

Mothering and trauma

Lived experiences of Aboriginal mums in NSW prisons

by Stacey Lee Lighton

Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

Under the supervision of:

Professor Elizabeth Sullivan
Professor Juanita Sherwood
Dr Sacha Kendall Jamieson
Professor Eileen Baldry
Dr Jonathan Marshall

University of Technology Sydney
Faculty of Health

May 2021

CERTIFICATE OF ORIGINAL AUTHORSHIP

I, **STACEY LEE LIGHTON** declare that this thesis, is submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the Faculty of Health at the University of Technology Sydney.

This thesis is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

This document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

This research is supported by the Australian Government Research Training Program.

Production Note:

Signature: Signature removed prior to publication.

Date: 10 MAY 2021.

Contents

Acknowledgements v

Abstract vii

Abbreviations viii

Glossary of terms x

1 Introduction 1

Context 2

Situating the study 4

Aim of the research 6

Delineating the issue 6

Setting the terms of the research 7

The study 11

Researcher and research space 12

Rationale 13

Significance 13

Chapter summary 15

Part A Reviewing the literature 18

2 Setting the context of separation: Aboriginal mothers, children and family 199

Introduction 199

The shaping effect of historical social relationships 20

Aboriginal women's voices from the literature 222

Women within families 24

Juanita's Redfern story 2727

Commissions and inquiries 300

Summary and discussion 338

The continuing effects of child removal 45

Conclusion 48

3 Investigating the literature 5050

Locating incarcerated Aboriginal women 50

Painting the picture: Indigenous women in prison 533

Visibility and intersections 61

The intersection of mental health, trauma and incarceration 62

Mothers in carceral environments 64

Discussion and conclusion 6666

Part B Creating knowledge together 18

- 4 Methodology 18
 - Introduction 69
 - The SCREAM project 91
 - Data analysis 96

Part C Findings 110

- 5 Women's childhoods and family environments 111
 - Introduction 111
 - Results 119
 - Conclusion 1422
- 6 Trauma and incarceration pathways 144
 - Introduction 144
 - Case study 1: Kathleen 161
 - Case study 2: Sally 170
 - Case study 3: Roxanne 176
 - Discussion: trauma and its conclusions 182
 - Conclusion 189
- 7 Mothering and prison 190
 - Introduction 190
 - Results 194
 - Discussion 219
 - Conclusion 223

Part D Conclusion 225

- 8 Summary and discussion 226
 - Introduction 226
 - Research questions 228
 - 'The gap' 229
 - Generating knowledge together that matters 232
 - How SEWB knowledge was generated 234
 - Research findings: summary and discussion 235
 - Key messages and implications 245
 - Concluding statement 246

References 248

Appendices 310

Acknowledgements

Though there is much solitary work completed, no PhD study is a lone venture. The impetus for PhD work sometimes builds for decades, with many people being formative, and rests on the body of work of those who have walked the path steadily before us. Collaboration is at the heart of PhD research, with academic institutions, research participants, project advisory groups, and not least of all supervisors, each guiding and shaping the work in their own ways.

With this in mind I would like to thank the strong and courageous Aboriginal mums who were interviewed for the Social and Cultural Resilience and Emotional Wellbeing of Aboriginal Mothers in Prison (SCREAM) New South Wales (NSW) project. All of the women remain an inspiration to me and their stories provide a sharp reminder that there is much work to be done in this space. I would like to thank my primary supervisor, Professor Elizabeth Sullivan, for the opportunity to participate in the SCREAM study and her steady guidance throughout. I believe she will not mind me mentioning that besides her many accolades she is a woman with her heart in the right place. My thanks are ever to my Indigenous supervisor, Professor Juanita Sherwood, who has supported this PhD in every way possible. I write more fully about our relationship and how her mentoring has shaped both me personally and the work in the methodology chapter. My thanks go to Dr Sacha Kendal Jamieson for being such an astute listener. Our spirited interactions have increased my enjoyment, and I hope the depth of my work, immeasurably. Also to Professor Eileen Baldry for her contribution to the SCREAM project and support of my work. I am indebted to Dr Jonathan Marshall for his encouragement and sharing his love of ideas.

My gratitude extends to the members of the SCREAM (NSW) advisory group, who have dedicatedly guided the SCREAM study for over a decade and have provided invaluable direction, feedback and advice to this PhD study. My gratitude also to the late Seth Richardson, who enthusiastically believed that I was capable of producing a PhD, and to my parents for demonstrating the lived value friendship and collaboration with Indigenous people when I was growing up. And last, but certainly not least, my

gratitude to my sons James and Matt for their unwavering support and love in this project and all matters of living.

This thesis has benefited from the professional editing services of Dr Juliet Richters AE, who also has expertise in social epidemiology. In accordance with the Institute of Professional Editors (IPEd) Guidelines, no advice was given by the editor on structure of argument or conceptual issues. Matt Lighton provided his kind assistance with the review of all Endnote entries.

Abstract

Australian Aboriginal women are incarcerated at ever increasing rates and are currently the fastest growing segment of the New South Wales (NSW) population, a disturbing trend reflected across Australian states. Mothers form 80 per cent of this group. The incarceration of Aboriginal mothers significantly impacts their social and emotional wellbeing (SEWB) and that of their children, families and communities, but the literature concerning this group is scant and requires updating. Moreover, much of the prison health literature focuses on Western-based health and disease models that exclude Aboriginal people's conceptualisations and standpoints on health. The aim of this study is to provide a depth of understanding of the women, their mothering, and the shaping effects of trauma in their lives, from their own perspectives.

Forty-three semi-structured qualitative interviews from the 'Social and Cultural Resilience and Emotional Wellbeing of Aboriginal Mothers in prison' (SCREAM) (NSW) project, which was conducted with Aboriginal mothers across six NSW prisons, were analysed. The PhD study was informed by an overarching Indigenous paradigm and guided by the SCREAM (NSW) project advisory group. A multi-method approach that included grounded theory analysis and the employment of case studies was applied. The results included: (1) women's narratives demonstrated strength and connection with family and sustained adversity in childhood, framed by the intergenerational effects of Aboriginal child removal and ongoing colonisation; (2) the trauma experienced by the women has not been well captured in Western-based diagnostic systems, and specific traumas shaped pathways to prison while untreated trauma sustained cycles of incarceration; (3) the compounding effects of child removal and criminalisation were causes of extreme stress; and (4) mothers experienced contact with their children on a connection/disruption continuum with corresponding clusters of SEWB states.

The findings reveal the specificity of stress and trauma experienced by incarcerated Aboriginal mothers, and underscore the need for translation of collaboratively generated research into the practice of culturally safe trauma prevention and treatment and into the provision of support for parenting rather than punitive removal.

Abbreviations

ABS	Australian Bureau of Statistics
ACE	Adverse Childhood Experiences (study)
ACT	Australian Capital Territory
AIATSIS	Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies
AIC	Australian Institute of Criminology
AIFS	Australian Institute of Family Studies
AIHW	Australian Institute of Health and Welfare
ALRC	Australian Law Reform Commission
AHMRC	Aboriginal Health and Medical Research Council (NSW)
AMS	Aboriginal Medical Service
BOCSAR	New South Wales Bureau of Crime Statistics and Research
CDC	Centers for Disease Control and prevention (US)
COAG	Council of Australian Governments
CPTSD	complex post-traumatic stress disorder
DCJ	Department of Communities and Justice (NSW)
DoCS	Department of Community Services (NSW) (replaced by FACS)
DSM-5	Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (5th edition)
FACS	Department of Family and Community Services (NSW) (replaced by DCJ)
GMAR	Grandmothers against Removals
GP	general practitioner (family doctor)
GT	grounded theory
HREOC	Human Rights and Equal Opportunities Commission
ICD-11	International Statistical Classification of Diseases and Related Health Problems (11 th revision)
IRM	Indigenous research methodologies
MAGIC	Mothers and Gestation in Custody
NGO	non-government organisation
NHMRC	National Health and Medical Research Council
NSW	New South Wales

NTER	Northern Territory Emergency Response
PTSD	post-traumatic stress disorder
QLD	Queensland
SCREAM	Social and Cultural Resilience and Emotional Wellbeing of Aboriginal Mothers in Prison (research project)
SEWB	social and emotional wellbeing
SNAICC	Secretariat of National Aboriginal and Islander Child Care, now called SNAICC: National Voice for Our Children
UNSW	University of New South Wales
UTS	University of Technology Sydney
VIC	Victoria
WA	Western Australia
WHO	World Health Organization

Glossary of terms

Aboriginal nation	A large Aboriginal language group with responsibility for a specific area of Country. There are more than 250 language groups in Australia.
Aboriginal person	A person who is of Aboriginal descent, who identifies as Aboriginal and is accepted by other Aboriginal community members.
colonisation	The forcible takeover of the land of Indigenous peoples and the exploitation of the land and the people, ignoring the rights of Indigenous people.
Community	Often capitalised when used in Aboriginal contexts. It has a more specific meaning when employed by Aboriginal people. 'Community' may refer to a physical group of people, and/or to belonging and laws, culture and descent that people have in common.
Country	In standard English 'country' refers to a nation state or the countryside. In Aboriginal English 'Country' refers to the special relationship that Aboriginal people sustain with the land, culture and nature.
decolonisation	The recognition of Aboriginal people's sovereignty and, flowing from this, the recognition of Aboriginal culture and the validity of Aboriginal and ways of knowing, being and doing. In praxis it involves a critique of dominant Western-based ways of doing business. This can lead to the changing of dysfunctional structures and processes entirely. Or it may mean collaboratively embedding Aboriginal people's standpoints, cultural values and practices in systems, institutions and processes and meaningfully including Aboriginal people in governing power structures.
DoCS	The word 'DoCS' (Department of Community Services) was used by the women in interviews to refer to the state agency responsible for child removals in NSW, though it had been superseded at the time of the interviews (2011) by the NSW

Department of Family and Community Services (FACS), which it turn was more recently replaced by the NSW Department of Communities and Justice (July 2019). As well as a designated name for a state agency, it also carries meaning for Aboriginal communities related to the punitive removal of children.

domestic violence	In this thesis the term ‘domestic violence’ refers to violence perpetrated by a person against their partner (see also family violence)
Elder	An Aboriginal Elder is someone who has gained recognition in their community as a custodian of law and knowledge. Elders provide vital support, guidance and wise counselling to their communities.
family violence	In this thesis ‘family violence’ refers to broader interfamilial violence. It includes physical violence but also refers to sexual abuse, threats of harm, emotional violence, kidnap, damage to pets or property or exposing children to these.
First Peoples	In Australia, First Peoples are Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people who inhabited and were sustained by the land, prior to colonisation.
foster care	Foster care is one type of out-of-home care provided for children who are no longer able to live with their parents. It is home-based care.
growing them up	Aboriginal English for ‘bringing them up’
growling	In Aboriginal English, a word that refers to being told off for wrongdoing
Indigenous person	A term at times used in Australia to refer to Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people. Some Aboriginal people do not like this term, as they feel it has colonial overtones and prefer to self-identify according other means, such as Aboriginal nation affiliation.
kinship care	A type of foster or adoptive care that places a child or young person with a relative or someone they already know. In Aboriginal communities, kin may be a relative of the child or someone who shares a cultural or community connection.

link-up services	Aboriginal-led services, funded to assist all Aboriginal people who have been directly affected by past government policies by being separated from their families and culture through forced removal, being fostered, adopted or raised in institutions, to trace, reconnect and reunify with family and Country
out-of-home care	Out-of-home care is a temporary or medium- or long-term statutory living arrangement for children for whom care and protection is transferred to others, most often as a result of child removal.
Stolen Generations	Refers to Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people who were forcibly removed from their families as a result of social policy, enacted by state, federal agencies, churches and welfare agencies. This process of targeted removal of Aboriginal children began from the start of colonisation and lasted until the 1970s. Many children were taken into institutional care, other children were fostered or adopted into 'white' families. Removals broke families apart, causing enormous feelings of grief and loss, and violated relationship and traditions of child socialisation. The details of many children's true identities were denied to them, and they did not know to which families and groups they belonged.
<i>terra nullius</i>	A concept in international law meaning 'a territory belonging to no-one' or 'over which no-one claims ownership'. A myth and deceit used to justify the colonisation and removal of Aboriginal people from their lands.
yarning circle	Both the culturally safe space that is created for communication on issues important to Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples, and the process of engaging in collective, cultural, trusting and respectful communication on important subjects.