

Understanding, Formalizing, and Reconstructing Mental Models with an Online Tool for Serious Discussions

by Madiha Anjum

Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for
the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

under the supervision of Distinguished Prof. Alexey Voinov,
Dr. Flavio Pileggi, Dr. Jaime Garcia, and Dr. Firouzeh
Taghikhah

University of Technology Sydney
Faculty of Engineering and Information Technology

July 2022

Certificate of Original Authorship

I, *Madiha Anjum*, declare that this thesis, submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy, in the *School of Computer Science, Faculty of Engineering & IT* at the University of Technology Sydney, Australia.

This thesis is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

This document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

This research is supported by the Australian Government Research Training Program.

Production Note:
Signature removed prior to publication.

SIGNATURE: _____

Madiha Anjum

DATE: 02-02-2023

Abstract

We live in a time when humanity faces many existential threats - climate change, resource depletion, biodiversity loss, and refugee crises. Wicked problems need to be properly approached and cannot be solved without human participation. These problems require stakeholder participation, which is hard to organize and support. Participatory modeling is one method that facilitates stakeholders' engagement in the decision-making process and enables collaboration to achieve a mutually acceptable solution. Mental models are essential tools in participatory modeling as mental models are informal representations of how the world works. The way we perceive, behave, and decide is also dependent on and influenced by our mental models. Direct observation, learning, and experience can help in maintaining and updating our mental models. At the same time, mental models are constantly relied upon to reason, explain, design, communicate, act, predict, and explore. Overall mental models play an essential role across all domains of human agency so, a tool that can help to formalize computer simulations from the mental models expressed by a group within a given problem situation will be of much benefit for experts and practitioners from various fields like behavioural science, psychology, economics, education, and sustainability as they can gain many insights.

We have developed a real-time, moderated tool, named Discussoo, for understanding and formalizing mental models of participants of online discussions. Users are presented with a topic, question, or problem to debate, on which they can express their opinions/thoughts in the form of comments. Users can also respond or expand on other users' opinions and/or initiate a new line of discussion. The discussion chain is then mined in real-time, using an ensemble of algorithms (including but not limited to concept mining, topic modeling, and sentiment analysis) to extract opinions, keywords, and concepts. This information is transcribed into formal models using Concept maps, Causal Loop Diagrams, and Networks Diagrams as the discussion evolves. To provide feedback, the system presents users with dynamic visualizations of the collective mental model, which they can use as contextual information to refine and update their individual mental models. Targeted moderator comments can also introduce feedback to steer or "nudge" the discussion towards a desirable collective mental model, outcome, consensus, or agreement.

Discussoo can be used in a variety of settings and problem situations, where the steering of collective mental models could improve the functioning, resilience, or sustainability of a given (social, environmental, or technical) system or used by policy makers or any other organization who would benefit from a more direct, transparent and meaningful engagement of their stakeholders.

To my parents

List of Publications Related to this thesis:

Journals:

Anjum, M., Voinov, A., Taghikhah, F. and Pileggi, S., 2021. Discusoo: Towards an intelligent tool for multi-scale participatory modeling. *Environmental Modelling & Software*.

Conferences:

Bakhanova, E., **Anjum, M.**, Voinov, A., Raffe, W. & Garcia Marin, J. (2021). Gamification of Discusoo: an online AI-based forum for serious discussions, 24th International Congress on Modelling and Simulation, Sydney, Australia

Anjum, M., Voinov, A Pileggi, SF 2019(2020). Eliciting, Formalising, And Debiasing Mental Models Through an Online Tool For Serious Discussions, *iEMSs2020, Brussels, Belgium*

Anjum, M., Voinov, A, Castilla Rho, J & Pileggi, SF 2019, 'Understanding mental models through a moderated framework for serious discussion', 23rd International Congress on Modelling and Simulation, Canberra.

Table of Contents

- Abstract..... 3
- List of Publications Related to this thesis: 6
- Chapter 1: Introduction 13**
- 1. Overview.....13
- 2. Introduction.....14
- 3. Research Goal, Objectives, and Research Questions16
- 4. Research Limitations.....17
- 5. Research Methodology and Design18
- 6. Outline of the Thesis.....21
- 7. Note on COVID 19 Impact on this research 22
- Chapter 2: An online, AI-powered, tool for moderating serious discussions and fostering stakeholder engagement.....23**
- 1. Overview..... 23
- 2. Abstract..... 24
- 3. Introduction..... 25
- 4. Review of existing text mining and computational linguistics techniques..... 29
- 5. An online AI-Based Tool for serious discussion: Discusoo37
- 6. Discusoo Engine (real-time analysis of discussions) 45
- 7. Gamification of Discusoo: An agent that facilitates the discussion: 53
- 8. Adding the chatbot functionality to encourage post engagement 58
- 9. Case Study..... 63
- 10. Discussion 65
- 11. Conclusions..... 68
- Chapter 3: Discusoo: Towards an intelligent tool for multi-scale participatory modeling..... 69**
- Overview 69

Chapter 4: Formalising Mental Models from Online Discussions: An Application of the Discusoo Platform	71
1. Overview.....	71
2. Abstract.....	72
3. Introduction.....	73
4. Background.....	77
4.1. Mental Models and applications	77
4.2. From Individual to Group Mental Models.....	80
4.3. The Mental Model Creation Process	81
5. Exploring gaps in mental model elicitation, analysis and representation.....	84
5.1. How to elicit mental models.....	84
5.2 How to analyze mental models.....	86
5.3 How to present mental models.....	91
5.4. How to address gaps in mental model	92
6. Exploring mental models with Discusoo: Australian community energy case study	99
6.1. Opinion collection and stakeholder engagement	99
6.2. Discussion analysis.....	101
6.3. Discussion representation	103
6. Discussion.....	104
7. Conclusions.....	108
Chapter 5: Reconstructing mental models through a moderated framework for serious discussion.....	110
1. Overview.....	110
2. Abstract.....	111
3. Introduction.....	112
3. Methodology:.....	117
4. Case Study:.....	120

5. Data Analysis	121
6. Data cleaning and pre-processing	122
7. Results and Discussion:	122
8. Conclusion:	137
Chapter 6: Conclusion	138
1. Development of an AI based online, moderated tool for serious discussion	138
2. Facilitating PM workshops using Discusoo	139
3. Mapping Mental Models from an Online Discussions platform.....	140
4. Reconstructing mental models through a moderated framework for serious discussion	141
5. Research Contributions	142
6. Why use Discusoo	143
7. Future Research.....	143
Appendix.....	145
Bibliography.....	152

List of Figures

Figure 1.1. Text Analysis phases	20
Figure 2.1. Discussoo Framework	29
Figure 2.2. Categories of NLP algorithm (source: self-elaboration based on literature).....	36
Figure 2.3. Challenges in using NLP (source: self-elaboration based on literature) .	36
Figure 2.4. Users can get involved in the discussions by pressing the join button ...	38
Figure 2.5. Admin can approve/edit/delete discussions in Discussoo.....	39
Figure 2.6. Admin can sort discussions based on title, group, comment count, and date created in Discussoo. Admin can also rearrange/pin discussion by using drag and drop features.....	40
Figure 2.7. Admins can enable or disable the chatbot and the game in all the discussions.....	41
Figure 2.8. Creating/Editing/Deleting Groups in Discussoo	41
Figure 2.9. Admins can enable and disable the following features in any discussion. (Reply, Score, Sharing).....	42
Figure 2.10. Admin can create new users on the platform	43
Figure 2.11. Admin can add trending topics to the home page.....	43
Figure 2.12. Rearranging the Comments	44
Figure 2.13. Admin can act against reported comments	45
Figure 2.14. Conceptual framework of Discussoo.....	45
Figure 2.15. Five phases that are involved in the creation of conceptual models from the discussion	46
Figure 2.16a. Unfiltered Conceptual Diagram	52
Figure 2.17. Influencer badges	56
Figure 2.18. Bubble Shooter Game	57
Figure 2.19. Loopy embedded in Discussoo.....	58
Figure 2.20. Flowchart of chatbot in Discussoo	61
Figure 2.21. Chatbot is suggesting a similar comment to the user and inviting feedback on that comment	62
Figure 2.22. Chatbot is responding to user's comment by adding a new comment...	62
Figure 2.23. Examples of comments added by the chatbot in the discussion.....	63
Figure 2.24. Response of students about the user experience of Discussoo	64
Figure 2.25. Response of students about the user experience of Discussoo	64
Figure 2.26. Word cloud of response from students when they were asked about "What did they liked the most about Discussoo"	65

Figure 2.27. How Discussoo can address the challenges in serious discussion forums.....	66
Figure 2.28. Applications of Discussoo.....	67
Figure 4.1. Process of formation, refining, and updating of a mental model.....	83
Figure 4.2. Techniques used in Discussoo for each phase of Mental model formation.....	97
Figure 4.3. Community energy concept phrase and word cloud generated in Discussoo.....	100
Figure 4.4. Sentiments extracted from the community renewable energy discussion.....	103
Figure 4.5. The Clusters and the Arc Diagram.....	105
Figure 5.1. Mental models and Real-world consequences.....	113
Figure 5.2. The Ladder of Inference.....	119
Figure 5.3. Ladder of Inference and Case Study questions.....	120
Figure 5.4. Results of Questions 1 (Pre and Post Survey).....	123
Figure 5.5. Comparison of Questions 2 (Pre and Post-Survey).....	125
Figure 5.6. Comparison of Questions 3 (Pre and Post Survey).....	126
Figure 5.7. Comparison of Questions 4 (Pre and Post Survey).....	126
Figure 5.8. Comparison of Questions 5 (Pre and Post Survey).....	128
Figure 5.9. Comparison of Questions 6 (Pre and Post Survey).....	129
Figure 5.10. Comparison of Questions 7 (Pre- and Post-Survey).....	130
Figure 5.11. Comparison of Questions 8 (Pre- and Post-Survey).....	131
Figure 5.12. Representing line graph of relative frequencies in Pre survey responses.....	132
Figure 5.13. Representing line graph of relative frequencies in Post survey responses.....	133
Figure 5.14. Results about “Discussoo can assist in 'observing data', 'selecting data', 'adding meanings to the data', 'making assumptions', and 'coming up to conclusions’”.....	134
Figure 5.15. Results about “Discussoo can assist in 'observing data', 'selecting data', 'adding meanings to the data', 'making assumptions', and 'coming up to conclusions’”.....	135

List of Tables

Table 1.1. Main phases of the research and methodologies applied	18
Table 2.1. A review of existing text mining and computational linguistics techniques	31
Table 2.2. Test results of Concept/ Keyphrase Extraction of bigrams or trigrams instead of unigrams (i.e., concept phrase (2-3 words) instead of concept word) using techniques like Tfidf, TopicRank, and TextRank.....	46
Table 2.3. Results for extracting clusters (Grouping of related words into clusters along with assignment of a topic to each cluster)	50
Table 2.4. Results of extracting Sentiments.....	54
Table 2.5. Results of testing different Chatbots	60
Table 4.1. A list of mental model elicitation techniques, applications, and limitations.....	88
Table 4.2. A summary of mental model analysis techniques, their advantages, and limitations.....	94
Table 4.3. A comparison of mental model representation techniques	95
Table 4.4. A list of identified gaps in mental model elicitation, analysis and presentation that are addressed by Discussoo.....	98
Table 5.1. Results of Questions 1 (Pre and Post Survey: Question 1).....	123
Table 5.2. Results of Questions 2 (Pre and Post Survey)	124
Table 5.3. Results of Questions 3 (Pre and Post Survey)	125
Table 5.4. Results of Questions 4 (Pre and Post Survey).....	127
Table 5.5. Results of Questions 5 (Pre and Post Survey)	127
Table 5.6. Results of Questions 6 (Pre and Post Survey).....	128
Table 5.7. Results of Questions 7 (Pre and Post Survey)	129
Table 5.8. Results of Questions 8 (Pre- and Post-Survey).....	130