Beyond the Surface: 
The Contemporary Experience of the Italian Renaissance

Jo-Anne Duggan

Thesis submitted as partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of 
Doctor of Creative Arts

University of Technology, Sydney 2003
Certificate of Authorship / Originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Jo-Anne Duggan

[Signature]
Acknowledgements

Foremost in my acknowledgments I offer heartfelt thanks to Associate Professor Norie Neumark, my principal supervisor for the last half of my doctorate. To Norie I am eternally grateful for her intellectual generosity, astute advice and direction, and constructive analysis and feedback. Norie’s supervision has been profound in many ways, her discerning and timely recommendations have enriched and extended this project, and enabled me to more critically reflect on the concerns not only related to my visual art practice but the very cross-disciplinary nature of this thesis. Norie’s intuitive understanding of how to combine the dichotomous nature of theoretical writing and creative art practice has been both insightful and inspiring.

I wish to thank my earlier principal supervisors, Associate Professor Paula Hamilton, who more recently assumed the role of co-supervisor, and Research Professor Ross Gibson, for their contributions and encouragement. Also, my initial co-supervisor, Dr Susan Best, for her support and feedback. (Unfortunately, both Prof Gibson and Dr Best moved from UTS during the early stages of my candidature.) At UTS, I would also like to acknowledge the support of the Dean of Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor Joyce Kirk and the Faculty Research Office, in particular Chris Anderson.

I especially wish to thank my research colleagues. Dr Melanie Swalwell whose unique and inquiring mind, intellectual magnanimity, and much valued friendship managed to extract from me much more than I knew I had to offer. Also, Dr Yuji Sone, Dr Stephen Gapps, Dr Cassi Plate, Dr Kate Evans, (as their titles suggest, they were my predecessors) Damian Lucas, Sue Georgevits and Nathalie Apouchtine all of whom shared with me the benefit of their experience not only with writing strategies, but equally important, their moral support, encouragement and friendship.

I am grateful to Mary Beckinsale, director of the Studio Arts Centre International, in Florence, for allowing me to exhibit and take up residence at
SACI. Also in Florence, Professor Daniela Lamberini, Laura Orsi and Mariantonia Rinaldi who generously offered their Italian insight, and the Soprintendenza ai Beni Artistici e Storici who granted me permission to photograph in the museums of Florence. I would also like to acknowledge the ongoing interest of the Italian Institute of Culture.

Beyond the institutions, I offer an enormous thank you to all my family, and to my dearest friends who I rely on for support in innumerable ways and would be lost without; especially Kim Allen, whose outstanding design work pervades this project, and Mary Gissing for her invaluable discussions and museum conservator’s expertise.

Ultimately, and above all, I would like to express my infinite gratitude to Kevin Bayley who has graciously endured my unrelenting obsession with this project. Without his encouragement this thesis would never have been started.
Contents

i  Certificate of Authorship
ii  Acknowledgments
iv  Contents
v   List of Illustrations
viii Abstract

Chapters
1   1. Introduction: Beyond the Surface
17  2. Possessing the Unpossessable
54  3. Before the Museum
77  4. Impossible Gaze
111 5. Conclusion: The Contemporary Experience

121 Bibliography
133 Documentation
List of Illustrations

All images have been photographed by the author/artist unless otherwise stated.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>page</th>
<th>illustration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2a</td>
<td>1. Art handlers at the National Gallery, London.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2a</td>
<td>2. Art handlers at the Galleria degli Uffizi, Florence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3a</td>
<td>3. Isolation and Profusion #5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3a</td>
<td>4. Isolation and Profusion #7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3b</td>
<td>5. Isolation and Profusion #21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4a</td>
<td>6. The Viewer's Gaze, series #1 to #10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8a</td>
<td>7. Raffaello, School of Athens (detail), 1510-1511.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21b</td>
<td>10. Aymard de Banville, Giza: Sphinx and Pyramid of Chephren, 1863.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27a</td>
<td>12. Roger Fenton, Discobolus, c.1857.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29a</td>
<td>14-17. Invisible Operations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29b</td>
<td>18-21. Invisible Operations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42a</td>
<td>30. The Gaze and the Glance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48a</td>
<td>33-34. Scale of Reproduction: life-size photographic images that cover entire architectural facades, Siena and Venice.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
      Detail: Fra Angelico, fresco, ca. 1449.
55b  40. *Before the Museum* #3. Origin: Galleria Doria Pamphilj,
      Palazzo Doria Pamphilj.
55c  41. *Before the Museum* #4. Origin: Cappelle Medicee, Basilica di San
      Lorenzo. Detail: Michelangelo Buonarroti, *Tomb of Lorenzo de' Medici*,
      1521-34.
      Detail: Sanzio Raffaello, *School of Athens*, fresco 1510-11.
55e  45. *Before the Museum* #8. Origin: Galleria Nazionale di Arte Antica,
      Palazzo Barberini.
55e  46. *Before the Museum* #9. Origin: Cattedrale di Santa Maria del Fiore,
      Detail: Andrea del Castagno, *Niccolò da Tolentino Memorial*,
      fresco transferred to canvas, 1456.
61a  48. Vacuuming at the National Gallery, London.
75a  50. Michelangelo's tomb, Santa Croce.
75a  51. Michelangelo's tomb, Santa Croce.
78a  52. *Impossible Gaze* #1. Origin: Room II – Sala del Trono [Throne Room],
      Appartamenti Reali, Palazzo Pitti.
78a  53. *Impossible Gaze* #2. Origin: Room L – The Carrand Room,
      Museo Nazionale del Bargello.
78b  54. *Impossible Gaze* #3. Origin: Room 5-6 – International Gothic.
      Detail: Lorenzo Monaco, *Coronation of the Virgin*, 1414,
      Galleria degli Uffizi.
78b  55. *Impossible Gaze* #4. Origin: Room XII – The Red Room,
      Appartamento del Re Appartamenti Reali, Palazzo Pitti.
      Detail: Andrea del Sarto, *Madonna of the Harpies*, 1517,
      Galleria degli Uffizi.
57. *Impossible Gaze* #6. Origin: Room II – Sala del Trono [Throne Room], Appartamenti Reali, Palazzo Pitti.

58. *Impossible Gaze* #7. Origin: Room II – Sala del Trono [Throne Room], Appartamenti Reali, Palazzo Pitti.

59. *Impossible Gaze* #8. Origin: Room X – Appartamento del Re [King’s Bedroom], Appartamenti Reali, Palazzo Pitti.


Detail: Lorenzo Monaco, *Coronation of the Virgin*, 1414, Galleria degli Uffizi.


66. *Impossible Gaze* #15. Origin: Room X – Appartamento del Re [King’s Bedroom], Appartamenti Reali, Palazzo Pitti.


68. *Impossible Gaze* #17. Origin: Room 27 – Sala di Apollo [Apollo Room], Galleria Palatina, Palazzo Pitti.


70. Ambient museum lighting.

71. Museums built as ‘temples of culture’.

72. ‘La Tribuna’ in the Uffizi housed the early Medici collections.
(Image reproduced from the Sillabe Archives.)


75-77. The paraphernalia of museum display.

78. Old Uffizi ticket stub.

79. New Uffizi ticket stub.

80. The Louvre copyist.

81. The ‘new’ David in Piazza della Signoria.

82. The ‘original’ David in Galleria dell’Accademia.
Abstract

It is the intention of this Doctor of Creative Arts to convey the complexity of viewing art in museums. Concentrating on both the physical and cultural contexts of art, I focus specifically on Italian museums that house artworks of the Renaissance. I argue that the viewing experience in these museums is formed at the intersection of cultures, histories, the past and the present, art and the subjectivity of the viewer's own gaze. In this project the personal, physical, cerebral, sensorial and temporal experiences of art are central to my concerns.

The structure of this DCA combines my photographic art practice with this written reflection. I work with both the visual and the textual to most appropriately and effectively express my concerns with the Renaissance and Italian museums. In a peculiar act of doubling, I am making art about the experience of viewing it, and through image-making I am able both to explore and to comment more profoundly on the experience of these museums. While my research and writing at times responds to these images, it also inspires them. Here I integrate the past, history and art, with contemporary theories that are relevant in the study of vision and today's art viewing, and rely on numerous writers across the broad fields of visual arts, art history and theory, museology, historiography and cultural tourism. In surveying these extensive interwoven disciplines I engage with the magnitude of the social, historical and theoretical studies that converge in the museum viewer's field of vision.

Beyond the glorious artworks themselves Italian Renaissance museums exhibit a dense visual and historic culture that provides an enriched viewing environment. They paradoxically intersect 'high' art with a phenomenal popularity that appears ever-expanding through endless reproductions and representations via modern technologies. Through examining these museums with their multiple histories and contexts I hope to argue for a slower, more considered engagement with art, that encourages the viewer to experience the sensual as well as the intellectual aspects that this opulent environment offers.
As you wait for a change in the light, or go about the mechanics of setting up a shot, you have the chance to slow down the act of looking...the camera is a prosthesis that helps you to think through what is.

Guido Guidi

Paintings still have that effect—they are ways of thinking about something other than what I am.

James Elkins

---