A preliminary, multidisciplinary investigation into the performance of professional referees in the Australian National Rugby League

Matthew D. Jeffriess

BA Exercise and Sport Science (Honours Class 1)

University of Newcastle

UTS: Health

University of Technology Sydney

NSW, Australia

This thesis is submitted for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

August - 2020

"Get em' onside!"

Everyone – at any rugby league game, anywhere.

Declaration

I certify that the work contained in this thesis has not been previously submitted either in whole,

or in part, for a degree at the University of Technology Sydney, or any other tertiary institution.

I also certify that this thesis is written by myself, Matthew Jeffriess. Any assistance that I have

received in my research work and in the preparation of this thesis has been acknowledged.

Additionally, I certify that all informational sources and literature used to complete this thesis

are indicated throughout.

This research is supported by the Australian Government Research Training Program.

Production Note:

Signature removed prior to publication.

Matthew Daniel Jeffriess

12th August 2020

Date

iii

Preface

This thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy is in the format of collated manuscripts intended for publication and abides by the 'Procedures for Presentation and Submission of Theses for Higher Degrees – University of Technology, Sydney; Policies and Directions of the University. All manuscripts included in this thesis are closely related in subject matter and form a cohesive research narrative.

Based on the research design and data collected by the candidate, four manuscripts have been prepared for submission into jeer reviewed journals. These papers are initially brought together by an Introduction, which provides background information, defines the research problem and the aim of each study. A Literature Review then follows to provide an overview of previous knowledge regarding Factors affecting training, evaluation, and performance of professional referees in the Australian National Rugby League (NRL). The body of the research is presented in manuscript form (Chapter Three to Chapter Six), in a logical sequence following the development of research ideas in this thesis. Each manuscript outlines and discusses the individual methodology and the findings of each study separately and includes all referencing specific to each manuscript in each chapter. The General Discussion chapter provides an interpretation of the collective findings, makes some practical recommendations, and acknowledges the limitations from the series of investigations that comprise this thesis. Finally, a Summary and Recommendations chapter presents the conclusions from each project and directions for future research to build on the findings of this thesis are suggested. The APA 6th reference style has been used throughout the document and the full reference list is at the end of the thesis.

Acknowledgments

To Cameron Black, who started me on this ride - while is as had its share of "Turbulence" you have been a mentor and a mate. Thank you mate.

To the NRL Referees Performance Staff – Michelle, Reece, Lach, Millsy.

Thank you for your tireless efforts into improving the performance of the squad.

To Aaron Coutts and Job Fransen – without a doubt, your guidance, supervision, assistance, and support helped me get here – I am indebted. Thank you for helping me find the daylight at the end of the tunnel (even when we most certainly thought it was a train coming).

To the NRL Referees – Very few people will ever understand the complexity or intricacies of the job you do. Your commitment and passion for the game of Rugby League is something people never seem to undervalue.

To my wonderful Mum – for always believing in me.

To Beck – for the late nights, and times I thought it was all too hard, you stuck by me and told me we would get there -you are the constant in my life. . . . Love you so.

Abstract

Sports officials are critical constituents to team sports competition, of which professional rugby league is no exception. Successful performance in sports officiating involves a complex interplay of components including, but not limited to; physical, technical, and perceptualcognitive factors. When comparing literature on sports officiating there is a clear paucity of research investigating the performance of rugby league referees. As a result, there is a deficiency in evidence—based practice when evaluating and training rugby league referees. This is of concern given the prominence of the elite rugby league competition has on the Australian sporting landscape. Given the scarcity of research into rugby league referees this thesis adapted a conceptual model rugby union referee performance as a framework for a preliminary, multidisciplinary investigation into factors that affect performance of elite rugby league referees. This thesis contains four studies with the aims of; (1) improving understanding of the physiological demands of the current 2-referee model utilised in the elite rugby league competition in Australia, and, (2) the contextual factors that affect physical performance of the referees in the 2-referee model. It is widely reported in the literature that the physical aspect of refereeing is only one component of referee performance, therefore, in addition to physical performance, the thesis also aimed to (3) examine to what extent other measurable referee performance variables, including technical psychological and perceptual-cognitive, contributed to rugby league referee performance evaluation. Finally, the thesis aimed to (4) create an ecologically valid decision-making task for referee decision making performance, and examine perceptual cognitive mechanisms underpinning elite referee decision making.

Study One identified between-role differences for match-activity profiles for the two on-field referees (head vs. assist) under the current referee model. Study Two expanded on this research

to investigate how contextual factors, specifically referee match experience and referee fitness effect the match-activity profiles of elite rugby league referees. The findings highlighted the importance of cardio-vascular fitness for elite rugby league referees and the effects of referee match experience on movement and positioning. Combined, these studies further the understanding of how the referee roles differ and provide supporting evidence to suggest the development of role specific training programs. Study Three identified that no movement characterises positively factor into the evaluation of referee performance. Rather, referee penalty accuracy was found to contribute most to evaluation score. This highlights the importance of decision making to referee on-field performance. Finally, the Study Four created a valid, reliable, domain specific decision-making test for rugby league referees. Additionally, this study found that although referees outperformance non-referees on the decision-making task, they do not employ different gaze strategies to the control group when making decisions. Results suggest referee have greater ability to process visual information and have increase procedural knowledge when applying the rules of rugby league.

In combination, the studies within the thesis provide insights into multi-factorial nature of rugby league referee performance. The results give evidence for development of appropriate physical training programs, while highlighting the importance of non-physical factors, such as perceptual cognitive skills, on referee performance. Furthermore, the thesis suggests that referee performance may be improved by the deliberate practice of referee domain-specific, perceptual-cognitive tasks in conjunction to role specific physical training programs. The unique, ecologically valid decision-making task had the potential to be utilised and future research investigations into factors affecting decision making of elite rugby league referees for talent identification purposes.

Table of contents

| Declaration | iii |
|---|--------------------------------------|
| Preface | iv |
| Acknowledgments | v |
| Abstract | vi |
| Table of contents | viii |
| List of Tables | xii |
| List of Figures | xiv |
| CHAPTER 1 | 16 |
| Introduction | 16 |
| Outline | 17 |
| Background | 17 |
| Research Question – rationale linking studies | 20 |
| Research Objectives | 22 |
| Progression of Studies | 23 |
| CHAPTER 2: | 28 |
| Literature Review | 28 |
| CHAPTER 3: STUDY 1 | 59 |
| Comparison of the running demands of Australian Natio | onal Rugby League referees under the |
| '2-referee model' | 59 |
| Abstract | 61 |
| Introduction | 62 |
| Methods | 65 |
| Participants | 65 |
| Procedure | 65 |
| Statistical Analyses | 66 |
| Results | 67 |

| Discussion | 69 |
|--|--------------------------------|
| Conclusions and Practical Applications | 74 |
| References | 75 |
| CHAPTER 4: STUDY 2 | 77 |
| Contextual factors affecting running demands of Australian Natio | nal Rugby League referees in |
| the '2-referee model' | 77 |
| Abstract | 79 |
| Introduction | 80 |
| Participants | 82 |
| Methods | 82 |
| Statistical Analyses | 84 |
| Results | 84 |
| Conclusions and Practical Applications | 92 |
| References | 93 |
| CHAPTER 5: STUDY 3 | 95 |
| On-field performance of National Rugby League referees – factor | rs which contribute to referee |
| post-match evaluation | 95 |
| Abstract | 97 |
| Introduction | 98 |
| Methods | 102 |
| Measurements | 102 |
| Statistical Analyses | 106 |
| Results | 110 |
| Discussion | 111 |
| Conclusions and Practical Applications | 119 |
| References | 121 |
| CHAPTER 6: STUDY 4 | 124 |
| Knowing the rules vs. applying the rules | 124 |
| | |

| Superior decision-making of National Rugby League referees is not a result the | eir visual search |
|--|-------------------|
| strategy | 124 |
| Abstract | 126 |
| Introduction | 127 |
| Participants | 130 |
| Methods | 131 |
| Statistical analysis | 136 |
| Results | 137 |
| Discussion | 141 |
| Conclusions and Practical Applications | 146 |
| References | 147 |
| CHAPTER 7: | 150 |
| General Discussion, | 150 |
| Limitations & | 150 |
| Practical Applications | 150 |
| Main Findings | 151 |
| Contribution of Thesis | 153 |
| Study 1: | 155 |
| Study 2: | 156 |
| Study 3 | 158 |
| Study 4 | 159 |
| Limitations | 161 |
| Practical Applications | 162 |
| Future Directions | 164 |
| CHAPTER 8: | 166 |
| Summary | 166 |
| CHAPTER 9 | 172 |

| References | 172 |
|--|-----|
| Appendices | 180 |
| Appendix A - Referee evaluation template 2014 | 181 |
| Appendix B – ethical approval – Movement Demands | 185 |
| Appendix B – ethical approval – Decision making | 187 |

List of Tables

| Table 2.1: Overview of research on expertise in sports officials and judges using video playback |
|---|
| systems and written or verbal response |
| Table 3.1: Global Positioning Systems (GPS) data comparing head referee (HR) and assist |
| referee movement profiles and internal loads during top-tier Australian National Rugby League |
| matches (314 matches during the 2013-2014 season) |
| Table 4.1: Correlation analysis for association between contextual factors and referee running |
| parameters in NRL referees (n=18) during the 2013 and 2014 NRL seasons. Referees were |
| median split for each criterion (fitness ranking and experience ranking) |
| Table 4.2: Linear regression model coefficients examining contextual factors (referee role, |
| referee fitness and match half) for relative match running distance (m/min) for Rugby League |
| Referees (n=18) in the Australian National Rugby League during season 2013 and 2014 86 |
| Table 4.3: Linear regression model coefficients examining contextual factors (referee role, |
| referee fitness, for match high speed running (>14.4 km·h ⁻¹) for Rugby League Referees (n=18) |
| in the Australian National Rugby League during seasons 2013 and 2014 |
| Table 5.1: Descriptions of predictors used to explain the variance in National Rugby League |
| referee post-match evaluation scores |
| Table 5.2: Multiple linear regression examining factors that contribute to National Rugby |
| League referees post-match evaluations scores |
| Table 5.2 (Cont.): |
| Table 6.1: Relative glance duration (%), first glance duration, and mean glance count on |
| specified areas of interest (Markers, 2 nd Defender contact, Ruck, 1 st Defender Contact, Ball, |
| Off-Ball Players and Referee) during a first person, video-based rugby league referee decision |
| assessment. Participants (non-referee n = 9, referee n= 9), across (n= 24) video trials |

List of Figures

| Figure 1.1: Conceptual model of linking of research studies within this thesis |
|--|
| Figure 2.1: The cornerstones model of refereeing performance. (Mascarenhas et al., 2005a). |
| 31 |
| Figure 3.1: Difference in match intensity (m/min) according to referee role (Head Referee = |
| 1st half vs Assist Referee) and match half |
| Figure 6.1 Example of the head-mounted referee camera worn by National Rugby League |
| Assist Referees during NRL matches. |
| Figure 6.2. Example test procedure set up for National Rugby League referees decision-making |
| and gaze tracking assessment. Note: occlusion screen shown |
| Figure 6.3. Example of areas of interest (AOI) overlayed onto the referee head-mounted |
| camera footage, used for gaze behaviour analysis in a video based decision-making assessment |
| for rugby league referees |
| Figure 6.4. Mean decision-making scores (AU out of 3) for referees (n=9) and non-referee |
| (n=9) groups during a first-person, video-based rugby league referee decision-making |
| assessment. AU = arbitrary unit. * Denotes significant ($p < 0.05$) difference between participant |
| groups |
| Figure 6.5: Comparison of relative glance duration (%), first glance duration (ms), and glance |
| count (n) (mean ± standard deviation) between experienced (NRL) referees (n=9) and non- |
| referees (n=9) on specified areas of interest (AOI) during a video-based, first-person rugby |
| league referee decision-making task |
| Figure 7.1: Adaptation of the 'cornerstones model of refereeing performance'. (Mascarenhas |
| et al., 2005b). With corresponding study focus within the thesis |