# Human-mediated landscapes of fear shape trophic cascades in <u>shared desert ecosystems</u> of the Middle East: elucidating the ecological roles of the <u>Arabian wolf (*Canis lupus arabs*)</u>

by Gavin Bonsen

# Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

under the supervision of Daniel Ramp and Arian Wallach

Centre for Compassionate Conservation

Faculty of Science

University of Technology Sydney

August 2022

### Certificate of Original Authorship

I, Gavin Bonsen, declare that this thesis is submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the School of Life Sciences at the University of Technology Sydney.

This thesis is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

This document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

This research is supported by an Australian Government Research Training Program.

Production Note: Signature: Signature removed prior to publication.

Date: 19 July 2022

### Acknowledgments

The amount of gratitude I have for the many people that have been involved in this feat is insurmountable; I could honestly write a whole thesis on acknowledgements alone. While this list may seem long, it is by no means exhaustive – I have tried to keep it to those directly involved in the development and production of this thesis. Nevertheless, there is one common feature that I feel everyone listed here (including names not written) deserves praise for: patience.

First, I am sincerely grateful to my team of supervisors and co-supervisors: Daniel Ramp, Arian Wallach, Dror Ben-Ami, and Oded Keynan. The opportunities these four have provided me with this unreal project and other ventures, and their ongoing guidance, support, and encouragement, have been amazing. Thanks to: Dan for believing in me, and pushing me, over the last ~10 years, but especially over the last year and a half – spending multiple hours with me each week, helping me think deeply about how to ask questions and answer them. Arian for putting so much time and effort into both me and this project; speaking with me weekly for my first couple of years in Israel, and always being available for chats or agile edits to chapters. Dror for supporting me in the Middle East, going above and beyond to help me with any health/car/visa issues, and for reminding me that my PhD is both my own and not a race. Oded for making me feel at home in the Arava; helping to get this project going, introducing me to the area, and bringing me in to the 'Zanvanim Team'. Thank you all so much for sticking by me and everything you've done for me, and I hope to continue building these relationships in striving for a more compassionate world. Extra thanks to Dan and Kate, Arian and Adam, Dror and Ondine, and Oded and Adi for great hospitality and chats in the many nights spent at their houses and properties.

These sincere thanks are also extended to the many collaborators I have had the privilege of building relationships and working with over these last few years. Particular thanks to: Anton Khalilieh for the love, support, and hospitality, by both bringing me into his home in the West Bank and helping make fieldwork in Jordan a reality. Uri Shanas and Yohay Carmel for many chats and extensive guidance and support around where to take this research, and how to follow through. The many rangers and other personnel in both the INPA and RSCN who allowed me to conduct fieldwork, assisted with fieldwork, and more importantly, treated me like a brother particularly those in the RSCN who, on top of organising field logistics, spent close to every day with me for my few months in Jordan. I am also very grateful to JNF Australia (including the Finkels), the UK Wolf Conservation Trust, Australian Research Council, and Compassionate Conservation Middle East/Voiceless for providing funds for research expenses; Micha Silver, Shirli Bar-David, and Oded Nezer for providing GIS layers; and Ramat Gan Safari, Hai-Bar Yotvata, and the many farmers who allowed me onto their properties, for providing animal poo and places to set camera-traps. Many thanks to Eli Geffen, Adi Barocas, Lee Koren, Miki Kam, and many more academics I had the privilege of meeting along my journey, for providing valuable insights into the ecology of these Middle Eastern deserts. Many thanks to Tamar Dayan and Dan Malkinson for putting time into assessing this thesis and giving insightful feedback and suggestions on the original version. I really appreciate these very helpful comments which I feel have considerably strengthened this thesis and potential publications.

I wholeheartedly thank the Society for the Protection of Nature in Israel, particularly Hazeva Field School, for accommodating me for the whole time I was in Israel. Special thanks to: Dorit and

Jonathan for providing me a home for so long; Raed, Niko, Georgie, Omri, Gal, and Noam for being great friends and neighbours/housemates. Raed, you took me in as a brother, helping to 'bring me back home' after my first few months in the Arava by introducing me to your friendship circles. Niko and Georgie, you made me see what it was like to live in a family of Serbs – and I loved it. You will each forever be part of my family. Many thanks to Shani, Naama, Chen, and Yael for the many visits and lots of sharing of gifts, stories, and knowledge. So many thanks to all the people that helped in the field, especially Jake and Steve, who flew over from Australia and the UK for two weeks of fieldwork.

Many thanks go to people at UTS, and everyone in the Compassionate Conservation community for continuing to go against the norm, and for the many great friendships I have built within the Centre. Particular thanks to: Eamonn for many good times in the field and office, and for much guidance and insight related to predator ecology; Chris for the good times, help with R and many other things, but most importantly for Yindi (and thanks to Kate); Erick for fun times whenever we were on the same continent, (re)introducing me to R and audiobooks – some that had a *profound influence* on me – and many insightful chats about research and life; Esty for many great chats and helpful discussions; Loic and Miriam for great times in the office and getting me out of Sydney (and to Loic and Laura for help analysing videos); Kyle for being a legend, and thoughts on R/stats/figures; Caitlin A. and Cristin for so much administrative assistance throughout my travels; and Lou for many deep, thought-provoking chats over coffees (or wines/ciders). Thanks to Shannon Hawkins for administrative support from UTS; Lana McClements for encouraging a certain potential PhD student to make the journey from Austria to Australia; and to Claire, Daniel, and the hens for providing some extra protein over these last few months.

Lastly, I would like to extend my deepest heartfelt appreciation to my extended family and friends across the globe. This thesis would not have been possible without the support of two dear friends, Caitlin S. and Inbar. Caitlin encouraged me to pursue an academic path, which I never thought would have been 'my thing' when I finished school. I'm forever grateful for the push and reintroduction to education (many thanks also to her education-oriented family). Inbar took me in and kept me going while I was in Israel (special thanks to Dalia for accepting me as part of the family). Thank you both, Caitlin and Inbar, for guiding and helping me on my journey of becoming me. Thanks to family (relatives and 'the boys' – and girls, obviously) for putting up with my lack of communication, being unable to attend weddings, childbirths, birthdays, and other milestones, and letting me stay at their houses while I was homeless. Thanks to my Mum and Dad for (consciously or unconsciously) helping me understand, from a young age, the importance of compassion and conservation, respectively; and to my late Gran who left us when I was doing fieldwork in the Middle East, thank you for passing on your love for animals.

Definitely not least, I would like to thank the kindest, most beautiful and compassionate person I know. I never thought a person existed who saw life and the world in a (nearly) similar way to me – but I've found her. Sahar, thank you so much for sticking by me these last two years, and for everything you do for Yindi and me. The sun never stops rising with you by my side. And of course, thanks to our 'little orange *thing*' (cat), Yindi. We are both so lucky to live with and love such a perfect pet.

#### To all the individuals (human and non-human) – particularly those captured on camera – that make up this story: <u>thank you</u>.

I hope this thesis can play a part, in one way or another, in transitioning towards a more peaceful co-existence between human and non-human animals.

### List of Papers and Statement of Author Contribution

This thesis is a compilation of an introductory chapter and the following four manuscripts currently either published or in preparation for publication. Referencing style throughout this thesis is based on the journal *Biological Conservation*.

# Chapter 2. Navigating a geopolitically complex landscape: the Arabian wolf's complicated plight.

Bonsen, G.T., Wallach, A.D., Ben-Ami, D., Keynan, O., Khalilieh, A., Ramp, D. in preparation.

Contributor	Statement of contribution
Production Note: Signature removed prior to publication.	Conceptualization (33%) Visualization (33%) Investigation (100%) Writing (100%)
Production Note:	Conceptualization (33%)
Signature removed	Visualization (33%)
prior to publication.	Review and editing (80%)
Production Note:	Conceptualization (33%)
Signature removed	Visualization (33%)
prior to publication.	Review and editing (20%)

#### Chapter 3. Tolerance of wolves shapes desert canid communities in the Middle East.

Bonsen, G.T., Wallach, A.D., Ben-Ami, D., Keynan, O., Khalilieh, A., Shanas, U., Wooster, E.I.F., Ramp, D. 2022. *Global Ecology and Conservation*.

Contributor	Statement of contribution
Production Note: Signature removed prior to publication.	Conceptualization (40%) Visualization (33%) Investigation (100%) Formal analysis (80%) Writing (100%)
Production Note: Signature removed prior to publication.	Conceptualization (40%) Visualization (33%) Review and editing (50%) Formal analysis (20%)
Production Note: Signature removed prior to publication.	Conceptualization (20%) Visualization (33%) Review and editing (50%)

# Chapter 4. Interactions between Arabian wolves and people drive risk-mediated trophic cascades in a Middle Eastern Desert.

Bonsen, G.T., Wallach, A.D., Ben-Ami, D., Carmel, Y., Keynan, O., Shanas, U., Ramp, D. in preparation.		
Contributor	Statement of contribution	

Contributor	Statement of contribution
Production Note: Signature removed prior to publication.	Conceptualization (40%) Investigation (100%) Formal analysis (100%) Visualization (33%) Writing (100%)
Production Note:	Conceptualization (40%)
Signature removed	Visualization (33%)
prior to publication.	Review and editing (80%)
Production Note:	Conceptualization (20%)
Signature removed	Visualization (33%)
prior to publication.	Review and editing (20%)

# Chapter 5. Agile responses of mesopredators and prey to ambient and imminent risk driven by Arabian wolves

Bonsen, G.T., Ramp, D., Wooster, E.I.F., Ben-Ami, D., Juillard, L., Keynan, O., Shanas, U., Wallach, A.D. *in preparation*.

Contributor	Statement of contribution
Production Note: Signature removed prior to publication.	Conceptualization (40%) Investigation (100%) Formal analysis (60%) Visualization (25%) Writing (100%)
Production Note: Signature removed prior to publication.	Conceptualization (30%) Formal analysis (20%) Visualization (25%) Review and editing (50%)
Production Note: Signature removed prior to publication.	Conceptualization (30%) Formal analysis (20%) Visualization (50%) Review and editing (50%)

## Table of Contents

#### Table of Contents

Certificate of Original Authorship	ii
Acknowledgments	iii
List of Papers and Statement of Author Contribution	vi
Table of Contents	viii
List of Figures	xii
Abstract	xvi
Chapter 1. General Introduction	1
1.1 The ecological importance of apex predators	2
1.2 Trophic cascades driven by fear	4
1.3 Humans as agents of fear	5
1.4 The grey wolf ( <i>Canis lupus</i> ) as apex predator	
1.5 The unique desert-adapted Arabian wolf	
1.6 Thesis overview	
1.7 References	
Chapter 2. Navigating a geopolitically complex landscape: the Arabian wolf's complicated plight Abstract	
2.1 Introduction	
2.1 Introduction	19
<ul> <li>2.2 Lessons from global conservation efforts</li></ul>	21 21 23 25
<ul><li>2.2 Lessons from global conservation efforts</li><li>2.2.1 Ecology and importance of wolves globally</li></ul>	21 21 25 27 28 28 28 28 30
<ul> <li>2.2 Lessons from global conservation efforts</li></ul>	21 23 25 27 28 28 30 32 34 34 34 35 37
<ul> <li>2.2 Lessons from global conservation efforts</li></ul>	21 23 25 27 28 28 30 32 34 34 35 37 41 43 43
<ul> <li>2.2 Lessons from global conservation efforts.</li> <li>2.2.1 Ecology and importance of wolves globally</li> <li>2.2.2 Conflict, persecution, and mitigation.</li> <li>2.2.3 Human attitudes and social research</li> <li>2.2.4 Practical strategies for coexistence.</li> </ul> 2.3 State of Knowledge of the Arabian wolf. <ul> <li>2.3.1 Toxonomy of <i>Canis lupus arabs</i>.</li> <li>2.3.2 Ecology and importance</li> <li>2.3.3 Distribution and abundance</li> </ul> 2.4 Geopolitical Diversity <ul> <li>2.4.1 Conservation of the Arabian wolf.</li> <li>2.4.2 Scale of jurisdictional crossover</li> <li>2.4.3 Governmental and non-governmental conservation effort</li> <li>2.4.4 Society, culture, and human-wolf relationships</li> </ul> 2.5 Moving Forwards <ul> <li>2.5.1 Building collaborative planning</li> </ul>	21 23 25 27 28 28 28 30 32 34 34 34 43 43 45

Chapter 3. Tolerance of wolves shapes desert canid communities in the Middle East	84
Abstract	
3.1 Introduction	85
3.2 Methods	
3.2.1 Study Area	
3.2.3 Data collection and analysis	
3.3 Results	
3.4 Discussion	
3.4.1 Conclusions	
3.5 References	
Chapter 3. Supplementary material	
Chapter 4. Interactions between Arabian wolves and people drive risk-mediated trophic ca Middle Eastern desert	
Abstract	
4.1 Introduction	109
4.2 Methods	
4.2 Methods 4.2.1 Study Area	
4.2.2 Study Species	
4.2.3 Design and Sampling	
4.2.4 Data Analyses	115
4.3 Results	
4.3.1 Evidence of human-induced trophic cascades	
4.3.2 Predator-predator interactions	
4.4 Discussion	
4.4 Discussion	
4.4.2 Conclusion	
4.5 References	
Chapter 4. Supplementary material	
Chapter 5. Agile responses of mesopredators and prey to ambient and imminent risk drive	on by Arabian
wolves	
Abstract	
5.1 Introduction	
5.2 Methods	
5.2.1 Study Species	
5.2.2 Study Sites	
5.2.3 Data Collection	
5.2.4 Data Analyses	149
5.3 Results	
5.3.1 Relative occupancy	
5.3.2 Event duration 5.3.3 Time spent vigilant	
5.4 Discussion	
5.5 References	
Chapter 5. Supplementary Material	

# List of Tables

Chapter 2
<b>Table 2.139</b> Overview summary of Arabian wolf status, protection, and conservation effort in the eleven countries likely to be within its distribution. For further details, see Table S2.1 in Supplementary Material.
Table S2.1.       62         Overview of legal frameworks, governance, and conservation efforts within the eleven countries considered to fall within the Arabian wolf's range.
Chapter 3
Table S3.1.       103         GIS layers used to categorise water point to land-use for occupancy and interspecific interactions.       103
<b>Table S3.2.</b> 104 Summary of canid records from camera-trap data, showing the number of events overall and within each land-use category, the number of water points ( <i>n</i> ) at which each species was recorded (% of total), and the probabilities of resource use ( $\psi$ ) and detection ( <i>p</i> ) of each canid overall and within each category.
Table S3.3.105Bootstrapped coefficient of overlap ( $\hat{\Delta}$ ) estimates and Wald's Test outputs used to determine changes in temporal activity patterns in canids. Wald's Test output corresponds to temporal activity changes of the species within the pair in <b>bold</b> text.
Table S3.4.       106         Estimated parameters used to calculate indices of relative abundance from tracking surveys conducted in the Arava Valley
Chapter 4

Summary of species records from camera-trapping data, showing the number of events, the number of sampling points (*n*) at which each species was recorded (% of total sampling points), and the marginal occupancy ( $\Psi$ ) and detection (*p*) probabilities of each species (± SE).

ble 4.2
---------

Bootstrapped coefficient of overlap ( $\hat{\Delta}$ ) estimates for dominant-subordinate predator species pairs across risk levels (95 % CI). High risk and low risk columns compare  $\hat{\Delta}$  between the two species within each risk level, while dominant and subordinate columns compare  $\hat{\Delta}$  between high and low risk levels within each species. Grey cells indicate insufficient data.

#### 

Bootstrapped coefficient of overlap ( $\hat{\Delta}$ ) estimates for predator-prey species pairs across risk levels (95 % CI). High risk and low risk columns compare  $\hat{\Delta}$  between the two species within each risk level, while dominant and subordinate columns compare  $\hat{\Delta}$  between high and low risk levels within each species. Grey cells indicate insufficient data.

Explanatory variables used in site selection and as covariates in occupancy models.

Top-performing single-species occupancy models for each species. Models were selected from a set of 31 candidate models for each species by choosing those with  $\Delta AIC < 2$ . As the entire slate of landscape variables featured in the top-performing models, we used the global model for each species.

Chapter 5

 Table 5.1.
 149

Summary of species records from fox and rodent stations showing the total number of events recorded, total number of stations (n), and occupancy and detection (p) probabilities for each species (or group of species).

### List of Figures

#### Chapter 2

Likely distributions of the two grey wolf subspecies that occur in the Middle East. The Indian wolf (*C. l. pallipes*) inhabits temperate climates from India to Turkey while the Arabian wolf (*C. l. arabs*) resides in the deserts of the southern Levant and Arabian Peninsula.

Population estimates of the Arabian wolf in Levantine and Arabian deserts within the Middle East (inset).

#### Chapter 3

#### 

Spatial distribution of monitored water points across three human land-use categories within a  $\sim$ 6,000 km<sup>2</sup> study area in the southern Levant (inset), highlighting the Arava Valley (outlined in purple) which straddles the international border between Israel and Jordan.

#### 

Probabilities of resource use of canids across land-use categories as a function of human population density reveal that wolves (grey lines and shading) and foxes (red lines) are negatively influenced, while jackals (gold lines) are positively influenced, by human population density, particularly in pastoralist landscapes. Dashed lines represent 95 % confidence intervals.

Overlap in temporal activity patterns illustrating: (a) a relatively high temporal overlap between larger (dotted lines) and smaller (dashed lines) canids overall, where all canids are largely nocturnal with bimodal peaks in activity around dawn and dusk for wolves (grey lines and shading) and foxes (red lines and shading), and slightly later in the morning for jackals (gold lines and shading); (b) a significant shift in wolf (solid and dashed lines) activity in pastoralist landscapes to the middle of the night when people (dotted lines) were inactive; and (c) a significant shift in jackal (solid and dashed lines) activity in crop farming landscapes to times when wolves (dotted lines) were less active. Values denote bootstrapped coefficients of overlap ( $\hat{\Delta} \pm 95 \%$  CI), while dashed lines in (b) and (c) represent overall temporal activity patterns of smaller canid [dashed boxes represent overall coefficient of overlap ( $\hat{\Delta} \pm 95 \%$  CI)].

#### 

Relative activity indices, calculated using the parameters estimated from tracking surveys, show that foxes in the Arava Valley are significantly more active in pastoralist landscapes than in crop farming landscapes where wolves are more active.

Chapter 4

Spatial distribution of human land-use and infrastructure across the study area. Inset shows the location of the study area within Israel.

#### 

Conceptual diagrams illustrating Species Interaction Factors (SIFs) between a super predatorapex predator; apex predator-mesopredators; and predators-prey in non-pastoralist and pastoralist landscapes. The colour of each arrow corresponds to the strength and direction (attraction vs avoidance) of interaction between a pair of interacting species. \*Significant difference in SIF between non-pastoralist and pastoralist landscapes (refer to Fig. S4.3 in Supplementary Material).

#### 

Relative risk maps depicting proposed landscapes of fear for a given subordinate predator species (bottom-right of each panel), based on spatial responses to the potential co-occurrence of a dominant predator (top-left of each panel) for a) people – wolf, b) wolf – jackal, c) wolf – foxes, and d) jackal – foxes. Colour scheme represents a gradient from low risk (green) to high risk (red).

#### 

Relative risk maps depicting proposed landscapes of fear for a given prey species (bottom-right of each panel, based on spatial responses to the potential co-occurrence of a predator (top-left of each panel) for a) wolf-large ungulate, b) wolf-small-medium ungulate, c) wolf-small herbivore, and d) foxes-small herbivore. Colour scheme represents a gradient from low risk (green) to high risk (red).

#### 

The six spatial variables included in site selection and occupancy model predictions, including a) human habitation (m), b) permanent water sources (m), c) paved roads (m), d) elevation (m), e) topographic complexity (2 km), and f) pastoralism (binary)

Schematic diagram illustrating the process used to calculate relative risk maps using single species and two-species occupancy model predictions. The colour scheme for the relative risk gradient corresponds to the legend in the bottom-right.

Species Interaction Factors (SIFs) between pairs of interacting dominant-subordinate species pairs in non-pastoralist and pastoralist landscapes. \*Significant difference in SIF between non-pastoralist and pastoralist landscapes based on the proportion of overlap of 95 % confidence intervals (prOv < 0.50).

Figure S	S4.4	137
----------	------	-----

Single-species occupancy model predictions across the landscape based on spatial variables included in each model for: a) people, b) wolves, c) jackals, d) foxes, e) onager, f) gazelle, g) ibex, and h) hare.

#### 

Single-species occupancy model predictions across the five continuous variables for each species.

#### 

Two-species occupancy model predictions across the landscape based on spatial variables included in each model for dominant-subordinate species pairs: a) people – wolf, d) wolf – jackal, c) wolf – foxes, d) jackal – foxes, e) wolf – onager, f) wolf – small-medium ungulates, g) wolf – hare, and h) foxes – hare).

#### 

Overlap in temporal activity across high and low risk areas between each dominant-subordinate predator species pair.

#### Chapter 5

#### 

Locations of the four study sites (two "high-wolf" in the Arava Valley and two "low-wolf" in the Negev Highlands), within protected areas in the Negev Desert of Israel (inset), relative to the modelled occupancy probability of Arabian wolves and human infrastructure (paved roads and human settlements).

#### 

Modelled probability of occupancy of red foxes (*V. vulpes*) and rodents (*Acomys* spp., *Gerbillus* spp., *Meriones* spp.) across high-wolf and low-wolf sites (point = model estimate, line range = 95 % confidence intervals).

Differences in mean duration of red fox and rodent events across ambient (control) and imminent cue (scent from a higher-order predator and cow) treatments at high-wolf and low-wolf sites (point = mean, line range = SE). Letters denote significant interactions (p < 0.025).

#### 

Proportion of time spent vigilant in fox and rodent events on control and scent (high-order predator and cow) periods across high- and low-wolf sites (point = mean, line range = SE).

Probability of occupancy for foxes and rodents based on local presence or absence of higherorder predators (wolf or red fox). We used data from HW1 and HW2 for red fox; HW2 for Blandford's fox; and HW1 and LW1 for rodents.

#### Abstract

Grey wolf (Canis lupus) populations are increasing globally, thanks to a general rise in human acceptance. However, the smallest subspecies, the Arabian wolf (Canis lupus arabs), remains endangered across its wide range in the Middle East. Human land-use varies throughout its range, as do attitudes towards wolves, which range from acceptance to complete intolerance. Likely to have played a large part in the increase in acceptance of wolves in other regions is the knowledge of the important ecological roles they play as apex predators. Presence of wolves has been linked to profound, cascading effects, which have been claimed to benefit ecosystems across multiple trophic levels. This has consistently been demonstrated in temperate regions, where ecosystems are productive, but doubt has been cast over whether Arabian wolves play similar roles in the arid to hyper-arid ecosystems they inhabit. In this thesis, I begin by exploring the mechanisms and approaches that have previously gone into global wolf conservation efforts, assisting in their recovery, and then contextualise this within the geopolitical diversity of the Middle East. Realising that relatively little is known about Arabian wolves, from their ecology to their taxonomic status and distribution, I set out to discover whether they have the capacity to influence ecosystems in similar ways to their temperate counterparts. I conducted ecological studies in the deserts of Israel and Jordan to identify the ways in which Arabian wolves shape ecosystem structure and function through their interactions with other species, and how these are mediated by human-wolf relationships. Using non-invasive survey techniques (camera-traps and passive tracking surveys), I found that wolf occupancy and density are largely related to human land-use, where wolves use areas where they are accepted but avoid areas where they are not tolerated. This then has cascading effects through the ecosystem, influencing canid communities, landscapes of fear for mesopredators and prey, and behavioural responses of predators and prey. This thesis unearths the importance of Arabian wolves in desert ecosystems by showing their role in influencing spatial distributions and behaviours of species in lower trophic levels. The last half-century has already witnessed the loss of two other large predators throughout the region, and this functional role would disappear if the Arabian wolf was to follow suit. Through improved conservation efforts and working towards a peaceful co-existence between people and Arabian wolves, this unique and iconic subspecies of wolf can persist, along with its important ecological role.