

DIVERSITY AND COHERENCE

A STUDY OF CAREERS IN HUMAN RESOURCE

DEVELOPMENT

Robyn Johnston, BA Dip.Ed.(Syd) MA (Macq)

**A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Education**

University of Technology Sydney

2004

CERTIFICATE

I certify that this thesis has not already been submitted for any degree and is not being admitted as part of candidature for any other degree. I also certify that the thesis has been written by me and that any help that I received in preparing this thesis and all sources used have been acknowledged in the thesis.

Production Note:

Signature removed prior to publication.

Signature of candidate

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This project arose from a genuine interest in how people construct careers and a realisation that this was an unexplored area in terms of human resource development practitioners. To conduct research which allowed me to move some way in understanding this phenomenon, however, required people to share aspects of their life with me. To those who helped satisfy my curiosity by being willing to talk about their lives I say thank you.

The support, advice and assistance of many others have also variously helped me to complete this research project and for this they deserve thanks. Firstly I would like to acknowledge the contribution made by my supervisors, Andrew Gonczi and Clive Chappell. I thank Andrew for his encouragement when I initially discussed the possibility of exploring this area and then the challenges he posed and his ongoing advice as I moved through the various iterations of the research project. I also thank Clive for his readiness to discuss my ideas, help me refine my thinking and read my writing over many cups of coffee before he was one of my supervisors and then his ongoing efforts in reviewing chapters of my project as a supervisor.

I also wish to thank my colleagues from the faculty, who at various times contributed to my thinking and research project progress. I would especially like to acknowledge the contribution of my “writing group” colleagues, some of who were fellow travellers along the road of completing a doctoral project. Their ongoing humour and advice especially during our meetings gave me the confidence to keep going. I also wish to thank Maree Joulain for her assistance and patience with me during final formatting and editing stage and for frequent help at various times when I thought I had lost research material on my computer.

My family also deserves my thanks for their support and help. To my younger daughter Fiona, who in the final year of her own schooling threw down the challenge to me to undertake this research journey, I say thank you. At times I wondered why I had ever listened to her words but the completion of project now makes them worth while. To my mother, Pat Sherring and my older daughter, Melissa, and, son, Lachlan I also say thank you. I have been grateful for their encouragement and interest in my progress especially at times when my energy for the project was flagging. Finally, I wish to thank my husband, Gary. His unswerving support for my endeavours related to my Ed.D studies and his critique, advice and encouragement in final stages of writing of this research project have been greatly appreciated.

Table of Contents

Abstract

Chapter 1: Context and orientation of research	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Focus of this research project	3
1.2.1 Overview	3
1.2.2. Key Research Questions	5
1.2.3. Understandings of key concepts associated with research	5
i) Human Resource Development	5
ii) Career	6
iii) Patterns	8
iv) Properties	9
1.3 Research perspectives	10
1.4 Structure of the research project	11
1.5 Anticipated contribution of research project to the knowledge in this field	13
Chapter 2: Lens for inquiry-a review of relevant literatures	15
2.1 Introduction	15
2.2 Exploring the HRD Literature	17
2.2.1 Overview of early history of practice of the field	17
2.2.2 Debates about the nature of the field	21
i) Definitional debates	21
ii) Theory base/ philosophies of practice debates	22
iii) Debate about models and scope of practice of the field	24
2.2.3 Searches for HRD competencies	27
i) USA studies	27

ii) <i>European Studies</i>	29
iii) <i>Australian studies</i>	30
2.2.4 <i>Linkage between HRD, HRM and business strategy</i>	34
2.2.5 <i>Advocacy for a “learning organisation” approach</i>	37
2.2.6 <i>Impact of rethinking of Vocational Education and Training policy within Australia on HRD practice.</i>	39
2.2.7 <i>Some conclusions</i>	43
2.3 <i>Informing themes from careers research literature</i>	45
2.3.1 <i>Overview of approaches to understanding careers</i>	45
2.3.2 <i>Dimensions of contemporary careers</i>	47
i) <i>External objective features v/+ Internal subjective experiences</i>	47
ii) <i>Direction and movement of careers</i>	48
iii) <i>Studies of types of careers</i>	49
iv) <i>Stages in Careers</i>	52
v) <i>Self agency dimensions of career construction</i>	55
vi) <i>The interconnection of work roles and other than work roles in career construction</i>	58
vii) <i>Understanding the relationship between job satisfaction and career construction</i>	58
2.3.3 <i>Some conclusions</i>	60
2.4. <i>Informing themes from the organisational literature</i>	61
2.4.1 <i>Impact of change in organisations</i>	61
2.4.1.1 <i>Changes in the organisation of work</i>	62
2.4.1.2 <i>Changing expectations and relationships with staff</i>	64
2.4.2 <i>Rise of the knowledge workers</i>	67
2.4.3 <i>Learning as an imperative for organisational effectiveness</i>	68
2.4.4 <i>Some conclusions</i>	69
2.5. <i>Unanswered questions requiring further investigation</i>	70
 Chapter 3: Research Methodology	 73
3.1 <i>Introduction</i>	73
3.2 <i>Research traditions and the empirical studies presented in the project</i>	73
3.3 <i>Theoretical positioning of the project</i>	74

i) Deetz' explanation of discursive spaces	76
ii) Dimensions determining research positioning	77
iii) Locating this research project within Deetz' schema	79
3.4 Research methods utilised in the project	80
3.4.1 Study 1 –Survey	80
i) Appropriateness of joint survey research for this project	81
ii) My role as researcher in the survey study	78
iii) Survey design	83
iv) Survey distribution	84
v) Analysis of survey data	84
3.4.2 Study 2 -Case studies based on interviews	85
i) Appropriateness of career biography interview research for this project	85
ii) Sample selection	86
iii) Data gathering and analysis processes	87
3.5 Criteria for judging knowledge claims produced from this research	91
3.6 Conclusion	94
 Chapter 4: Mapping the field: reportage and discussion of findings from survey research	 95
4.1 Introduction	95
4.2 Specific context of survey research	95
4.3. Background to the survey study	97
4.4. Discussion of results from survey revealing insights about careers in HRD	98
4.4.1 About response rate and respondents	93
4.4.2 About the organisations in which survey respondents worked: questions and responses	99
4.4.3 Perceptions about organisational priority afforded training and development HRD practice	101
4.4.4 What the survey showed about the use and qualifications of specialist v non specialist Training and Development/ HRD employees	103

4.4.5 Positional labels for this area of organisational practice	105
4.4.6 Positioning HRD within the organisational structure	106
4.4.7 Perceptions of current skill requirements of T and D practitioners	107
4.4.8 Perceptions about current and future importance of various T and D practice areas	108
4.4.9 Perceptions of occupational purpose	112
4.5 What do such results show us about HRD practitioners in organisations?	113
4.6 Some conclusions: what this research reveals about careers in this field	115
Chapter 5: Mapping the field: reportage and discussion of findings from career stories	118
5.1 Introduction	118
5.2 A perspective of participating HRD practitioners	119
5.2.1 Selected Vignettes of HRD careers	121
Donald's career story	
Cecily's career story	
Susan's career story	
5.3 Analysing and interpreting the career stories	125
5.4 Findings from interviews about entry to HRD as career field	126
5.4.1 Entry to an occupational field	126
5.4.2. Entry to the field of HRD -implications of unregulated field of practice	122
5.4.3 Patterns of entry from stories of HRD practitioners	130
i) Entry following study in tertiary institution	130
ii) Entry following developing expertise in workplace skills/procedures	131
iii) Full time versus part time entry patterns	132
iv) Almost accidental entry versus planned and keenly sought entry	133
5.5 Findings from stories about transitions in HRD Careers	135
5.5.1 Overview of studies of career transitions	135
5.5.2 Career transition stories of HRD practitioners	137
i) Moves to other positions in HRD within the same organisation	137

ii) Moves or transitions to HRD positions in other organisations or to different industry	137
iii) Moves between organisations into roles, which required the practitioner to carry out other technical/functional roles as well as an HRD role	137
iv) Moves out of organisations into HRD consultancy practice roles	137
5.5.3 Reasons for career movements	141
i) Organisational restructuring	141
ii) New opportunities, new pastures	141
iii) Dissatisfaction with work role/ employer work climate	141
iv) Other than work experiences	143
5.5.4 Career lines/ career pattern in field of HRD as shown through practitioners' transitions	143
5.6 Consistent experiences across HRD careers	147
5.6.1 Consistency in early practice experiences	148
5.6.2 Consistency in experiences resulting from transitions and growing maturity in field	149
5.6.3 Consistency in way HRD practice approaches changed	151
5.7. Off shore experiences	153
5.8 Consistency in skills acquisition	153
5.9 Consistency in beliefs, values, attitudes philosophies related to HRD practice	157
5.10 Other -than -work experiences	160
5.11 Some conclusions	160
Chapter 6: Conclusions and implications from research	162
6.1 Introduction	162
6.2 Summary of research questions and project approach	162
6.2.1 Research questions	162

6.2.2 <i>Research approach: theoretical investigation</i>	163
6.2.3 <i>Research approach: empirical investigation</i>	165
6.3 <i>Key themes and findings</i>	163
6.3.1 <i>Prominent themes in HRD, careers and organisational literature</i>	166
6.3.2 <i>Key findings from the survey of practitioners</i>	170
6.3.3 <i>Findings from interviews with practitioners</i>	172
6.4 <i>Resonances in findings from data sources and tentative propositions</i>	174
6.5 <i>Coherence of HRD as a career field</i>	181
6.6 <i>Implications for professional development required by practitioners</i>	182
6.7 <i>Limitations of study and suggestions for further research</i>	184
6.8 <i>Conclusion</i>	185
Bibliography	187
Appendices	
1. <i>Survey</i>	209
2. <i>Project "Examining Careers in Human Resource Development"</i>	
<i>Interview protocol</i>	216
3. <i>Career stories</i>	218

List of Figures and Tables

Fig 3.1 Contrasting Dimensions from the Metatheory of Representational practices Source: Deetz, 1994	76
Table 4.1 Summary of size of respondents' organisations (n=197)	99
Table 4.2 Summary of industries represented in responses (n =197)	100
Table 4.3 Amount of and priority afforded to training and development within respondents' organisations within the past 3 years	102
Table 4.4 Current and predicted importance of training and development in particular practice areas	109
Table 4.5 Perceptions of changes in importance in T and D/ HRD activities	111
Table 4.6 Perceptions of purpose of training and development's contribution to organisations	112
Table 5.1 Dimensions of career of participating interviewees	119

ABSTRACT

This research study is concerned with examining human resource development (HRD) as a career field. In so doing the research study attempts to present a picture of the nature and structure of careers of those who practise in this field in Australian organisations. This line of investigation has been pursued by researchers for other career fields such as teaching and management. Such research has added to the maturation of these occupational fields and provided insights for the ongoing development of practitioners aspiring to or seeking to maintain careers in these fields of practice. This line of research, however, has not been pursued as part of building a more complete understanding of human resource development. The lack of research examining HRD from a career perspective could be seen as needing to be addressed to assist this field of practice attain greater maturity as an occupational field. Such research potentially will provide those who practise or wish to practise in this field with informed insights into the nature and structure of careers that are available to them. Further, such research could be seen also as being timely given the recent attention by governments throughout the developed world to the processes of skill formation as a way of building national capability and increasing competitiveness, and, the increased interest by organisations in employee development and learning initiatives as a way of building organisational capability and improving organizational performance.

This research project therefore attempts to illuminate this field of practice from a career perspective. In so doing it uses the literatures of HRD, careers and changing organisational practice as three disparate yet interrelated lens to examine the dimensions and characteristics of HRD careers and to surface questions that need to be asked to better understand this area as a career field. This research project argues that such sources are relevant given the dearth of direct research about HRD as a career field. The project also draws on findings from two empirical research studies. One of these studies is a survey -based study that was completed by HRD practitioners or their supervisors. The second empirical component comprised a series of in depth interviews with 12 HRD practitioners about their careers in this field of practice.

Findings from these sources allow the research project to argue that the nature of careers in HRD can be explained by the dynamic interplay of forces originating from individual aspiration, capacity and self agency, the shifts in practices which are occurring in contemporary organisations as well as from the diverse and evolving nature of the field of

HRD. These forces and the interplay between them determine the direction and movement within individual HRD careers. They also shape what could be seen as consistent career patterns and common career experiences of practitioners in this field even though it is recognised that there is considerable diversity in the models of practice associated with this occupational area. This research project therefore argues that coherence can be seen in HRD careers even if at times this area as a career field lacks the regularity or orderliness of some other career fields. Findings from studies showed consistency in career structure and some career experiences. Findings also indicated at a very embryonic level a commonly held sense of occupational identity can be seen as existing amongst practitioners who come from this area of organisational practice.

The report of this study concludes with some general implications for ongoing development of practitioners drawn from these findings about careers.