

Changing Labour Market Dynamics in Australia: Skill Shortages, Job Transitions, and Artificial Intelligence Technology Adoption

by Nikolas Dawson

Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

under the supervision of Distinguished Professor Mary-Anne Williams, Dr Marian-Andrei Rizoiu, and Dr Benjamin Johnston

University of Technology Sydney Faculty of Engineering & IT

June 2021

CERTIFICATE OF ORIGINAL AUTHORSHIP

, Nikolas Dawson declare that this thesis, is submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the School of Computer Science, Faculty of Engineering & IT at the University of Technology Sydney.

This thesis is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis. This document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution. This research is supported by the Australian Government Research Training Program.

Production Note: SIGNATURE: Signature removed prior to publication.

[Nikolas Dawson]

DATE: 27th June, 2021

PLACE: Sydney, Australia

© 2021 by Nikolas Dawson All Rights Reserved

ABSTRACT

he Australian labour market is in the midst of significant structural changes. Emerging technologies, such as Artificial Intelligence (AI), are changing the demands for skills and tasks within jobs. Additionally, the economic crisis induced by COVID-19, in conjunction with other factors, have accelerated these adjustments. Three major issues for the Australian labour market are (1) skill shortages, (2) job transitions, and (3) AI adoption at the firm-level. This thesis by compilation addresses each of these issues in a series of four standalone papers. The first paper puts forward a range of indicators to detect skill shortages from a longitudinal dataset of online job advertisements (ads). The second paper develops a machine learning model that accurately predicts skill shortages from job ads data and employment statistics. The third paper conducts an in-depth case study of the journalism jobs crisis in Australia, examining both the changes in labour demand (using job ads) and labour supply (using employment statistics) from 2012-2020. Last, the fourth paper develops a novel method to measure the similarity between sets of skills from real-time job ads data. These similarity measures are then combined with other labour market variables to build a 'Job Transitions Recommender System' that accurately predicts transition pathways between occupations, validated against a longitudinal household survey. The same skills set similarity method is then used to construct a measure of new technology adoption in labour markets, showcasing AI.

DEDICATION

To my wife, Emma, for her ongoing love, patience, and support.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Indertaking doctoral research has been both the hardest and most rewarding endeavour of my career thus far. It has been a marathon to complete and a rollercoaster of emotions. While working towards my doctorate has developed skills and knowledge that I'll carry forward in my career, it has also taught me a significant lesson: *the most important thing to do is to think for yourself.* This is the foundation of great research or creating anything new of lasting value. A lesson that is simple to preach but difficult to practice.

I underestimated the amount of support required for completing a Ph.D. when I began my research. Thankfully, I have had plenty, for whom I would like to acknowledge here. First, to my principal supervisor, Mary-Anne Williams, who made my candidacy possible. Mary-Anne has enabled opportunities throughout my Ph.D. Most notably, arranging a research assistant position with the United Nations in Geneva for a project on the 'Economic Impacts of Artificial Intelligence'. I thank Mary-Anne for the opportunities and support she has provided – these opportunities have shaped me professionally and personally. I would also like to thank Benjamin Johnston, one of my co-supervisors, for some technical assistance and valuable feedback he provided early in my Ph.D.

To Marian-Andrei Rizoiu (Andrei), my other co-supervisor, I express my deepest gratitude. The research presented in this thesis and their corresponding publications would not have been possible without Andrei's guidance. Andrei is among the most intelligent and capable people I know. It has been a rare privilege to work with and learn from Andrei. I hope that we get the opportunity to work together in the future again.

Central to all of the research papers that I present in this thesis are job advertisements data, which have been generously provided by Burning Glass Technologies (BGT). Therefore, I would like to acknowledge and thank BGT for granting access to these data that enabled this research. Specifically, I would like to thank Bledi Taska and Davor Miskulin from BGT for establishing the data sharing agreement and for their valuable feedback on the various papers.

Last, I would like to thank my family and friends for being a constant source of support during this process. To my mother, Annmaree, who has created a foundation of support that has given me every chance to succeed. To my uncle, Berto, whose editing and feedback has been invaluable for the research papers presented in this thesis and other pieces of writing. And to my wife, Emma, whose love and support has been unwavering, even during the stresses of deadlines. Thank you for centring and helping me on this journey.

LIST OF PUBLICATIONS & STATEMENT OF CONTRIBUTION

RELATED TO THE THESIS (PUBLISHED):

- Dawson, N., MA. Rizoiu, B. Johnston, and MA. Williams. 2019. "Adaptively Selecting Occupations to Detect Skill Shortages from Online Job Ads." In 2019 IEEE International Conference on Big Data (Big Data), 1637–43 [120].
- Dawson, N., MA. Rizoiu, B. Johnston, and MA. Williams. 2020. "Predicting Skill Shortages in Labor Markets: A Machine Learning Approach." In *The 4th IEEE* Workshop on Human-in-the-Loop Methods and Future of Work in BigData (Colocated with 2020 IEEE International Conference on Big Data) [121].
- Dawson, N., S. Molitorisz, MA. Rizoiu, and P. Fray. 2021. "Layoffs, Inequity and COVID-19: A Longitudinal Study of the Journalism Jobs Crisis in Australia from 2012 to 2020." *Journalism* [118].

RELATED TO THE THESIS (UNDER REVIEW):

 Dawson, N., MA. Rizoiu, and MA. Williams. 2021. "Skill-driven Recommendations for Job Transition Pathways." – submitted to *PLOS ONE* and awaiting second round of peer reviews as of the 25th of June 2021.

NOT INCLUDED IN THE THESIS (PUBLISHED):

 Gromov, A., A. Maslennikov, N. Dawson, K. Musial, and K. Kitto. 2020. "Curriculum profile: modelling the gaps between curriculum and the job market." In *Proceedings* of *The 13th International Conference on Educational Data Mining (EDM 2020)*, pp. 610-614 [168]. Dawson, N., and MA Rizoiu. 2020. "Coronavirus Infecting Australian Jobs: Vacancy Rates down since Early February." The Conversation, March 22, 2020. http:// theconversation.com/coronavirus-infecting-australian-jobs-vacancy-rates-down-sinceearly-february-134234.

Title	Lead Au- thor	Co-Author 1	Co-Author 2	Co-Author 3
Adaptively Selecting Oc- cupations to Detect Skill Shortages from Online Job Ads.	Nikolas Dawson	Dr. Marian-Andrei Rizoiu , Lecturer at UTS and Ph.D. co- supervisor – assisted with the design of the research, data analy- sis, and manuscript editing.	Dr. Benjamin John- ston , Senior Lecturer at UTS and Ph.D. co- supervisor – provided feedback and techni- cal assistance.	Distinguished Pro- fessor Mary-Anne Williams , UTS and Ph.D. supervisor – assisted with data col- lection and provided feedback.
Predicting Skill Short- ages in Labor Markets: A Machine Learning Approach.	Nikolas Dawson	Dr. Marian-Andrei Rizoiu , Lecturer at UTS and Ph.D. co- supervisor – assisted with the design of the research, data analy- sis, and manuscript editing.	Dr. Benjamin John- ston , Senior Lecturer at UTS and Ph.D. co- supervisor – provided feedback and techni- cal assistance.	Distinguished Pro- fessor Mary-Anne Williams , UTS and Ph.D. supervisor – assisted with data col- lection and provided feedback.
Layoffs, In- equity and COVID-19: A Longitudinal Study of the Journalism Jobs Crisis in Australia from 2012 to 2020.	Nikolas Dawson	Dr. Sacha Moli- torisz , Lecturer at UTS – assisted with the design of the re- search, preparation of the manuscript, and journalism-specific expertise.	Dr. Marian-Andrei Rizoiu , Lecturer at UTS and Ph.D. co- supervisor – assisted with the design of the research, data analy- sis, and manuscript editing.	Peter Fray , Manag- ing Editor at Private Media – assisted with the design of the re- search.
Skill-driven Recommen- dations for Job Transition Pathways.	Nikolas Dawson	Dr. Marian-Andrei Rizoiu , Lecturer at UTS and Ph.D. co- supervisor – assisted with the design of the research, data analy- sis, and manuscript editing.	Distinguished Pro- fessor Mary-Anne Williams , UTS and Ph.D. supervisor – assisted with data col- lection and provided feedback.	

Table 1: Papers and contributions by co-authors.

THE ABOVE STATED INFORMATION IS CORRECT:

Production Note:

SIGNATURE:

Signature removed prior to publication.

[Marian-Andrei Rizoiu]

Production Note:

SIGNATURE: _______ Signature removed prior to publication.

[Mary-Anne Williams]

Production Note: Signature removed prior to publication.

[Benjamin Johnston]

Production Note:

SIGNATURE: Signature removed prior to publication.

[Sacha Molitorisz]

Production Note:

SIGNATURE: ______ Signature removed prior to publication.

[Peter Fray]

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Li	st of	Public	cations	ix
Li	st of	Figure	es	xix
Li	st of	Tables	3	xxv
1	Intr	oduct	ion	1
	1.1	Identi	ified research gaps	3
	1.2	Aims	and contributions of this research	4
	1.3	Thesis	s structure: A Ph.D. by compilation of papers	6
2	Lite	erature	e Review	9
	2.1	Austr	alia's changing labour market	9
		2.1.1	Australia's labour market performance	10
		2.1.2	The changing nature of employment and skills in Australia's work-	
			force	12
		2.1.3	Labour Market Programmes: supporting displaced workers to tran-	
			sition	17
	2.2	Job tr	ansitions & skill mismatches	25
		2.2.1	Occupational mobility and job transitions	25
	2.3	AI & i	its impacts on labour markets	30
		2.3.1	Defining AI	31
		2.3.2	Categorising the Extent of AI	32
		2.3.3	Research Trends & Subsets of AI	33
		2.3.4	Drivers of Recent AI Advancements	36
		2.3.5	AI as the Next General Purpose Technology	38
		2.3.6	Projecting the Economic Impacts of AI	40

		2.3.7	Creative Destruction: Long-term relationship between technology and jobs	4
		2.3.8	AI and Inequality	
		2.3.9	AI Adoption	
	2.4		oning this research	
	2.4	1 05101		0
3	Рар	er 1 -	Adaptively selecting occupations to detect skill shortages	
	fror	n onlir	ne job ads 5	59
	3.1	Introd	luction	60
	3.2	Relate	ed Work & Limitations	53
	3.3	Skill s	similarity and sets of related skills	34
	3.4	DSA o	occupations and categories	55
	3.5	Detect	ting Skill Shortages from Job Ads	66
		3.5.1	Variables for detecting skill shortages	58
		3.5.2	Predict job ad posting 6	59
	3.6	Discus	ssion	0
	3.7	Conclu	usions and Future Research	'3
	3.8	Suppl	ementary Materials	$^{\prime}5$
		3.8.1	Australia's looming DSA Shortfall	$^{\prime}5$
		3.8.2	Limitations of Online Job Ads Data	$^{\prime}5$
		3.8.3	Challenges with Classifying Occupations	6
		3.8.4	DSA Skill Demands 7	6
		3.8.5	Time Series Forecasting with Prophet	7
		3.8.6	Evaluating performance	8
		3.8.7	DSA Skills List	'9
4	Рар	er 2 -	Predicting Skill Shortages in Labor Markets: A Machine	
	Lea	rning.	Approach 8	31
	4.1	Introd	luction	32
	4.2	Relate	ed Work & Limitations	35
		4.2.1	Measuring Labor Shortages	5
		4.2.2	Economic Costs of Skill Shortages	37
	4.3	Data a		88
		4.3.1	Data sources and constructed features	8
		4.3.2	Quantify skill importance for occupations	0
		4.3.3	Predictive Setup for Skill Shortages)1

	4.4	Result	${ m ts}$. 93
		4.4.1	Profiling the Skills Shortage Prediction dataset	. 94
		4.4.2	Skill importance levels for Data Scientists.	. 96
		4.4.3	Predict Skill Shortages	. 97
		4.4.4	Feature Importance for Predicting Skill Shortages	. 98
	4.5	Discus	ssion	. 99
	4.6	Conclu	usion and Future Work	. 101
	4.7	Suppl	ementary Materials	. 102
		4.7.1	Cyclical and Structural Factors Affecting Skill Shortages	. 102
		4.7.2	Oversampling	. 103
		4.7.3	Performance metrics	. 104
		4.7.4	Using a standardized occupation taxonomy – ANZSCO	. 104
		4.7.5	Summary of constructed features	. 105
		4.7.6	Feature correlation analysis	. 106
_	ъ	о т		
5	-		Layoffs, Inequity and COVID-19: A Longitudinal Study of the	107
			m Jobs Crisis in Australia from 2012 to 2020	
	5.1 5.2			
	5.2		ed Work & Background	
	5.3		& Methods	
		5.3.1	Data Sources	
	F 4	5.3.2	Skill Similarity	
	5.4		Data Analysis and Results	
		5.4.1	Posting Frequency & Employment levels	
		5.4.2	Salaries	
		5.4.3 5.4.4	Trend Analysis & Predictability	
		- · ·	Gender	
		5.4.5	Location	
		5.4.6	Education & Experience	
		5.4.7	Employment Type	
		5.4.8 Diama	Journalism Skills	
	5.5		ssion	
		5.5.1	Volatility of journalism jobs	
		5.5.2	Gender Wage Gap	
		5.5.3	Location	. 131

		5.5.4	Evolving journalism skills
	5.6	Conclu	usion
	5.7		ementary Materials
		5.7.1	Data Sources
		5.7.2	Skill Similarity
		5.7.3	Trend Analysis & Predictability
		5.7.4	Quantify Labour Demand Volatility
		5.7.5	Top Journalism Skills by Year 141
6	Рар	er 4 - S	Skill-driven Recommendations for Job Transition Pathways 143
	6.1	Introd	uction
	6.2	Mater	ials and methods
		6.2.1	Datasets and ground-truth
		6.2.2	Measuring skill similarity
		6.2.3	Job Transitions Recommender System setup
		6.2.4	Constructing a leading indicator of AI adoption
	6.3	Result	s & Discussion
		6.3.1	Skill similarity results
		6.3.2	SKILLS SPACE results
		6.3.3	Validation of SKILLS SPACE distance
		6.3.4	Job Transitions Recommender System
		6.3.5	A leading indicator of AI adoption
		6.3.6	Limitations
	6.4	Conclu	usion \ldots \ldots \ldots \ldots \ldots \ldots \ldots 165
	6.5	Supple	ementary Materials
		6.5.1	Using a standardized occupation taxonomy – ANZSCO 167
		6.5.2	Model Features
		6.5.3	Validation
		6.5.4	Recommending Jobs & Skills
		6.5.5	AI Adoption
		6.5.6	Skill Count Distribution
		6.5.7	Posting Frequency of AI Seed Skills
		6.5.8	Advantages of Skill Similarity over Posting Frequency 179
7	Disc	cussior	n & Conclusion 181
	7.1	Limita	ations and future research

graphy	I	187
7.1.4	A final note	186
7.1.3	AI adoption	185
7.1.2	Job transitions	184
7.1.1	Skill shortages 1	182

Bibliography

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE

Page

2.1	Monthly unemployment and underemployment rates in Australia from 1978	
	to 2020 for the (a) total Australian workforce and (b) youth workforce aged	
	15-24 years from the ABS [33].	11
2.2	(a) Full-time (FT) and part-time (PT) monthly employment levels (000's) by	
	gender in Australia (b) monthly employment to population ratio by gender in	
	Australia.	13
2.3	Employment change by industry over 20 years from to May 2018 (000's)	14
2.4	Australian (a) employment by skill type as a percentage of total employment	
	and (b) employment by skill level as a percentage of total employment	15
2.5	Australian unemployment and labour market participation in 2017 by educa-	
	tional attainment.	16
2.6	The number of persons (000's) who ceased a job during the last three months	
	because they were retrenched or were self-employed whose business closed	
	down. The stacked bar charts further indicate the current employment status	
	of persons retrenched as 'employed', 'unemployed', and 'not in labour force'	
	(NILF). The orange line highlights the retrenchment rate as a percentage of	
	the total workforce.	22
2.7	A basic illustration of a feed-forward neural network architecture used for DL.	37
2.8	Examples of occupations according to the 'Task Model' put forward by Autor	
	et al. [47]	42
2.9	Comparison of labour automation risk by study as shown by Bruckner et	
	al. [84]	43
2.10	Distribution of labour force by agriculture, manufacturing, and services in	
	the US from 1840-2010 [156].	47
3.1	Defining DSA Categories adopted from Markow et al and Blake [70, 227]	67

3.2	Labour demand variables for detecting skill shortages from job ads data: posting frequency (a) and its annual growth (b); median salary (Australian \$) (c); education level (years of formal education) (d); experience (years) (e) and job ad posting predictability in terms of SMAPE error scores (f)	69
3.3	Sliding window setup for evaluating job ads forecasting performance	03 71
3.4	Trend lines of daily online job ad postings	72
3.5	Top 10 DSA Skills for each year from 2012-2019	
0.0		••
4.1	Overview of Skills Shortage Dataset : (a) Proportion of occupations represented in dataset by ANZSCO Major Group classes; (b) count of occupations grouped by the number of years <i>In Shortage</i> (the colors correspond to the same occupational categories observed in the Fig. 4.1(a) legend); (c) yearly distribution of occupations classified as <i>Not in Shortage</i> (light blue bars - 718 total) or <i>In Shortage</i> (dark blue bars - 206 total) and the yearly number of occupations whose shortage status has changed since the previous year (orange stars).	93
4.2	Top occupations most <i>In Shortage</i> at the ANZSCO 6-digit occupational level.	94
4.3	 Comparison of two methods to analyze underlying skill demands of occupations in shortage: (a) posting frequency of skills in an occupation; (b) Revealed Comparative Advantage of skills in an occupation to normalize highly-common skills and uncover skills most relevant to an occupation 	95
4.4	Skills Shortage prediction results : (a) While the prediction results are highly auto-regressive, Labor Demand and Labor Supply features alone (and combined) perform almost as well for predicting occupational shortages; (b) Labor Demand and Labor Supply features perform better than other features at predicting shortage status changes of occupations.	96
4.5	Feature importance of Labor Demand (LD) and Labor Supply (LS) feature model.	99
4.6	Correlation analysis between modeled features.	106
5.1	Quarterly posting frequency of journalism job ads (see Sec. Section 5.3) and employment levels of 'Journalists & Other Writers' at the ANZSCO Unit level (000's) from Jan 2012 to Mar 2020	118

5.2	Posting frequency for journalism jobs during the early stages of the	
	COVID-19 crisis in Australia and its major cities : (a) Weekly posting	
	frequency volumes for journalists and all Australian job ads between April	
	2019 and March 2020. Both decreased as the early stages of the COVID-19	
	crisis hit; (b) Monthly posting frequency for journalists were down 63 per cent	
	when comparing March 2019 to March 2020. This was significantly higher	
	than all Australian job vacancies, which was down 37 per cent over the same	
	period	119
5.3	Journalist salaries (solid blue line) increased according to job ads data, but	
	remained below market average levels (dashed blue line). However, according	
	to ABS data, 'Journalists & Other Writers' (ANZSCO Unit level, solid orange	
	line) earned a growing wage premium above the market average (dashed	
	orange line).	120
5.4	Trend lines of posting frequency for 'Journalists', 'Data Scientists', 'Data	
	Analysts', and 'All Australian job ads'. Posting frequency for 'Journalists'	
	trended downwards since 2016.	121
5.5	(a) Predictability comparison of temporal posting frequency highlighting the	
	difficulties of predicting journalism job ads and their volatility. \ldots	121
5.6	Journalist employment levels and salaries by Gender: (a) Since 2015,	
	the employment ratio of female-to-male journalists increased; (b) Wage in-	
	equality increased between males and females in the 'Journalists & Other	
	Writers' Unit group. This was at the same time that the average age of	
	journalists decreased for females and increasing for males since 2014. \ldots	122
5.7	Location of journalists in Australia: (a) Posting frequency for journalism	
	jobs decreased in major Australian cities, in relative terms; (b) As of 2019,	
	the majority of journalists in Australia were employed in New South Wales,	
	Victoria, and Queensland, respectively.	123
5.8	(a) Years of Education demanded by employers from job ads were consistent	
	with the market average; (b) Years of Experience required by employers con-	
	sistently remained below the market average, according to job ads. However,	
	this gap had closed since 2014.	124
5.9	Temporary positions represented the majority of journalism job ads in Aus-	
	tralia.	125
5.10	The absolute posting frequency (a) and relative yearly rank (b) of three major	
	journalism skills increased between 2012 and 2019. \ldots	126

- 6.3 Validation and the Transitions Map. Visualizes a subset of the Transitions Map, where 20 occupations and their pairwise transition probabilities can be observed. In this visualization, transitions occur from columns to rows, and dark blue depicts high transition probabilities, and white depicts low probabilities. While job transitions to the same occupation yield the highest probabilities (dark blue diagonal squares), it is clear that transitions are asymmetric. The dendrogram highlights how similar occupations cluster together, where there is a clear divide between services and manual labor occupations.

- Here, we demonstrate the Job Transitions Recommender System using the 6.5 'Domestic Cleaner' occupation as an example - an occupation classified as a 'non-essential' occupation and that has experienced significant declines during the beginning of the COVID-19 outbreak in Australia. (upper panel) The twodimensional space of occupations (see Fig. 6.1) with 'essential' occupations in blue markers and 'non-essential' occupations in red markers. (lower panel) We first use the *Transitions Map* to calculate the occupations with the highest transition probabilities (other than itself). These are the nodes on the right side of the flow diagram in the bottom panel of the figure, where the link colors depict posting frequency percentage change from March-April 2019 to March-April 2020. The link widths represent the posting frequency volume of March-April 2020 to indicate labor demand. The top six occupations have all experienced significant declines during the COVID-19 period; however, the seventh recommendation, 'Aged and Disabled Carers', is experiencing significant labor demand growth. 'Aged and Disabled Carers' were also classified as an 'essential' occupation during COVID-19 in Australia. We select this as the target occupation and then make personalized skill recommendations. We argue that workers trying to transition to another occupation should invest time and resources into skill development when (1) the skills are of **high importance** and (2) there is a **high distance** to acquire the skill. Conversely, workers should *not* focus on skill development if (1) the skills are **low importance** or (2) there is a **low distance** to acquire the skill. 160

6.12	(a) Ablation test of classifier features and (b) feature importance analysis $\ . \ .$	174
6.13	Yearly skill similarities between AI skills and Australian Industry (ANZSIC	
	Division) skill sets from 2012-2019	176
6.14	Empirical Cumulative Distribution Function of skill counts within job ads for	
	2018	177
6.15	Yearly posting frequency of the five AI seed skills used to build a dynamic list	
	of yearly AI skills.	178
6.16	The percentage of vacancies in Australia that contain these five AI seed skills.	179

LIST OF TABLES

1	Papers and contributions by co-authors.
Т	YABLEPage
3.1	Selected DSA Occupations and their job ad counts
3.2	Top DSA Skills Growth 78
3.3	Selected 150 Data Science and Analytics skills
4.1	Summary of constructed features and their explanation
5.1	Random sample of journalism job ad titles
5.2	Top journalism skills calculated by skill similarity methodology in Skill Simi-
	<i>larity</i>
6.1	Summary of constructed features and their explanation