

Graduate Health Management Trainees’ Perceptions of Workplace Bullying Behaviours: An Australian Perspective

Sharlene Anne Chadwick

B.Ed; MProfessional Ed and Training; MProfessional Ed and Training
(Research Thesis)

Thesis submitted in total fulfilment of the requirements of the
degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

under the supervision of Professor Joanne Travaglia and Dr Deborah
Debono

University of Technology Sydney

Faculty of Health

Centre for Health Service Management

February 2021

Certificate of Original Authorship

I, Sharlene Anne Chadwick, declare that this thesis, is submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy in the Centre for Health Service Management, Faculty of Health at the University of Technology Sydney.

This thesis is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

This document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

Production Note:

Signature: Signature removed prior to publication.

Date: 14 February 2021

This research is supported by an Australian Government Research Training Program Scholarship.

Acknowledgements

Many people have supported and encouraged me to attain my doctorate in ‘perseverance’, as it is so aptly termed, and I am sincerely grateful to all. To those who have gone before me on this adventure, your generosity in sharing your insights is appreciated as you truly understood what I was going through. To all of the research participants in the focus groups, individual interviews and validation interviews who took the time to share their experiences and to provide the rich data I was able to work with, I am thankful to you for volunteering your time. To the experts who participated in the reference group who were willing to give your time, experience and expertise to review the components developed specifically for this study, I am immensely grateful and humbled.

To my constant source of support, guidance, expertise and extraordinary encouragement, Professor Joanne Travaglia, I owe so much. Jo, you believed in this research and, more importantly, you believed in me and inspired me every day, *grazie dal profondo del mio cuore*. To Dr Lesley Halliday, who started on this journey with us and was instrumental in guiding me to find clarity when the task of researching ‘bullying’ seemed too overwhelming and who kept reminding me of the end goal. To Dr Deborah Debono, who provided new perspectives and a much-needed fresh lens to this study and kept me focused on the ‘so what’. All of you improved the quality of the final thesis in more ways than you know. Jo, Lesley and Deb, thank you for the laughs along the way. We did it.

To my support group - my closest friends. To Jim, *hvala iz srca*. You rode every wave of joy, despair, frustration, tears and celebration over the many years. You have always been there for me, encouraging me and allowing me the time to focus on writing. You have kept me grounded. To Deb, for your words of wisdom and absolute belief in me. Jim and Deb, you have been generous of your time and your unwavering encouragement, made sure I celebrated along the way and were able to take me away from the process. I am so grateful to have you as my dearest friends. Thank you.

To my ‘fur baby’, Carter, for the distraction and the need to go for long walks.

To my parents, Judi and Brian, who each offered support in many ways and who have always encouraged me to reach my potential and fostered the desire in me to do so. Dad, my ‘book’ is finished. Now I get to wear the fluffy bonnet.

Thank you all.

Contents

Certificate of Original Authorship.....	i
Acknowledgements	ii
Contents	iii
List of Figures	viii
List of Tables.....	ix
List of Abbreviations	x
List of Publications and Presentations arising from this Research	xi
Abstract	xiv
Preface	1
Chapter 1: Introduction - Researching the Perceptions of Workplace Bullying Behaviours	4
1.1 Introduction	4
1.2 Defining workplace bullying	5
1.2.1 Workplace bullying in healthcare settings.....	5
1.2.2 Workplace bullying versus conflict	6
1.2.3 Definitions of workplace bullying.....	6
1.3 Origin and purpose of the study.....	8
1.3.1 Impacts of workplace bullying	9
1.3.2 Workplace bullying and health management	9
1.3.3 Workplace bullying in Australia	10
1.4 Brief historical perspective of workplace bullying legislation	11
1.4.1 Legislation in Australia	11
1.5 Theoretical underpinnings	13
1.5.1 Experiential learning model	13
1.5.2 Social contexts theory.....	15
1.5.3 Situated cognition theory.....	16
1.6 Research questions.....	16
1.7 Significance of the study	17
1.7.1 Impact on staff wellbeing.....	18
1.7.2 Increase in suicide rates	19
1.7.3 Patient safety.....	20
1.7.4 Cost of workplace bullying to organisations and individuals.....	20
1.7.5 Work health and safety	22
1.7.6 Effective practices for addressing workplace bullying in healthcare.....	23
1.8 Phases of the study.....	25
1.8.1 Phase one of the study	25
1.8.2 Phase two of the study.....	26
1.9 Organisation of the thesis	26
1.10 Conclusion	27

Chapter 2: Literature Review - Workplace Bullying in the Health Sector.....	28
2.1 Introduction	28
2.2 Method	29
2.2.1 Overview of method	29
2.2.2 Search strategies.....	30
2.2.3 Search findings	31
2.2.4 Review process	33
2.2.5 Data extraction and analysis	33
2.3 Findings and discussion	34
2.3.1 Prevalence rates	34
2.3.2 Lack of definition of workplace bullying.....	35
2.3.3 Types of workplace bullying behaviours	36
2.3.4 Impact of workplace bullying	37
2.4 Contributing factors.....	38
2.4.1 Lack of management leadership	39
2.4.2 Hierarchical structures	40
2.4.3 Lack of workplace support.....	41
2.4.4 Informal power	42
2.4.5 Social environment	42
2.5 Strategies which can address workplace bullying.....	43
2.6 The paradoxical place of reporting workplace bullying.....	43
2.7 Conclusion	45
Chapter 3: Research Methodology, Design and Strategy	48
3.1 Introduction	48
3.2 Methodology.....	50
3.2.1 Research Paradigm.....	50
3.3 Research design and strategy.....	53
3.3.1 Research aims and objectives.....	53
3.3.2 Research design	54
3.4 Phase one - qualitative methods.....	55
3.4.1 Selection and recruitment of participants	58
3.5 Phase two - quantitative and qualitative methods	59
3.5.1 Development of the provisional anti-bullying learning framework	60
3.5.2 Expert reference group	61
3.6 Research methods	63
3.6.1 Focus groups	63
3.6.2 Individual interviews	65
3.6.3 Respondent validation interviews	66
3.6.4 Transcription.....	69
3.6.5 Quantitative and qualitative survey - expert reference group	69

3.7	Analysis of data	70
3.7.1	Content analysis.....	70
3.7.2	Thematic analysis	72
3.7.3	Coding the data	73
3.8	Ethics.....	74
3.9	Reflection and reflexivity	75
3.9.1	Assumptions.....	78
3.10	Detailed overview of the research plan	78
3.11	Conclusion	82
Chapter 4: Results - Perceptions of Workplace Bullying.....		83
4.1	Introduction.....	83
4.1.1	Emergent themes	84
4.2	Domain one - perceptions of workplace bullying	89
4.2.1	Theme 1: Level of awareness of workplace bullying.....	89
4.2.2	Theme 2: Behaviours which constitute workplace bullying.....	94
4.2.3	Theme 3: Causes of workplace bullying	99
4.2.4	Theme 4: Consequences of workplace bullying.....	104
4.2.5	Theme 6: Nature of workplace bullying	107
4.3	Respondent validation interviews.....	113
4.3.1	Theme 1: Level of awareness of workplace bullying.....	113
4.3.2	Theme 2: Behaviours which constitute workplace bullying.....	115
4.3.3	Theme 4: Consequences of workplace bullying.....	117
4.3.4	Theme 6: Nature of workplace bullying	118
4.4	Conclusion	119
Chapter 5: Results - Strategies for Dealing with Workplace Bullying.....		121
5.1	Introduction	121
5.2	Domain two - strategies for dealing with workplace bullying.....	121
5.2.1	Theme 5: Dealing with workplace bullying.....	122
5.2.2	Theme 7: Positive relationships.....	129
5.2.3	Theme 8: Reporting of workplace bullying.....	134
5.2.4	Theme 9: Training needs.....	137
5.3	Respondent validation interviews.....	141
5.3.1	Theme 5: Dealing with workplace bullying.....	142
5.3.2	Theme 7: Positive relationships.....	142
5.3.3	Theme 8: Reporting of workplace bullying	143
5.3.4	Theme 9: Training needs.....	143
5.4	Conclusion	144
Chapter 6: Phase 2: Results of Expert Reference Group		145
6.1	Introduction	145
6.2	Provisional anti-bullying learning framework	146

6.2.1	Quantitative survey - proof of concept for the provisional anti-bullying learning framework.....	150
6.2.2	Qualitative survey - workplace bullying in global healthcare settings	152
6.3	Conclusion	156
Chapter 7:	Discussion	158
7.1	Introduction	158
7.1.1	Overview of the study	158
7.2	Summary of research findings	159
7.2.1	Overarching domain - perceptions of workplace bullying.....	164
7.2.2	Overarching domain - strategies for dealing with workplace bullying	165
7.2.3	Research question one	166
7.2.4	Research question two	167
7.2.5	Research question three	168
7.2.6	Research question four.....	168
7.2.7	Research question five	169
7.2.8	Research question six.....	170
7.3	Discussion of common themes.....	170
7.3.1	Power	171
7.3.2	Culture.....	176
7.3.3	Reporting.....	182
7.4	Discussion of main findings.....	183
7.4.1	Unexpected results	187
7.5	Implications for healthcare management.....	187
7.5.1	Positive work environments	188
7.5.2	Impact on individuals.....	191
7.5.3	Health managers' changing roles	195
7.5.4	Effective leadership	196
7.5.5	Culture of safety and patient care	199
7.5.6	Developing effective anti-bullying organisations.....	201
7.6	Strengths and limitations of the study	204
7.7	Conclusion	206
Chapter 8:	Conclusion	207
8.1	Introduction	207
8.2	Importance of this research.....	207
8.3	Implications for future directions.....	208
8.3.1	Implications for policy and practice.....	208
8.3.2	Implications for anti-bullying training	210
8.3.3	Implications for future research	210
8.4	Conclusion	212
Appendices	214

Appendix 1: List of studies identified for the literature review	215
Appendix 2: Invitation to participate - focus groups	224
Appendix 3: Provisional anti-bullying learning framework	227
Appendix 4: Quantitative survey - expert reference group	229
Appendix 5: Invitation to participate - expert reference group	235
Appendix 6: Participant information and consent form - expert reference group....	238
Appendix 7: Confidentiality agreement for participants	242
Appendix 8: Participant information and consent form - focus groups.....	243
Appendix 9: Handout of resources for participants.....	248
Appendix 10: Descriptions of themes and sub-themes	250
References	252

List of Figures

Figure A: Study components.	3
Figure 1.1: Experiential learning model	14
Figure 1.2: Overview of study phase one.	26
Figure 1.3: Overview of study phase two.	26
Figure 2.1: PRISMA diagram for inclusion in this review.	34
Figure 2.2: Factors contributing to workplace bullying.	39
Figure 3.1: Inductive approach	49
Figure 3.2: Overview of the framework of the study.	51
Figure 3.3: Research design.	54
Figure 3.4: Research approach - phase one.	55
Figure 3.5: Research approach - phase two.	59
Figure 3.6: Development process for provisional anti-bullying learning framework.	61
Figure 3.7: Framework for thematic analysis	72
Figure 4.1: Graphical representation of the themes and sub-themes.	86
Figure 4.2: Response themes - focus groups compared to individual interviews.	87
Figure 6.1: Research approach - phase two.	145
Figure 6.2: Guiding principles - provisional anti-bullying learning framework.	146
Figure 7.1: Trainees' perceptions of workplace bullying.	164
Figure 7.2: Strategies for dealing with workplace bullying.	166

List of Tables

Table 2.1: Key words searched	30
Table 2.2: Exclusion criteria	31
Table 2.3: Search findings for selected databases.....	32
Table 2.4: Search findings for other sources	32
Table 3.1: Comparison between methods chosen (adapted from Morgan2013)	56
Table 3.2: Focus group and individual interview schedule	65
Table 3.3: Participants in the study - focus groups and individual interviews.....	66
Table 3.4: Validation questions posed to participants	68
Table 3.5: Participants in the study - respondent validation interviews	68
Table 3.6: Participants in the study - provisional anti-bullying learning framework	70
Table 3.7: Detailed overview of the research plan	79
Table 4.1: Identified themes and sub-themes.....	85
Table 4.2: Summary of coding for both focus groups and individual interviews	88
Table 6.1: Provisional anti-bullying learning framework aims	147
Table 6.2: Guiding principles for anti-bullying training.....	148
Table 6.3: Expert reference group responses - provisional anti-bullying learning framework	150
Table 6.4: Expert reference group responses - broader issues	153
Table 7.1: Detailed overview of research plan with key findings	160
Table 7.2: Summary of cross-cutting themes.....	172
Table 7.3: Summary of results from 2017 NSW Health and NSW Public Service Commission Surveys	186

List of Abbreviations

ABF	Activity Based Funding
ACHSM	Australasian College of Health Service Management
AHPRA	Australian Health Practitioner Regulation Agency
AMA	Australian Medical Association
AWB	Australian Workplace Barometer project
CICM	College of Intensive Care Medicine
EAP	Employee Assistance Program
EOC	Essentials of Care
FWC	Fair Work Commission
GHMP	Graduate Health Management Program
GHMT	Graduate Health Management Trainee
HREC	Human Research Ethics Committee
IHI	Institute for Healthcare Improvement
JMO	Junior Medical Officer
LSQ	Learning Style Questionnaire
MBA	Medical Board of Australia
MeSH	Medical Subject Headings
MLA	Modern Language Association
NHS	National Health Service
NSQHS	National Safety and Quality Health Service Standards
NSW	New South Wales
OHS	Occupational Health and Safety
PRISMA	Preferred Reporting Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analysis
RAM	RAND/UCLA Appropriateness Method
WBB	Workplace Bullying Behaviours
WHO	World Health Organization
WHS	Workplace Health and Safety

List of Publications and Presentations arising from this Research

A. Referred Publications

Chadwick, S. and Travaglia, J. (2017). Workplace bullying in an Australian health context: a systematic review. *Journal of Health Organisation and Management*, 3(3): 286-301. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JHOM-09-2016-0166>.

This paper has received attention in the following ways:

- 16 requests for full text (including UTS library).
- Cited four times as 'project reference'.
- Doe, F., Puplampu, B.B. (2019). Coercive management behaviour causes scale: validation and reliability. *International Journal of Organisational Analysis*, 27(3): 729-744. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJOA-08-2018-1508>.
- Mubarak, Fozia and Mumtaz, Sana. (2018). The impact of workplace bullying on project success as mediated through individual organisational citizenship behaviour: a study in Pakistan. *Cogent Business and Management*, 5(1): Article 1532278. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23311975.2018.1532278>.
- Behboohdi-Moghadam, Zahra et al. (2018). Workplace harassment through the experiences of Iranian women: a qualitative study, 2017. *Iran Journal of Psychiatry and Behavioural Sciences*, 12(3): e66945. DOI: 10.5812/ijpbs.66945.
- Morris, J., Canaway, R., & Bismark, M.M. (2017). *Reducing, identifying and managing vexatious complaints. Summary report of a literature review prepared for the Australian Health Practitioner Regulation Agency*. Melbourne School of Population and Global Health, The University of Melbourne.
- Invited as peer-reviewer for *International Journal of Nursing Studies*.
- Invitation to submit further articles to *International Journal of Clinical Medical Research*.
- Invited as peer-reviewer for *Heliyon* journal.
- Invitation to publish research findings as a book from Lambert Academic Publishing.

Chadwick, S. and Franklin, N. (2013). The impact of workplace bullying in nursing. *Australian Nursing Journal*, 21(1): 31.

This paper has received attention in the following ways:

- Hartin, P., Birks, M., and Lindsey, D. (2019). Bullying in nursing: is it in the eye of the beholder? *Policy, Politics and Nursing Practice*, 20(2): 82-91. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1527154419845411>.
- Mamman, B et al. (2018). Newly qualified graduate nurses' experiences of workplace incivility in Australian hospital settings. *Collegian*, 25(4): 591-599. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.colegn.2018.08.003>.

- Adams, A.M. (2018). The perceived and experienced role of the nurse unit manager in supporting the wellbeing of intensive care unit nurses: an integrative literature review. *Australian Critical Care*, 32(4): 319-329. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aucc.2018.06.003>.
- Koharchik, L. (2018). Nursing instructor incivility towards students. *The American Journal of Nursing*, 118(7): 64-66. <https://doi.org/10.1097/01.NAJ.0000541442.76122.e4>.
- Nagata, M and Suzuki, K. (2018). Vocational intention of nursing staff working at nursing care service office. *Bulletin of Department of Health Sciences*, Graduate School of Medicine, Akita University.
- Oyama, Y. et al. (2018). Factors related to the actual state of separation intention of a new nurse and vocational career maturity. *Bulletin of Department of Health Sciences*, Graduate School of Medicine, Akita University.
- Aul, K. (2017). Who's uncivil to who? Perceptions on incivility in pre-licensure nursing programs. *Nurse Education in Practice*, 27: 36-44. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nepr.2017.08.016>.
- Chadwick, S. and Travaglia, J. (2017). Workplace bullying in an Australian health context: a systematic review. *Journal of Health Organisation and Management*, 3(3): 286-301. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JHOM-09-2016-0166>.
- Booth, C. (2017). *Nurse educators' perceptions of nursing students' bullying behaviours in traditional and online education settings: a phenomenological study*. Unpublished dissertation proposal, Doctor of Education, Northcentral University.
- Gee, G. (2017). How does shift work on placement affect healthcare students' lives?' *Fields: Journal of Huddersfield Student Research*, 3(1). <https://doi.org/10.5920/fields.2017.03>
- Osborne, N. (2016). *An exploratory study on how workplace bullying is conceptualised in the Australasian media*. Unpublished Master of Business dissertation, Auckland University of Technology.
- Gantt, G. (2016). *Being bullied in the workplace and impaired professional performance: the lived experience of nurses*. Unpublished Doctor of Philosophy in Nursing dissertation, University of Phoenix.
- Aul, K. (2015). A comparison of perceptions of incivility among nursing students and faculty in pre-licensure nursing programs. Unpublished Doctor of Philosophy dissertation, Robert Morris University.

B. Referred Presentations or Published Abstracts and Posters

- Chadwick, S. Workshop presentation. International Association of Workplace Bullying and Harassment Conference. Dubai, UAE, June 2020.*

* Postponed to April 2021 due to COVID-19 pandemic.

- Chadwick, S. Workplace bullying in the Australian health context: a health management trainees' perspective. Oral presentation. APAC Forum - Concurrent session, Gold Coast, Australia, September 2017.
- Chadwick, S. Dealing with workplace bullying in the health context - the development of a professional learning module. Poster presentation. APAC Forum, Gold Coast, Australia, September 2017.

C. Invited Presentations

- August 2014 - Gold Coast - QUT - WorkSmart Conference. Keynote Speaker.
- July 2014 - UNSW - 'Impacts of Workplace Bullying' - findings from research.
- July 2013 - Wagga Wagga - Medicare Locals. 'Impacts of Workplace Bullying.'

D. Seminar or other public presentation

- April 2016 - Gold Coast - Australian and New Zealand Mental Health Association - No2Bullying. Conference Chair, Keynote Speaker and Program Advisory Committee.
- June 2015 - Gold Coast - Australian and New Zealand Mental Health Association - No2Bullying. Conference Chair, Keynote Speaker and Program Advisory Committee.
- April 2014 - Gold Coast - Australian and New Zealand Mental Health Association - No2Bullying. Conference Chair, Keynote Speaker and Program Advisory Committee.
- May 2013 - Sydney - ACHSM - Knowledge Series Seminar - 'The Impacts of Workplace Bullying.'

Abstract

Workplace bullying is a significant issue in healthcare and unprofessional behaviour is widespread in the Australian healthcare system. The purpose of this thesis is to understand workplace bullying from the perspective of graduate health management trainees (GHMTs) undertaking a two-year training program that includes work placements in healthcare settings.

There is sparse literature on perceptions of workplace bullying among GHMTs in Australia. This study aims to address this gap by specifically exploring this phenomenon. Addressing and researching this gap in the literature is important, as GHMTs have a future role in influencing systemic change, policies, education and practice. As their careers advance, GHMTs will also be key decision-makers and be expected to promote a positive and cooperative workplace culture.

The study was conducted in two phases. Phase one used qualitative methods with focus groups and individual interviews with participants to answer the research questions. Respondent validation interviews were also undertaken to ensure the validity of the findings. Phase two used both quantitative and qualitative methods with an international expert reference group to provide feedback and comment on a provisional anti-bullying learning framework developed specifically for this study as a result of the findings from phase one.

Two overarching domains emerged from the findings in phase one: (1) perceptions of workplace bullying; and (2) strategies for dealing with workplace bullying. Five themes are identified under the domain perceptions of workplace bullying: (1) level of awareness of workplace bullying; (2) behaviours that constitute workplace bullying; (3) causes of workplace bullying; (4) consequences of workplace bullying; and (5) the nature of workplace bullying. Four themes are identified under the domain strategies for dealing with workplace bullying: (1) dealing with workplace bullying; (2) positive relationships; (3) reporting of workplace bullying; and (4) training needs.

Recommendations are proposed for future research and practice that may impact on health professionals and patient safety. Long-term, sustained change in healthcare settings for dealing with workplace bullying are evidenced through the development, implementation and evaluation of policies and procedures. The delivery of anti-bullying

training and professional development for staff will also be a key metric in assessing the efficacy of systemic change within the healthcare profession. Findings from this study have substantive and methodological implications for researchers studying workplace bullying in healthcare settings.