

Beyond the Surface:
The Contemporary Experience of the Italian Renaissance

Jo-Anne Duggan

Thesis submitted as partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Creative Arts

University of Technology, Sydney 2003

Certificate of Authorship / Originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Jo-Anne Duggan

Production Note:

Signature removed prior to publication.

Acknowledgements

Foremost in my acknowledgments I offer heartfelt thanks to Associate Professor Norie Neumark, my principal supervisor for the last half of my doctorate. To Norie I am eternally grateful for her intellectual generosity, astute advice and direction, and constructive analysis and feedback. Norie's supervision has been profound in many ways, her discerning and timely recommendations have enriched and extended this project, and enabled me to more critically reflect on the concerns not only related to my visual art practice but the very cross-disciplinary nature of this thesis. Norie's intuitive understanding of how to combine the dichotomous nature of theoretical writing and creative art practice has been both insightful and inspiring.

I wish to thank my earlier principal supervisors, Associate Professor Paula Hamilton, who more recently assumed the role of co-supervisor, and Research Professor Ross Gibson, for their contributions and encouragement. Also, my initial co-supervisor, Dr Susan Best, for her support and feedback. (Unfortunately, both Prof Gibson and Dr Best moved from UTS during the early stages of my candidature.) At UTS, I would also like to acknowledge the support of the Dean of Humanities and Social Sciences, Professor Joyce Kirk and the Faculty Research Office, in particular Chris Anderson.

I especially wish to thank my research colleagues. Dr Melanie Swalwell whose unique and inquiring mind, intellectual magnanimity, and much valued friendship managed to extract from me much more than I knew I had to offer. Also, Dr Yuji Sone, Dr Stephen Gapps, Dr Cassi Plate, Dr Kate Evans, (as their titles suggest, they were my predecessors) Damian Lucas, Sue Georgevits and Nathalie Apouchtine all of whom shared with me the benefit of their experience not only with writing strategies, but equally important, their moral support, encouragement and friendship.

I am grateful to Mary Beckinsale, director of the Studio Arts Centre International, in Florence, for allowing me to exhibit and take up residence at

SACI. Also in Florence, Professor Daniela Lamberini, Laura Orsi and Mariantonia Rinaldi who generously offered their Italian insight, and the Soprintendenza ai Beni Artistici e Storici who granted me permission to photograph in the museums of Florence. I would also like to acknowledge the ongoing interest of the Italian Institute of Culture.

Beyond the institutions, I offer an enormous thank you to all my family, and to my dearest friends who I rely on for support in innumerable ways and would be lost without; especially Kim Allen, whose outstanding design work pervades this project, and Mary Gissing for her invaluable discussions and museum conservator's expertise.

Ultimately, and above all, I would like to express my infinite gratitude to Kevin Bayley who has graciously endured my unrelenting obsession with this project. Without his encouragement this thesis would never have been started.

Contents

page

i	Certificate of Authorship
ii	Acknowledgments
iv	Contents
v	List of Illustrations
viii	Abstract

Chapters

1	1. Introduction: Beyond the Surface
17	2. Possessing the Unpossessable
54	3. Before the Museum
77	4. Impossible Gaze
111	5. Conclusion: The Contemporary Experience
121	Bibliography
133	Documentation

List of Illustrations

All images have been photographed by the author/artist unless otherwise stated.

page	illustration
2a	1. Art handlers at the National Gallery, London.
2a	2. Art handlers at the Galleria degli Uffizi, Florence.
3a	3. <i>Isolation and Profusion</i> #5
3a	4. <i>Isolation and Profusion</i> #7
3b	5. <i>Isolation and Profusion</i> #21
4a	6. <i>The Viewer's Gaze</i> , series #1 to #10
8a	7. Raffaello, <i>School of Athens</i> (detail), 1510-1511.
8a	8. Camera Obscura, illustration from Kircher's ' <i>Ars magna Lucis et Umbrae</i> ', Rome, 1649.
21a	9. Lutz Dille, <i>Three in a Window</i> , 1959.
21b	10. Aymard de Banville, <i>Giza: Sphinx and Pyramid of Khephren</i> , 1863.
21c	11. Souvenir photo of a Florentine church, 2001.
27a	12. Roger Fenton, <i>Discobolus</i> , c.1857.
27a	13. Stephen Thompson, <i>Satyr</i> , <i>British Museum</i> , c.1869-72.
29a	14-17. <i>Invisible Operations</i>
29b	18-21. <i>Invisible Operations</i>
32a	22. Sophie Calle, <i>Last Seen... (Rembrandt, A Lady and a Gentleman in Black)</i> , 1991.
32a	23. Sophie Calle, <i>Last Seen... (Vemeer, The Concert)</i> , 1991.
36a	24. Louise Lawler, <i>Statue Before Painting</i> , 1982.
36a	25. Louise Lawler, <i>Salon Hodler</i> , 1992.
38a	26. Candida Höfer, <i>Galleria Nazionale d'Arte Moderna</i> , Rome, 1990.
38a	27. Andreas Gursky, <i>Library</i> , 1999.
39a	28. Thomas Struth, <i>Stanza di Raffaello II</i> , Rome, 1990.
39a	29. Thomas Struth, <i>Galleria dell'Accademia</i> , Venice, 1992.
42a	30. <i>The Gaze and the Glance</i>
45a	31. Karen Knorr, <i>The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction</i> , 1988.
45a	32. Karen Knorr, <i>Härleman's Anatomy</i> , 1994.
48a	33-34. Scale of Reproduction: life-size photographic images that cover entire architectural facades, Siena and Venice.

page	illustration
49a	35. Palazzo Vecchio without computers, 1997.
49a	36. Palazzo Vecchio with computers, 2001.
51a	37. Karen Knorr, <i>The Analysis of Beauty</i> , 1988.
55a	38. <i>Before the Museum #1</i> . Origin: Palazzo Pitti, Galleria Palantina.
55a	39. <i>Before the Museum #2</i> . Origin: Museo di San Marco. Detail: Fra Angelico, fresco, ca. 1449.
55b	40. <i>Before the Museum #3</i> . Origin: Galleria Doria Pamhilj, Palazzo Doria Pamhilj.
55c	41. <i>Before the Museum #4</i> . Origin: Cappelle Medicee, Basilica di San Lorenzo. Detail: Michelangelo Buonarroti, <i>Tomb of Lorenzo de' Medici</i> , 1521-34.
55c	42. <i>Before the Museum #5</i> . Origin: Palazzo Pitti, Galleria Palantina.
55d	43. <i>Before the Museum #6</i> . Origin: Stanza della Segnatura, Musei Vaticani. Detail: Sanzio Raffaello, <i>School of Athens</i> , fresco 1510-11.
55d	44. <i>Before the Museum #7</i> . Origin: Museo di San Marco. Detail: Fra Angelico, <i>The Annunciation</i> , fresco ca. 1449.
55e	45. <i>Before the Museum #8</i> . Origin: Galleria Nazionale di Arte Antica, Palazzo Barberini.
55e	46. <i>Before the Museum #9</i> . Origin: Cattedrale di Santa Maria del Fiore, Detail: Andrea del Castagno, <i>Niccolò da Tolentino Memorial</i> , fresco transferred to canvas, 1456.
55f	47. <i>Before the Museum #10</i> . Origin: Cortile, Palazzo Vecchio.
61a	48. Vacuuming at the National Gallery, London.
61a	49. Elliott Erwitt, <i>Victoria and Albert Museum</i> , 1996.
75a	50. Michelangelo's tomb, Santa Croce.
75a	51. Michelangelo's tomb, Santa Croce.
78a	52. <i>Impossible Gaze #1</i> . Origin: Room II – Sala del Trono [Throne Room], Appartamenti Reali, Palazzo Pitti.
78a	53. <i>Impossible Gaze #2</i> . Origin: Room L – The Carrand Room, Museo Nazionale del Bargello.
78b	54. <i>Impossible Gaze #3</i> . Origin: Room 5-6 – International Gothic, Detail: Lorenzo Monaco, <i>Coronation of the Virgin</i> , 1414, Galleria degli Uffizi.
78b	55. <i>Impossible Gaze #4</i> . Origin: Room XII – The Red Room, Appartamento del Re Appartamenti Reali, Palazzo Pitti.
78c	56. <i>Impossible Gaze #5</i> . Origin: Room 26 – Raphael and Andrea del Sarto. Detail: Andrea del Sarto, <i>Madonna of the Harpies</i> , 1517, Galleria degli Uffizi.

page	illustration
78c	57. <i>Impossible Gaze</i> #6. Origin: Room II – Sala del Trono [Throne Room], Appartamenti Reali, Palazzo Pitti.
78d	58. <i>Impossible Gaze</i> #7. Origin: Room II – Sala del Trono [Throne Room], Appartamenti Reali, Palazzo Pitti.
78d	59. <i>Impossible Gaze</i> #8. Origin: Room X – Appartamento del Re [King's Bedroom], Appartamenti Reali, Palazzo Pitti.
78e	60. <i>Impossible Gaze</i> #9. Origin: Room L – The Carrand Room, Museo Nazionale del Bargello.
78e	61. <i>Impossible Gaze</i> #10. Origin: Room XII – The Red Room, Appartamento del Re, Appartamenti Reali, Palazzo Pitti.
78f	62. <i>Impossible Gaze</i> #11. Origin: Room 26 – Raffaello and Andrea del Sarto. Detail: Raffaello, <i>Self-portrait</i> , 1506, Galleria degli Uffizi.
78f	63. <i>Impossible Gaze</i> #12. Origin: Room 26 – Sala di Marte [Mars Room], Galleria Palatina, Palazzo Pitti.
78g	64. <i>Impossible Gaze</i> #13. Origin: Room 5-6 – International Gothic. Detail: Lorenzo Monaco, <i>Coronation of the Virgin</i> , 1414, Galleria degli Uffizi.
78g	65. <i>Impossible Gaze</i> #14. Origin: Room II – Sala del Trono [Throne Room], Appartamenti Reali, Palazzo Pitti.
78h	66. <i>Impossible Gaze</i> #15. Origin: Room X – Appartamento del Re [King's Bedroom], Appartamenti Reali, Palazzo Pitti.
78h	67. <i>Impossible Gaze</i> #16. Origin: Room XII – The Red Room, Appartamento del Re, Appartamenti Reali, Palazzo Pitti.
78i	68. <i>Impossible Gaze</i> #17. Origin: Room 27 – Sala di Apollo [Apollo Room], Galleria Palatina, Palazzo Pitti.
78i	69. <i>Impossible Gaze</i> #18. Origin: Room XVI – Tapestry Room, Appartamenti Reali, Palazzo Pitti.
87a	70. Ambient museum lighting.
87a	71. Museums built as 'temples of culture'.
87a	72. 'La Tribuna' in the Uffizi housed the early Medici collections. (Image reproduced from the Sillabe Archives.)
93a	73. Galleries of the Uffizi under renovation, 2001.
93a	74. Galleries of the Uffizi under renovation, 2001.
97a	75-77. The paraphernalia of museum display.
101a	78. Old Uffizi ticket stub.
101a	79. New Uffizi ticket stub.
106a	80. The Louvre copyist.
110a	81. The 'new' David in Piazza della Signoria.
110a	82. The 'original' David in Galleria dell'Accademia.

Abstract

It is the intention of this Doctor of Creative Arts to convey the complexity of viewing art in museums. Concentrating on both the physical and cultural contexts of art, I focus specifically on Italian museums that house artworks of the Renaissance. I argue that the viewing experience in these museums is formed at the intersection of cultures, histories, the past and the present, art and the subjectivity of the viewer's own gaze. In this project the personal, physical, cerebral, sensorial and temporal experiences of art are central to my concerns.

The structure of this DCA combines my photographic art practice with this written reflection. I work with both the visual and the textual to most appropriately and effectively express my concerns with the Renaissance and Italian museums. In a peculiar act of doubling, I am making art about the experience of viewing it, and through image-making I am able both to explore and to comment more profoundly on the experience of these museums. While my research and writing at times responds to these images, it also inspires them. Here I integrate the past, history and art, with contemporary theories that are relevant in the study of vision and today's art viewing, and rely on numerous writers across the broad fields of visual arts, art history and theory, museology, historiography and cultural tourism. In surveying these extensive interwoven disciplines I engage with the magnitude of the social, historical and theoretical studies that converge in the museum viewer's field of vision.

Beyond the glorious artworks themselves Italian Renaissance museums exhibit a dense visual and historic culture that provides an enriched viewing environment. They paradoxically intersect 'high' art with a phenomenal popularity that appears ever-expanding through endless reproductions and representations via modern technologies. Through examining these museums with their multiple histories and contexts I hope to argue for a slower, more considered engagement with art, that encourages the viewer to experience the sensual as well as the intellectual aspects that this opulent environment offers.

As you wait for a change in the light, or go about the mechanics of setting up a shot, you have the chance to slow down the act of looking... the camera is a prosthesis that helps you to think through what is.

Guido Guidi¹

Paintings still have that effect—they are ways of thinking about something other than what I am.

James Elkins²

¹ Guido Guidi, from the collection of essays, Nicholas Olsberg, (et al.), *Carlo Scarpa Architect: Intervening with History*, New York: Monacelli Press and Montréal, Quebec: Canadian Centre For Architecture, 1999, p. 208.

² James Elkins. *The Object Stares Back: On the Nature of Seeing*, San Diego: 1st Harvest edition, Harcourt Brace, 1997, p. 23.