

Multi-scale analysis of wrinkling during consolidation of thermoset composites

by Vu An Le

Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

under the supervision of Dr Sanjay Nimbalkar Dr Sardar Malekmohammadi Dr Emre Erkmen Dr Navid Zobeiry

University of Technology Sydney Faculty of Engineering and Information Technology

July 2022

CERTIFICATE OF ORIGINAL AUTHORSHIP

I, Vu An Le declare that this thesis, is submitted in fulfillment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the School of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Faculty of Engineering and Information Technology at the University of Technology Sydney.

This thesis is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

This document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

This research is supported by the Australian Government Research Training Program Scholarship.

Signature: Signature removed prior to publication.

Vu An Le

Date: 15/07/2022

Acknowledgements

This work would not have been possible without the support of my colleagues, friends and family and I owe all of them my most profound thanks.

I am sincerely grateful to all my supervisors, Dr Emre Erkmen, Dr Sardar Malek, Dr Rijun Shrestha, Dr Sanjay Nimbalkar and Dr Navid Zobeiry for their invaluable support, encouragement and guidance throughout my PhD study. I would like to thank Dr Emre Erkmen for accepting me as his PhD student, giving me a chance to work with Dr Sardar Malek when he was about to leave UTS and still providing me with his supervision remotely. Great appreciation for the excellent inspiration and continuous support from Dr Sardar Malek is expressed. His constructive criticisms and encouragement constantly motivated me. Particular gratitude is given to Dr Sanjay Nimbalkar for his kindness and assistance in the final year of my PhD. I would like to acknowledge and thank Dr Navid Zobeiry who was always willing to provide me with important advice for achieving my major milestones during my 4-year study. Without his advice, detailed comments and constructive feedback, my work would not have been possible.

My sincere and deep respect goes to the staff at the Faculty of Engineering and IT, especially Prof Hadi Khabbaz, Dr Nadarajah Gowripalan and Mrs Van Le for their dedicated encouragement, attention and support throughout my PhD candidature. I would like to acknowledge the financial support provided by International Research Scholarship and UTS-VIED scholarship. I also truly value the friendship of several close friends who I met in Sydney. I appreciate their time for listening, sharing and encouraging me during my PhD.

Lastly, I would like to thank my family without whom this work would not have been accomplished. I would like to thank my beloved parents for their endless and unconditional love throughout my life. I would like to thank my dear sisters and brothers for standing at my side and encouraging me to follow my passion. Special thanks go to my parents-in-law for taking care of my lovely son, as this helped me to accomplish my PhD program as planned.

List of publications

Le, A., Zobeiry, N., Erkmen, E. & Malek, S. 2019, 'Buckling analysis of multilayered beams with soft and rigid interfaces', *ICCM22*, Engineers Australia, Melbourne, Vic, pp. 204-12.

Le, V.A., Zobeiry, N., Erkmen, E. & Malek, S. 2021, 'Buckling behaviour of laminated viscoelastic composites under axial loads', *Mechanics of Materials*, 159, 103897.

Le, V.A., Nimbalkar, S., Zobeiry, N. & Malek, S. 2022, 'An efficient multi-scale approach for viscoelastic analysis of woven composites under bending', *Composite Structures*, 292, 115698.

Le, V.A., Nimbalkar, S., Zobeiry, N. & Malek, S. 2022, 'Multi-scale viscoelastic bending analysis of laminated composites with soft interfaces', Full paper submitted to *ECCM20*, Lausanne- Switzerland.

Title Pagei
Declarationi
Acknowledgementsii
List of publicationsiii
Table of contentiv
List of figuresvii
List of tables xi
Abstract xiv
Chapter 1. Introduction1
1.1. Laminated composites1
1.2. Textile composites
1.3. Overview of composite manufacturing techniques
1.4. Applications and challenges
1.5. Knowledge gaps9
1.6. Research objectives 10
1.7. Thesis structure
Chapter 2. Literature review17
2.1. Micro-mechanical modelling of circular fibre composites
2.1.1. Analytical micromechanics equations for predicting properties of solid unidirectional composites
2.1.2. Predicting the viscoelastic properties of composites during cure
2.2. Meso-mechanical modelling of textile composites
2.3. Buckling behaviour of laminated viscoelastic composites
2.4. Bending behaviour of woven composites during forming processes
2.4.1. Bending properties of uncured thin laminates
Chapter 3. Research methodology

Table of content

3.1. Micro- and meso-scale model 40
3.1.1. Micro-mechanical modelling of UD composites413.1.2. Analytical procedure for predicting elastic engineering constants of woven composites at the meso-scale413.1.2.1. Geometric modelling of 5HS satin weave423.1.2.2. Discretisation technique of yarns and determination of three-dimensional effective stiffnesses44
3.2. Macro-scale (structural) modelling of viscoelastic composites
 3.2.1. Numerical approach using Abaqus built-in viscoelastic model (IF)
Chapter 4. Buckling analysis of multilayered elastic beams with soft and rigid interfaces
4.1. Introduction
4.2. Method
4.3. Multilayered cantilever beam under bending (Case I)
4.4. Flat laminate under compressive load (Case II)53
4.4.1. Two pinned ends 54 4.4.2. Four fixed edges 57
4.5. Summary and conclusions
Chapter 5. Buckling behaviour of laminated viscoelastic composites under axial loads
5.1. Introduction
5.2. Method
5.3. Model verification
5.3.1. Geometry and input parameters625.3.2. FE analysis64
5.4. Model validation and comparison with experiments
5.4.1. Isotropic viscoelastic material695.4.2. Orthotropic viscoelastic material76
5.5. Summary and conclusions
Chapter 6. Bending behviour of viscoelatic woven composite plates

6.1. Introduction	
6.2. Method	
6.2.1. Micro- and meso-scale properties	
6.2.2. Macro-scale analysis	
6.2.2.1. Analytical method	
6.2.2.2. Numerical method	89
6.3. Results and model validation	
6.3.1. Elastic material	
6.3.1.1. Micro-scale results	91
6.3.1.2. Meso-scale properties	
6.3.2. Viscoelastic material	94
6.4. Discussion	
6.5. Summary and conclusions	110
Chapter 7: Bending behaviour of multilayered viscoelastic plates with th	in and soft
interfaces	
7.1. Introduction	
7.2. Method	
7.3. Macro-scale model	
7.4. Results and model validation	
7.4.1. Elastic material	
7.4.2. Viscoelastic material	119
7.5. Summary and conclusions	
Chapter 8. Conclusions and recommendations	126
8.1. Summary	
8.2. Contributions and Key findings	
8.3. Limitations and recommendations for future studies	
Appendices	
A.1. Transformation matrix used in Eq. (3.7)	
A.2. Differential approach to modelling generally orthotropic materials.	
A.3. Implementation	
References	

List of figures

Figure 1.1: Typical reinforcement types
Figure 1.2: Arrangement of plies in (a) a unidirectional (UD) layup (b) a quasi-isotropic layup
Figure 1.3: Classification of textile composites
(Dixit & Singh 2013)
Figure 1.4: Schematic of the common weaves. (a) Plain weave. (b) Twill weave. (c) 5-harness (5HS) satin weave
Figure 1.5: Principle of autoclave curing
Figure 1.6: Buckling of the plies due to the excess length with fixed ends during consolidation (Adapted from Belnoue et al. (2018))
Figure 1.7: Thesis structure
Figure 2.1: Composite Cylindrical Assemblage (Malek 2014)18
Figure 2.2: Fibre bed deforms under shear stress. (a) Fibre bed deforms together with resin. (b) Fibre deforms under the overall shear stress. (c) Analog representation
(Malek, Thorpe & Poursartip 2011)
Figure 2.3: Schematic of (a) mosaic model; (b) undulation model and (c) bridging model proposed by Ishikawa & Chou (1982)
Figure 2.4: Unit cell of plain weave composite improved by Naik & Shembekar (1992)
Figure 2.5: Schematic of (a) "X model"; (b) "Y model" and (c) "Z model" developed by Tan, Tong & Steven (1999)
Figure 2.6: Schematic of (a) the representative unit cell in a 3D orthotropic laminated composite; (b) the discretised stripes of layer l ; (c) global and local coordinate systems for stripe 1 (Wu, Brown & Davies 2002)
Figure 2.7: Schematic of 3 Stage Homogenisation Method (3SHM) developed by Hallal et al. (2012)
Figure 3.1: Schematic of the multi-scale modelling framework for viscoelastic modelling of orthotropic composites (Adopted from Malek (2014))
Figure 3.2: (a) The RUC geometry and notation for a 5-harness satin weave composite; (b)Yarn cross-sectional shape (c) Orientation angles
Figure 4.1: Two types of analysis model employed for this study
Figure 4.2: Composite layup
Figure 4.3: The role of interface stiffness and ply anisotropy on the multilayered cantilever beam rigidity

Figure 4.4: Comparisons of FE results with Euler predictions for isotropic plies (E_p = 100
GPa) bonded with a range of interfaces
Figure 4.5: Buckling mode shape for flat laminates with stiff interfaces ($E_i = 100$ GPa) using PML approach. The beam cross section is depicted on the right side
Figure 4.6: Buckling mode shape for flat laminates with stiff interfaces ($E_i = 100$ GPa) using Abaqus CE. The laminate layup is depicted on the right side for clarity
Figure 4.7: Buckling mode shape for flat laminates with soft interfaces ($E_i = 100$ kPa) using PML approach
Figure 4.8: The influence of ply elastic constants on the buckling response of flat laminates using PML approach
Figure 4.9: Magnitude displacement (in mm) at critical buckling load – Composite element model – $E_i = 100$ GPa
Figure 4.10: Internal buckling wavelength along the beam length – Physically modelling layers
Figure 5.1: Detail of the 3D model under axial displacement
(According to Wang, Long & Clifford (2009))
Figure 5.2: FE mesh of the buckled laminated composite under axial loading
Figure 5.3: Comparison of deformed shape and Mises effective stress (in MPa) at ultimate state for cured isotropic laminates with different mesh sizes: (a) Mesh 1 (b) Mesh 2 (c) Mesh 3 (d) Mesh 4 under uniform axial displacement
Figure 5.4: Comparison of the deformed shape (mode shape 1) obtained from the eigenvalue for the cured composite assuming: (a) isotropic (b) transversely isotropic material behaviour under uniform axial displacement
Figure 5.5: Effect of loading rate on force vs displacement relationship using IF (Case 2a). The resin viscoelastic properties are taken from Section 3.1.1 in Abaqus Benchmarks Guide. The material properties are listed in Table 5.5
Figure 5.6: Comparison between IF (Case 2a) and DF (Case 2b) approaches for two presentative cases. The viscoelastic properties of the resin are provided in Section 3.1.1 in Abaqus Benchmarks Guide
Figure 5.7: Effect of Prony series constants on force vs displacement relationship using IF
(Case 2a and 3a) and DF (Case 2b and 3b) viscoelastic model compare to isotropic model
(Case 1). The same loading rate of 4.4 mm/min has been used in all cases
Figure 5.8: Stress relaxation response under tensile load calculated using: (a) a single- term Prony series (b) twelve-term Prony series
Figure 5.9: Effect of E_0 on the buckling behaviour of the isotropic viscoelastic laminates using IF. The resin viscoelastic properties are taken from Section 3.1.1 in Abaqus Benchmarks Guide (Case 2a) at rate of 10 mm/min

Figure 5.10: Effect of ply anisotropy on the buckling response of viscoelastic composites.
Various resin viscoelastic properties are assumed as listed in Table 5.5 and the same
loading rate of 4.4 mm/min is considered for all cases
Figure 5.11: Results of parametric studies: Effect of (a) increasing E_o (Case 5), (b) increasing E_∞ (Case 6) and (c) higher E_o and E_∞ (Case 7) on the buckling behaviour of the uncured orthotropic viscoelastic laminates using DF. The resin viscoelastic properties are provided in Table 5.4 (w_i and τ_i) and Table 5.10 (E_o and E_∞). The loading rate is 4.4 mm/min in all cases.
Figure 6.1: (a) Schematic of the multi-scale modelling approach for bending behaviour of
5-harness satin weave composites from micro-scale to macro-scale; (b) Flow chart depicting the analytical and numerical models utilized in the multi-scale analysis
Figure 6.2: Bending of a cantilever beam: (a) beam with load; (b) deflection curve; (c) cross-section of beam showing the x-axis as the neutral axis of the cross-section 89
Figure 6.3: (a) Bending profile with tip displacement of 10 mm
(b) Bending moment – curvature relation in the isotropic elastic beam ($E = 500$ MPa, $v = 0.2$) 90
Figure 6.4: Detail of the 3D model under bending
(According to Alshahrani & Hojjati (2017b))
Figure 6.5: Deformed sample at tip displacement of 50 mm (U_3 in mm)
Figure 6.6: Bending moment versus curvature based on isotropic elastic material assumption. 98
Figure 6.7: Bending moment versus curvature of uncured 5HS prepreg with different values of fibre stiffness (E_1). A loading rate of 3 mm/s is considered for all cases 107
Figure 6.8: Effect of loading rate on bending moment versus curvature of 5HS prepreg. Fibre stiffness is assumed to be $E_1 = 1.5$ GPa in all cases
Figure 6.9: Comparison between IF and DF approaches for the validation case (effective fibre modulus $E_1 = 1.5$ GPa). The viscoelastic properties of the resin are provided in Table 6.9.
Figure 6.10: Comparision between prepreg and dry 5HS behaviour according to different assumed values for fibre stiffness, E_1
Figure 7.1: Schematic of the multi-scale modelling approach for bending behaviour of 5- harness satin weave multilayered composites from micro-scale to macro-scale 115
Figure 7.2: Bending model of a three-layer plate. Each layer is separated by a thin interface of 0.01 mm (According to Alshahrani & Hojjati (2017a))
Figure 7.3: FE mesh of the three-layer plate used in this study. Numbers of mesh are 30 \times 75 \times 24 in X, Y and Z respectively
Figure 7.4: Deformed sample at tip displacement of 30 mm (U_3 in mm) under bending. The top end is is restrained from all displacements in a length of 30 mm

Figure 7.5: The effect of interface properties on the bending loads. Required loads to
reach a tip displacement of 30 mm at room temperature are compared using various
material models. Resin viscoelastic properties selected for the orthotropic viscoelastic
material model are provided in (Thorpe 2012). The model has the length of 150 mm, the
width of 50 mm and the thickness of 1.67 mm
Figure 7.6: The effect of interface properties on the bending loads in a thick laminate.
Required loads to reach a tip displacement of 30 mm at room temperature are compared
using various material models. The model has the length of 80 mm, the width of 50 mm
and the thickness of 3.91 mm 122
Figure 7.7: Stacking sequences of three-layer plate (a) Stacking 1 [0°/0°/0°]; (b) Stacking
2 [0°/45°/0°]; (c) Stacking 3 [0°/45°/45°]; (d) Stacking 4 [45°/45°/0°]
Figure 7.8: Moment vs curvature for all selected stacking sequences at room temperature.
A loading rate of 3 mm/s is considered and the interface modulus, E_i , is assumed 7 MPa
for all cases. Resin viscoelastic properties selected for the orthotropic viscoelastic material
model are provided in (Thorpe 2012) 124

List of tables

Table 2.1: List of experimental studies on deformation of uncured composites andcalibrated material properties for the corresponding FE simulations.37
Table 4.1: Comparisons between current FE predictions, Dodwell (2015)'s FE results,and the analytical model based on Euler-Bernoulli kinematics (Eq. 4.1) for a multilayeredcantilever beam (Case I)
Table 4.2: Input properties of the transversely isotropic plies. 52
Table 4.3: Input properties of the transversely isotropic plies. 56
Table 4.4: Comparisons of FE results between composite element models and models layered physically $-E_p = 100$ GPa for all cases
Table 5.1: Input properties according to Wang, Long & Clifford (2009) for the cured sample
Table 5.2: Mesh convergence study results 66
Table 5.3: Comparisons of critical buckling loads between theoretical result and eigenvalue and large deformation analyses for the cured composite assuming isotropic and transversely isotropic input parameters. 68
Table 5.4: Prony series parameters for MTM45-1 epoxy as reported in Thorpe (2012) 70
Table 5.5: Summary of case studies considered in Section 5.3
Table 5.6: The shear moduli G_i associated with the specific relaxation time, τ_i used for Case 3b
Table 5.7: Material properties of fibre, resin and fibre bed used in the buckling simulation of composite laminates. 77
Table 5.8: Relaxed and unrelaxed values of components of the composite relaxation matrix. 78
Table 5.9: Prony series parameters for each component of the relaxation matrix of the composite material obtained from micromechanics equations following the approach presented in Malek (2014)
Table 5.10: Parametric case studies conducted for determining the effect of resin
properties on the post buckling response of uncured laminates
Table 6.1: Constituent material properties used for cured and uncured UD thermosetcomposite according to Ersoy et al. (2010)
Table 6.2: Comparison of the UD composite material properties obtained by the present
analysis (Malek 2014) and data available in the literature (Ersoy et al. (2010)93
Table 6.3: Yarn and resin properties used in validation model for woven composite properties according to Naik (1994).
Table 6.4: Comparison of results for cured woven composites. 94
1 I

Table 6.5: Mesh convergence study results (isotropic elastic case ($E = 700$ MPa, $v = 0.4$)). 			
Table 6.6a: Input material properties of fibre, resin and fibre bed used in the bending simulation of textile prepregs. The compressive properties have been assigned to the bending model.			
Table 6.6b: Input material properties of fibre, resin and fibre bed used in the bending simulation of textile prepregs. The tensile properties have been assigned to the bending model. 100			
Table 6.6c: Input material properties of fibre, resin and fibre bed used in the bending simulation of textile prepregs. The effective bending properties have been assigned to the model. 100			
Table 6.7a: Micro-scale predictions of UD mechanical properties using micromechanicsequations with fibre-bed effect (Malek 2014) under compressive load.101			
Table 6.7b: Micro-scale predictions of UD mechanical properties using micromechanicsequations with fibre-bed effect (Malek 2014) under tensile load			
Table 6.7c: Micro-scale predictions of UD mechanical properties using micromechanicsequations with fibre-bed effect (Malek 2014) under bending load.102			
Table 6.8a: Meso-scale predictions of 5HS prepreg mechanical properties undercompression using the analytical technique of Naik (1994).103			
Table 6.8b: Meso-scale predictions of 5HS prepreg mechanical properties under tensionusing the analytical technique of Naik (1994)			
Table 6.8c: Meso-scale predictions of 5HS prepreg mechanical properties under bendingusing the analytical technique of Naik (1994)			
Table 6.9: Prony series parameters for MTM45-1 epoxy as reported in Thorpe's thesis (Thorpe 2012). 104			
Table 6.10: Relaxed and unrelaxed values of components of the composite relaxation matrix. The effective bending properties have been assigned to the model at micro-scale.			
Table 6.11: Prony series parameters for each component of the relaxation matrix of the composite material obtained from micromechanics equations following the approach presented in Malek et al. (2018). The effective bending properties have been assigned to the model at micro-scale			
Table 6.12: Summary of composite properties for UD and 5HS prepregs, as well as dry UD and 5HS according to different values of fibre stiffness, E_1			
Table 7.1: Comparisons between current FE predictions and the analytical model (Warren & Richard 2002)			
Table 7.2: Input properties of the plies 119			

Table 7.3: Input material properties of fibre, resin and fibre bed used in the	bending
simulation of textile prepregs (Le et al. 2022)	120
Table 7.4: Meso-scale predictions of 5HS prepreg mechanical properties under	bending
using the analytical technique of Naik (1994)	120

Abstract

Carbon fibre is known for its high strength, light weight and durability. The aerospace and automotive industries have demonstrated a strong interest in utilising carbon fibre when designing their structural parts. However, there are still barriers preventing other industries from realising the full potential of such advanced laminated composites. Among these challenges are the formation of wrinkles and defects throughout the manufacturing process. Currently, manufacturing composite parts with mitigation of defects greatly relies on the designers' experience and the outcomes of trial-and-error procedures. Due to the high cost of experiments and a large number of process parameters involved in composite manufacturing, an improved understanding of wrinkle formation is desirable for industries. Therefore, predictive modelling to aid design engineers in their understanding of the wrinkling phenomenon has become vital over the past two decades.

According to a few recent studies, fibre waviness, misalignment and the complex viscoelastic behaviour of a composite's layered structure during cure are the primary causes of defects, wrinkle formation, and eventual rejection of large composite components. However, the relationship between these factors and the wrinkling of plies caused by micro-buckling has not been investigated quantitatively. Furthermore, these effects are not fully captured in current process models. This research aims to develop an efficient strategy for analysing the multi-scale mechanisms of wrinkling due to buckling of plies during the composite consolidation process. A multi-scale approach that can be incorporated into current process models is proposed for this purpose. Using the suggested approach, the wrinkling response of plies under compressive and bending loads are predicted numerically. Wrinkling wavelengths and critical buckling strength of flat laminates are compared with wrinkling profiles and the strength values reported in the literature. Unlike previous studies, the viscoelastic contribution of resin as well as fibre stiffness and fabric architecture (for woven composites) are taken into account. The effect of these parameters on the buckling behaviour of fibres and the orthotropic nature of plies are also investigated at different scales, quantitatively. Results highlight that the viscoelastic properties of the resin have a considerable effect on the buckling response of woven composites and thus on wrinkle formation during the early stage of cure. Experimental studies are suggested for characterizing the viscoelastic behaviour of resins and its effect on the micro-buckling response of fibres during cure.