CYNTHIA DODD

MA (UTS)

CO3O34

INTERNATIONAL STUDIES (RESEARCH)

DEVELOPING STUDENTS' INTERCULTURAL CAPABILITIES IN THE SECONDARY LANGUAGES CLASSROOM

46,039 Words

Autumn, 2019

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for CO3O34 Research Thesis, Autumn Semester 2019, at the University of Technology Sydney

Supervisors: Prof. Lesley Harbon & Dr. Angela Giovanangeli

Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences

University of Technology Sydney

CERTIFICATE OF ORIGINAL AUTHORSHIP

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as part of the collaborative master/doctoral degree and/or fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Student:

Production Note:
Signature removed prior to publication.

Date: 27th February 2019

This research is supported by the Australian Government Research Training Program.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The completion of thesis would not have been possible without the ongoing contribution and support of my supervisors, Prof. Lesley Harbon and Dr. Angela Giovanangeli. Their timely, sage advice and encouragement have been a model of Vygotsky-an practice, prodding me out of my comfort zone, challenging perspectives and facilitating my thinking, encouraging me when I stumbled. I would also like to thank Dr. Emi Otsuji for her provocation and wise input in the conceptualisation of this research, and Dr. Neil England for his constructive, timely advice.

Pivotal to this work has been the generosity of the eight Senior Secondary Languages teachers who opened their classrooms and practice to provide such valuable data. Intercultural language education colleagues, Dr Julia Rothwell and Sherryl Saunders, both passionate supporters of adaptive, reflective practice, provided valuable critical feedback and support along the way.

When the task seemed overwhelming, the affirmation of my wonderfully supportive family and friends, and consideration of my grandchildren's futures were "the wind beneath my wings".

Finally, I am privileged to have received support from the Australian Government Research Training Program, without which this research would not have been possible.

This work is dedicated to all educators who cherish their students and mediate their becoming active, collaborative, capable agents of their own meaningful life journeys in our dynamic world.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CERTIFICATE OF ORIGINAL AUTHORSHIP I

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT II

LIST OF TABLES VI

LIST OF FIGURES VII

LIST OF APPENDICES VIII

LIST OF ACRONYMS IX

GLOSSARY OF TERMS AND DEFINITIONS X

ABSTRACT 1

CHAPTER I INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND 4

1.0 Overview 4

1.1 Background 4

1.2 Considerations for Senior Years Languages curricula and assessment 10

1.3 Aims and objectives 13

1.4 Research question 14

1.5 Thesis overview 14

CHAPTER II CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK AND LITERATURE REVIEW 18

2.0 Overview 18

2.1 Reflections on the current Australian educational context 19

2.2 Conceptual framework 22

2.3 Literature review 24

2.3.1 Languages education 24

2.3.1(a) Languages education as evolving 25

2.3.1(b) Languages education as ecological 29

2.3.1(c) Languages education as transformative ... 33
2.3.2 Languages education as intercultural ... 43
2.3.2.1 Intercultural language education as problematic ... 44
2.3.2.2 Intercultural capability ... 75
2.3.3 The relationship between capability and agency ... 78
2.3.3.1 Conceptions of agency ... 78
2.3.3.2 Learner agency ... 80
2.3.3.3 Agency and the role of the teacher ... 83
2.3.3.4 Conceptions of capability ... 89
2.3.3.5 The relationship between capability and agency ... 90

CHAPTER III METHODOLOGY ... 97

3.0 Context of project ... 97

3.1 Sampling 97

3.2 Multiple strategy qualitative study ... 98

3.3 Selection of year level, sites and teachers ... 102

3.4. Ethical considerations ... 104

3.5 Data gathering ... 108
3.5.1 Examination of curriculum documents ... 109
3.5.2 Classroom observations ... 109
3.5.3 Student questionnaire ... 110
3.5.4 Teacher questionnaire ... 112
3.5.5 A videoed class ... 114
3.5.6 Stimulated recall ... 115

3.6 Data reduction ... 116

3.7 Data analysis ... 116

CHAPTER IV HOW ICLTL IS BEING ENACTED IN THESE QUEENSLAND CLASSROOMS ... 120

4.1 Overview and presentation of data ... 120

4.2 What data sources reveal: how ICLTL is being enacted ... 120
4.2.1 Student Questionnaires ... 121
4.2.2 Teacher Questionnaires ... 123
4.2.3 Classroom observations ... 127
4.2.4 Curriculum document examination ... 132
4.2.4.1 QCAA programme document examination ... 132
4.2.4.2 IB Diploma programme document examination ... 135
4.2.5 Videoed classroom observation ... 137
4.2.6 Stimulated recall ... 139
4.2.6.1 Context responsive enactment of ICLTL: evidence from Stimulated Recall 142
4.2.6.2 Curriculum dictates in ICLTL: evidence from Stimulated Recall 145

4.3 Analysis 146
4.3.1 Mediation in ICLTL teachers' practice 151
4.3.1.1 The role of languaging 154
4.3.1.2 The treatment of 'languacultures' 158

CHAPTER V ANALYSIS OF DATA: THE DEGREES OF DIDACTIC (INFLUENCE OF PROSCRIPTION) AND AGENTIVE PRACTICE IN THE ICLTL PROCESS 160

5.1 Overview and presentation of data 160
5.1.1 A key consideration: Agency for what? 161

5.2 The enactment of agency in ICLTL by teachers and learners 163
5.2.1 Teacher agency enacted in ICLTL 164
5.2.1.1 Didactic enactment of ICLTL 165
5.2.1.2 Agentive enactment of ICLTL 167
5.2.2 Learner agency enacted 175
5.2.2.1 Types of learner agency enacted - situated (contextually, temporally, interpersonally, intrapersonally) 176

5.3 Analysis 180
5.3.1 Enactment of teacher agency 180
5.3.2 Enactment of learner agency 182

CHAPTER VI CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS 184

6.1 Summary of the study 184

6.2 Recommendations 187
6.2.1 Implications for curriculum authorities 187
6.2.2 Implications for school and curriculum leadership 190
6.2.3 Implications for language teacher educators 191

BIBLIOGRAPHY 193

APPENDICES 216

LIST OF TABLES

Table no.	Table title	Page no.
Table 1	*Intercultural capability – Studies Authorities' views*	75
Table 2	*Phases of research*	99
Table 3	*Student questionnaire responses: Q1*	110
Table 4	*Student questionnaire responses: Q2*	111
Table 5	*Teacher questionnaire responses: backgrounds and languages spoken and taught*	113
Table 6	*Thematic analysis – data reduction, categorisation, reorganisation (Roulston, 2013)*	116
Table 7	*Addressing Guba's Four Criteria for Trustworthiness (Shenton, 2004: 73)*	117
Table 8	*Annotated Appendix H _Classroom observation protocol: Teacher attributes and methods (Sumisu)*	127, 172
Table 9	*Summary of teacher attributes and methods observed in classroom observation*	128
Table 10	*Student questionnaires – class-specific summary of learners' perceptions of opportunities offered in their Languages studies*	121
Table 11	*Elements revealed in curriculum document examination QCAA programmes*	132, 169
Table 12	*Breakdown of curriculum type by school*	135
Table 13	*Elements revealed in curriculum document examination IB Diploma programmes*	136,170
Table 14	*Appendix I - Videoed classroom observation protocol_ checklist for language, learner and learning (Elena)*	138
Table 15	*Frequency of questions used in stimulated recall of videoed classroom interactions*	141
Table 16	*Classroom infrastructure usage*	143
Table 17	*Agency for what?*	162

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure number	Figure title	Page no.
Figure 1	*Intercultural language learners: spectators or capable agents?*	23
Figure 2	*Languaculture at the centre of language, culture and literature*	52
Figure 3	*Knowledge-Agency Window (Deakin-Crick, 2011)*	94
Figure 4	*AGENCY: agentic engagement/intercultural capability – from latent to overt*	95
Figure 5	*Hammersley framework (adapted)*	101
Figure 6	*Celebrations lesson flow*	128
Figure 7	*Kurisumasu paatei*	129
Figure 8	*Mediation in Mme Cheval's practice*	149
Figure 9	*Teachers as agentive, strategic, accomplished mediators in relational reflective spaces*	179

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix number	Appendix name	Page number
APPENDIX A	National goals for schooling in Australia	209
APPENDIX B	AFMLTA Professional standards for accomplished teaching of languages and cultures	211
APPENDIX C	Principal information sheet-consent form	219
APPENDIX D	Teacher participant information sheet-consent form	223
APPENDIX E	Parent and child information sheet-consent form	227
APPENDIX F	Student questionnaire – UTS(ETH17-1528	231
APPENDIX G	Teacher questionnaire – UTS(ETH17-1528	232
APPENDIX H	Classroom observation protocol	234
APPENDIX I	Videoed classroom observation protocol	236
APPENDIX J	Curriculum document examination protocol	237
APPENDIX K	Stimulated recall of videoed classroom interactions (audio record, researcher notes)	238
APPENDIX L	Blyth permission to use diagram	240
APPENDIX M	Crick permission to use graphic	242
APPENDIX N	PSP Information sheet	244
APPENDIX O	Celebrations unit – researcher notes on classroom observation	246
APPENDIX P	Teachers' sourcing and use of authentic materials	250
APPENDIX Q	Ethics approval letter	253
APPENDIX R	Summary of Teacher Questionnaire responses to Question 4 and Question 5	255
APPENDIX S	QCAA curriculum documents	258
APPENDIX T	IB curriculum documents	264

LIST OF ACRONYMS

AaL	Assessment as Learning
ACARA	Australian Curriculum, Assessment and Reporting Authority
ACER	Australian Council of Educational Research
AF	Assessment Formative
AfL	Assessment for Learning
AifL	Assessment is for Learning
AFMLTA	Australian Federation of Modern Language Teachers' Associations
AILA	Association Internationale de Linguistique Appliquée
AITSL	Australian Institute of Teaching and School Leadership
AoL	Assessment of Learning
AS	Assessment Summative
C/CT	Chaos and Complexity Theory
CEFR	Common European Framework of Reference for Languages
CMC	Computer Mediated Communication
DA	Dynamic Assessment
EFL	English as a Foreign Language
IAS	Integrated Assessment System
ICC	Intercultural Communicative Competence
ICLTL	Intercultural Language Teaching and Learning
ILTLP	Intercultural Language Teaching and Learning in Practice
IWB	Interactive whiteboard
MLE	Mediated Learning Experience
MoRe LEAPS	Mentoring and Reflecting: Languages Educators and Professional Standards
NAPLAN	National Assessment Program – Literacy and Numeracy
OTL	Opportunity To Learn
PDWC	Parliamentary Debate World Conference
PSP	Professional Standards for Accomplished Teaching of Languages and Cultures
QCAA	Queensland Curriculum and Assessment Authority
QCAR	Queensland Curriculum, Assessment and Reporting framework
QSA	Queensland Studies Authority
SLA	Second Language Acquisition
TL	Target Language
ZPD	Zone of Proximal Development

GLOSSARY OF TERMS AND DEFINITIONS

Agency

Agency is "movement, a change of state or direction, or even a lack of movement where movement is expected. (…) the concept of agency is central in learning, more general and more profound than the terms autonomy, motivation and investment, though closely related".

Van Lier (2010, p 4)

"… appreciating the role of human agency (is impossible) without acknowledging people as agents not only of their own lives but also of the very world they live in and come into realization together with. […] Human beings are portrayed as social actors, or agentive co-creators … not only of their development but of the world composed of collective practices in their ongoing communal historicity. In this sense, people and their development …are neither products of culture and social practices …but co-creators of culture and social practices."

Stetsenko & Arievetch (2016, p. 207)

Globalisation

Globalisation is the process by which the world is becoming increasingly interconnected as a result of massively increased trade and cultural exchange.

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/schools/gcsebitesize/geography/globalisation/globalisation_rev1.shtm>.

Competence

Global competence is the capacity to analyse global and intercultural issues critically and from multiple perspectives, to understand how differences affect perceptions, judgments, and ideas of self and others, and to engage in open, appropriate and effective interactions with others from different backgrounds on the basis of a shared respect for human dignity.

<https://www.oecd.org/education/Global-competency-for-an-inclusive-world.pdf> , p. 6, viewed 3 September 17)

Intercultural Communicative Competence (ICC)

... has four dimensions – knowledge, (positive) attitudes/affect, skills and awareness, with awareness – about self vis-à-vis everything else in the world - being central to cross-cultural development..

Fantini, A.E., in Jackson, J., ed. 2011. *The Routledge Handbook of Language and Intercultural Communication,* Taylor and Francis

… '**competence**' is not only a cognitive construct but also includes psychological traits such as attitudes, affective aspects and constructions of identity.

Witte and Harden, 2011.

Global business discourse is about **human capital** (the combination of the knowledge and skills of people working in firms) **and its competency** (individual's ability to achieve a specific task, the learning of scripts derived from interactions between individual and environment, necessity for the education of practice-based professions, a

starting point to bridge the gap between the individual and organizational levels of analysis).

Sen, S., Bhattacharya, A., and Sen, R. 2016, pp. 1-2.

Capability

… (regarding) the accumulation of 'human capita' and the expansion of 'human capability'. The former concentrates on the agency of human beings - through skill and knowledge as well as effort - in augmenting production possibilities. The latter focuses on the ability of human beings to lead lives they have reason to value and to enhance the substantive choices they have.

Sen, A. 1997, p. 1.

AITSL Professional capability at four career stages states that Highly Accomplished teachers 'maximise learning opportunities for their students by understanding their backgrounds and individual characteristics and the impact of those factors on their learning'.

Professional Standards for Teachers 2011, viewed 28 August 2017, <https://www.aitsl.edu.au/docs/default-source/apst-resources/australian_professional_standard_for_teachers_final.pdf >, p. 5.

The Capability Approach

The capability approach is a theoretical framework that entails two core normative claims: first, the claim that the freedom to achieve well-being is of primary moral importance, and second, that freedom to achieve well-being is to be understood in terms of people's capabilities, that is, their real opportunities to do and be what they have reason to value

Stanford Encyclopaedia of Philosophy, 2016, viewed 16 June, 2017, https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/capability-approach/>.

Human capability strictly connected to the real social context where the human lives, such that intelligence and learning, rather than being a product, are a process in which the (child) becomes involved in their own development as a social actor (individual who does something), or agent (who does something with other people). This *doing* makes things happen, in so doing contributing to wider (...) transformation processes.

Hart, C.S., Biggeri, M. and Babic, B., eds. 2014, *Agency and Participation in Childhood and Youth: International applications of the capability approach in schools and beyond*. London, Bloomsbury.

Intercultural capability

The goal of intercultural language learning is extending students' repertoires of communication and their meta-awareness of the relationship between language, culture, meaning and learning. Students therefore have dual roles. As PARTICIPANT USERS of the target language they use language to communicate meanings and experience different ways of making meaning between languages and cultures. They are also LEARNERS/ANALYSERS of the target language, constantly reflecting critically on the exchange of meanings from multiple perspectives; reflecting on their own values and those of others. In the dual process of experience and analysis of communication between languages and cultures, students are invited to de-centre from their own linguistic and cultural situation to consider that of others. They become participants in diversity. Through these experiences, students come to understand over time that in intercultural interaction the ethical consequences of communication are always

amplified, because intercultural interaction involves negotiating difference as well as experiencing new and at times challenging ways of 'reading' the world. Assessing intercultural capability therefore involves assessing students' performances in experiencing and analysing communication, a dual process that requires moving between the students' own languages and cultures and the language and culture being learned.

Scarino, A. 2009, p. 4.

Developing intercultural capability requires the integration of performance, analysis and reflection.

Liddicoat, A.J., 2017

Intercultural language capability

'Learning to communicate successfully, to exchange meaning across languages and cultures, and, through reflection, to develop an understanding of the processes involved'.

Scarino, A., 2014

Capacity

Synonyms relate to ability/potential; competence/proficiency/faculty/skill; cleverness; gifts/knack; and experience.

(https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/thesaurus/capacity, viewed 20 May 2018)

Translingual and transcultural competence

Places value on the ability to operate between languages.

'Foreign Languages and Higher Education: New Structures for a Changed World', Report of the Modern Languages Association (MLA) Ad Hoc Committee on Foreign Languages, 2007

…is not the prospect of crossing wide-open spaces into exotic foreign territory, but rather reveals an eye-opening horizon of entanglements, ruptures, illusions and disillusions associated with language itself. Translingual competence is not the simple juxtaposition of two equally valid dictionary meanings, nor is transcultural competence the bland co-existence of multiple cultures under the happy banner of diversity.

Kramsch, C., 'Theorizing Translingual/Transcultural Competence', in Levine, Glenn S. & Phipps, A., eds. 2010, *Critical and Intercultural Theory and Language Pedagogy*, AAUSC Issues in Language Program Direction, ch 2.

Translanguaging

Translanguaging is the deployment of a speaker's full linguistic repertoire without regard for watchful adherence to the socially and politically defined boundaries of names (and usually national and state) languages.

Otheguy, Garcia and Reid 2015, p. 281.

Mediator/mediation

Mediation in sociocultural theory emphasises the dynamic interactions and negotiations between learners and material/symbolic artifacts or cultural tools.

Vygotsky, 2004 in Da Silva Iddings 2017, p. 3.

Mediation is fundamentally an interpretive act, through which meanings that have been created in one language are communicated in another. [It is] a process that involves aspects that are internal to the translator (mediation for the self) and aspects that are oriented to the reader of the target text (mediation for others) that are in turn linked through selective processes of determining what resources are needed to enable a target text reader to understand a source text meaning.

Liddicoat, A.J. 2015.

ABSTRACT

Current educators, employers and authorities advocate that learners develop intercultural capacity. The term 'cultural competence' has more recently included an intercultural orientation, yet definitions of intercultural competence vary and are contested, the desired intercultural capacity more recently defined as intercultural capability. However, there have been no practical studies in whether and how this is developed, nor on the inherent role of agency.

This study examines, through iterative reflective inquiry using a multiple strategy qualitative research design, whether and how school language teachers in one Australian state – Queensland – develop their students' intercultural capabilities. It focusses on the practice of eight Senior languages teachers; their perceptions of their students and their interculturality; and whether and how they design their teaching to develop what can be assessed as intercultural capability. This will be examined through a focus on teachers' own world views; their perceptions of their learners as individuals with stores of knowledge; the learner routines they design and implement; their mediation of language, culture and learning; and their reflexivity. It is hoped that this exploration of teachers' situated discursive and relational practices will illustrate ways their pedagogical stances develop agency and intercultural capability.

The study was undertaken in four schools across all sectors using Studies Authority and IB curricula. Classroom observation notes, a curriculum document examination, student questionnaire, teacher questionnaire, videoed class and subsequent stimulated recall with each teacher provided data which were reduced using both deductive and inductive processes. Thematic content analysis was used to discern themes and how they might coalesce, and to categorize, then reorganize as necessary.

Research in the area of ICLTL reveals the complexity of the dynamic ecological terrain and systemic constraints teachers and learners need to navigate if true intercultural capability is to be developed.

The research question – How is ICLTL (intercultural language teaching and learning) being enacted in these Queensland classrooms? – was addressed in writing up findings, firstly according to the instrument, then considering the role of agency. Themes emerging from analysis reflect key notions of agency and capability operating in ecological contexts which offer a range of affordances as teachers navigate dynamic terrain, adhering to systemic constraints.'

In providing evidence of intercultural language pedagogy and its effectiveness with learners across a spectrum of practice this thesis may make apparent learner engagement strategies in iterative reflective practice, or evidence gaps in teacher participants' knowledge and pedagogy which provide opportunities

for professional growth. Amidst demands for transformative education, it may contribute to the way intercultural languages teachers conceptualize their role.