Operational risk management (ORM) systems –

An Australian study

By

Thitima Pitinanondha

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for

the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Faculty of Engineering

University of Technology Sydney

Australia

June 2008

Certificate of authorship/originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree, nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Student

Production Note: Signature removed prior to publication.

Acknowledgements

This thesis would not have been completed without the great support from many people. First, I would like to deeply thank my principal supervisor, Dr Hasan Akpolat for opening the door for me to become a PhD candidate. For what I have learned from you during the four-year PhD study period, I strongly believe that it will be infinitely profitable for the rest of my life. Your inspired suggestions, superb guidance and critical comments have significantly contributed to this thesis.

I am especially indebted to my co-supervisor, Professor James Irish, for guiding and leading me to the risk management world in my first and second year. While conducting this research project, I also obtained help from Dr John Crawford and Dr Douglas Davis. I would like to thank them for providing the comments and suggestions in questionnaire development and revision. I would like to thank all my friends and colleagues at the Faculty of Engineering of the University of Technology, Sydney. Although I cannot mention you all by name, my sincere thanks go out to you all for creating such a pleasant working environment.

I wish to express my sincere thanks to my father, Manoch Pitinanondha, and my mother, La-or Pitinanondha, for your love that brought me where I am today. I greatly appreciate my sister, Thanawan Pitinanondha and my brother, Vorakorn Pitinanondha for fulfilling my duty to take care of our parents. Finally, I would like to deeply thank

my partner, Vorapin Kusolsomboon for your deep understanding, profound encouragement, and unlimited support.

Thitima Pitinanondha,

June, 2008

Contents

Acknowledgement	ii
Contents	iv
List of tables	Х
List of figures	xi
Abstract	xii

Chapter 1 Introduction

1.1	Background to the research	1
	1.1.1 Operational risk (OR)	1
	1.1.2 Managing operational risk	2
	1.1.3 Operational risk management (ORM) systems	3
	1.1.4 Status of ORM system implementation in Australia	5
1.2	Research objectives	9
1.3	Research questions	10
1.4	Research approach	11

Chapter 2 Literature review

2.1	Introd	uction	13
2.2	Histor	ry of ORM systems	13
2.3	The us	se of ORM systems in Australia	17
	2.3.1	Generic risk management systems	17
		2.3.1.1 Introduction	17
		2.3.1.2 Generic risk management system framework	18
		2.3.1.3 Generic risk management system applications	21
	2.3.2	Enterprise-wide risk management systems	22
		2.3.2.1 Introduction	22
		2.3.2.2 ERM system framework	23
		2.3.2.3 ERM system applications	25
	2.3.3	ORM systems based on operations management systems	26
		2.3.3.1 Introduction	26
		2.3.3.2 Operations management system frameworks	27
		2.3.3.3 Operations management system applications	29
	2.3.4	Discussions	31
2.4	Summ	nary	32

Chapter 3 Research model, propositions and hypotheses

3.1	Introduction		33
3.2	Propo	sed ORM system framework in this study	33
3.3	Eleme	ents of proposed ORM system framework	36
	3.3.1	Element 1: Leadership	36
	3.3.2	Element 2: Planning and strategic alignment	37
	3.3.3	Element 3: Implementation	38
	3.3.4	Element 4: Monitoring and continuous improvement	38
	3.3.5	Element 5: Training and performance appraisal	39
	3.3.6	Element 6: Employee involvement and empowerment	39
	3.3.7	Element 7: Communication	40
3.4	Resea	rch model	40
	3.4.1	Module 1: Top management	41
	3.4.2	Module 2: Process management	43
	3.4.3	Module 3: Human resource management	43
	3.4.4	Summary of research model	43
3.5	Resea	rch propositions and hypotheses	44
3.6	Summ	nary	49

Chapter 4 Research method

4.1	Introd	uction	50
4.2	System	matic approach for this study	50
4.3	Theor	etical foundation	52
4.4	Resea	rch design	52
4.5	Data c	collection method	53
4.6	Imple	mentation	54
	4.6.1	Population and sample selection	54
	4.6.2	Sample size	55
	4.6.3	Questionnaire development	56
	4.6.4	Pilot testing	60
	4.6.5	Ethics approval	62
	4.6.6	Web-based survey	62
	4.6.7	Response rate improvement	63
	4.6.8	Data entry and data checking	64
4.7	Analy	sis of data	64
	4.7.1	Preliminary data analysis and hypotheses testing	64
	4.7.2	Reliability testing	65
	4.7.3	Validity testing	67
4.8	Summ	nary	69

Chapter 5 Survey results and discussion

5.1	Introd	uction	71
5.2	Gener	al characteristics of respondents	71
	5.2.1	Background of respondents	72
		5.2.1.1 Size of responding organisations	72
		5.2.1.2 Type of industry	73
	5.2.2	Status of respondents' ORM system practices	74
		5.2.2.1 Use of management system standards for ORM systems	75
		5.2.2.2 Integration of management system standards	75
5.3	Testin	g reliability of responses	77
5.4	Testin	g validity of responses	78
	5.4.1	Content validity	78
	5.4.2	Construct validity	79
	5.4.3	Criterion-related validity	80
5.5	Result	t of the ORM survey	81
	5.5.1	Perceptual responses to ORM practices	82
	5.5.2	Perceptual responses to ORM importance	83
5.6	Testin	g research hypotheses	84
5.7	ORM	system implementation guideline	100
	5.7.1	Top management	103
	5.7.2	Process management	103

	5.7.3	Human resource management	104
5.8	Sumn	nary	105

Chapter 6 Conclusions

6.1	Introduction	107
6.2	Brief summary	107
6.3	Summary	111
6.4	Limitations and future research perspectives	113
6.5	Research contributions	114

References

115

Appendices

Appendix 1 Final version of questionnaire survey	133
Appendix 2 Letter of approval from UTS Human Research Ethics Committee	138
Appendix 3 Example of survey email	139
Appendix 4 Questionnaire coding sheet	140
Appendix 5 Missing data analysis	150
Appendix 6 Factor analysis	152
Appendix 7 Multiple regression analysis	159

List of publications	161
----------------------	-----

List of tables

Table 1.1 ORM standards and guidelines	4
Table 1.2 Environmental prosecution cases	9
Table 1.3 Breaching Trade Practices Act cases	9
Table 3.1 Framework comparison	34
Table 4.1 The structure of the research methodology of this study	51
Table 4.2 ORM system factors vs. Questionnaire statements	58
Table 5.1 Size of organisation	73
Table 5.2 Internal consistency analysis results	77
Table 5.3 Construct validity analysis results	80
Table 5.4 Mean practice results	82
Table 5.5 Mean importance results	83
Table 5.6 Comparison statistics for practice and importance	85
Table 5.7 Mean result of each item in Factor 1	87
Table 5.8 Pairwise comparison statistics for items of Factor 1	88
Table 5.9 Mean result of each item in Factor 2	89
Table 5.10 Pairwise comparison statistics for importance items of Factor 2	90
Table 5.11 Mean result of each item in Factor 3	91
Table 5.12 Comparison statistics for importance items of Factor 3	92
Table 5.13 Mean result of each item in Factor 4	93
Table 5.14 Pairwise comparison statistics for importance items of Factor 4	94
Table 5.15 Mean result of each item in Factor 5	95

Table 5.16 Pairwise comparison statistics for importance items of Factor 5	95
Table 5.17 Mean result of each item in Factor 6	97
Table 5.18 Comparison statistics for importance items of Factor 6	97
Table 5.19 Mean result of each item in Factor 7	98
Table 5.20 Comparison statistics for importance items of Factor 7	99
Table 5.21 Correlation analysis results of ORM system implementation factors	100

List of figures

Figure 2.1 History of operational improvements	14
Figure 2.2 The three ages of risk management	16
Figure 2.3 The AS/NZS 4360 model	20
Figure 2.4 The COSO ERM model	23
Figure 2.5 The ISO 9001 model	27
Figure 2.6 The ISO 14001 model	28
Figure 2.7 The AS/NZS 4801 model	28
Figure 3.1 The proposed ORM system implementation model	42
Figure 5.1 Breakdown of industry	74
Figure 5.2 Use of management system standards for ORM systems	76
Figure 5.3 Management system integration	76
Figure 5.4 ORM system implementation model	102

Abstract

In today's business environment, increased competition, market globalisation, increased customer demands and accelerated technologies require organisations to focus on efficiency in every aspect of their operations. Many studies in operations management have focused on the improvement of operational performance, including reduction of process variability, increasing flexibility or implementing controls in operations. However, managing the risk in operations seems to have been neglected by researchers.

Hence, there are two major objectives of this study. The first objective is to investigate the use of the operational risk management (ORM) systems in Australia and study the factors that have an impact on effective operational risk management. Then, based on the identified factors, the second objective is to develop an ORM system implementation model and guideline for Australian organisations.

A review of the ORM systems and its implementation was conducted. As a result of this investigation, a definition of ORM system in this study was formulated and the factors of effective ORM system implementation were identified as a basis for the next stage of this study.

An investigation of the factors of ORM system implementation was then carried out. An extensive questionnaire survey was used to collect empirical data from Australian organisations. Statistical analysis results and feedback from experts was used to develop an applicable model and guideline for ORM system implementation.

The main outcome of this study is a proposed model and guideline for ORM system implementation in Australian organisations, which will assist the organisation to manage operational risks more effectively and provide motivation for carrying out further research in ORM.