

UNIVERSITY OF TECHNOLOGY, SYDNEY
FACULTY OF INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY

**A UNIFIED APPROACH TO
ENTERPRISE ARCHITECTURE
MODELLING**

By Gerald R. Khoury

A dissertation submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Computing Science.

2007

To my lovely wife Isabelle, who has provided me with unwavering support throughout my research program.

And to my dear Mother and Father, for encouraging a love of learning.

Acknowledgments

I would like to extend my sincere thanks and appreciation to my thesis supervisor, Associate Professor Simeon J. Simoff. I am very fortunate that he accepted me as a student. Simeon's keen sense of diplomacy, combined with a kind and good-humoured nature, allowed me the room to grow and express myself through my work. All the while, Simeon's pragmatism, keen analytical mind and vision provided the framework needed to ensure a sound research program.

I would also like to thank my co-supervisor, Dr Roger Jenkins, for his kind and generous support. Roger provided me with valuable input when it was most needed, while also providing me with an inspiring introduction to the 'classics'.

A special thanks to the ITD Team at UTS who, despite their hectic schedules, were kind enough to support this research program. In particular, I would like to thank the Director Peter James for his generous reception to the project, Peter Demou and Ian Waters for their close involvement in the development of the project artefacts, and all of the ITD managers for their important contributions to the development of the EA models. I would also like to thank the independent Enterprise Architects who contributed to this research: Trevor Christie-Taylor, Luke Vassallo, Som Adel and George Wanat.

Copyright © 2007 by Gerald R. Khoury. Permission to make digital or hard copies of part or all of this work for personal or classroom use is granted without fee provided that copies are not made or distributed for profit or commercial advantage and that copies bear this notice and the full citation on the first page. Copyrights for components of this work owned by others than Gerald R. Khoury must be honoured. Abstracting with credit is permitted. To copy otherwise, to republish, to post on servers, or to redistribute to lists, requires prior specific permission and/or a fee.

Overview of Contents

List of Figures	i
List of Tables	iii
Abbreviations	iv
Abstract	v
1 Introduction	1
2 Enterprise Architecture and Systems Modelling	17
3 Metaphor	56
4 Theoretical Principles for The Development of Unified EA Modelling Languages	76
5 The LEAN Ontology	89
6 Experimental Research Methodology	112
7 Experimental Studies	119
8 Conclusions and Future Research Directions	153
9 Bibliography	159
10 Appendix A – Project Summary for UTS EA Project	169
11 Appendix B – Final Project Report for UTS EA Project	174
12 Appendix C – Questionnaires	211
13 Appendix D – USDoS ITA	218
14 Appendix E – USDoS ITA LEAN Models	261
15 Appendix F – Designing and Re-Engineering Subsystems	278

Detailed Table of Contents

List of Figures	i
List of Tables	iii
Abbreviations	iv
Abstract	v
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Research Problem	4
1.2 Research Hypothesis	6
1.3 Justification and Significance of the Research	7
1.4 Research Methodology	9
1.5 Thesis Outline	10
1.6 Outcomes	12
1.7 Expected Benefits	12
1.8 Summary	15
2 Enterprise Architecture and Systems Modelling	17
2.1 The Need for Enterprise Architecture	17
2.2 Defining Enterprise Architecture	19
2.3 Defining a System	20
2.4 Defining a Model?	20
2.4.1 Requirements of Modelling Languages	21
2.4.2 Models as Abstractions	22
2.4.3 Views and Viewpoints	23
2.4.4 Visualising Models	26
2.5 A Review of EA Modelling Languages	28
2.5.1 Unified Modeling Language (UML)	30
2.5.2 ArchiMate Enterprise Architecture Language	31
2.5.3 Integrated Definition Languages (IDEF)	33
2.5.4 Unified Enterprise Modelling Language (UEML)	34
2.5.5 Conceptual Graphs	34
2.5.6 Ad-Hoc Modelling Languages	36
2.6 A Review of EA Approaches	36
2.6.1 Soft Systems Methodology (SSM)	39
2.6.2 The Zachman Framework	41
2.6.3 The Information Framework	45
2.6.4 The Open Group Architecture Framework (TOGAF)	45
2.6.5 ISO Reference Model of Open Distributed Processing (RM-ODP)	46
2.6.6 Purdue Enterprise Reference Architecture (PERA)	47
2.6.7 Computer Integrated Manufacturing - Open System Architecture (CIMOSA)	47
2.6.8 Generalized Enterprise Reference Architecture and Methodology (GERAM)	48
2.6.9 IEEE Standards	49

2.6.10 Model Driven Architecture (MDA)	49
2.7 The Problem with Enterprise Architecture	50
2.8 Summary	54
3 Metaphor	56
3.1 Introduction	56
3.2 Contemporary Views on Metaphor	56
3.2.1 What is Metaphor?	56
3.2.2 Concrete Metaphor	59
3.2.3 The Ghost in the Machine	64
3.2.4 Persuasive Metaphors	65
3.2.5 Enterprise Architecture Metaphors	66
3.2.6 Metaphor Hierarchies	68
3.3 The Dynamic Type Hierarchy Theory of Metaphor	70
3.3.1 Support for Way's Theory	73
3.4 Summary	75
4 Theoretical Principles for The Development of Unified EA Modelling Languages	76
4.1 Introduction	76
4.2 Models and Metaphors	77
4.3 Model Hierarchies	79
4.4 A Methodology for Developing Unified EA Modelling Languages	82
4.5 An Enterprise Metaphor	84
4.6 Summary	88
5 The LEAN Ontology	89
5.1 Introduction	89
5.2 The Ontology Development Methodology	91
5.3 The LEAN Ontology	93
5.3.1 Purpose and Scope of the Ontology	93
5.3.2 Ontology Construction	93
5.3.2.1 Formalising the Enterprise Metaphor Concepts	94
5.3.2.2 The LEAN Topology	97
5.3.2.3 The LEAN Syntax	98
5.3.3 Assumptions	106
5.3.4 Limitations	106
5.4 The LEAN Modelling Tool	107
5.5 Summary	109
6 Experimental Research Methodology	112
6.1 Introduction	112
6.2 Quantitative Research Methods	112
6.3 Qualitative Research Methods	113
6.3.1 Action Research	114
6.3.2 Case Study Research	114
6.3.3 Ethnographic Research	115
6.3.4 Grounded Theory Research	115
6.4 Chosen Methods	116

6.5 Summary	117
7 Experimental Studies	119
7.1 Study One: Modelling a Large Enterprise	119
7.1.1 Introduction	119
7.1.2 Research Approach	120
7.1.3 Project Outline	121
7.1.4 The Survey Questions	122
7.1.5 Results	124
7.1.5.1 Business Users Survey Results	125
7.1.5.2 Enterprise Architect Survey Results	129
7.1.6 Analysis of Results	133
7.1.6.1 Closed Questions	134
7.1.6.2 Open Questions	135
7.1.6.3 Analysis of Models	138
7.1.7 Summary	142
7.2 Study Two: Re-Modelling a Public Domain Architecture	143
7.2.1 Introduction	143
7.2.2 The USDoS Enterprise Architecture	144
7.2.3 Analysis	146
7.2.4 Summary	150
7.3 Evaluation	150
8 Conclusions and Future Research Directions	153
8.1 Conclusions	153
8.2 Future Research Directions	155
8.3 Closing Remarks	157
9 Bibliography	159
10 Appendix A – Project Summary for UTS EA Project	169
11 Appendix B – Final Project Report for UTS EA Project	174
12 Appendix C – Questionnaires	211
13 Appendix D – USDoS ITA	218
14 Appendix E – USDoS ITA LEAN Models	261
15 Appendix F – Designing and Re-Engineering Subsystems	278
15.1 Developing a Unified Modelling Language	279
15.2 Reengineering Existing Interfaces	281
15.2.1 Decomposition and Mapping	281
15.2.1.1 Hotmail Interface	281
15.2.1.2 Yahoo Interface	283
15.2.1.3 Lotus Notes Interface	285
15.2.2 Interface Recomposition	287
15.2.2.1 Hotmail Interface	287

15.2.2.2 Yahoo Interface	289
15.2.2.3 Lotus Notes Interface	290
15.2.3 The Result	291
15.3 Developing New Interfaces	292
15.3.1 Identifying the Required Functions	293
15.3.2 Mapping	293
15.3.3 Construction	294
15.4 Conclusion	294

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1- Research Methodology	10
Figure 2 - Thesis Structure and Flow	11
Figure 3 - The relationship between Level of Description and Level of Machine Orientation for a selection of Modelling Languages	15
Figure 4 - Levels of Abstraction, Structures and Models Based on a talk given by Luciano Floridi, Informational Realism, Proceedings Computing and Philosophy conf., Canberra, Nov.2003	23
Figure 5 – An Example of the Decomposition of an EA into Various Architectural Views	25
Figure 6 - ArchiMate Concepts (Instituut, 2004)	32
Figure 7 - Situated Components of an Enterprise Architecture	37
Figure 8 - The Zachman Framework	42
Figure 9 - Possible modelling languages with which to populate the Zachman framework. From (Noran, 2003)	44
Figure 10 - The Relationship between the Source and Target of a Metaphor	57
Figure 11 - Scope and Level of Metaphors (partially based on (Hammond and Allison, 1987))	69
Figure 12 - Metaphor Hierarchy from Elastic to Concrete	70
Figure 13 - The Relationship between Models, Metaphors and Concept Type Hierarchies	77
Figure 14 - Enterprise System Hierarchy with Enterprise as Global Supertype	80
Figure 15 - Enterprise System Hierarchy with New Enterprise Supertype	81
Figure 16 - The Applicability of LEAN at Various Levels of Abstraction	84
Figure 17 - Methodology for Developing and Applying a Unified Language	85
Figure 18 - LEAN in relation to EA views and domain specific models	87
Figure 19 – Views, Viewpoints and Architectural Areas of Concern	96
Figure 20 - The Graphical Representations of LEAN Nodes	99
Figure 21 - A LEAN Relationship	100
Figure 22 - A LEAN Universal and Non-Universal Type	104
Figure 23 - Primary Research Approaches	112
Figure 24 - Responses for Two Groups (Business Users and EA's) Compared by Question and Test Area.	134
Figure 25 - Top Level Generic Activity Model	148
Figure 26 - Hotmail Interface	281
Figure 27 - Hotmail Functions	282
Figure 28 - Decomposition and Mapping of Hotmail Functions	283
Figure 30 - Yahoo functions	284
Figure 29 - Yahoo Interface	284
Figure 31 – Decomposition and Mapping of Yahoo Functions	285
Figure 32 - Lotus Notes Interface	286
Figure 33 - Lotus Notes functions	286
Figure 34 - Lotus Notes "Tools" Drop Down Menu	286
Figure 35 - Decomposition and Mapping of Lotus Notes Functions	287
Figure 36 - Recomposed Hotmail Functions	288
Figure 37 - Recomposed Hotmail Functions - Expanded	288
Figure 38 - Recomposition of Hotmail Interface based on Unified Metaphor	288

Figure 39 - Recomposed Yahoo Functions	289
Figure 40 - Recomposed Yahoo Functions - Expanded	289
Figure 41 - Recomposition of Yahoo Interface based on Unified Metaphor	290
Figure 42 - Recomposed Lotus Notes Functions	290
Figure 43 - Recomposed Lotus Notes Functions - Expanded	291
Figure 44 - Recomposition of Lotus Notes Interface based on Unified Metaphor	292
Figure 45 - Mapping of New Email Interface Functions	293
Figure 46 - New Email Interface Functions	294

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1 - Research Questions and Qualities Corresponding to the Research Hypothesis.	7
Table 2 – Some Integrated Modelling Languages	30
Table 3 - IDEF Methods from (IDEF, 1992)	33
Table 4 – Some Well Known EA Frameworks, Methods and Standards	38
Table 5 - City Landscape Metaphor Mapping	68
Table 6 - Definitions of Agent, Resource, Rule and Action Concepts	96
Table 7 - Mapping Between a Generic Relationship Set and the Range of Possible Node Pairings	105
Table 8 - ITD Project Objectives	121
Table 9 - Study One Test Areas and Research Approaches	123
Table 10 - Results of LEAN Survey for Business Users - Closed Questions	126
Table 11 - Results of LEAN Survey for Business Users - Open Questions	128
Table 12 - Results of LEAN Survey for Enterprise Architects - Closed Questions	130
Table 13 - Results of LEAN Survey for Enterprise Architects - Open Questions	133
Table 14 - Top Ten Words not in Wordlist	136
Table 15 - Concordance List for High Frequency Words	138
Table 16 - LEAN Node Frequency Distribution	139
Table 17 – Relationship Frequencies in ITD EA Models	141
Table 18 - Relationship Frequencies in USDoS ITA	149

ABBREVIATIONS

CG	Conceptual Graph
CRM	Customer Relationship Management
DTH	Dynamic Type Hierarchy
EA	Enterprise Architecture or Enterprise Architect
EA's	Enterprise Architectures or Enterprise Architects
EM	Elastic Metaphor
ERM	Enterprise Resource Management
HCI	Human Computer Interaction
HTML	Hypertext Mark-up Language
ICT	Information and Communications Technology
IS	Information System
IT	Information Technology
ITA	Information Technology Architecture
ITD	Information Technology Department of UTS
LEAN	Lightweight Enterprise Architecture Notation
MCS	Minimal Common Supertype
ODBC	Open Data-Base Connectivity
UML	Unified Modeling Language
USDoS	United States, Department of State
UTS	University of Technology, Sydney
VE	Virtual Environment
VR	Virtual Reality
WIMP	Windows, Icons, Mice, Pull-down menus

ABSTRACT

As IT environments grow in complexity and diversity, their strategic management becomes a critical business issue. Enterprise architectures (EA's) provide support by ensuring that there is alignment between an enterprise's business objectives and the IT systems that it deploys to achieve these objectives. While EA is a relatively new discipline, it has already found widespread commercial application. It is likely that EA will receive even more focus as IT environments continue to grow in complexity and heterogeneity.

Despite this widespread acceptance of EA as a valuable IT discipline, there are several serious challenges that contemporary EA approaches are yet to overcome. These arise from the fact that currently, there is no *unified* EA modelling language that is also *easy to use*. A unified EA modelling language is one that is able to describe a wide range of IT domains using a single modelling notation. Without a unified, easy to use EA modelling language, it is impossible to create integrated models of the enterprise. Instead, a variety of modelling languages must be used to create an EA, leading to enterprise models that are inconsistent, incomplete and difficult to understand. The need to use multiple modelling languages also places a high cognitive load on modellers and excludes non-IT specialists from developing or using these models, even though such people may be the most important stakeholders in an EA program.

The research presented in this thesis tackles these problems by developing a metaphor-based approach to the construction of unified EA modelling languages. Contemporary approaches to the understanding of metaphor are surveyed, and it is noted that one way to understand metaphor is to view it as part of a dynamic type hierarchy. This understanding of metaphor is related to the development of enterprise models and it is shown that highly abstract metaphors can be used to provide conceptually unified models of a range of enterprises and their component structures.

This approach is operationalised as methodology that can be used to generate any number of unified EA modelling languages. This methodology is then applied to generate a new, unified EA modelling language called 'LEAN' (Lightweight Enterprise Architecture Notation).

LEAN is evaluated using a mixed-methods research approach. This evaluation demonstrates that LEAN *can* be used to model a wide range of domains and that it is easy to learn and simple to understand.

The application of the theoretical principles and methodology presented in this thesis can be expected to improve the understandability and consistency of EA's significantly. This, in turn, can be expected to deliver significant tangible business benefits through improved strategic change management that more closely aligns the delivery of IT services with business drivers.

The findings in this research also provide fertile ground for further research. This includes the development and comparative evaluation of alternative unified languages, further research into the use of the methodology presented to align architectures at various levels of abstraction, and the investigation of the applicability of this theoretical approach to other, non-IT disciplines.