Elsevier required licence: © <2022>. This manuscript version is made available under the CC-BY-NC-ND 4.0 license<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/> The definitive publisher version is available online at [10.1016/j.scitotenv.2022.155874](http://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2022.155874)



#### **Abstract**

28 Copper ion  $(Cu^{2+})$  and zinc ion  $(Zn^{2+})$  are widely co-existent in anaerobic digestion 29 effluent as typical contaminants. This work aims to explore how  $Cu^{2+}-Zn^{2+}$  association affects physiological properties of *S. platensis* using Schlösser medium (SM) and sterilized anaerobic digestion effluent (SADE). Microalgae cells viability, biochemical 32 properties, uptake of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$ , and risk assessment associated with the biomass reuse as additives to pigs were comprehensively assessed. Biomass production ranged 34 from 0.03 to 0.28 g/L in SM and 0.63 to 0.79 g/L in SADE due to the presence of  $Cu^{2+}$ 35 and  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$ . Peak value of chlorophyll-a and carotenoid content during the experiment decreased by 70-100% and 40-100% in SM, and by 70-77% and 30-55% in SADE. Crude protein level reduced by 4-41% in SM and by 65-75% in SADE. The reduction 38 ratio of these compounds was positively related to the  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  concentrations. Maximum value of saturated and unsaturated fatty acids was both obtained at 0.3 Cu+2.0 Zn (50.8% and 22.8%, respectively) and 25% SADE reactors (33.8% and 41 27.7%, respectively). Uptake of Cu in biomass was facilitated by  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  concentration (> 42 4.0 mg/L). Risk of *S. platensis* biomass associated with  $Cu^{2+}$  was higher than  $Zn^{2+}$ . *S.* 43 *platensis* from SM ( $Cu^{2+} \le 0.3$  mg/L and  $Zn^{2+} \le 4.0$  mg/L) and diluted SADE (25% and 50% SADE) reactors could be used as feed additives without any risk (hazard index < 1), which provides sufficient protein and fatty acids for pig consumption. These results 46 revealed the promising application of using *S. platensis* for bioremediation of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  in anaerobic digestion effluent and harvesting biomass for animal feed additives. 

 **Keywords:** *S. platensis*; Heavy metal; Sterilized anaerobic digestion effluent; Ecotoxicological response; Risk assessment

#### **1. Introduction**

 Anaerobic digestion effluent (ADE) from intensive livestock industry contains high concentrations of nitrogen (N) and phosphates (P) along with heavy metals such as 56 copper ion  $(Cu^{2+})$  and zinc ion  $(Zn^{2+})$ , and the concentrations of these pollutants sometimes even exceed the environmental regulations (Baker et al., 2021; Cao et al., 2018). The inappropriate disposal of the ADE can cause serious consequences, such as eutrophication, pathogen contamination, ecosystem deterioration and so on (Praveen et 60 al., 2018). The heavy metals, such as  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$ , released into environment can migrate to groundwater and surface waters, and even accumulated in soils and crops, exerting a profound and negative effect on environmental and human health (Feng et al., 2018). Therefore, it is necessary to remove those nutrients and heavy metals from ADE before they are released into the environment (Cai et al., 2013; Gupta et al., 2022). Several techniques, i.e., membrane bioreactor, chemical precipitation, and constructed wetlands, have been developed for ADE treatment but all facing eco-friendly and sustainable problems or difficulties (such as high cost, energy consumption, low efficiency and so on) (Monfet et al., 2017).

 Microalgae-based technology shows a promising remedy of ADE in nutrient recovery, which converts N and P in ADE into biomass for future utilization (Hasan et al., 2021; 72 Xie et al., 2018; Wang et al., 2019a,b). Ammonia nitrogen (NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N) in the ADE can act as a major nitrogen source for the synthesis of protein, enzymes and energy transfer, and P can be assimilated for the production of phospholipids, nucleic acid, and ATP during microalgae growth (Cheng et al., 2020). A variety of microalgae has been applied for ADE treatment including *Desmodesmus* sp., *Chlorella* sp. and *Scenedesmus* 77 sp.. Previous reports documented that above 90% NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N and 84% total nitrogen from

 ADE were eliminated by *Desmodesmus* sp. after 14 days of cultivation (Li et al., 2021); 79 while 93% NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N and 100% phosphate  $(PO<sub>4</sub><sup>3</sup>)$  from ADE were removed using a microalgae co-culture (*Chlorella* sp. and *Scenedesmus* sp.) (Hasan et al., 2021). Among multiple microalgae used for ADE treatment, *S. platensis* attracted the attention of researchers due to its fast growth rate, strong adaptability, high-valuable metabolites 83 accumulation (Zhou et al., 2021; Zhou et al., 2018). With *S. platensis*, up to 99% NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-84 N and  $45\%$  PO<sub>4</sub><sup>3</sup> were assimilated to further convert into biomass with the 85 supplementation of HCO<sub>3</sub> in ADE, leading to a biomass concentration of 1.50 g/L after 12 days (Matos et al., 2021). Compared to other microalgae, *S. platensis* also has the ability to auto-flocculate and float on the water surface owing to the filamentous structure, which facilitates the biomass harvest for further utilization (Razak and Sharip, 2020). It is worth noting that *S. platensis* is the most popular food supplement and animal feeds around the world with the richest source of plant proteins (60 - 70% of its weight) among microalgae biomass (Usharani, 2012). As stated above, the merits of nutrient recovery, biomass productivity and value-added metabolites potential make microalgae-based technology a more appealing technique for ADE purification.

95 Aside from nutrients, ADE also possess high concentrations of  $Cu^{2+}$  (< 5 mg/L) and 96  $Zn^{2+}$  (< 10 mg/L) (Jin and Chang, 2011). Although  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  are essential microelements for microalgal growth in pure cultivation, the excess of these heavy metals shows great inhibition for microalgae growth and metabolism, which greatly affect biomass production and nutrient conversion (El.Din, 2017; Zhou et al., 2018). 100 Our previous study observed that the increase of  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  concentration from 0.0 to 8.0 mg/Lin culture medium reduced the biomass production of *S. platensis* by 70.3% (Zhou 102 et al., 2018). Increase of  $Cu^{2+}$  concentration from 0.5 to 3 mg/L also decreased biomass 103 yield of *S. platensis* (El.Din, 2017). In ADE with *Coelastrella* sp., increase of  $Cu^{2+}$ 

104 concentration from 0.0 to 3.0 mg/L decreased the removal efficiency of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N from 105 80% to 39% (Li et al., 2018), but increased  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  from 0.0 to 2.0 mg/L reduced total 106 phosphate (TP) removal efficiency by 7.7% (Li et al., 2020). More importantly,  $Cu^{2+}$ 107 and  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  are usually co-existed in ADE. de Souca Oliveira et al. (2021) investigated the 108 simultaneous interferences of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  in high-rate algal ponds (HRAP) and found 109 lowest biomass yield of *Chlorella* sp. was observed in HRAP with 0.5 mg/L Cu<sup>2+</sup> and 110 5.0 mg/L  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$ . To date, the impact of both  $\text{Cu}^{2+}$  and  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  in pure culture or ADE on *S*. 111 *platensis* growth remains unclear. Furthermore,  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  exposure also alter the 112 biochemical properties of microalgae biomass. The inhibition of total chlorophyll and 113 protein content in *S. platensis* biomass caused by 3 mg/L Cu<sup>2+</sup> were 65.9% and 63.0%, 114 respectively (El.Din, 2017). The increase of  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  from 2.0 to 8.0 mg/L inhibited the 115 biosynthesis of photosynthetic pigments (phycocyanin, chlorophyll-a and carotenoid) 116 but improved the amount of polyunsaturated fatty acids (PUFA) (C18:2 and C18:3) in 117 *S. platensis* biomass (Zhou et al., 2018). Rocha et al. (2021) reported that the amounts 118 of total lipids and fatty acids in the biomass of *Selenastrum gracile* was enhanced 119 linearly by with the concentration of  $Cu^{2+}$  from  $0.7 \times 10^{-2}$  to  $9.6 \times 10^{-2}$  µM in culture 120 medium, whereas the amount of saturated fatty acids declined. During the cultivation 121 of *Coelastrella* sp. in the swine wastewater, high  $Zn^{2+}$  concentration (> 1.0 mg/L) 122 decreased chlorophyll-a content but increased protein level against  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  toxicity (Li et 123 al., 2020), whereas both chlorophyll-a and protein content decreased at 0.1 - 3 mg/L  $124$  Cu<sup>2+</sup> (Li et al., 2018). Indeed, the growth and response of microalgae varies between 125 microalgae species exposed to  $Cu^{2+}$ -  $Zn^{2+}$  association. *S. platensis* is considered as a 126 good source of nutrient in animal diet due to the abundant proteins, fatty acids and 127 carotenoid (Zhou et al., 2018). The alteration in the content of those nutrients in biomass 128 may limit the application as feed additives. Up to now, the change of biochemical

129 properties of *S. platensis* biomass due to the presence of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  in ADE has not 130 been well investigated. In addition, *S. platensis* has been demonstrated to absorb  $Cu^{2+}$ 131 and  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  from aquatic environments (Chan et al., 2013). The uptake capacity ranged 132 from 0.6 to 78.0 mg/g dry weight of  $Cu^{2+}$  (Nalimova et al., 2005; Vannela and Verma, 133 2006) and 0.1 to 38.7 mg/g dry weight of  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  (Pane et al., 2008; Vannela and Verma, 134 2006). However, the uptake capacity of  $Cu^{2+}$  or  $Zn^{2+}$  may be impacted by the presence 135 of other metals. Franklin et al. (2002) reported that  $Cu^{2+}$  hindered the uptake of  $Zn^{2+}$  by 136 *Chlorella* sp., while  $Zn^{2+}$  had no obvious impact on the uptake of  $Cu^{2+}$ . Those metals 137 accumulated in metal-rich biomass can enter the food chain and result in serious health 138 issues in animals (Nagarajan et al., 2021). The uptake capacity of *S. platensis* to Cu2+ 139 and  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  in Cu<sup>2+</sup>-Zn<sup>2+</sup> association system, and whether heavy metals-enriched biomass 140 can be reused as supplemented animal feed additives are still not investigated.

141

142 Although several heavy metals (i.e.,  $Cu^{2+}$ ,  $Zn^{2+}$ ,  $Cr^{6+}$ ,  $Cd^{2+}$ , and  $Pb^{2+}$ ) are found in swine 143 manure, reaching different concentrations in the ADE; concentrations of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  are found 10-100 times higher than other metals due to their widespread occurrence in feed additives and incomplete metabolism in pigs (do Amaral et al., 2014; Feng et al., 146 2018; Zhang et al., 2016). Therefore,  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  were chosen as the main representatives of heavy metals in ADE in this study to evaluate their impacts on *S. platensis*. This study aims to evaluate the impacts of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  association on the biomass production and reuse from ADE using *S. platensis*. Microalgae cells viability, biochemical properties of biomass (i.e., photosynthetic pigments, protein, and fatty 151 acids), accumulation of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  in biomass and risk assessment associated with the biomass reuse as an additive to pigs were comprehensively assessed under laboratory tests with eight concentration scenarios. The results improved the 154 understanding of the impact of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  association on the development of



183 under each concentration scenario were incubated for 11 days under  $25\pm1$  °C and light intensity of about 1200 Lux. The reactors were shaken manually three times a day.

 The growth performance of *S. platensis* was calculated using the biomass concentrations. Chlorophyll fluorescence activity was measured every two days to reflect the photosynthetic activity of *S. platensis* cells under different concentration scenarios. Photosynthesis pigments of *S. platensis* were reflected by chlorophyll-a and carotenoid concentrations, which were measured every two days during the cultivation. 191 Biochemical components (crude protein and fatty acids) and uptake of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  were also measured after the harvest of *S. platensis* biomass on the 11th day. The details of the analytical process were described in section 2.4.

 *2.3 Growth of S. platensis in presence of sterilized anaerobic digestion effluent with Cu2+-Zn2+*

 ADE was collected from a pig farm located in Fengcheng City, Jiangxi Province, China. 199 The ADE was centrifuged at 4  $^{\circ}$ C and 10,000 rpm for 15 min to collect the supernatant. 200 To minimize the contribution of other microorganisms in the ADE, the supernatant was 201 sterilized at 121 °C for 20 min. The main characteristics of sterilized anaerobic digestion 202 effluent (SADE) were determined and shown in Table 2. SADE was further diluted in two different concentrations (25% and 50%) using deionized water, which were labelled as 25% SADE and 50% SADE, respectively. Dilution ratios of ADE were ascertained as our previous pre-experiment studies due to the obvious difference in growth and chlorophyll fluorescence activity (data not shown). 250 mLof 25%, 50% and 100% (no dilution) SADE was transferred in sterilized 500 mL Erlenmeyer flasks for *S. platensis* cultivation and each SADE concentration was prepared in triplicates.



#### *2.4 Analytical methods and statistical analysis*

 Biomass concentrations of *S. platensis* during the cultivation period were assessed by 226 measuring the dry cell weight (DCW) of microalgae biomass at 105  $\degree$ C for 24 h 227 according to the method described in Zhou et al. (2021). The growth inhibition rate (GIR) of *S. platensis* was calculated as follows:

229 GIR  $(^{0}_{0}) = [(DCW_{control} - DCW_{sample}) / DCW_{control}] \times 100\%$  (1)

230 where DCW<sub>sample</sub> represents the dry cell weight  $(g/L)$  of biomass in reactors with SM 231 or SADE with the presence of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$ , and DCW<sub>control</sub> means the dry cell weight (g/L) of biomass in corresponding control, such as Control<sub>SM</sub> and Control<sub>SADE</sub>.

233<br>234

The maximum photochemical quantum yield of Photosystem II (PS II)  $(F_v/F_m)$  was 235 used to represent chlorophyll fluorescence activity.  $F_v/F_m$  was determined in dark using Water-PAM (WALZ, Germany) and obtained from the measured chlorophyll 237 fluorescence induction curves developed by WinControl software v.3.2.  $F_v/F_m$  is usually

 calculated as follows (Ramanna et al., 2014):

$$
F_v = F_m - F_0 \tag{2}
$$

240 
$$
F_v/F_m = (F_m - F_0)/F_m
$$
 (3)

241 where  $F_v$  is the variable fluorescence.  $F_m$  and  $F_0$  are the maximum fluorescence and initial chlorophyll fluorescence measured of *S. platensis* in dark, respectively.

 An ultraviolet spectrophotometer was employed to determine the chlorophyll-a and carotenoid concentration in *S. platensis* biomass through spectrophotometry in the process of cultivation as described previously (Zhou et al., 2018). Protein content of *S. platensis* was presented as crude protein (TN×6.25), which was estimated from total 248 nitrogen (TN) using a conversion factor (6.25) (Zhou et al., 2021). Fatty acids profile was analyzed through GC-MS (Agilent 7890B-7000D, USA) as discussed in the 250 previous study (Zhou et al., 2018).

 Cu and Zn contents in the freeze-dried *S. platensis* biomass were determined by ICP- OES (Optima 8000, United States), respectively. Samples were digested with HNO3 (70% purity, Aladdin Biochemical Technology Co., Ltd, China) and HCl (37% purity, 255 Aladdin Biochemical Technology Co., Ltd, China) mixture  $(HNO<sub>3</sub>:HC1 = 1:3, v/v)$  in 256 a microwave oven and the procedure was as follows: (1) at 120  $\degree$ C for 2 min, (2) at 257 160 °C for 3 min, (3) at 180 °C for 20 min. Afterwards, samples were diluted to 1:50 with ultra-pure water before measurement. Then the diluted sample was analyzed by ICP-OES (Zhou et al., 2018).

- *2.5 Risk assessment*
- 

The risk of pig exposure to Cu and Zn after ingesting these microalgae biomass was

 assessed by the average daily intake (ADI) (mg/(kg∙day)) and the hazard quotient (HQ) as equations below Eq (4) and (5) (Shamsollahi et al., 2019):

$$
ADI = (C \times I \times EF \times ED) / (BW \times AT)
$$
 (4)

 where C means the Cu or Zn concentrations in microalgae (mg/kg); I is the ingestion rate of biomass (kg/day), 0.075 kg/day for one pig in this study (Hugh et al., 1985; 269 Michalak et al., 2015); EF means the exposure frequency (days/years), in this study, 87 day/years (Michalak et al., 2015); ED means the exposure duration (year), 1 year for this study; BW means the body weight of the exposed individual (kg), 30 kg for pigs in 272 this study (Šimkus et al., 2013); and AT means the exposure time period (day),  $ED \times 365$ days (Zheng et al., 2010).

$$
HQ = ADI / RfD
$$
 (5)

 where RfD represents the reference dose for ingestion (mg/(kg∙day)). Daily requirements of Cu and Zn are 6.01 mg Cu and 90.2 mg for one pig weighing 25 - 50kg, respectively (National Research Council, 2012). Thus, RfD was 0.12 mg/(kg∙day) for Cu and 1.80 mg/(kg∙day) for Zn, derived by dividing the daily requirements of heavy metals by body weight (50 kg).

 For a mixture of pollutants, the hazard index (HI) is the summation of hazard quotients 282 for all heavy metals in this study, and is calculated by Eq.  $(6)$ :

283  $HI = HQ_{Cu} + HQ_{Zn}$  (6)

284 where  $HQ_{Cu}$  and  $HQ_{Zn}$  mean the HQ value of Cu and Zn, respectively.

The statistical analysis of all data and data plotting were performed with Microsoft

Excel 2013 and Origin 2017. The comparison was performed by One-Way ANOVA

using IBM SPSS Statistics 26. The *P* < 0.05 was considered as statistically significant.

3. Results

292 *3.1 Biomass growth*

293

- 294 *3.1.1 Biomass growth in SM*
- 

295  $Fig.1$  shows the growth and chlorophyll fluorescence activity  $(F_v/F_m)$  of *S. platensis* cell 297 at various treatments for 11 days of cultivation. The presence of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  in SM 298 greatly reduced the biomass development of *S. platensis* (Fig 1A). In control reactors, 299 biomass concentration increased steadily to 0.62 g/L after 11 days of cultivation. In SM 300 with the presence of  $Cu^{2+}$  or  $Zn^{2+}$ , the biomass was 0.03 - 0.28 g/L after 11 days. This 301 biomass reduction is directly related to the increase of  $Cu^{2+}$  or  $Zn^{2+}$  concentration. In 302 SM with the presence of 0.3 mg/L  $Cu^{2+}$ , the increase of  $Zn^{2+}$  from 0 to 8.0 mg/L reduced 303 biomass concentrations from 0.28 g/L to 0.03 g/L. Increased  $Cu^{2+}$  concentrations from 304 0.3 to 0.6 mg/L at constant  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  levels in SM also resulted in significant decrease of 305 biomass yield from 0.22 - 0.28 g/L to 0 - 0.12 g/L ( $P < 0.05$ ). In particular, the growth 306 at 0.6 Cu+2.0 Zn was almost completely inhibited. Moreover, extended lag phases 307 (from 0 day to 3 - 9 days) were observed in the reactors with increased  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  level at 0.3 308 mg/L  $Cu^{2+}$  or increased  $Cu^{2+}$  level at constant  $Zn^{2+}$  concentration. These results indicate 309 the growth of *S. platensis* was suppressed significantly (*P* < 0.05) in SM with the 310 addition of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$ . This is also reflected by the growth inhibition rate (GIR) 311 shown in Fig. 1C. When  $Zn^{2+}$  concentrations increased from 2.0 to 8.0 mg/L under 0.3  $312 \text{ mg/L Cu}^{2+}$ , GIR increased from 63.9% to 95.9% on the 11<sup>th</sup> day, which was much higher 313 than the GIR at 0.3 Cu<sup>2+</sup> (55.5%). Under 0.6 mg/L Cu<sup>2+</sup>, the addition of  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  also 314 enhanced the GIR from 81.4% to 99.8%. Meanwhile, an increased GIR from 55.5% to 315 99.8% was also observed with increasing  $Cu^{2+}$  concentration (from 0.3 to 0.6 mg/L) 316 under a fixed  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  concentration (0.0 or 2.0 mg/L) on the 11<sup>th</sup> day.

317



- 
- *3.1.2 Biomass growth in SADE*
- 

 Biomass yield of *S. platensis* exhibited a continual upward trend for 10 days cultivation, 334 obtaining 0.99 g/L in control reactors and  $0.63 - 0.79$  g/L in reactors with SADE (Fig. 335 1B). Biomass concentration in 100% SADE enhanced obviously to 0.45  $g/L$  in the first day while the biomass yield in 25% and 50% SADE was significantly lower than 100% 337 SADE (Fig. 1B). It is likely there were more abundant nutrients in 100% SADE reactors than diluted SADE, which could be consumed by *S. platensis* for biomass accumulation. It was found that higher SADE proportions in the reactors led to lower GIR in the first 3 days, corresponding to -304.9% to -106.2% in 100% SADE reactors, -107.1% to - 15.8% in 50% SADE reactors and -42.2% to -15.8% in 25% SADE (Fig. 1D), implying promotion effect of SADE on *S. platensis* growth at the start of the experimentation. After 3 days, GIR increased slowly and then tended to be stable of 21.8% in 25% SADE,



*3.2 Accumulation of intracellular biochemical components*

*3.2.1 Photosynthetic pigments*

 Concentrations of photosynthetic pigments in different reactors are displayed in Fig. 2. In ControlSM, the chlorophyll-a and carotenoid concentrations of *S. platensis* biomass gradually increased during the cultivation, reaching the maximum values at 3.49 mg/L 357 and 1.51 mg/L on the  $10<sup>th</sup>$  day, respectively (Fig. 2A and 2B). The production of 358 chlorophyll-a and carotenoid was completely inhibited at  $0.6$  Cu+2.0 Zn on the  $10^{th}$  day. 359 Increase of  $Cu^{2+}$  concentration from 0.3 to 0.6 mg/L at fixed  $Zn^{2+}$  reduced chlorophyll-360 a and carotenoid levels by 32.5 - 100% and 49.3 - 100% on the  $10<sup>th</sup>$  day, respectively. 361 When  $Zn^{2+}$  concentration was elevated from 0.0 mg/L to 8.0 mg/L at 0.3 mg/L  $Cu^{2+}$ , maximum chlorophyll-a and carotenoid levels increased from 0.77 and 0.67 mg/L to 1.03 and 0.91 mg/L and then decreased to 0.13 and 0.16 mg/L, respectively. The peak values of chlorophyll-a and carotenoid were achieved at 0.3 Cu+4.0 Zn and 0.3 Cu+2.0 365 Zn, respectively, which were significantly lower than that in Control<sub>SM</sub> ( $P < 0.05$ ). This 366 implies the  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  in SM can alter the biosynthesis of chlorophyll-a and 367 carotenoid in *S. platensis*. More importantly, the presence of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  in SM accelerated the time required to reach the peak of chlorophyll-a and carotenoid levels. 369 In Control<sub>SM</sub>, the peak reached on the 10th day. Increase of  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  from 0.0 to 8.0 mg/L 370 at 0.3 mg/L Cu<sup>2+</sup> and increase of Cu<sup>2+</sup> from 0.3 to 0.6 mg/L at fixed  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  concentrations

 both reduced the time required for the peak of chlorophyll-a and carotenoid levels from 10 days to 4 days.

 As depicted in Fig. 2C and 2D, chlorophyll-a and carotenoid concentrations in *S. platensis* cells accumulated with the cultivation time and reached a peak value of 10.17 376 mg/L and 2.87 mg/L on day 10 in ControlsADE, respectively. Similarly, for 50% SADE and 100% SADE, the production of chlorophyll-a and carotenoid increased slowly and 378 reached a peak value on day 10. In comparison to ControlsADE, the peak values of chlorophyll-a and carotenoid decreased by 70.7 - 77.2% and 38.8 - 55.4% in 50% SADE and 100% SADE, respectively. In the reactors with 25% SADE, the maximum value of chlorophyll-a and carotenoid declined by 70.0% and 30.3% in comparison to ControlSADE, respectively. As stated above, the increase of SADE content clearly reduced the production of chlorophyll-a and carotenoid.

#### 3.2.2 *Biochemical composition of microalgae biomass*

 The biochemical compositions of *S. platensis* biomass can be reflected in crude protein 388 contents and fatty acids profiles (Fig. 3). In SM, the presence of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  significantly reduced the production of crude protein in *S. platensis* biomass by 5.0 - 390 41.1%  $(P < 0.05)$  (Fig. 3A) in comparison to Control<sub>SM</sub>. Under the same Cu<sup>2+</sup>, the 391 increase of  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  from 0.0 to 8.0 mg/L reduced the production of crude protein from 392 70.0% to 43.4%. Under the same  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$ , the increase of Cu<sup>2+</sup> (0.3 - 0.6 mg/L) reduced the synthesis of crude protein from 70.0% to 46.9%. Similarly, in reactors with SADE, regardless of the dilution ratio of SADE, the crude protein production in *S. platensis* 395 biomass decreased by 65.1 - 75.3% in comparison to Controls<sub>ADE</sub> (Fig. 3C). A higher dilution ratio of SADE contributed to a slight increase of 36.1% - 41.4% in crude protein levels in comparison to 100% SADE.

398<br>399 Fig. 3B and 3D reveal the compositional distribution of fatty acids extracted from *S*. 400 *platensis* biomass, where C16-C18 were the main components. The fatty acids profiles 401 of *S. platensis* cells at 0.3 Cu+8.0 Zn and 0.6 Cu+2.0 Zn were not detected due to the 402 extremely low biomass. In SM reactors, C16:0 was dominant and followed by C18:0, 403 C18:2, C18:3, C18:1, and C16:1 (Fig. 3B). Unsaturated fatty acids (UFA) are composed 404 of monounsaturated fatty acids (MUFA) and polyunsaturated fatty acids (PUFA). 405 Despite C16:0 is the predominant fatty acids in SM, most interest is focused on the 406 polyunsaturated fatty acids (PUFA) with two or more double bonds (such as  $\gamma$ -linolenic 407 acid) due to a wide range of application in food additives (Tonietto et al., 2014). The 408 amount of SFA and UFA in Control<sub>SM</sub> were 41.5% and 19.0%, respectively, where the 409 fraction of PUFA was about double as abundant as MUFA. The presence of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $410$   $Zn^{2+}$  in SM exhibited negligible impact on MUFA amount, and altered the fraction of 411 SFA, PUFA, and UFA. With the increase of  $Cu^{2+}$  concentration from 0.0 to 0.6 mg/L in 412 the absent  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  of SM, the proportion of SFA (mainly C16:0) and UFA (mainly C18:2 413 and C18:3) decreased by 14.0% and 29.3%, respectively. This implies that  $Cu^{2+}$  could 414 decrease the saturation of C16 and C18, which was opposite to the conclusion of Li et 415 al. (2018) that the proportion of C16:0 and C18:0 increased with the elevated  $Cu^{2+}$ 416 concentration (1-3 mg/L) in anaerobically digested swine wastewater (ADSW). With 417 the increase of  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  levels from 0.0 to 6.0 mg/L in SM under 0.3 mg/L Cu<sup>2+</sup>, the fraction 418 of SFA, PUFA, and UFA enhanced apparently till 0.3 Cu+2.0 Zn with maximum values 419 of 50.8% SFA, 19.3% PUFA and 22.8% UFA, and then reduced slowly. The proportion 420 of C18:2 and C18:3 also peaked at 0.3 Cu+2.0 Zn, which increased by 30.7% and 97.1% 421 in comparison to Control<sub>SM</sub>, respectively. This implies that an appropriate concentration 422 of  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  could alleviate the negative impact of  $\text{Cu}^{2+}$  on the biosynthesis of specific fatty 423 acids in *S. platensis* biomass.



#### 3.3 *Uptake of Cu and Zn in S. platensis biomass*

439 The uptake capacities of *S. platensis* to different concentrations of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  were 440 determined at the end of the cultivation (Fig. 4). The uptake of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  in *S*. *platensis* biomass at 0.6 Cu+2.0 Zn was not detected due to the extremely low biomass. 442 In Controlsm, contents of Cu and Zn were about 24.3 mg/kg dry weight and 29.7 mg/kg 443 dry weight, respectively. Under 0.3 mg/L  $Cu^{2+}$  in SM, the uptake of Zn in biomass 444 increased from 87.7 to 1031.7 mg/kg dry weight at 0.0 - 6.0 mg/L  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  and then sharply 445 declined to 213.3 mg/kg dry weight at  $8.0 \text{ mg/L Zn}^{2+}$  ( $P < 0.05$ ) (Fig. 4A). In the absent 446  $Zn^{2+}$  in SM, increase of Cu<sup>2+</sup> from 0.3 to 0.6 mg/L facilitated the uptake of Cu in biomass from 118.0 to 301.3 mg/kg dry weight (*P* < 0.05). Furthermore, the increase of 448  $Zn^{2+}$  concentration from 0.0 to 4.0 mg/L at 0.3 mg/L Cu<sup>2+</sup> in SM showed negligible impacts on the uptake of Cu contents (99.0 to 118.0 mg/kg dry weight) but accelerated uptake of Cu in biomass to 386.3 mg/kg dry weight from 4.0 to 8.0 mg/L, indicating 451 the ability of *S. platensis* to uptake  $Cu^{2+}$  was enhanced in the presence of  $Zn^{2+} > 4.0$  mg/L (Fig. 4A). Bioconcentration factor (BCF) is an index to evaluate the ability of microalgae to accumulate heavy metals during the bioconcentration process. A similar trend of BCF of Cu was also observed where BCF remained around 330.0 to 393.3 at 455  $Zn^{2+}$  concentration of 0.0 - 4.0 mg/L but increased continuously reaching 1287.8 at  $Zn^{2+}$ 456 concentration of 8.0 mg/L under  $Cu^{2+}$  of 0.3 mg/L (Fig. S2). The different initial 457 concentrations of  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  tested for *S. platensis* also altered the BCF value of  $\text{Zn}$  (Fig. S2). 458 Under 0.3 mg/L  $Cu^{2+}$  in SM, BCF values of Zn remained 120.7 - 171.9 at 2.0 - 6.0 mg/L 459 Zn<sup>2+</sup> but declined to 26.7 at 8.0 mg/L  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  concentration. In reactors with SADE, a higher dilution ratio was associated with lower contents of Cu

 and Zn in biomass (Fig. 4B). The uptake capacities of *S. platensis* biomass significantly decreased from 113.0 in 100% SADE to 27.4 mg/kg dry weight in 25% SADE for Cu and from 1377.3 to 373.4 mg/kg dry weight for Zn with a continuous dilution of SADE  $(P < 0.05)$ .

*3.4 Risk assessment*

 Microalgae could pose health risks through transferring microalgae-associated heavy metals to livestock and humans through food chains when consumed in large amounts at once or in small amounts over a long period of time, even if the concentrations of heavy metals in biomass are low or below toxic levels (Roleda et al., 2019). Thus, the risk of using metal-laden *S. platensis* biomass as a feedstock additive for pigs was investigated.

As seen in Fig. 5A and 5C, a daily consume of 0.075kg of *S. platensis* harvested from

477 the reactors of 2.0 - 4.0 mg/L  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  at 0.3 mg/L  $\text{Cu}^{2+}$  resulted in higher HQ for  $\text{Cu}^{2+}$ 



#### **4. Discussion**

493<br>494

## 4.1 *Effects* of  $Cu^{2+}$  *and*  $Zn^{2+}$  *on the growth of S. platensis*

496 This study showed that  $Cu^{2+}$  (0.3 - 0.6 mg/L) and  $Zn^{2+}$  (0.0 - 8.0 mg/L) in SM and SADE system inhibited the production of *S. platensis* biomass. This is likely related to the declined photosynthetic pigment concentrations and increased heavy metals 499 contents in microalgae cells (Fig. 2 and 4). In SM reactors, the presence of  $Cu^{2+}$  and 500  $Zn^{2+}$  inhibited the biosynthesis of chlorophyll-a and carotenoid. (Fig. 2A and 2B). The 501 inhibition effect was also positively linked with the  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$ concentrations. Similarly, reduced chlorophyll-a and carotenoid levels were also observed in SADE 503 with the inherent presence of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  in SADE, where the reduction was alleviated by the dilution of SADE (Fig. 2C and 2D). Decreased chlorophyll-a level in 505 microalgae is a typical sign of metal poisoning (de Filippis et al., 1981). This is likely 506 due to the replacement of magnesium atoms in the chlorophyll porphyrin ring by  $Cu^{2+}$ 507 and  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  (Kowalewska et al., 1987; Zhou et al., 2018).  $\text{Cu}^{2+}$  and  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  in high 508 concentrations also inhibit the photosynthetic electron transport on the oxidizing side 509 of PS Iland inactivate some PS Ilreaction centers (Yang et al., 2015), consequently 510 reducing photosynthesis and inhibiting the growth of microalgae. The result of 511 chlorophyll-a reduction due to  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  agreed with the declined chlorophyll-a 512 concentration in *Coelastrella* sp. cells cultivated in ADSW with increased Cu<sup>2+</sup> levels 513 (0.1 - 3 mg/L) (Li et al., 2018). Carotenoid, acting as an antioxidant, is generally 514 synthesized in large amounts in microalgae cells to protect the cells from oxidative 515 damage due to the enhanced production of reactive oxygen species (ROS) under 516 unfavorable growth conditions such as when being exposed to heavy metals (Foyer and 517 Mullineaux, 1994). In this study, carotenoid production was inhibited due to the toxicity 518 from  $Cu^{2+}$  and/or  $Zn^{2+}$  in both SM and SADE reactors, where carotenoid concentrations 519 in SM and SADE reactors were significantly lower than their respective control reactors 520 (*P* < 0.05). Similar observation was also found by Kondzior and Butarewicz (2018) that 521  $Zn^{2+}$  in 6.25 - 100 mg/L and Cu<sup>2+</sup> in 0.025 - 0.15 mg/L in Blue-Green medium (BG 11) 522 both decreased the carotenoids content in *Chlorella vulgaris* cells. Besides carotenoid, 523 Superoxide dismutase (SOD) also acts as the first-line antioxidant enzyme defending 524 against ROS (Saha et al., 2013). A slight increase (7.0%) of carotenoid concentration 525 was observed from day 8 to day 10 in 25% SADE reactors (lowest  $Cu^{2+}$  (c.a. 0.17 mg/L) 526 and/or  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  (c.a. 0.45 mg/L) concentrations among both SM and SADE reactors) in 527 comparison to Controls<sub>ADE</sub>. In contrast, on the  $10<sup>th</sup>$  day, the activity of SOD, reduced 528 by 12.4% in 25% SADE reactors, but increased by 8.2% and 3.6% in 50% SADE and 529 100% SADE reactors in comparison to ControlsADE, respectively, (Fig. S2).

530 Considering the lowest initial cultivation  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  condition in 25% SADE reactors and the accumulation of Cu and Zn from the aqueous phase to biomass, it is likely that SOD played the major role in alleviating oxidative stress from ROS when 533 the carotenoid production was inhibited at higher  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  concentrations (i.e. 50%) 534 and 100% SADE), while the increase of carotenoid production at lower  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  condition (i.e. 25% SADE at the later stage of cultivation) reduced the oxidative stress and SOD expression (Gauthier et al., 2020). However, over the whole cultivation, chlorophyll-a, carotenoid and biomass concentrations in SM and SADE reactors with Cu<sup>2+</sup> and or  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  were reduced in comparison to respective control reactors, implying impaired photosynthetic activity of *S. platensis* cells (Fig. 1B, Fig. 2C and 2D). These 540 observations imply toxicity of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  in all SM and SADE reactors potentially had exceeded the total antioxidant production capacity of *S. platensis* in this study.

542

543 In SM reactors, increase of  $Cu^{2+}$  (0.0 - 0.6 mg/L) and  $Zn^{2+}$  (0.0 - 6.0 mg/L) 544 concentration facilitated the uptake of Cu and Zn content in the biomass, respectively. 545 This is consistent with SADE reactors with Cu<sup>2+</sup> (0.17 - 0.67 mg/L) and  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  (0.45 -546 1.78 mg/L), where the uptake of Cu and Zn in the biomass was positively related to the 547 Cu and Zn concentrations, respectively. This is likely sufficient active sites existed on 548 the surface of *S. platensis* cells to bind to  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$ . The higher the concentration 549 of exposed  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$ , the more  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  adsorbed on the cell surface. 550 Moreover, in SM reactors,  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  concentration > 4.0 mg/L promoted the uptake of Cu in 551 biomass, indicating the improved selective for  $Cu^{2+}$ . This is likely related to the 552 membrane lipid peroxidation and improved membrane permeability resulted from 553 increasing  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  level, and thus more substance, such as  $\text{Cu}^{2+}$ , entered the cell and got 554 internalized. Similar results were reported by Flouty and Estephane (2012) that high 555 levels of  $Pb^{2+}$  (> 10<sup>-6</sup> M) promoted the bioaccumulation of  $Cu^{2+}$  by *Chlamydomonas* 

*reinhardtii* cells, while low levels of  $Pb^{2+}$  ( $\leq 5 \times 10^{-7}$  M) had no effect on Cu<sup>2+</sup> bioaccumulation. This is mainly associated with the presence of two uptake sites of Cu, that is, a Pb-independent, high affinity site and a Pb-dependent, low affinity site (Flouty 559 and Estephane, 2012). However,  $\text{Zn}^{2+} \geq 8.0 \text{ mg/L}$  at 0.3 mg/L  $\text{Cu}^{2+}$  inhibited the uptake of Zn, it is likely that the structure of *S. platensis* cells was damaged.

 Cu<sup>2+</sup> and Zn<sup>2+</sup> accumulated in cells was found negatively correlated to the biosynthesis of protein (Fig. 3A and 3C). Crude protein production decreased with the increase of 564 Cu<sup>2+</sup> and  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  concentrations in SM reactors (Fig. 3A). Dilution of SADE increased the crude protein level, compared with 100% SADE (Fig. 3B). This suggests that the 566 production of protein was compromised under the presence of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  levels in 567 this study. This is likely due to that  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  compete with other metals for the 568 binding sites in proteins following the Irving-Williams series  $(Mg^{2+})$  and  $Ca^{2+}$  (weakest 569 binding)  $\leq Mn^{2+} < Fe^{2+} < Ce^{2+} < Ni^{2+} < Cu^{2+} > Zn^{2+}$  (Waldron and Robinson, 2009), leading to the structural destruction, perturbation of protein function and, in some cases, 571 protein degradation (Huertas et al., 2014). Previous studies also showed that production 572 of proteins in *Coelastrella* sp. cells decreased in ADSW with the increased Cu<sup>2+</sup> content 573 (Li et al., 2018). Alteration of fatty acids caused by  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  likely exerted an impact on cell plasma membranes (Wu et al., 2006), subsequently influencing the growth of *S. platensis*. The degree of saturation of fatty acids is associated with the fluidity of membranes and may influence the microalgae response to pollutants (Rocha et al., 2021), i.e., the decrease in PUFA can reduce the fluidity of photosynthetic membranes (Wacker et al., 2016) to result in an alteration in photosynthesis rate (Spijkerman and Wacker, 2011). The fraction of PUFA decreased by 11.4 - 39.5% in 25%, 50% and 100% SADE and by 4.8 - 27.2% at 0.3 Cu, 0.3 Cu+6.0 Zn and 0.6 Cu in comparison to their respective control (Fig. 3B and 3D). The growth of *S. platensis*

 observed in those mentioned reactors was also lower than their respective control (Fig. 1Aand 1B). Areduction of C18:3 (ω3) amount led to lower incorporation of D1 protein, which is responsible for maintenance of PS II activity (Anderson et al., 1997). C18:3 (ω3) disappeared in 50%, 100% SADE and decreased by 20.6% at 0.6 Cu in comparison 586 to Control<sub>SM</sub>. Despite the increase of C18:3 at 25% SADE, 0.3 Cu+2.0 Zn, 0.3 Cu+4.0 587 Zn and 0.3 Cu+6.0 Zn, this was not enough to avoid damage of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  in the 588 photoprotective mechanisms. Therefore, the decline of PUFA, caused by  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  in SM and SADE reactors, also weakened photosynthetic performance and hindered microalgal growth of *S. platensis*.

 Furthermore, the growth of *S. platensis* observed on day 11 at 0.6 Cu (GIR: 81.4%, and biomass yield: 0.12 g/L) was comparable to that achieved at 0.3 Cu+6.0 Zn (GIR: 85.1%, and biomass yield: 0.09 g/L). Chlorophyll-a (0.67 mg/Lat 0.3 Cu+6.0 Zn versus 0.52 mg/L at 0.6 Cu) and crude protein (58.4% L at 0.3 Cu+6.0 Zn versus 60.7% 0.6 Cu) levels were also comparable between these two reactors, implying *S. platensis* underwent comparable heavy metals toxicity when exposed to 0.3 Cu+6.0 Zn and 0.6 598 Cu. This demonstrates that *S. platensis* was more sensitive to  $Cu^{2+}$  than  $Zn^{2+}$ . Generally, the changes of metabolites, such as photosynthetic pigments, protein, and fatty acids in cells, can be regarded as an attempt by microalgae to maintain their growth rates or increase their chances of survival under adversity (Li et al., 2018; Rocha et al., 2021; Zhou et al., 2018).

*4.2 Comparison of growth pattern of S. platensis in different substrates*

- 
- In this study, the growth of *S. platensis* differed between SADE reactors and SM 607 reactors with comparable concentrations of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  (i.e. 100% SADE versus 0.6
- Cu+2.0 Zn, and 50% SADE versus 0.3 Cu or 0.3 Cu+2.0 Zn). During the cultivation,

 the biomass concentration of *S. platensis* in 100% SADE (0.63 g/L) was significantly 610 greater than 0.6 Cu+2.0 Zn which was inhibited completely by heavy metals ( $P < 0.05$ ). A similar phenomenon occurred between 50% SADE and 0.3 Cu or 0.3 Cu+2.0 Zn. 612 This is likely that microalgae prefer to utilize the NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N in SADE rather than nitrate nitrogen in SM as nitrogen source for biomass accumulation (Cai et al., 2013). Despite the different biomass production patterns between SADE and SM reactors, similar 615 trends of  $F_v/F_m$  were observed in the two groups of reactors: (1) 100% SADE and 0.6 Cu+2.0 Zn, (2) 50% SADE, and 0.3 Cu or 0.3 Cu+2.0 Zn, implying *S. platensis* cells 617 suffered similarly from combined toxicity of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  in both types of reactors. Chlorophyll-a and carotenoid concentrations in SADE reactors were 73.2% -100% and 619 62.1% - 100% greater than respective SM reactors with comparable  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  level, respectively. Chlorophyll-a and carotenoid levels were associated with biomass concentration. Biomass yields of *S. platensis* in SADE were higher than SM reactors 622 with comparable  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  level, leading to improved pigments concentrations. SADE is a complex matrix with some substances like tetracycline antibiotics, which may promote the synthesis of pigments (Tong et al., 2020; Zhou et al., 2021). Besides, 625 N element content in SADE is much lower than that in SM reactors  $(2.50 \text{ g/L})$ . N starvation stimulated lipolysis process to produce acetyl-CoA, which was a precursor for synthesis of carotenoid (Kand and Nagarajan, 2013). Crude protein level in 50% and 100% SADE reactors was 61.1% - 64.9% lower than respective SM reactors with 629 comparable  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  level. Fatty acids profile of 0.6 Cu+2.0 Zn was not analyzed owing to the low biomass, and no comparison of SFA and UFA between 100% SADE and 0.6 Cu+2.0 Zn was provided in this study. The proportion of SFA and UFA in 50% SADE reactors were 40.9% and 17.1% lower than that at 0.3 Cu+2.0 Zn, respectively. N and P are the major substances for biosynthesis of protein and fatty acids. The



656<br>657 *4.3 Implication for S. platensis in the treatment of ADE*

Our results showed the promising potential of using ADE as an economical option for

 the cultivation and harvest of *S. platensis* cells as a feedstock for pig consumption. The economic viability of this system also relies on that *S. platensis* has been proved as an effective supplement in regular animal feeds to improve immune response of animals and enhance meat quality by providing protein and essential fatty acids (Dineshbabu et al., 2019; Zhang et al., 2019). Based on nutritional consideration, the SADE-grown *S. platensis* can provide a variety of nutrients needed for pigs and the crude protein (~24%) 666 was equivalent to traditional plant protein sources, such as peas  $(\sim 22\%)$  and distillers dried grains with solubles (~27%) (Moheimani et al., 2018). The PUFA levels, particularly C18:2 (9.7%) and C18:3 (18.0%) in 25% SADE-grown biomass were comparable with those cultivated in chemicals, thereby providing pigs with abundant PUFA. The risk associated with using the biomass with heavy metal accumulation was assessed in this study. ADI values of Cu and Zn in *S. platensis* biomass grown in SADE systems were all below the limits, and HQ values for Cu and Zn were also less than 1 (Fig. 5B and 5D). HI values of diluted SADE (50% or 25% dilution) were also below 1, but HI value in 100% SADE was slightly above 1, suggesting biomass from diluted 675 SADE was acceptable for pigs as animal feeds. This is likely related to the high  $Cu^{2+}$ 676 (0.67 mg/L) and  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  (1.78 mg/L) in 100% SADE, where a consistent higher HI value 677 was observed in SM reactors with  $Cu^{2+} \ge 0.3$  and  $Zn^{2+} > 4.0$  mg/L. Thus, concentrations 678 of Cu<sup>2+</sup> < 0.3 mg/L and Zn<sup>2+</sup> < 4.0 mg/L are recommended for the application of ADE, where proper dilutions might be essential.

 Based on our laboratory testing results, a comparable amount of biomass could be noticed when *S. platensis* grown in 25% SADE (0.78 g/L) and ControlSADE (0.88 g/L) (Fig. 1B). Thus, growing microalgae in diluted SADE yielded comparable biomass with lower chemical use and financial input in comparison to ControlSADE. On the other hand, cultivation in SADE allows for a reduction in harvesting cost owing to the auto flocculation of biomass. Zeta potential of *S. platensis* cells decreased by 14.2 - 71.3% in diluted SADE reactors and increased by 14.1% in 100% SADE in comparison to ControlSADE (Fig. S3). Particles with lower zeta potential values showed a higher tendency for attachment and aggregation (Novoa et al., 2020). Therefore, auto- flocculation of *S. platensis* cells is potentially easier in 25% SADE than 100% SADE 691 and Control<sub>SADE</sub> due to the lower zeta potential values shown in Fig.  $S3$ , making it feasible for reducing the cost of harvesting *S. platensis* biomass. These results indicate that 25% SADE reactors make the reduced costs of biomass production and harvesting technically viable.

 A "circular economy" concept in ADE based on the proposed microalgae technology was established in Fig. 6, relying on the ability of *S. platensis* for nutrient recovery and heavy metals removal in ADE and biomass production used for livestock. In our study, *S. platensis* assimilated 56.2 - 82.9% NH4 +-N from SADE reactors (Table 3) for 700 biomass production along with the uptake of heavy metals (27.4 - 113.0 mg/kg for  $Cu^{2+}$ ) 701 and 377.4 - 1373.3 mg/kg for  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$ ) (Fig. 4B). This is consistent with the removal efficiency of NH4 +-N (approximately 38 - 93%) in ADE reported in previous 703 publications (Hasan et al., 2021; Li et al., 2021; Li et al., 2018). The residuals of  $Cu^{2+}$ 704 and  $\text{Zn}^{2+}$  were below than 0.11 and 0.04 mg/L in treated ADE, respectively (Table 3), which was suitable for irrigation (World Health Organization, 2006). The accumulated Cu and Zn in biomass (Fig. 4) indicates *S. platensis* cells can be an effective bio- adsorbent, transferring heavy metals form aqueous solutions to the surface and interior of cells (Chan et al., 2013). These imply that the cultivation of *S. platensis* in ADE can be a potential strategy to remove ammonia and heavy metals from ADE and minimize the pollutions related to the ADE discharge in the environment. The treated ADE can also be recycled for piggery cleaning or water supplement for ADE dilution and  microalgae cultivation to relieve pressure on the water and truly realize water circulation (Fig.6). In addition, this study applied pure species of S. platensis with sterilized laboratory cultivation environments (i.e. culture medium, sterilized ADE, and conical flasks materials) with strict aseptic manipulation to prevent microbial contaminations during the cultivation. In larger-scale setups, potential microbial contaminations might occur during the cultivation, the impact of which requires future investigations.

- **5. Conclusion**
- 

 This study explored the physiological and biochemical properties of *S. platensis* 723 cultivated in co-existed  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  of SM and SADE reactors. This led to the following findings:

726 • Presence of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  in SM and SADE resulted in the reduction of biomass, chlorophyll-a and carotenoid concentrations, and production of protein and fatty acids in biomass. The reduction ratio of these compounds 729 was positively related to the  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  concentrations.

- 731 S. *platensis* exhibited the ability of nutrient recovery (56.2 82.9% of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>- N) and heavy metals removal in ADE. The excellent uptake capacity reached 99.0 - 386.3 mg/kg in SM and 27.4 - 113.0 mg/kg in SADE for Cu, and 87.7 734 - 1031.7 mg/kg in SM and 373.4 - 1377.3 mg/kg in SADE for Zn, respectively.
- Using ADE for *S. platensis* cultivation and harvesting the biomass as feedstock additive is promising with economic feasibility (and limited environmental footprint although proper dilution of ADE to Cu < 0.3 mg/L 739 and  $Zn < 2.0$  is essential.

### **Acknowledgements**







- Chan, A., Salsali, H., McBean, E., 2014. Heavy metal removal (copper and zinc) in secondary effluent from wastewater treatment plants by microalgae. ACS Sustain.
- 770 Chem. Eng., 2(2), 130-137.
- Cheng, H.H., Narindri, B., Chu, H., Whang, L.M. (2020) Recent advancement on biological technologies and strategies for resource recovery from swine wastewater. Bioresour. Technol., 303, 122861.
- de Filippis, L.F., Hampp, R., Ziegler, H., 1981. The effects of sublethal concentrations
- of zinc, cadmium and mercury on *Euglena*. growth and pigments. Zeitschrift für Pflanzenphysiologie, 101(1), 37-47.
- de Sousa Oliveira, A.P.S., Assemany, P., Júnior, J.I.R, Covell, L., Nunes-Nesi, A.,
- Calijuri, M.L., 2021. Swine wastewater treatment in high rate algal ponds: Effects
- of Cu and Zn on nutrient removal, productivity and biomass composition. J.
- Environ. Manage., 299, 113668.
- Dineshbabu, G., Goswami, G., Kumar, R., Sinha, A., Das, D., 2019. Microalgae–
- nutritious, sustainable aqua- and animal feed source. J. Funct. Foods, 62, 103545.
- do Amaral, A.C., Kunz, A., Steinmetz, R.L.R., Justi, K.C., 2014. Zinc and copper
- distribution in swine wastewater treated by anaerobic digestion. J. Environ.
- Manage., 141, 132-137.
- El-Din, S.M.M., 2017. Effect of copper and lead on growth and some metabolic
- activities of cyanobacterium *Spirulina platensis* (Nordstedt). Egypt. J. Bot. 5(3), 445-456.
- Feng, Z.M., Zhu, H.H., Deng, Q.F., He, Y.M., Li, J., Yin, J., Gao, F.X., Huang, R.L., Li,
- T.J., 2018. Environmental pollution induced by heavy metal(loid)s from pig farming. Environ. Earth Sci., 77, 103.
- Flouty, R., Estephane, G., 2012. Bioaccumulation and biosorption of copper and lead
- by a unicellular algae *Chlamydomonas reinhardtii* in single and binary metal systems: a comparative study. J. Environ. Manage., 111, 106-114.
- Foyer, C.H., Mullineaux, P.M., 1994. Causes of photooxidative stress and amelioration of defense systems in plants. CRC press, Londres (united kingdom).
- Franklin, N.M., Stauber, J.L., Lim, Richard P., Peter, P., 2002. Toxicity of metal
- mixtures to a tropical freshwater alga (*Chlorella* sp.) The effect of interactions
- between copper, cadmium, and zinc on metal cell binding and uptake. Environ.
- Toxicol. Chem., 21, 2412-2422.
- Gauthier, M.R., Senhorinho, G.N.A., Scott, J.A., 2020. Microalgae under environmental stress as a source of antioxidants. Algal Res. 52, 102104.
- Gupta, M., Savla, N., Pandit, C., Pandit, S., Gupta, P.K., Pant, M., Khilari, S., Kumar,
- Y., Agarwal, D., Nair, R.R., Thomas, D., Thakur, V.K., 2022. Use of biomass-
- derived biochar in wastewater treatment and power production: A promising solution for a sustainable environment. Sci. Total Environ., 825, 153892.
- Hasan, M., Khalekuzzaman, M., Hossain, N., Alamgir, M., 2021. Anaerobic digested effluent phycoremediation by microalgae co-culture and harvesting by *Moringa*
	-
- *oleifera* as natural coagulant. J. Cleaner Prod., 292, 126042.
- Hugh, W.I., Dominy, W., Duerr, E., 1985. Evaluation of dehydrated spirulina (*Spirulina*
- *platensis*) as a protein replacement in swine starter diets. Honolulu: University of
- Hawaii Research and Extension Series, 056.
- Huertas, M.J., Lopez-Maury, L., Giner-Lamia, J., Sanchez-Riego, A.M., Florencio, F.J.,
- 2014. Metals in cyanobacteria: analysis of the copper, nickel, cobalt and arsenic homeostasis mechanisms. Life, 4(4), 865-886.
- Jin, H.M., Chang, Z.Z., 2011. Distribution of heavy metal contents and chemical
- fractions in anaerobically digested manure slurry. Appl. Biochem. Biotechnol., 164(3), 268-282.
- Kand, S., Nagarajan P., 2013. Effect of different nitrogen concentrations on the biomass and biochemical consituents of *Spirulina platensis* [Geitler]. Asian J. Bio Sci., 8,
- 245-247.
- Kondzior, P., Butarewicz, A., 2018. Effect of heavy metals (Cu and Zn) on the content
- of photosynthetic pigments in the cells of algae *Chlorella vulgaris*. J. Ecol. Eng., 19(3), 18-28.
- Kowalewska, G., Falkowski, L., Hoffmann, S.K., Szczepaniak, L.S., 1987. Replacement of magnesium by copper in the chlorophyll porphyrin ring of planktonic algae. Acta Physiol. Plant., 9(2), 43-52.
- Kusmayadi, A., Lu, P.H., Huang, C.Y., Leong, Y.K., Yen, H.W., Chang, J.S., 2022.
- Integrating anaerobic digestion and microalgae cultivation for dairy wastewater
- treatment and potential biochemicals production from the harvested microalgal





- Moheimani, N.R., Vadiveloo, A., Ayre,J.M., Pluske, J.R., 2018. Nutritional profile and
- in vitro digestibility of microalgae grown in anaerobically digested piggery
- effluent. Algal Res., 35, 362-369.
- Monfet, E., Aubry, G., Ramirez, A.A. 2017. Nutrient removal and recovery from digestate: a review of the technology. Biofuels, 9(2), 247-262.
- Nagarajan, D., Varjani, S., Lee, D.J., Chang, J.S., 2021. Sustainable aquaculture and
- animal feed from microalgae Nutritive value and techno-functional components.
- Renew. Sust. Energy Rev., 150, 111549.
- Nalimova, A.A., Popova, V.V., Tsoglin, L.N., Pronina, N.A., 2005. The effects of
- copper and zinc on *Spirulina platensis* growth and heavy metal accumulation in
- its cells. Russ. J. Plant Physiol. 52, 229-234.
- National research council, 2012. Nutrient requirements of swine. Eleventh revised edition, National Academy Press, Washington, D.C., USA.
- Nikokherad, H., Esmaili-Sarib,A., Moradi, A.M., Bahramifar, N. Mostafavi, P.G., 2022.
- Bioaccumulation capacity of *Chlorella vulgaris* and *Spirulina platensis* exposed
- to silver nanoparticles and silver nitrate: Bio- and health risk assessment approach.
- Algal Res., 64, 102671.
- Novoa, A.F., Fortunato, L., Rehman, Z.U., Leiknes, T., 2020. Evaluating the effect of
- hydraulic retention time on fouling development and biomass characteristics in an
- algal membrane photobioreactor treating a secondary wastewater effluent.
- Bioresour. Technol., 309, 123348.
- Pane, L., Solisio, C., Lodi, A., Mariottini, G.L., Converti, A., 2008. Effect of extracts
- from *Spirulina platensis* bioaccumulating cadmium and zinc on L929 cells. Ecotoxicol. Environ. Saf., 70(1), 121-126.



lipid yields of *Chlorella sorokiniana* when using wastewater supplemented with

different nitrogen sources. Bioresour. Technol., 168, 127-135.

- Razak, S.B.A., Sharip, Z., 2020. The potential of phycoremediation in controlling eutrophication in tropical lake and reservoir: a review. Desalin. Water Treat., 180, 164-173.
- Rocha, G.S., Parrish, C.C., Espíndola, E.L.G., 2021. Effects of copper on photosynthetic and physiological parameters of a freshwater microalga (Chlorophyceae). Algal Res., 54, 102223.
- Roleda, M.Y., Marfaing, H., Desnica, N., Jónsdóttir, R., Skjermo, J., Rebours, C.,
- Nitschke, U., 2019. Variations in polyphenol and heavy metal contents of wild-
- harvested and cultivated seaweed bulk biomass: Health risk assessment and
- implication for food applications. Food Control, 95, 121-134.
- Ronda, S.R., Parupudi, P.L.C., Vemula, S., Tumma, S., Botlagunta, M., Settaluri, V.S.,
- Lele, S., Sharma, S., Kandala, C., 2014. Optimization of medium components
- using orthogonal arrays for γ-Linolenic acid production by *Spirulina platensis*.
- Korean J. Chem. Eng., 31(10), 1839-1844.
- Saha, S.K., Moane, S., Murray, P., 2013. Effect of macro- and micro-nutrient limitation
- on superoxide dismutase activities and carotenoid levels in microalga *Dunaliella*
- *salina* CCAP 19/18. Bioresour. Technol., 147, 23-28.
- Schlösser, U.G., 1982. Sammlung von Algenkulturen. Ber. Dtsch. Bot. Ges., 95(1), 181- 276.
- Shamsollahi, H.R., Alimohammadi, M., Momeni, S., Naddafi, K., Nabizadeh, R.,
- Khorasgani, F.C., Masinaei, M., Yousefi, M., 2019. Assessment of the health risk
- induced by accumulated heavy metals from anaerobic digestion of biological sludge of the lettuce. Biol. Trace Elem. Res., 188(2), 514-520.
- Šimkus, A., Šimkienė, A., Černauskienė, J., Kvietkutė, N., Černauskas, A., Paleckaitis,
- M., Kerzienė, S., 2013. The effect of blue algae *Spirulina platensis* on pig growth performance and carcass and meat quality. Veterinarija ir Zootechnika., 61(83),
- 70-74.
- Spijkerman, E., Wacker, A., 2011. Interactions between P-limitation and different C conditions on the fatty acid composition of an extremophile microalga. Extremophiles, 15(5), 597-609.
- Tong, M.Y., Li, X., Luo, Q., Yang, C.P., Lou, W., Liu, H.Y., Du, C., Nie, L.J., Zhong,
- Y.Y., 2020. Effects of humic acids on biotoxicity of tetracycline to microalgae *Coelastrella* sp. Algal Res, 50, 101962.
- Tonietto, A.E., Lombardi, A.T., Vieira, A.A.H., Parrish, C.C., Choueri, R.B., 2014.
- *Cylindrospermopsis raciborskii* (Cyanobacteria) exudates: Chemical
- characterization and complexation capacity for Cu, Zn, Cd and Pb. Water Res., 49,
- 381-390.
- Usharani, G., Saranra, P., Kanchana, D., 2012. *Spirulina* cultivation: A review. Int. J.
- Pharm. Biol. Arch., 3(6), 1327-1341.
- 920 Vannela, R, Verma, S.K., 2006.  $Co^{2+}$ ,  $Cu^{2+}$ , and  $Zn^{2+}$  Accumulation by Cyanobacterium
- *Spirulina platensis*. Biotechnol. Progr, 22(5), 1282-1293.
- Wacker, A., Piepho, M., Harwood, J.L., Guschina, I.A., Arts, M.T., 2016. Light-
- induced changes in fatty acid profiles of specific lipid classes in several freshwater
- phytoplankton species. Front. Plant. Sci., 7, 264.
- Waldron, K.J., Robinson, N.J., 2009. How do bacterial cells ensure that metalloproteins get the correct metal? Nat. Rev .Microbiol. 7(1), 25-35.
- Wang, Q., Gong, Y., Liu, S., Wang, D., Liu, R., Zhou, X., Nghiem, L., Zhao, Y. 2019a.
- Free Ammonia Pretreatment to Improve Bio-hydrogen Production from Anaerobic
- 929 Dark Fermentation of Microalgae. ACS Sustainable Chemistry & Engineering, 7, 1642-1647.
- Wang, Q., Sun, J., Liu, S., Gao, L., Zhou, X., Wang, D., Song, K., Nghiem, L. 2019b.
- Free ammonia pretreatment improves anaerobic methane generation from algae.
- Water Research, 162, 269-275.
- World Health Organization, 2006. WHO guidelines for the safe use of wasterwater
- excreta and greywater. Volume 2: Wastewater use in agriculture, Geneva, Switzerland, pp. 1-196.
- Wu, J.T., Chiang, Y.R., Huang, W.Y. and Jane, W.N., 2006. Cytotoxic effects of free
- fatty acids on phytoplankton algae and cyanobacteria. Aquat. Toxicol., 80(4), 338- 345.
- Xie, B.H., Gong, W.J., Tian, Y., Qu, F.S., Luo, Y.L., Du, X., Tang, X.B., Xu, D.L., Lin,



- biosorption and bioaccumulation of cadmium, copper, manganese and zinc by oleaginous microalgae *Chlorella minutissima* UTEX2341. Bioresour. Technol., 175, 537-544.
- Zhang, L.Y., Jin, P.T., Qin, S.Z., Liu, J.Z., Yang, Z.J., Zhao, H.B., Sheng, Q.K., 2019.
- Effects of dietary supplementation with *S. platensis* and probiotics on the growth performance, immune response and the fecal *Lactobacillus* spp. and *E. coli* contents of weaned piglets. Livest. Sci., 225, 32-38.
- Zhang, S.H., Hua, Y.M., Deng, L.W., 2016. Nutrient status and contamination risks from digested pig slurry applied on a vegetable crops field. Int. J. Environ. Res. Public Health, 13, 406.
- Zheng, N., Liu, J.S., Wang, Q.C., Liang, Z.Z., 2010. Health risk assessment of heavy
- metal exposure to street dust in the zinc smelting district, Northeast of China. Sci. Total Environ., 408(4), 726-733.
- Zhou, T., Cao, L.P., Zhang, Q., Liu, Y.H., Xiang, S.Y., Liu, T.Y., Ruan, R., 2021. Effect
- of chlortetracycline on the growth and intracellular components of *Spirulina*
- *platensis* and its biodegradation pathway. J. Hazard. Mater., 413, 125310.
- Zhou, T., Wang, J.J., Zheng, H.L., Wu, X.D., Wang, Y.P., Liu, M.Z., Xiang, S.Y., Cao,
- L.P., Ruan, R., Liu, Y.H., 2018. Characterization of additional zinc ions on the
- growth, biochemical composition and photosynthetic performance from *Spirulina*
- *platensis*. Bioresour. Technol., 269, 285-291.



Table 1 Exposure of *S. platensis* to different concentrations of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$  association in SM.

Parameter	Content $(mg/L)$		
$Cu2+$	$0.67 \pm 0.00$		
$Zn^{2+}$	$1.78 \pm 0.04$		
$Mg^{2+}$	$162.20 \pm 0.10$		
Ammonia nitrogen (NH <sub>4</sub> <sup>+</sup> -N)	$96.15 \pm 0.45$		
Chemical oxygen demand (COD)	$407.80 \pm 0.00$		

Table 2 Characteristics of the sterilized original anaerobic digestion effluent (SADE).

Table 3 Residual of  $Cu^{2+}$  and  $Zn^{2+}$ , and removal of NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>-N by *S. platensis* in SADE. Data are presented as mean values  $\pm$  standard deviations in biological duplicates (n =

3).

Dilution	Heavy metal $(mg/L)$		$NH_4^+$ -N (mg/L)		
	Cu	Z <sub>n</sub>	Day 0	Day $10$	Removal
					efficiency $(\% )$
100%	$0.11 \pm 0.01$	$0.038 \pm 0.00$	$96.2 \pm 0.5$	$15.9 \pm 1.1$	$82.9 \pm 0.9$
50%	$0.068 \pm 0.00$	$0.017 \pm 0.00$	$47.8 \pm 1.5$	$18.3 \pm 1.2$	$61.8 \pm 1.2$
25%	$0.028 \pm 0.00$	$0.013 \pm 0.00$	$23.6 \pm 2.9$	$10.5 \pm 2.6$	$56.2 \pm 5.2$



Fig. 1 Growth performance of *S. platensis* in different reactors during the cultivation. (A), (C) and (E) were the biomass concentrations, growth inhibition rate (GIR) and  $F_v/F_m$  (the maximum photochemical quantum yield of Photosystem Ⅱ) of *S. platensis* cells grown in SM with different concentrations of  $Cu^{2+}-Zn^{2+}$  association, respectively. (B), (D) and (F) were the biomass concentrations, GIR and Fv/Fm of *S. platensis* biomass cultivated in reactors with different dilution of SADE, respectively. Data are presented as mean values  $\pm$  standard deviations in biological duplicates ( $n = 3$ ).





Fig.2 Concentrations of photosynthetic pigments in *S. platensis* biomass when exposed to different reactors. (A) and (B) were chlorophyll-a and carotenoid in reactors with SM and different concentrations of  $Cu^{2+}-Zn^{2+}$  association, respectively. (C) and (D) were chlorophylla and carotenoid in reactors with different proportions of SADE. Data are presented as mean values  $\pm$  standard deviations in biological duplicates (n = 3).



Fig. 3 Crude protein contents in  $Cu^{2+}-Zn^{2+}$  associated SM reactors (A) and sterilized anaerobic digestion effluent (SADE) reactors (C); fatty acids profiles in  $Cu^{2+}-Zn^{2+}$  associated SM reactors (B) and SADE reactors (D). Data were measured at the end of the cultivation. Error bars



Fig. 4 Uptake of Cu<sup>2+</sup> and Zn<sup>2+</sup> in *S. platensis* biomass in Cu<sup>2+</sup>-Zn<sup>2+</sup> associated SM reactors (A) and sterilized anaerobic digestion effluent (SADE) reactors (B) (with standard deviations ( $n =$ 3)).



Fig. 5 Risk assessment of harvested *S. platensis* biomass digested by pigs. (A) and (B) mean ADI (average daily intake) of Cu and Zn from *S. platensis* grown in Cu<sup>2+</sup>-Zn<sup>2+</sup> associated SM reactors and sterilized anaerobic digestion effluent (SADE) reactors, respectively. (C) and (D) represent the hazard quotient when pigs were fed on *S. platensis* biomass cultivated in Cu<sup>2+</sup>- $Zn^{2+}$  associated SM reactors and SADE reactors (with standard deviations (n = 3)).



Fig. 6 Schematic representation of anaerobic digestion purification and sustainable utilization of *S. platensis* biomass in the circular economy framework.