilisation for cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort.....	78
2.3 A critical review of complementary and alternative medicine use by women with cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort: A focus upon prevalence, patterns and applications of use and users' motivations, information seeking and self-perceived efficacy.....	79
2.3.1 Introduction	80
2.3.2 Material and methods.....	82
2.3.3 Results.....	84
2.3.4 Discussion	97
2.3.5 Conclusion.....	107
2.4 Chapter summary.....	108
3. Research design and methodology.....	109
3.1 Chapter introduction	109
3.2 Cross-sectional studies	109
3.3 Australian Longitudinal Study on Women's Health.....	110
3.3.1 Aims of the ALSWH	110
3.3.2 The ALSWH Methodology	111
3.3.3 The ALSWH Sample	111
3.3.4 CPPD and CAM use	112
3.3.5 Statistical considerations for ALSWH data.....	115
3.3.6 Data collection and management for the ALSWH	117
3.4 The Practitioner Research And Collaborative Initiative (PRACI)	117
3.4.1 Aims of PRACI.....	117
3.4.2 Design of PRACI	118
3.4.3 The PRACI sample	118
3.4.4 PRACI and the CPPD sub-study	119
3.4.5 Data collection and management for PRACI.....	121
3.5 Statistical analysis	121

3.5.1 Descriptive statistics	121
3.5.2 Bivariate analyses.....	122
3.5.3 Multivariate analyses.....	122
3.6 Ethical considerations	123
3.7 Chapter summary.....	123
4. The use of complementary and alternative medicine by 7,427 Australian women with cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort.....	125
4.1 Chapter introduction	125
4.2 Background	126
4.3 The use of complementary and alternative medicine by 7,427 Australian women with cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort.....	129
4.3.1 Introduction	129
4.4 Method	131
4.4.1 Sample.....	132
4.4.2 Cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort symptoms	132
4.4.3 Complementary and alternative medicine use.....	132
4.4.4 Confounders.....	133
4.4.5 Statistical Analysis.....	134
4.5 Results	134
4.6 Discussion.....	140
4.6.1 Prevalence of CPPD.....	141
4.6.2 CAM use for CPPD.....	142
4.7 Conclusion	144
4.8 Chapter summary.....	145
5. A longitudinal analysis of changes in cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort amongst Australian women and their associated complementary and alternative medicine use.....	146
5.1 Chapter introduction	146
5.2 Background	146
5.3 Cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort and Australian women's associated use of complementary and alternative medicine: a longitudinal study	150
5.3.1 Introduction	150
5.3.2 Materials and Methods.....	152
5.3.2.1 Sample.....	152
5.3.2.2 Cyclic Perimenstrual Pain and Discomfort (CPPD) symptoms.....	153
5.3.2.3 Complementary and alternative medicine (CAM) use	153
5.3.2.4 Confounders	153
5.3.2.5 Statistical Analysis.....	155
5.3.3 Results	155

5.3.4 Discussion	158
5.3.4.1 Prevalence of CPPD	159
5.3.4.2 CAM use and CPPD	160
5.3.4.3 Prevalence of CAM use.....	163
5.3.4.4 Health policy implications.....	165
5.3.4.5 Study limitations	170
5.3.5 Conclusion.....	170
5.4 Chapter summary	171
6. Western herbalists' treatment of common menstrual problems.	172
6.1 Chapter introduction	172
6.2 Background	173
6.3 Western herbal medicine consultations for common menstrual problems; practitioner experiences and perceptions of treatment.....	177
6.3.1 Introduction	177
6.4 Method.....	181
6.4.1 Sample.....	181
6.4.2 Questionnaire format.....	182
6.4.3 Practitioner demographics.....	182
6.4.4 Practice details.....	182
6.4.5 Treatment of Specific menstrual problems.....	183
6.4.6 Interaction with other practitioners	183
6.4.7 Perceived client behaviour	183
6.4.8 Menstrual problems	183
6.4.9 Statistical analyses	184
6.5 Results	184
6.5.1 Professional demographics and practice details	184
6.5.2 Treatment of menstrual problems.....	185
6.5.3 Interaction with other health practitioners regarding treatment of patients with menstrual problems.....	189
6.6 Discussion.....	192
6.7 Conclusion	198
6.8 Chapter summary	198
7. Is there a role for Western herbal medicine in treating cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort?	200
7.1 Chapter introduction	200
7.2 Background	200
7.3 Is there a role for Western herbal medicine in treating cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort?	203

7.3.1 Commentary.....	203
7.3.2 <i>Vitex agnus-castus</i> (VAC)	205
7.3.3 <i>Angelica sinensis</i> , <i>Paeonia lactiflora</i> and <i>Actaea racemosa</i>	206
7.3.4 So is Western herbal medicine an option for CPPD?.....	207
7.4 Chapter summary	208
8. Discussion.....	210
8.1 Chapter introduction	210
8.2 Significant findings in the prevalence of Cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort and the use of complementary and alternative medicine in its treatment	210
8.3 Implications arising from this research	213
8.3.1 Women with CPPD	214
8.3.2 Health professional perspective	222
8.3.3 Health policy perspective.....	228
8.4 Limitations of research	237
8.4.1 Definition of terms	238
8.4.2 English language	238
8.4.3 Lack of direct causality.....	239
8.4.4 Potential Biases	239
8.5 Strengths of research.....	239
8.6 Future research	240
8.6.1 Improved healthcare for women	240
8.6.2 Research funding and support.....	251
8.6.3 Research models	252
8.7 Chapter summary	254
9. Conclusion.....	256
10. References	259
11. Appendices	285

Tables

Table 1.1	Premenstrual Dysphoric Disorder	45
Table 1.2	Common CPPD changes/symptoms	51
Table 2.1	Description of quality scoring for the Complementary and Alternative Medicine surveys reviewed	85
Table 2.2	Quality Assessment of Reviewed Articles	91
Table 2.3	General Information on Research Articles into CAM and CPPD	101
Table 3.1	Demographic data as a percentage of the young cohort from 1996 for ALSWH and from Census information	113
Table 3.2	Participation and retention of 14,247 women in the 1973-78 cohort of women who were 18-23 years old at the first survey in 1996	114
Table 3.3	Comparison of Western Herbalists from NHAA database and survey participants	120
Table 4.1	The association between cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort (CPPD) and consultations with complementary and alternative medicine practitioners	136
Table 4.2	The association between cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort (CPPD) and use of complementary and alternative medicine practices and products.	137
Table 4.3	The odds ratio for association of cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort and consultations with complementary and alternative medicine practitioners.	138
Table 4.4	The odds ratio for association between cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort and use of complementary and alternative medicine practices and products.	139
Table 5.1	Comparison of information for ALSWH surveys	147
Table 5.2	The Prevalence of Menstrual Problem in non-pregnant women in 2006, 2009 and 2012	156
Table 5.3	The odds ratio* for association of cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort and consultations with complementary and alternative medicine practitioners.	166
Table 5.4	Prevalence of cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort symptom and use of complementary and alternative medicine practitioners in 2012.	167
Table 5.5	The odds ratio* for association between cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort and use of complementary and alternative medicine therapies and products	168

Tables continued

Table 5.6	Prevalence of cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort symptom and use of complementary and alternative medicine therapies and products in 2012	169
Table 6.1	Demographics of Western herbalists by gender	186
Table 6.2	WHs characteristics regarding treatment of menstrual problems	188
Table 6.3	Characteristics of WHs practice and assessment of treatment for menstrual problems	190
Table 6.4	Herbs most often prescribed by WHs to treat specific menstrual symptoms	191
Table 8.1	The numbers of women with CPPD symptoms in each category and combination of categories based on sample size of 7427	215

Appendices

Appendix 1	A critical review of complementary and alternative medicine use by women with cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort: A focus upon prevalence, patterns and applications of use and users' motivations, information seeking and self-perceived efficacy	285
Appendix 2	Questionnaire for Western Herbalists and Naturopaths	307
Appendix 3	The use of complementary and alternative medicine by 7427 Australian women with cyclic perimenstrual pain and discomfort: a cross-sectional study.	316
Appendix 4	Cyclic Perimenstrual Pain and Discomfort and Australian Women's Associated Use of Complementary and Alternative Medicine: A Longitudinal Study	331
Appendix 5	Western herbal medicine consultations for common menstrual problems; practitioner experiences and perceptions of treatment	351
Appendix 6	Ethics Approval for Survey of Western Herbalists	369
Appendix 7	Is there are role for Western herbal medicine in the treatment of cyclic, perimenstrual pain and discomfort	370