

Privacy Literacy In the Era of the Internet of Things and Big Data

A Thesis submitted to the Faculty of
University of Technology Sydney
By

Zablon Bosire Pingo

In partial fulfilment of the requirement for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
2020

Thesis Supervisors
Dr. Bhuvan Narayan
Dr. Keiko Yasukawa

Abstract

The aim of this study was to investigate people's privacy management practices in the digital environment, especially on platforms that generate and collect personal data as part of larger Big Data practices. The use of digital technologies have become part of our everyday life with the increased use of social networking sites for socialisation, sharing information, and entertainment, among other benefits. In addition, in the current digital age, there is increased use of Internet-connected devices like fitness trackers for monitoring various aspects of our physical activities, and also the use of digitally-tracked consumer loyalty systems. All these technologies generate and provide access to personal data to organisations and other individuals. In our current data-driven economy, personal data has become an important resource for service providers to mine data and gain insights into users' behavioural activities in return for services. Increasingly, consumers are required to protect themselves, and "privacy in YOUR hands" is a common public service message by governments to protect their citizens.

This study used an empirical approach to understand the extent to which users manage their privacy and their personal information, while enjoying the benefits and affordances of such technologies. Semi-structured interviews were used to collect qualitative data from twenty-one (n=21) users who used all three technologies — social media, consumer loyalty systems, and fitness trackers. In addition to participant interviews, a Facebook walkthrough of the participants' profiles was undertaken to understand their use of privacy settings and their online behaviours. Sandra Petronio's *Communication Privacy Management* (CPM) theory was used as the main lens in analysing the resulting data. The CPM theory, originally proposed in 2002, uses a boundary metaphor to explain how people make decisions about revealing or concealing personal information with various communication partners; they do so through boundary rule formation (who to share with) and boundary coordination (between people they shared with), and readjust if there is a boundary turbulence or breach of confidence. It was originally developed to understand interpersonal communication, but in this study, it is used as a framework to understand communication in digital technologies, where both people and organisations are

involved.

The findings show that people balance benefits against risks in information disclosure; they selectively disclosed personal information on social media and segmented their professional and social worlds as a privacy management strategy to delineate and distinguish the boundaries of the various privacy levels they desired in their personal and professional lives. The findings also show that individuals make a cost-benefit analysis -- or use privacy as a negotiation tool -- in trading their social and personal data for certain benefits, but also expect “contextual integrity” of their data; that is, they expect privacy protection against that data reaching outside the boundaries of the entity they were trading the data with.

Participants' privacy literacy around social media platforms was the most evolved, for it was a new public-facing technology where they had a huge learning curve, and hence they were used to being somewhat careful already. In the case of loyalty systems, participants were somewhat aware of the risk of sharing too much personal information, but since these systems were generally run by companies that they trusted and had done business with for many years, they did not perceive as much of a threat in disclosing personal information to them, although these same companies had merged since and were now sharing data. In the case of fitness trackers and other wearable technologies, participants were generally much more open to sharing their health data with third-party organisations, as they clearly perceived some health (and sometimes monetary) benefits from doing so, among other derived value, and did not clearly envision the future risks such as higher health insurance premiums in the future in case their fitness routine falls short.

While privacy knowledge is important for individuals in protecting their privacy, participants' use of privacy protection strategies was often exercised after experiencing privacy breaches. Hence, boundary rule formation and boundary coordination are both an evolving process and change continually based on privacy knowledge gained and boundary turbulence experienced. The study also uncovered some challenges users face in their effort to manage their online information privacy including usability and an understanding of the reasons for privacy protection.

This study provides evidence of how individuals use digital technologies in their everyday lives and participate in the digital economy, while also trying to protect their informational privacy. There is often a tension between individual and organisational motives in this environment, which can only be overcome through some level of privacy awareness and privacy literacy for individuals in addition to regulatory controls for organisations to maintain a level of “contextual integrity” when handling user data.

Dedication

I dedicate this thesis to my late father.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank all who supported me in every way during my entire candidature period.

Firstly, I am thankful to my family for their sacrifice, love and support.

Secondly, gratitude and respect to my academic supervisor Dr. Bhuvu Narayan for accepting me as one of her PhD students and supporting me in every way throughout the journey, especially in the intellectual development of the ideas in this thesis.

I am also indebted to my alternate supervisor Dr. Keiko Yasukawa for her guidance, patience, and support throughout my candidature.

My thanks also go to Dr. Marie Manidis for kick-starting my doctoral journey with a series of workshops and other supportive workshops from Dr. Nick Hopwood and Dr. Julie Roberts, which remain invaluable to me as an Early Career Researcher.

Likewise, I am grateful to all my colleagues for being there for casual chats and sharing ideas during the PhD journey (Suman, Irwin, Daniel, Ellen, Oxana, Marie, Sarita, Pauline, Henry, Chichi, Victoria, Peter, Ruchira, Mukesh, Anne, Bilquis, Janindu, Mariana, Paloma and many others).

I cannot forget to thank Dr. Janet Gibson for giving me work opportunity during my doctoral studies, which was invaluable and continues to shape my career as a teacher.

I also wish to thank all my research participants without whose time and effort to take part in my research, I could not have achieved what I set out to do.

I am also grateful to the *Oxford Internet Institute* for accepting me in their Summer Doctoral Programme in 2017. The opportunity introduced me to other excellent researchers from around the world with whom I still keep in touch.

I am grateful to the Australian Government for granting me the *International Research Scholarship* to cover my tuition fees, and to UTS for providing me the *UTS President's Scholarship* to support my research and my life in Sydney.

I can't forget my Futsal and Football squad whom I enjoyed playing with, as it was an important part of my wellbeing and a safe escape from my research.

I also thank all my friends from around the world for their kindness, including all my housemates in UTS Housing (Gumal Ngurang).

I thank Krystal Campbell for the proof-reading of the thesis, alongside making sure the writing follows the Australian English and quotation conventions as required by my university, and her cross-checking of my citations and references.

Finally, I thank my external examiners Prof. Bitange Ndemo, Prof. Makiko Miwa, and Dr. Jennifer-Campbell Meier for reading the thesis and providing me with valuable feedback.

Certificate of original authorship

I, Zablou Pingo, declare that this thesis is submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy at the University of Technology Sydney.

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of the requirements for a degree at any other academic institution except as fully acknowledged within the text.

This thesis is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

This research was supported by the Australian Government Research Training Program.

Signature:

Production Note:

Signature removed prior to publication.

Date: 19/02/2020

List of works published from this thesis

Book Chapters

1. **Pingo Z.**, Narayan B. 2019, Users' Responses to Privacy Issues with the Connected Information on Ecologies Created by Fitness Trackers", In M. Dobрева, A. Hinze, & M. Zumer (Eds.), *Maturity and Innovation in Digital Libraries, Lecture Notes in Computer Science series* (Vol. 11279). Springer International Publishing, Berlin, pp. 240-55.
2. **Pingo, Z.**, Narayan, B. 2019 "Big Data and the Internet of Things: Current Industry Practices and their Implications for Consumer Privacy and Privacy Literacy" In: Kaur, G. & Tomar, P. (Eds) *Handbook of Research on Big Data and Internet of Things*. IGI Global Publishing, Hershey P.A., pp.55-76
3. **Pingo, Z.** & Narayan, B. 2019, "Privacy Literacy and the Everyday Use of Social Technologies" In S. Kurbanoglu, S. Špiranec, E. Grassian, D. Mizrachi & L. Roy (eds.), *Information Literacy in Everyday Life*, Springer International Publishing, Berlin, pp. 33-49.
4. **Pingo, Z.** & Narayan, B. 2016, 'When Personal Data Becomes Open Data: An Exploration of Lifelogging, User Privacy, and Implications for Privacy Literacy', in R.A. Morishima & Liew C. (ed.), *Digital Libraries: Knowledge, Information, and Data in an Open Access Society*, vol. 10075, Springer, Cham, pp. 3-9.

Journal Articles

5. **Pingo Z.**, Narayan B. (2019). "My smartwatch told me to see a sleep doctor": A study of activity tracker use. *Online Information Review*. Ahead of Print, Accessible from <https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/OIR-04-2018-0115/full/html>

Conference Papers

6. **Pingo, Z.**, & Narayan, B. 2018, Users' Responses to Privacy Issues with the Connected Information Ecologies Created by Fitness Trackers, *In the 20th International Conference of Asia-Pacific Digital Libraries*, Waikato, New Zealand, 19-22 November 2018.

7. **Pingo, Z.** & Narayan, B. 2019, "Privacy Literacy and the Everyday Use of Social Technologies. *European Conference on Information literacy (ECIL)*. Oulu, Finland, 24-27 September 2018.
8. **Pingo, Z.**, & Narayan, B. 2017, Privacy Literacy: Extending Information Literacy in the Age of Social Media and Big Data. *i3: Information: Interactions and Impact Conference* Aberdeen: Robert Gordon University, 27-30 June 2017.
9. **Pingo, Z.**, & Narayan, B. 2016, When Personal Data Becomes Open Data: An Exploration of Lifelogging, User Privacy, and Implications for Privacy Literacy. Presented at the *18th International Conference of Asia-Pacific Digital Libraries*, University of Tsukuba, Tsukuba, Japan, 7-9 December 2016.
10. Narayan, B., & **Pingo, Z.** 2016, Understanding Privacy through an Information Behaviour Perspective: Implications for Privacy Literacy. In *Research Applications in Information and Library Studies*. Wellington, New Zealand, 6-8 December 2016.

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	i
Dedication	iv
Acknowledgements	v
Certificate of original authorship.....	vii
List of works published from this thesis	viii
Table of Contents	x
List of Figures.....	xv
List of Tables.....	xv
CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1. Background.....	1
1.2 Context of this research.....	4
1.3 Research questions.....	8
1.4 Research aims and significance	9
1.5 Definition of terms.....	11
1.6 Thesis structure	12
CHAPTER 2. LITERATURE REVIEW	14
2.1 The notion of privacy.....	14
2.1.1 Values of privacy in society	21
2.1.2 The changing notion of privacy	22
2.1.3 Dimensions to privacy.....	23
2.2 Privacy in the context of Big Data and the Internet of Things	24
2.2.1 Big data and privacy	25
2.2.2 Internet of Things, collection of personal information and privacy.....	28
2.2.3 Dataveillance in Big Data and Internet of Things era	32
2.2.3.1 Private self-tracking practices.....	34
2.2.3.2 Pushed and imposed self-tracking practices.....	35
2.2.3.3 Exploited self-tracking practices.....	35
2.2.4 Personalisation and privacy.....	36
2.2.4.1 Implications of personalisation	37
2.1.5 Data Practices in digital economies	37
2.3 Types of personal information	39
2.3.1 Public Information	43
2.3.2 Private information.....	43
2.3.3 Protected information (Sensitive information).....	43
2.3.4 Other kinds of data in digital economies.....	44
2.4 Digital technologies and personal data collection	46
2.4.1 Social Media as a source of personal data.....	46
2.4.2 Loyalty card systems.....	50

2.4.2.1 Privacy concerns around loyalty card systems.....	51
2.4.3 Personal activity trackers	52
2.4.3.1 Privacy and security concerns in Activity trackers	54
2.5 Personal information and privacy risks	56
2.5.1 Privacy risks in digital technologies.....	57
2.5.2 Privacy risks associated with repurposing of personal data.....	61
2.6 Approaches to informational privacy protection.....	63
2.6.1 Ethical Self-regulation	64
2.6.1.1 Consent and notices	66
2.6.1.2 Personal information ownership and control	67
2.6.1.3 Anonymity online and privacy management.....	68
2.6.1.4 Transparency and openness in data practices	69
2.7 Privacy protection principles.....	71
2.7.2 Australian Privacy Principles (APP).....	72
2.7.3 OECD Data Protection Principles.....	74
2.7.4 General Data Protection Regulation	76
2.7.4 Privacy by Design (PbD) principles	78
2.8 Use of privacy-enhancing technologies (PETs) to protect privacy.....	79
2.8.1 De-identification of personal information	81
2.8.2 Privacy protection tools.....	82
2.9 Conception of privacy literacy in the information society	83
2.9.1 Privacy literacy as a meta-literacy in information literacy	84
2.9.2 Responsibilities of users' privacy protection in digital society	85
2.9.3 Managing privacy in social technologies.....	86
2.9.3.1 Self-presentation and privacy management	87
2.10 Privacy awareness and privacy concerns in the information society	88
2.10.1 Privacy concerns and perceptions in the digital age	89
2.10.2 Privacy attitudes, concerns and paradox in new technologies	90
2.11 Stakeholders' responsibilities in privacy management.....	91
2.12 Theoretical frameworks overview.....	94
2.12.1 Informational Privacy Awareness Theories.....	95
2.12.2 Privacy as Contextual Integrity.....	97
2.12.2.1 Roles and context	98
2.12.2.2 Appropriate information flow and contexts.....	99
2.12.2.3 Transmission Principles.....	99
2.12.2.4 Informational Norms/expectation of information flow	100
2.12.2.5 Challenges of contextual integrity in data practices	101
2.12.3 Privacy literacy Framework.....	102
2.12.4 Communication Privacy Management (CPM) theory.....	102
2.12.4.1 Boundary coordination.....	106

2.12.4.2 Boundary turbulence.....	107
2.12.4.3 Boundary rule formation	107
2.12.4.4 Privacy rule formation foundations	108
2.12.4.5 Application of CPM in this study.....	111
CHAPTER 3. RESEARCH DESIGN	113
3.1 The Qualitative approach.....	113
3.1.1 Iterative processes in qualitative research	115
3.2 Case Study	117
3.2.1 Defining the cases for this study	118
3.2.1.1 Users of social networking sites.....	119
3.2.1.2 Users of fitness/activity trackers.....	121
3.2.1.3 Users of membership cards and loyalty system schemes	122
3.3 Participant recruitment and selection criteria.....	122
3.3.1 Participant demographics.....	123
3.4 Data collection	126
3.4.1 Interviews	126
3.4.1.1 Testing of interview questions.....	127
3.4.1.2 Interview protocol.....	127
3.4.1.3 Interview Questions.....	128
3.4.2.3 Use of visual images in interviews.....	130
3.4.2 Online walkthrough and observations	133
3.5 Data Analysis.....	134
3.5.1 Thematic Analysis	135
3.5.2 Data coding and Analysis	137
3.6 Ensuring quality in qualitative research approach	138
3.7 Ethical Considerations	140
3.7.1 Informed Consent.....	141
3.7.2 Confidentiality and anonymity	141
3.7.3 Data collection.....	141
3.7.4 Data storage and Protection	141
3.8 Research delimitations	141
CHAPTER 4: PRIVACY AWARENESS AND PROTECTION STRATEGIES	143
4.1 Withholding and minimising information exposure online	143
4.2 Information sharing and identity management.....	148
4.2.1 Balancing privacy concerns with benefits of information disclosure.....	152
4.3 Monitoring digital footprint online as a privacy management tool	153
4.4 Self-censorship as a privacy management strategy	156
4.5 Navigating the online context collapse	160
CHAPTER 5: PRIVACY NEGOTIATION.....	166
5.1 Commodification of personal data for benefits.....	166

5.1.2 Loyalty card systems and privacy concerns	171
5.2 Boundary negotiation through privacy policies in digital technologies	173
5.2.1 Information overload in privacy policies	173
5.2.2 Lack of choice in privacy policies	175
5.2.3 User expectations of transparency and accountability	177
5.3 User agency in negotiating and determining information flow	179
CHAPTER 6: PRIVACY PERCEPTIONS AND MANAGEMENT.....	185
6.1 Flow of information across unintended boundaries	185
6.1.1 Use of SNS privacy settings to protect privacy	185
6.1.1.1 Use of tagging permissions to protect privacy	189
6.1.1.2 Use of blocking feature in managing information boundaries	192
6.1.2 Vulnerabilities in privacy settings.....	193
6.2 Activity trackers, information flow, and privacy	196
6.2.1 Sharing personal data with providers of activity trackers	197
6.2.1.1 Sharing of fitness tracker data and privacy perceptions	199
6.2.2 Conceptualisations of activity tracker data.....	202
6.2.2.2. Activity tracker data seen as non-sensitive data.....	205
6.2.3 Use of privacy settings in fitness trackers	206
6.3 Locational privacy management on digital trackers.....	206
CHAPTER 7: PRIVACY BOUNDARY MANAGEMENT AND THE PRIVACY PARADOX.....	211
7.1 Opening and closing of information boundaries to organisations	211
7.1.1 Privacy concerns in linking organisational information boundaries.....	212
7.1.2 Usability and ease of use through boundary linkages	216
7.1.3 Boundary infiltration and targeted advertisements	218
7.1.4 Response to boundary turbulence	221
7.2 Interpersonal boundaries and privacy management	223
7.2.1 Separation of private and professional boundaries	224
7.2.2 Limiting the number of friends/contacts on SNS	228
7.2.3 Protecting other people's privacy	230
CHAPTER 8: DISCUSSION.....	232
8.1 Use of privacy knowledge to protect privacy online	232
8.1.1 Information withholding vs. information sharing.....	233
8.1.2 Information control and self-monitoring online.....	234
8.1.3 Use of pseudonyms and multiple identities	235
8.1.4 Use of privacy settings.....	236
8.2 Personal information disclosure and privacy boundary management	237
8.2.1 Interpersonal boundary management in social networking sites	238
8.2.1.1 Managing separate personal and professional identities.....	240
8.2.2 Privacy management at impersonal / organisation boundaries	241
8.3 Personal information as a negotiation tool versus privacy risks	242

8.4 Consent, privacy policies and boundary coordination	245
8.5 Experiential effect of privacy turbulence.....	249
8.6 Constraints to effective privacy management in digital technologies	250
8.7 Reflection on privacy literacy within different domains	251
CHAPTER 9: CONCLUSION	254
9.1 Summary of the key findings.....	255
9.1.1 Perceived privacy risks help boundary rule formation	256
9.1.2 Perceived risks vs. rewards affect privacy boundary coordination	256
9.1.3 Constraints of privacy policies hinder privacy literacy development.....	257
9.1.4 Privacy literacy is context dependent.....	257
9.1.5 Privacy turbulence leads to better privacy literacy.....	258
9.1.6 Mismatch between privacy expectations leads to privacy vulnerability	258
9.2 Implications for CPM theory	259
9.3 Implications for practice	259
9.4 Methodological contributions.....	260
9.5 Limitations of the study.....	260
9.6 Future research directions.....	261
REFERENCES.....	263
Appendix 1: INFORMATION SHEET FOR PARTICIPANTS	296
Appendix 2: INFORMED CONSENT FORM FOR PARTICIPANTS.....	297
APPENDIX 3: ETHICS APPROVAL LETTER.....	299

List of Figures

Figure 1: Sources of Big data	27
Figure 2: An example of incentivised linkage.....	32
Figure 3: Potential privacy threats, invasions and related risks framework	58
Figure 4: CPM Rule development	110
Figure 5: Summary of the Maxwell (2005) Interactive research design model.....	116
Figure 6: Privacy in your hands (AOIC 2016)	132
Figure 7: Sign in with Facebook to other applications	132
Figure 8: Linking of fitness trackers, insurance membership and loyalty cards	132

List of Tables

Table 1: Summary of privacy definitions	18
Table 2: Examples of Internet of Things devices and their use	29
Table 3: Categories of personal information	41
Table 4: Example of types of data in SNS	49
Table 5: A summary of potential privacy risks and consequences in the digital technologies	58
Table 6: Fair Information Practice Principles	66
Table 7: Summary of Australian Privacy principles	73
Table 8: OECD principles.....	75
Table 9: Examples of privacy enhancing tools.....	82
Table 10: Stakeholder responsibilities in privacy enhancement.....	91
Table 11: Summary of the Participants.....	125
Table 12: Trustworthiness criteria.....	139