

More Than a Meal: Building an Evidence-Based Framework of Mealtime-Related Quality of Life, Participation, and Inclusion for People with Swallowing Disability

Doctor of Philosophy: Speech Pathology (C02066)

Rebecca Jane Smith

Supervisors: Professor Bronwyn Hemsley and Doctor Lucy Bryant

Graduate School of Health

14<sup>th</sup> October 2022

ii

**Certificate of Original Authorship** 

I, Rebecca Smith declare that this thesis, is submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the

award of Doctor of Philosophy in Speech Pathology, in the Graduate School of Health at the

University of Technology Sydney.

This thesis is wholly my own work unless otherwise referenced or acknowledged. In

addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

This document has not been submitted for qualifications at any other academic institution.

This research is supported by the Australian Government Research Training Program.

Production Note:

 $Signature: \ \ \ \text{Signature removed prior to publication}.$ 

Date: 14/10/2022

## Acknowledgements

First, I would like to acknowledge all of the participants who took part in this research. Whether that was by engaging in the interviews, focus groups, or survey, I would like to say thank you. Your experiences and views of dysphagia, quality of life, and 3D food printing, informed this thesis and without your input, this research could not have been completed. I hope that this research can help shape positive mealtime experiences for people with dysphagia into the future.

Second, I would also like to thank my supervisors, Professor Bronwyn Hemsley and Doctor Lucy Bryant. With your encouragement from the beginning, I had the confidence to apply for the PhD program. You have both been an immense support over the last three and a half years and have helped me become a better researcher to help shape the future of the speech pathology profession. Finally, thank you for your advice and feedback on many drafts, this thesis certainly would not have the same impact without it.

I was grateful to receive financial support throughout my PhD candidature. Firstly, this project was funded by a University of Technology Sydney Doctoral Scholarship (April 2019 –December 2019). I would also like to thank the National Health and Medical Research Council (NHMRC) for a Post Graduate Scholarship (APP1191359) from January 2020 to March 2022. I was also supported by the Australian Government Research Training Program for the length of my candidature. This funding allowed me to dedicate the time to answer the questions of this project in a sufficient manner for all people with dysphagia. I would also like to acknowledge that a late version of this thesis was proofread by Matthew Sidebotham from Workwisewords.

To my family, you showed me the importance of hard work and exactly how personal dysphagia was to me. To my grandfather, Ronald Smith (1932–2020), your fighting spirit

lives on in this PhD. You never remembered if I was Rebecca or Sarah, but your support was always there to the end, and when I see your meal from the aged-care facility used as part of this PhD project, I think of you. To my grandmother, Eva Dawson, your influence shaped me more than you know, you did everything you could for all of us grandchildren, including talking about your swallowing difficulties with me. To my grandfather, Russell Dawson, your voice of reason and logic was constantly with me in all decisions of this PhD and I hope I have done you proud. To my parents Sue and Tony, you always wanted the best for me and pulled me up when I was down, thank you for everything. To my sister, Sarah, for living with me throughout this PhD and all the COVID-19 lockdowns, we made it. To Alison, Adam, and little Harriet, you gave us all hope during the lockdowns and Harriet your cuddles mean the world. Lastly to Basil the dog, you are THE PhD Pup, enough said.

I couldn't forget my fellow Higher Degree by Research students, Rebecca Sullivan and Harmony Turnbull. Although we live in different states, your presence (on Teams) kept me motivated and laughing on a daily basis. I certainly wouldn't have made it through months of lockdown in the PhD universe without our video calls and chats. So I say thank you!

## **Note on Thesis Format and Style**

This thesis follows the Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association (APA) Seventh Edition (APA7) for both referencing and style guidelines (American Psychological Association, 2020). Australian English spelling is used throughout; apart from published articles requiring American English spelling. The Australian term 'speech pathologist' is also used throughout this thesis apart from articles published in journals where the publisher required the term 'speech-language pathologist' to be used. Person-first language is also used in this thesis to describe people with dysphagia.

Following APA guidelines (American Psychological Association, 2020) this thesis is double spaced except for tables and figures which are single spaced. Tables and figures are placed within the body of the text after they are first referenced. References from the thesis, including the published chapters, are formatted according to APA 7 (American Psychological Association, 2020) and are consolidated in the reference list at the end of the thesis.

Chapters 2, 3, and 11 appear in this thesis in the full published form including tables, figures and reference lists as in the published version and following the formatting and referencing guidelines required by the publishing journal. These papers are included with permission.

Throughout this thesis a number of terms are used specific to this research. A glossary of definitions can be found in Appendix A.

## **Ethical Approval**

This project received ethical approval from the University of Technology Sydney

Human Research Ethics Committee in 2019 [ETH19-3708]. The ethics application was then
amended in 2021 to include a survey and was approved by University of Technology Sydney

Human Research Ethics Committee in 2021 [ETH21-6568 and ETH21-6781].

## **Funding Sources**

This research has been funded through a University of Technology Sydney Doctoral Scholarship (April 2019–December 2019), a National Health and Medical Research Council (NHMRC) Post Graduate Scholarship (January 2020–March 2022), and an Australian Government Research Training Program Scholarship (April 2019–September 2022).

Conference attendance was supported by:

- The University of Technology Sydney Vice Chancellor Conference Fund (2021): \$290
- National Health and Medical Research Council (NHMRC) Post Graduate
   Scholarship (2021): \$919

Research support was also provided to this PhD candidate through the:

- National Health and Medical Research Council (NHMRC) Post Graduate
   Scholarship (e.g., participant vouchers)
- Provision of a laptop (University of Technology Sydney)
- Funding to complete Dysphagia Disorder Survey Training Course (Graduate School of Health, University of Technology Sydney)
- Open access publication fee for one research paper published in a Q1 journal
   (Graduate School of Health, University of Technology Sydney)

## **Publications and Presentations**

International peer-reviewed publications are presented below in order of appearance in the thesis. Presentations are presented here in reverse chronological order within each category. Conference abstracts and poster presentations are in Appendix B.

## **International Peer-Reviewed Journal Articles**

- Smith, R., Hemsley, B., & Bryant, L. (2019). Systematic review of dysphagia and quality of life, participation, and inclusion experiences or outcomes for adults and children with dysphagia. PROSPERO 2019. CRD42019140246.
  https://www.crd.york.ac.uk/prospero/display\_record.php?ID=CRD42019140246
- Smith, R., Bryant, L., Hemsley, B. (2022c). Dysphagia and quality of life, participation, and inclusion experiences and outcomes for adults and children with dysphagia: A scoping review. *Perspectives of the ASHA Special Interest Groups, 7(1),* 181-196. https://doi.org/10.1044/2021\_PERSP-21-00162
- Smith, R., Bryant, L., Reddacliff, C., Hemsley, B. (2022). A review of the impact of food design on the mealtimes of people with swallowing disability who require texture-modified food. *International Journal of Food Design*, 7(1), 7–28. https://doi.org/10.1386/ijfd\_00034\_1
- Smith, R., Bryant, L., & Hemsley, B. (in press-b). The true cost of dysphagia on quality of life: The views of adults with swallowing disability. *International Journal of Language & Communication Disorders*.
- Smith, R., Bryant, L., & Hemsley, B. (in press-a). "Know the risks but balance that with their enjoyment": Impacts of dysphagia on quality of life from the perspective of allied health professionals. *Advances in Communication and Swallowing*.

- Smith, R., Bryant, L., & Hemsley, B. (2022d). "I only eat to because I have to, to live": An online survey examining the impacts of dysphagia on quality of life [Manuscript submitted for publication in Disability and Rehabilitation]. Graduate School of Health, University of Technology Sydney.
- Smith, R., Bryant, L., & Hemsley, B. (2022a). 3D food printing to improve mealtime quality of life: The perspective of people with dysphagia and their supporters [Manuscript submitted for publication in Disability and Rehabilitation: Assistive Technology].

  Graduate School of Health, University of Technology Sydney.
- Smith, R., Bryant, L., Hemsley, B. (2022b) Allied health professionals' views on the use of 3D food printing to improve the mealtime quality of life for people with dysphagia:

  Impact, cost, practicality, and potential. *American Journal of Speech-Language*Pathology, 31(4), 1868–1877. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1044/2022\_AJSLP-21-00391
- Smith, R., Bryant, L., & Hemsley, B. (2022e). "It looks better than a bowl of mush": Views on food design and 3D food printing to improve the mealtime experience for people with dysphagia [Manuscript submitted for publication in American Journal of Speech-Language Pathology]. Graduate School of Health, The University of Technology Sydney.

## **International Peer-Reviewed Conference Presentations**

Smith, R., Bryant, L., Hemsley, B. (2022, November 17–19). *The Cost of Dysphagia: Impacts of Dysphagia on Quality of Life for People with Dysphagia*. [Technical presentation]. 2022 ASHA Convention, New Orleans, Louisiana.

https://convention.asha.org/

- Smith, R., Bryant, L., Hemsley, B. (2022, March 15–18). "All the food is like wet dog food":

  Could 3D food printing improve mealtime management and quality of life for people
  with dysphagia who need pureed food? [Poster presentation]. Thirtieth Annual
  Dysphagia Research Society Meeting, San Juan Puerto Rico.

  https://www.dysphagiaresearch.org/page/30th\_Annual\_Meeting\_Attendee\_Information
- Smith, R., Bryant, L., Hemsley, B. (2022, February 3–4). *Printing our way to improved mealtimes for people with dysphagia: Views of key stakeholders on the use of 3D food printers* [Poster presentation]. Ninth United Kingdom Swallow Research Group Conference, Online virtual conference. http://www.uksrg.org.uk/conferences/uksrg-2022/
- Smith, R., Bryant, L., Hemsley, B. (2021, November 4–6). Can the personal cost of dysphagia on quality of life, participation, and inclusion be reduced through improved food design and 3D food printing? Views of adults with swallowing disability. [Poster presentation]. Eleventh annual congress of the European Society for Swallowing Disorders, Online virtual conference. https://essd2021.org/
- Smith, R., Bryant, L., Hemsley, B. (2021, November 4–6). *Mealtimes are a balancing act:*Health professionals' views on the quality of life impacts of dysphagia and potential for improvements through 3D food printing. [Poster presentation]. Eleventh annual congress of the European Society for Swallowing Disorders, Online virtual conference. https://essd2021.org/

## **National Conference Presentations**

Smith, R., Bryant, L., Hemsley, B. (2021, May 31- June 2). The impacts of dysphagia on quality of life, participation, and inclusion for adults and children with dysphagia: A

- systematic review [Poster presentation]. Speech Pathology Australia National Conference 2021, online virtual conference.
- Smith, R., Bryant, L., Hemsley, B. (2021, May 31- June 2). A review of food design for people on texture-modified diets: The shape of things to come [Conference presentation]. Speech Pathology Australia National Conference 2021, online virtual conference.
- Smith, R., Bryant, L., Hemsley, B. (2020, May 24–27). The impacts of dysphagia on quality of life, participation, and inclusion experiences or outcomes for adults and children with dysphagia: A systematic review [Accepted Conference presentation]. Speech Pathology Australia National Conference 2020, Darwin, NT, Australia.

#### **Local Conference Presentations**

- Smith, R., Bryant, L., Hemsley, B. (2020, December 2). The impacts of food design on the quality of life, participation and inclusion of people with swallowing disability. The Inaugural Speech Pathology Symposium (SEER) Showcasing Emerging and Established Researchers.
- Smith, R., Bryant, L., Hemsley, B. (2020, July 30). *More than a meal? 3D food printing for safe and enjoyable meals*. Paper presented at the University of Technology Sydney Faculty of Health Three Minute Thesis Challenge. Online virtual event.
- Smith, R., Bryant, L., Hemsley, B. (2020, July 3). *More than a meal? 3D food printing for safe and enjoyable meals*. Paper presented at the University of Technology Sydney Graduate School of Health Three Minute Thesis Challenge. Online virtual event.
- Smith, R., Bryant, L., Hemsley, B. (2019, November 29). *More than a meal: A constructivist* grounded theory of a mealtime related quality of life and inclusion for people with

swallowing disability. Paper presented at the University of Technology Sydney Graduate School of Health Student Seminar.

## **Invitations to Speak**

- Smith, R., Bryant, L., Hemsley, B. (2022, February 8). *The impacts of dysphagia on quality of life: Can it be improved with 3D food printing?* [Conference Presentation]. The Myositis Association Australia National Zoom Meeting, online virtual event.
- Smith R. (2020, 2021, 2022). Dysphagia disorders in developmental disability [PowerPoint slides]. Lecture delivered in the Master of Speech Pathology course, Subject 96124

  Swallowing Disorders. The University of Technology Sydney.

## **Research Translation through Online Publications**

I developed an online blog to share updates and new information related to dysphagia and quality of life (see https://rebeccasmithsp.wordpress.com/). Along with this blog I also used my Twitter account (@beccysmith7) to increase research translation to the wider international community.

## Awards

Awards are presented in reverse chronological order:

- The University of Technology Sydney, Vice Chancellor Conference Fund (2021):
   \$290
- The University of Technology Sydney, Faculty of Health, 3 Minute Thesis

  Competition Runner Up (2020): \$500 (combined for Runner Up and People's Choice)
- The University of Technology Sydney, Faculty of Health, 3 Minute Thesis
   Competition People's Choice Award (2020): \$500 (combined for runner up and People's Choice)
- The University of Technology Sydney, Graduate School of Health, 3 Minute Thesis
   Competition Winner for Best Presentation (2020): \$200
- The University of Technology Sydney, Graduate School of Health. 3 Minute Thesis
   Competition People's Choice Award (2020): \$100

Appendix C includes copies of the awards received by the researcher during this PhD candidature.

## **Author Attribution Statement**

I am the lead author for all published papers included in this thesis and a description of my role for each study is presented here in Chapter order.

Smith, R., Hemsley, B., & Bryant, L. (2019). Systematic review of dysphagia and quality of life, participation, and inclusion experiences or outcomes for adults and children with dysphagia. PROSPERO 2019. CRD42019140246.

https://www.crd.york.ac.uk/prospero/display record.php?ID=CRD42019140246

Smith, R., Bryant, L., Hemsley, B. (2022c). Dysphagia and quality of life, participation, and inclusion experiences and outcomes for adults and children with dysphagia: A scoping review. Perspectives of the ASHA Special Interest Groups.
https://doi.org/10.1044/2021 PERSP-21-00162

I led the design of the above scoping review, then completed the database searches, determined inclusion status of studies, extracted data, analysed data, and wrote the manuscript with feedback from co-authors within their supervisory roles.

Smith, R., Bryant, L., Reddacliff, C., Hemsley, B. (2022). A review of the impact of food design on the mealtimes of people with swallowing disability who require texture-modified food. *International Journal of Food Design*, 7(1), 7-28. https://doi.org/10.1386/ijfd 00034 1

I led the design of this narrative review, then completed the database searches, determined inclusion status of studies, extracted data, analysed data, and wrote the manuscript with feedback from co-authors within their supervisory roles.

Smith, R., Bryant, L., & Hemsley, B. (in press-b). The true cost of dysphagia on quality of life: The views of adults with swallowing disability. *International Journal of Language & Communication Disorders*.

I led and completed the design of this study, data collection, transcription, data analysis and coding, and writing of this paper; with input from co-authors in their supervisory roles.

Smith, R., Bryant, L., & Hemsley, B. (in press-a). "Know the risks but balance that with their enjoyment": Impacts of dysphagia on quality of life from the perspective of allied health professionals. *Advances in Communication and Swallowing*.

I led and completed the design of this study, data collection, transcription, data analysis and coding, and writing of this paper; with input from co-authors in their supervisory roles.

Smith, R., Bryant, L., & Hemsley, B. (2022d). "I only eat to because I have to, to live": An online survey examining the impacts of dysphagia on quality of life [Manuscript submitted for publication]. Graduate School of Health, University of Technology Sydney.

I led and completed the design of this study, data collection, data analysis and coding, and writing of this paper; with input from co-authors in their supervisory roles.

Smith, R., Bryant, L., & Hemsley, B. (2022a). 3D food printing to improve mealtime quality of life: The perspective of people with dysphagia and their supporters [Manuscript submitted for publication]. Graduate School of Health, University of Technology Sydney.

I led and completed the design of this study, data collection, transcription, data analysis and coding, and writing of this paper; with input from co-authors in their supervisory roles.

Smith, R., Bryant, L., Hemsley, B. (2022) Allied health professionals' views on the use of 3D food printing to improve the mealtime quality of life for people with dysphagia: Impact, cost, practicality, and potential. *American Journal of Speech-Language Pathology*, 31(4), 1868–1877. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1044/2022 AJSLP-21-00391

I led and completed the design of this study, data collection, transcription, data analysis and coding, and writing of this paper; with input from co-authors in their supervisory roles.

Smith, R., Bryant, L., & Hemsley, B. (2022e). "It looks better than a bowl of mush": Views on food design and 3D food printing to improve the mealtime experience for people with dysphagia [Manuscript submitted for publication]. Graduate School of Health, The University of Technology Sydney.

I led and completed the design of this study, data collection, transcription, data analysis and coding, and writing of this paper; with input from co-authors in their supervisory roles.

Further publications arising from my research during the course of this thesis can be found in Appendix D.

## **Table of Contents**

Certificate of Original Authorship	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
Note on Thesis Format and Style	v
Ethical Approval	vi
Funding Sources	vii
Publications and Presentations	viii
Awards	xiii
Author Attribution Statement	xiv
Table of Contents	xvii
List of Tables	xix
List of Figures	XX
List of Appendices	xxi
Abstract	xxii
Thesis Synopsis and Chapter Outline	xxv
Section One: Introduction	1
Chapter 1: Background to the Research	2
Chapter 2: Scoping Review of Dysphagia and Quality of Life, Participation, and In	clusion
Experiences and Outcomes for Adults and Children with Dysphagia	20
Chapter 3: A Review of the Impact of Food Design on Mealtimes of People with S	wallowing
Disability	53
Section Two: Methodology	76
Chapter 4: Methodology	78
Chapter 5: Methods	97

	xviii
Chapter 6: COVID-19 Impacts	132
Section Three: Results	137
Part A: The Impacts of Dysphagia on Quality of Life, Participation, and Inclusion	140
Chapter 7: The Impacts of Dysphagia on Quality of Life from the Perspective of People	with
Dysphagia and their Supporters	141
Chapter 8: The Impacts of Dysphagia on Quality of Life from the Perspective of Health	
Professionals	170
Chapter 9: Survey Findings on Quality of Life	193
Part B: The Feasibility of 3D Food Printing to Improve the Mealtime Experience for Peo	ple
with Dysphagia	218
Chapter 10: The Feasibility of 3D Food Printing from the Perspective of People with	
Dysphagia and their Supporters	219
Chapter 11: The Feasibility of 3D Food Printing from the Perspective of Health	
Professionals	246
Chapter 12: Survey Findings on the Feasibility of 3D Food Printing	257
Part C: Establishing an Evidence-Based Framework	281
Chapter 13: Meta-Synthesis of Findings	282
Section Four: Discussion	306
Chapter 14: Disucssion and Conclusions	308
Section Five: References	325
Section Six: Appendices	349

## **List of Tables**

Table 1 Philosophical Approach of Study	84
Table 2 Ethical Issues for Participants with Dysphagia and Their Supporters	94
Table 3 Ethical Issues for Allied Health Professionals	95
Table 4 Research Questions Answered in Each Study	99
Table 5 Standard Operating Procedure for Mealtime Observations at Home	103
Table 6 Interview Topic Guide	106
Table 7 Mealtime Document Data Extraction Sheet	111
Table 8 3D Printed Food Experience Question Guide	112
Table 9 Focus Group Topic Guide	118
Table 10 Research Dissemination Methods Employed	130
Table 11 Chapter 7 Participant Demographic Information	149
Table 12 Chapter 8 Participant Demographic Information	176
Table 13 Unmitigated Risk of Not Addressing Quality of Life for People with Dysphagia	a and
Ways to Manage It	179
Table 14 Quotes Describing Quality of Life for People with Dysphagia and Ways to Manag	ge It
	180
Table 15 Chapter 9 Participant Demographic Information	201
Table 16 Chapter 10 Participant Demographic Information	228
Table 17 Usability Heuristics (Nielsen, 1994)	231
Table 18 Chapter 12 Demographic Information	265
Table 19 Overview of the Included Research Studies and Results	286
Table 20 Content Themes and Categories of Meaning in the Component Studies	288
Table 21 Distribution of Meta-Synthesis Content Themes	291

# **List of Figures**

Figure 1 Revised Wilson and Cleary Model for Health Related Quality of Life	8
Figure 2 The Process of 3D Food Printing	14
Figure 3 Conceptual Map of the Reviews and Studies Informing the Analysis	126
Figure 4 Screenshot of Research Blog (From: https://rebeccasmithsp.wordpress.com)	130
Figure 5 The Reality of a Pureed Meal	134
Figure 6 Facilitators, Barriers, and Impacts on Quality of Life	154
Figure 7 Impact of swallowing difficulties for people with dysphagia	205
Figure 8 Impacts of Swallowing Difficulties From the Perspective of Supporters of Peop	le
with Dysphagia and Allied Health Professionals	206
Figure 9 Impacts of Texture-Modified Food for People with Dysphagia	207
Figure 10 Impacts of Texture-Modified Food on Quality of Life From the Perspective of	
Supporters of People with Dysphagia and Allied Health Professionals	208
Figure 11 3D Printed Foods Created with the 3D Food Printer	233
Figure 12 Food Design Methods Implemented by People with Dysphagia, Supporters of	
People with Dysphagia, and Allied Health Professionals	267
Figure 13 Strategies Implemented to Improve the Mealtime Experience by People with	
Dysphagia, Supporters of People with Dysphagia, and Allied Health Professiona	als
	269
Figure 14 Participant Perspectives on whether 3D Food Printing Improves the Appearance	ce
and Enjoyment of Texture-Modified Food	270
Figure 15 Opinions of Participants with Dysphagia	271
Figure 16 Opinions of Supporters of People with Dysphagia and Allied Health Profession	nals
on 3D Food Printing	273
Figure 17 Framework of Mealtime Quality of Life for People with Dysphagia	292

## **List of Appendices**

Appendix A: Definitions	350
Appendix B: Conference Abstracts and Posters	352
Appendix C: Awards	367
Appendix D: Other Publications during PhD	372
Appendix E: Prospero Protocol	377
Appendix F: Survey Tool	385

#### **Abstract**

Dysphagia (difficulty swallowing) affects an estimated 8% of the world's population and can result from a number of lifelong health conditions (e.g., cerebral palsy) or acquired health conditions (e.g., stroke). Dysphagia can lead to poor respiratory health, poor nutritional health, and death. Dysphagia can also reduce a person's quality of life by leading to social isolation around meals and a fear of choking. A common intervention for dysphagia, the provision of a texture-modified diet, may also impact on a person's quality of life if the foods are unappealing and lead to reduced oral intake. To add to previous food shaping techniques of using piping bags or food moulds, 3D food printing has been proposed as a way to improve quality of life by making texture-modified foods more visually appealing.

The overall aim of this study was to gain an in-depth understanding of the impacts of dysphagia on a person's mealtime quality of life and, within that, the influence of food shaping techniques including 3D food printing on mealtime experiences, participation and inclusion. This study involved applying constructivist grounded theory techniques to build an evidence-based framework explaining (a) the impacts of dysphagia and dysphagia interventions on mealtime quality of life, participation, and inclusion for adults with dysphagia; (b) barriers and facilitators to mealtime quality of life for adults with dysphagia; (c) the impact of food design strategies on the mealtime experience of people with dysphagia; and (d) the feasibility of using 3D food printing as food shaping technique to improve the visual appeal of texture-modified foods and mealtime experiences for people with dysphagia.

Constructivist grounded theory techniques and a mixed methods approach guided data collection, analysis, and reporting across component studies. First, a scoping review of the literature revealed widespread impacts of dysphagia on mealtime quality of life. This was followed by a narrative review of food design strategies to improve the mealtime experience

for people with dysphagia. The reviews informed the design of the research instruments of this research. Then, nine people with dysphagia and four of their supporters engaged in indepth interviews, a mealtime observation, and an immersive 3D food printing experience and interview to understand their views and experiences of both dysphagia and mealtime quality of life and 3D food printing. Following this, fifteen allied health professionals engaged in one of four focus groups about their views on mealtime quality of life associated with dysphagia, and the feasibility of 3D food printing. Finally, to verify and expand upon these studies, an online survey was completed by people with dysphagia, supporters of people with dysphagia, and allied health professionals. These methods provided the best and most feasible strategy for answering the research questions during the COVID-19 pandemic. These original, integrated studies enabled the triangulation of findings and the development of an evidence-based framework, developed through meta-synthesis of the two literature reviews and the findings of the original research.

Overall, dysphagia and its interventions negatively impacted on mealtime quality of life, particularly through limited choice and control related to food and mealtimes, reduced physical safety, reduced social engagement, and poor mealtime experiences. Several factors were identified as barriers and/or facilitators to quality of life. These factors included the person with dysphagia's ability to engage in designing their own meal, ownership of swallowing difficulties, the opinions of others supporting the person, the provision of education, the person's adaptability or resistance to change, and the provision of interventions to improve swallowing. Participants considered that 3D food printing could improve mealtime experiences; however there were barriers to use that would need to be overcome for this to be possible. These included the practicality of the device, the suitability for different populations, cost of the device, and the acceptability of printed foods. The final stage of the research, a meta-synthesis across studies, integrated results to build an evidence-based

framework to guide clinicians working in the field of dysphagia towards holistic and personcentred management of dysphagia, designed to sustain and improve a person's mealtime quality of life, participation, and inclusion.

## Thesis Synopsis and Chapter Outline

This thesis provides new information about the impacts of dysphagia on quality of life and the potential to improve the mealtime experience using food shaping techniques, including 3D food printing. Each section includes individual studies, culminating in a metasynthesis chapter presenting the overarching evidence-based framework on dysphagia, quality of life, and food shaping including 3D food printing. Each section builds on the prior section and the understanding of the concepts being examined. Section 1 provides the context of what is already known on the topic of dysphagia, quality of life, and 3D food printing. This contextual information shaped the methodological approach taken and the methods used throughout the remainder of the thesis, described in Section 2. Sections 3a and 3b describe the exploration on the impacts of dysphagia on quality of life (Section 3a) and the feasibility of 3D food printing to improve the mealtime experience for people with dysphagia (Section 3b). In Section 3c, data described in the literature reviews (Section 1) and original research (Section 3a and 3b) are triangulated and synthesised through qualitative research synthesis to build an evidence-based framework. Lastly Section 4, describes areas for future research, and identifies implications of this research for clinical practice.

## **Section One: Introduction**

Chapter 1 provides an introduction to the background and aims of this research regarding the impacts of dysphagia on mealtime quality of life and the feasibility of using 3D food printing to improve mealtime quality of life, participation, and inclusion of people with dysphagia. It also describes current research regarding the use of food design strategies for people with dysphagia to improve the mealtime experience, in particular 3D food printing. To clearly outline prior knowledge on dysphagia and mealtime quality of life, and to identify gaps in the research, Chapter 2 provides a scoping literature review examining the impacts of

dysphagia on mealtime quality of life, participation, and inclusion. The PROSPERO Protocol for this review is included in Appendix E (Smith et al., 2019). One of the key issues identified in the scoping review was that dysphagia affected mealtime quality of life around food and meals, particularly impacting on the visual appeal of texture-modified food. Chapter 3 explores these issues further through a narrative literature review on the impact of food design on mealtime enjoyment and engagement for people with dysphagia. The literature reviews presented in Section One identified that dysphagia, mealtimes, and quality of life are intricately related in ways that are not yet well understood. There was a paucity of research on dysphagia and mealtime quality of life using qualitative research approaches.

## **Section Two: Methodology**

Chapter 4 describes the methodology of the present doctoral research to address the gap identified in Section One. It outlines the ontological, epistemological, and theoretical standpoints taken by the researcher in the course of this research. It also outlines the ethical considerations of the project.

A number of methods were put in place to follow the methodological approach outlined in Chapter 4. These methods were used to examine the impacts of dysphagia on mealtime quality of life and the feasibility of 3D food printing and are described in Chapter 5. This chapter outlines the use of interviews, mealtime observations, mealtime document analysis, surveys, and focus groups. As this project was completed from 2019 to 2022, it was impacted by COVID-19 and the associated social distancing and travel rules enacted. Chapter 6 describes the impacts of COVID-19 on this PhD project. This chapter is also expanded upon through an article co-authored by three speech pathology higher degree research students at UTS, including this HDR candidate. This article was published in Speech

Pathology Australia's 'Speak Out' in 2020. A copy of this non-peer-reviewed article can be found in Appendix D.

## **Section Three: Results**

Based on the methods described in Section 2, three studies were completed to gain an in-depth understanding of the impacts of dysphagia on quality of life, food design strategies implemented by people with dysphagia, and the feasibility of 3D food printing to improve the mealtime experience. These studies included people with dysphagia, supporters of people with dysphagia, and allied health professionals.

## Part A: The Impacts of Dysphagia on Quality of Life, Participation, and Inclusion

Chapters 7, 8, and 9 report the on the results relating to the impacts of dysphagia on quality of life. In Chapter 7, the perspectives of people with dysphagia are explored. This chapter describes the results and analysis of results from Study 1a, interviews with people with dysphagia, mealtime observations, and examination of mealtime documents to determine the impact of dysphagia on quality of life. However, this chapter also acknowledges that management of dysphagia involves both the people with dysphagia and their supporters, and allied health professionals. Chapter 7 outlines the perspectives of people with dysphagia and their supporters, and Chapter 8 discusses the views of allied health professionals on the impacts of dysphagia on quality of life (Study 2).

Due to low participant numbers and COVID-19 restrictions, a further study was conducted to gain the perspectives of a wider group of people with dysphagia, supporters of people with dysphagia, and allied health professionals who work with people with dysphagia to verify and expand on the findings of the other studies, and so to inform creation of an evidence-based framework using constructivist grounded theory methods. Thus, Chapter 9 describes an online survey completed by people with dysphagia, supporters of people with

dysphagia, and allied health professionals to examine the impacts of dysphagia on mealtime quality of life, participation, and inclusion. This survey was used for data triangulation with the results of prior qualitative research described in Chapters 7 and 8.

# Part B: The Feasibility of 3D Food Printing to Improve the Mealtime Experience for People with Dysphagia

As the improvement of food design was identified as an important factor influencing mealtime quality of life for people with dysphagia in Chapter 3, Part B of this section investigates the use 3D food printing, proposed to improve the visual appeal of texture-modified foods, in greater detail.

Chapters 10–12 report on results across interviews, focus groups and survey data related to the feasibility of using 3D food printing as a strategy to improve mealtime experiences for people with dysphagia. Chapter 10 describes the 3D printed food experiences of people with dysphagia and their supporters (Study 1b). In this study, participants provided their views on the use of 3D food printing to improve mealtime quality of life. As health professionals, including speech pathologists, occupational therapists, and dietitians, have significant input into prescribing and supporting mealtimes for people with dysphagia, their perspectives were also considered important to explore. Chapter 11 presents the views of allied health professionals obtained during the focus groups on the feasibility of using 3D food printing to create more visually appealing meals (Study 2). Due to the low participant numbers across studies and COVID-19 restrictions impacting on the research, an online survey (Study 3) was conducted with people with dysphagia, supporters of people with dysphagia, and allied health professionals. This is presented in Chapter 12. This was done to inform development of an evidence-based framework using constructivist grounded theory methods.

## Part C: Establishing an Evidence-Based Framework

In Part C, the results of each individual study in Section 3a and 3b were synthesised to construct an evidence-based framework of the impacts of dysphagia on quality of life and the feasibility of 3D food printing to improve the mealtime experience. Chapter 13 provides a qualitative meta-synthesis of the research findings of Chapters 2, 3, and 7–12 and presents an evidence-based framework to guide clinical practice and further research.

## **Section Four: Discussion**

Chapter 14 provides an overarching discussion and conclusion to the research. This includes a discussion on the implications of the research, the limitations of this study, and directions for future research.