

**Revealing the mechanistic basis of reef-building coral tolerance
versus susceptibility to low O₂ stress**

Rachel Clare Alderdice

MSci in Marine Biology

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy at

Climate Change Cluster

School of Life Sciences

University of Technology Sydney

August 2022

Certificate of original authorship

I, Rachel Clare Alderdice declare that this thesis, is submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the Faculty of Science at the University of Technology Sydney.

This thesis is wholly my own work unless otherwise reference or acknowledged.

In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

This document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

This research was supported by an Australian Government Research Training Program.

Funding for this research was supported by the Australian Research Council (ARC) Discovery Grant (DP180100074) and University of Technology Sydney International Research and Presidents Scholarships.

Signature:

Production Note:
Signature removed prior to publication.

Date: 22nd of February 2022

Thesis abstract

Exposure of marine life to low oxygen is accelerating worldwide as a consequence of climate change and localized pollution. Global coral populations have been in significant decline now since the 1950s, experiencing widespread fatal bleaching episodes (i.e., loss of their symbiotic algae). However, only recently have such events been proposed to be directly associated with an inadequate oxygen supply (hypoxia).

I first examined the mechanistic basis for coral hypoxia stress response systems between two common reef-building *Acropora* species reported to have differential bleaching thresholds to heat stress in the field. As expected, only the less stress-tolerant species bleached under night-time deoxygenated conditions, corresponding to contrasting gene expression profiles indicative of varied effectiveness of their hypoxia-inducible factor (HIF) hypoxia response system (HRS).

I next considered how the responses observed for adult corals applied to coral larvae, where the latter exhibit very different physiologies related to their predominant free-living planktonic (without photosynthetic algae symbionts) versus benthic stages. Despite exhibiting a consistent swimming phenotype compared to control samples, coral planulae demonstrated similar HIF-HRS expression to the adult and differential gene expression that reflected a disruption of pathways involved in developmental regulation, mitochondrial activity, lipid metabolism, and O₂-sensitive epigenetic regulators.

I then incorporated deoxygenated seawater into short-term heat assays and demonstrated that deoxygenation can lower the thermal limit of an *Acropora* coral species by as much as 0.4 °C and 1°C based on the maximum photosystem II (PSII) photosynthetic efficiency and bleaching index score, respectively. I showed that even heating alone activates putative genes key to the HIF-HRS, which may suggest that a hypoxic state is reached in the coral tissue under heat stress, possibly as a result of an O₂-intensive stress response.

Hypoxia stress associated genes I identified from model *Acropora* corals were then considered against genomic gene sets of a wider range of coral species based on the notion that a variation in gene copy number can result in differential gene expression with subsequent differences in the effectiveness of any given stress response. Therefore, I used an ortholog-based meta-analysis to investigate how the hypoxia gene set inventory differed amongst 24 coral species. Interestingly, the highest gene copy number was consistently presented by *Porites lutea*, which is considered to exhibit inherently greater stress tolerance to bleaching. As such, the unevenly expanded (or reduced) hypoxia genes presented here provide key genes of interest to target in examining (or diagnosing) coral stress thresholds.

Thesis Acknowledgements

The research in this thesis would not have been possible without the invaluable support and guidance from so many wonderful people. I would like to start off by expressing my sincere gratitude to my supervisors David Suggett, Christian Woolstra and Mathieu Pernice for giving me the opportunity to embark on what has been a fantastic research endeavour. I am truly grateful for all their guidance, encouragement, and passion that they provided each step of the way. Their vision of and contributions to coral reef conservation and restoration has always been a great source of motivation. I have learnt so much from each of my supervisors, not only all-things science within my research project but also how to become a stronger and more resilient version of myself. They have coached me far beyond what I thought I was capable of achieving. A huge thank you for all the consistent support and understanding when incredibly difficult life events unfolded and for always helping me to take the next step forward. Not to forget, thank you for always having a good laugh with me (or at me), I always appreciated that positive energy.

My time at UTS was cut short as I had to make my PhD remote due to both unfortunate family and COVID situations arising. However, I am very grateful to have made it to Australia for my first year or so and to work with such amazing people at UTS and beyond. A huge thank you to my supervisor Dave for introducing me to the beautiful corals on the Great Barrier reef, showing me

how to navigate through the chaos of fieldwork and always giving me an extra push of encouragement. Another big thank you to my co-supervisor Mat, who took the time to teach me how to extract coral RNA and always checked in on my well-being. I would also like to thank Caitlin Lawson, David Hughes and Trent Haydon for helping to keep a smile on my face during long hours in the field, laboratory or office. Thanks to the rest of the Future Reefs team; Paige Strudwick, Sage Fitzgerald, Isabel Nunez Lendo, Mickael Ros, Samantha Goyen, Jennifer Matthews and Matt Nitschke for giving me a helping hand along the way – I am looking forward to going for dumplings and a snorkel again soon. I am also so very thankful to Paul Brooks and Scott Allchin who both always went above and beyond to make things work when I was preparing for the field. A special thanks to Pauline Jaum who was the best lunch buddy and someone who I could always let off steam with. I would also like to give a huge thanks to Emma Camp and Jean-Baptiste Raina for their mentoring and kindness during stressful times. Another special thanks to Paige Strudwick for being so supportive, even from overseas. Outside of work, I am very grateful to have spent time with my loving Australian family members Robert and Margaret Alderdice. Lastly, I am extremely thankful to have met Ellen Bush and Julz Peniazeva when I first arrived in Sydney, you both made my transition to life in Australia such a joy.

During my visit to King Abdullah University of Science and Technology (KAUST) in Saudi Arabia, I am grateful to have been introduced to the world of bioinformatics by Anny Cárdenas – you are such kind and patient teacher. I would also like to thank Tim Thomson, Romain Savary, Saeed Bunna and Morgan Bennett-Smith for being so welcoming and good fun in the desert and Red Sea. I also managed to visit the University of Konstanz (UKON) in Germany during lockdown, and I owe the success of my last experiment to Gabriela Perna – thank you for all your help but also for making my time in Konstanz so enjoyable along with Till Thomson and Katharina Kiefel. Thank you also to Ben Hume for patiently assisting me with bioinformatic analyses and for taking the time to help me with my scientific writing. I am truly thankful to my co-supervisor Christian for making this trip possible and for opening up a whole new window of opportunities, one being

the offer of an amazing postdoctoral position at UKON. I am very excited to get stuck into this next Chapter with you and the rest of Global Search team. You have shown me what a difference you can make when you truly believe in yourself and your work – thank you for that.

Lastly, but most importantly, thank you so much to my family for being so incredibly supportive of my crazy adventures and getting me through some very difficult circumstances over the past 3.5 years. I am so appreciative of my mum for showing me what a dedicated woman in science looks like but more importantly what a good work-family life balance looks like. A special thank you to my Dad for encouraging my adventurous streak and for all the late night walks of reassurance. I am very grateful for both my brother and sister for showing me what true determination can lead to. Thank you also to my extended family – my girls in Belfast – for always cheering me on.

Thesis structure

This thesis is comprised of a series of four data chapters (Chapters 2 to 5) with their own full and chapter-focussed introduction sections and hence my general introduction (background literature review, Chapter 1) has been kept brief to avoid unnecessary repetition. At the time of thesis submission, all data chapters were published or accepted for publication.

Chapter 1: Contributed to the following published perspective article.

Hughes, D.J., **Alderdice, R.**, Cooney, C., Kühl, M., Pernice, M., Voolstra, C.R., Suggett, D.J. (2020) Coral reef survival under accelerating ocean deoxygenation. *Nature Climate Change* 10: 296–307. doi:10.1038/s41558-020-0737-9.

Chapter 2: Presented as the following published research article.

Alderdice, R., Suggett, D.J., Cárdenas, A., Hughes, D.J., Kühl, M., Pernice, M., Voolstra, C.R. (2021) Divergence of hypoxia response systems under deoxygenation in reef-forming corals aligns with bleaching susceptibility. *Global Change Biology* 27: 312-326. gcb.15436. doi:10.1111/gcb.15436.

Chapter 3: Presented as the following published research article.

Alderdice, R., Pernice, M., Cárdenas, A., Hughes, D. J., Harrison, P. L., Boulotte, N., Chartrand, K., Kühl, M., Suggett, D.J., Voolstra, C.R. (2022) Hypoxia as a physiological cue and pathological stress for coral larvae. *Molecular Ecology* 00, 1–17. doi:10.1111/mec.16259.

Chapter 4: Presented as the following research article accepted for publication.

Alderdice, R., Perna, G., Cárdenas, A., Hume, B., Wolf, M., Pernice, M., Kühl, M., Suggett, D. J., Voolstra, C. R. (2022) Deoxygenation lowers the coral thermal threshold. *Scientific Reports* (Accepted).

Chapter 5: Presented as the following published research article.

Alderdice, R., Hume, B.C., Kühl, M., Pernice, M., Suggett, D. J., Voolstra, C. R. (2022) Disparate inventories of hypoxia gene sets across corals. *Frontiers in Marine Science* 9, 834332. doi:10.3389/fmars.2022.834332.

Chapter 6: Discussion of results and insights gained from all data chapters.

List of Tables

Table 3.1. Gene homologs selected for analysis associated with HIF gene system.	128
Table 5.1. Coral genomic gene sets used for Orthofinder analysis.....	234
Table 5.2. Genes of interest associated with hypoxia stress.	235
Table 6.1. List of genes compiled from all chapters associated with HIF-HRS.	283

List of Figures

Figure 1.1. Map of regions with low oxygen concentrations.....	14
Figure 1.2. Potential molecular mechanisms for hypoxia regulation in coral.	16
Figure 2.1. Experimental conditions & physiological response to deoxygenation.	53
Figure 2.2. Broad gene expression response to deoxygenation.	55
Figure 2.3. Coral HIF pathway and gene expression response to hypoxia.	57
Figure 2.4. Divergent hypoxia-induced stress response between coral species.....	63
Figure 2.5 Coral hypoxia response system for the bleaching tolerant versus susceptible.	71
Figure 3.1. Details of experimental incubation setup.	122
Figure 3.2. HIF-focused response of coral larvae to deoxygenation-reoxygenation exposure....	131
Figure 3.3. Non-HIF focused response to deoxygenation-reoxygenation exposure.	135
Figure 3.4. Key regulations of HIF gene system under low O ₂ across coral life stages.	138
Figure 3.5. The putative role of HIF in development of coral larvae.	140
Figure 4.1. Deoxygenation lowers coral thermal thresholds for bleaching.	190
Figure 4.3. Corals exhibit a similar response to heat stress with and without deoxygenation.....	193
Figure 4.4. Deoxygenation-specific stress responses may influence coral bleaching.	195

Figure 5.1. Classification of genomic protein sets.	240
Figure 5.2. Gene count heatmap table for genes of interest (GOI).	245
Figure 5.3. Rooted phylogenetic gene trees of highly disparate gene copy number.	246
Figure 5.4. Hypoxia stress gene set expansion may coincide with increased coral stress.	253
Figure 6.1. Schematic of updated coral HIF-mediated hypoxia response gene network.	280
Figure 6.2. Key HIF-HRS gene expression signature aligning to coral bleaching	287
Figure 6.3. Hypoxia stress is a fundamental stressor under multiple different stressors.	289
Figure 6.4. Summary schematic of main future avenues to next investigate.	294

List of Supplementary Tables

Table S 2.1. Corresponding raw & calculated average (Av.) of O ₂ & pH: <i>Acropora tenuis</i>	90
Table S 2.2. Corresponding raw & calculated average (Av.) of O ₂ & pH: <i>Acropora selago</i>	91
Table S 2.3. Additional O ₂ and pH measurements taken during experiment.	92
Table S 2.4. Symbiodiniaceae cell count replicates & normalised average for <i>Acropora tenuis</i> . .	93
Table S 2.5. Symbiodiniaceae cell count replicates & normalised average for <i>Acropora selago</i> .	94
Table S 2.6. Estimated Chlorophyll a, c ₂ & total chlorophyll for <i>Acropora tenuis</i>	95
Table S 2.7. Estimated Chlorophyll a, c ₂ and total chlorophyll for <i>Acropora selago</i>	96
Table S 2.8. Estimated coral surface area (S.A.) for <i>Acropora tenuis</i>	97
Table S 2.9. Estimated coral surface area (S.A.) for <i>Acropora selago</i>	98
Table S 2.10. Read mapping statistics.	99
Table S 2.11. Tracking of <i>Acropora tenuis</i> 's read 1 count.	100
Table S 2.12. Tracking of <i>Acropora selago</i> 's read 1 count.	101
Table S 2.13. List of gene names with corresponding KEGG Orthology.	102
Table S 2.14. Statistical results of two-way ANOVA & Tukey HSD for <i>Acropora tenuis</i>	103
Table S 2.15. Statistical results of two-way ANOVA & Tukey HSD for <i>Acropora selago</i>	105
Table S 2.16. Symbiodiniaceae density & chlorophyll concentration for <i>Acropora tenuis</i>	107
Table S 2.17. Symbiodiniaceae density & chlorophyll concentration for <i>Acropora selago</i>	108
Table S 2.18. Number of differentially expressed genes for <i>Acropora tenuis</i> & <i>selago</i>	109
Table S 2.19. KEGG BRITE output from KEGG Mapper Reconstruction results.	110
Table S 3.1. Raw & calculated averages (Av.) of O ₂ & pH conditions.	164
Table S 3.2. Additional O ₂ & pH measurements taken during experiment.	165
Table S 3.3. Tracking of read 1 count.	166
Table S 3.4. List of genes with corresponding KEGG Orthology.	167
Table S 3.5. Counts of inactive <i>Acropora selago</i> larvae.	171
Table S 3.6. Gene Ontology (GO) enrichment.	172
Table S 3.7. Number of differentially expressed genes.	173
Table S 4.1. Aquarium holding tank parameters.	222
Table S 4.2. Read 1 count of different stages of the analysis pipeline.	223
Table S 4.3. Number of unique contigs per taxa group in de novo transcriptome assemblies. ...	224
Table S 4.4. De novo transcriptome assembly statistics.	225
Table S 4.5. Number of differentially expressed transcripts between different temperatures.	225
Table S 4.6. Number of differentially expressed transcripts at each temperature.	226
Table S 5.1. Overview of sequencing platform and assembly and annotations methods	264
Table S 5.2. Additional details for genes of interest associated with hypoxia stress.	265
Table S 5.3. GOIs annotated to multiple orthogroups.	268
Table S 5.4. Gene count heatmap table for Universal Stress Protein (USP).	268
Table S 5.5. Gene count heatmap table for Sacsin (SACS).	269

Table S 5.6. Gene count heatmap table for Melatonin receptors (MTNR).....	269
Table S 5.7. Gene count heatmap table for GABA receptor (GABR).....	270
Table S 6.1. Corresponding references for Figure 6.3.....	305

List of Supplementary Figures

Figure S 2.1. Corresponding pH environment over time points.....	84
Figure S 2.2. Schematic of experimental incubation setup.....	85
Figure S 2.3. ‘Single wax dipping’ technique surface area standard measurements.....	85
Figure S 2.4. Box plot distributions.....	86
Figure S 2.5. Total chlorophyll a per cm ² of coral surface area over time points.....	86
Figure S 2.6. Mapping of reads to Symbiodiniaceae ITS2 reference sequences.....	87
Figure S 2.7. KEGG Mapper results of genes mapped to ‘HIF-1 signalling pathway’.....	88
Figure S 2.8. Prolyl-hydroxylase domain (PHD) gene expression dynamics across time points.....	89
Figure S 3.1. pH levels over experimental time points.....	160
Figure S 3.2. Gene expression response to deoxygenation-reoxygenation stress.....	161
Figure S 3.3. Gene expression across time points for additional genes of interest.....	162
Figure S 3.4. Gene expression of HIF-targeted glycolytic enzymes.....	163
Figure S 4.1. Images of the experimental setup.....	217
Figure S 4.2. Thermal profiles of CBASS runs.....	218
Figure S 4.3. Hourly measurements of temperature (°C), dissolved oxygen (DO) & pH (PSU).....	219
Figure S 4.4. ED50-based on photosynthetic efficiency (F_v/F_m) over lower temperature range.....	220
Figure S 4.5. ED50 thermal threshold based on Bleaching Index Score (BIS).....	220
Figure S 4.6. Symbiodiniaceae assemblage of experimental corals.....	221
Figure S 4.7. Transcriptome clustering in response to normoxic/deoxygenation heat stress.....	222
Figure S 5.1. Classification of genomic protein sets for 3 additional OrthoFinder analyses.....	261
Figure S 5.2. Rooted phylogenetic gene trees.....	262
Figure S 5.3. Rooted phylogenetic gene tree of GABA receptors (GABR).....	263

Table of Contents

Certificate of original authorship.....	2
Thesis abstract.....	3
Thesis Acknowledgements.....	4
Thesis structure.....	6
List of Tables.....	7
List of Figures.....	7
List of Supplementary Tables.....	8
List of Supplementary Figures.....	9
Table of Contents.....	9
1) Chapter 1. General Introduction.....	13
1.1 Significance.....	13
1.2. Suffocating Reefs.....	13

1.3	Detecting and responding to hypoxia at the molecular level	17
1.4	Evolutionary implications for O ₂ sensing in coral	18
1.5	Informing coral management using biomarkers: from genotypic to phenotypic	20
1.6	Thesis Aims & Hypotheses.....	22
1.7	References.....	25
2)	Chapter 2. Coral adult stress response system to deoxygenation.....	42
2.1	Abstract.....	43
2.2	Introduction.....	43
2.3	Materials and Methods.....	47
2.3.1	Experimental design.....	47
2.3.2	Chlorophyll extraction and cell density	49
2.3.3	RNA isolation and sequencing.....	50
2.3.4	Sequence data processing and analysis	50
2.3.5	Statistical analysis	52
2.4	Results.....	52
2.4.1	Divergent phenotypic response to deoxygenation	52
2.4.2	Contrasting gene expression responses to deoxygenation exposure.....	53
2.4.3	A hypoxia response system similar to other metazoans.....	56
2.3.4	Divergent expression of hypoxia response system genes	58
2.3.5	Divergent hypoxia-induced stress response.....	61
2.5	Discussion	64
2.6	Acknowledgements.....	71
2.7	Data Availability	72
2.8	References.....	72
2.9	Supplementary Material.....	83
3)	Chapter 3. Coral larvae stress response system to deoxygenation.....	115
3.1	Abstract.....	116
3.2	Introduction.....	116
3.3	Materials and Methods.....	120
3.3.1	Coral collection and larvae culture	120
3.3.2	Experimental setup.....	122
3.3.3	RNA isolation and RNA-Seq.....	125
3.3.4	Sequence data processing and analysis	125
3.4	Results.....	126
3.4.1	Phenotype and broad pattern transcriptional response.....	126

3.4.2	Differential gene expression under deoxygenation associated with early development and O ₂ -dependent processes.....	129
3.5	Discussion	136
3.6	Acknowledgements	143
3.7	Data Availability	143
3.8	References	144
3.9	Supplementary Material	160
4)	Chapter 4 Coral adult response to deoxygenation and heating	175
4.1	Abstract	176
4.2	Introduction	176
4.3	Materials and methods	179
4.3.1	Coral samples	179
4.3.2	Experimental set up	180
4.3.3	Coral bleaching assessment	183
4.3.4	RNA isolation and sequencing	184
4.3.5	<i>De novo</i> Transcriptome Assembly	185
4.3.6	RNASeq Analysis	186
4.3.7	DNA extractions and Symbiodiniaceae ITS2 amplification	187
4.3.8	ITS2-based Symbiodiniaceae profiling	188
4.4	Results	188
4.4.1	Deoxygenation lowers thermal thresholds of coral bleaching	188
4.4.2	Corals exhibit a similar response to heat stress with and without deoxygenation.	191
4.4.3	Deoxygenation-specific stress responses may influence bleaching susceptibility	194
4.5	Discussion	197
4.5.1	Deoxygenation lowers thermal thresholds for bleaching	198
4.5.2	Corals exhibit a similar response to heat stress with and without deoxygenation.	199
4.5.3	Deoxygenation induces coral vulnerability to light- and heat-stress.	201
4.5.4	Summary	202
4.6	Acknowledgements	203
4.7	Data Availability	203
4.8	References	203
4.9	Supplementary Material	217
5)	Chapter 5 Copy number variation in corals of hypoxia-associated genes.	227
5.1	Abstract	228
5.2	Introduction	228
5.3	Methods	233

5.3.1 Coral genomes	233
5.3.2. Hypoxia gene repertoire.....	235
5.3.3 Orthology analysis	236
5.4 Results.....	239
5.4.1 Overall gene distribution.....	239
5.4.2 Genes associated with hypoxia stress exhibit copy number variation.	241
5.4.3. Genes assigned to multiple orthogroups exhibit large copy number differences.	247
5.5 Discussion.....	248
5.5.1 Differences in protein inventories between species at large.	249
5.5.2 Orthogroups of hypoxia-associated genes exhibiting stark differences.....	250
5.5.3 Summary	254
5.6 Acknowledgments	254
5.7 Data Availability	255
5.8 References.....	255
5.9 Supplementary Materials	261
6) Chapter 6 General Discussion.....	277
6.1 How do corals respond to deoxygenation & how does it influence bleaching	278
6.2 Hypoxia as an overlooked fundamental stressor to coral under heating.....	285
6.3 Deoxygenation lowers thermal thresholds for corals.....	290
6.4 Future Directions & Concluding Remarks.....	291
6.5 References.....	295
6.6 Supplementary Materials	305