The Influence of Organisational Culture, Subculture, Leadership Style and Job Satisfaction on Organisational Commitment

Peter Lok

B.App.Sc., M.H.P. (UNSW), M.B.A. (UTS)

This thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy Graduate School of Business University of Technology, Sydney

Ph. D (1997)

Ackno	wledgement7
Abstra	act9
Table	of Figures13
List of	Tables14
List of	Appendices17
Chapt	er 1: Introduction, Rationale and Hypotheses18
1.1	Introduction 18
1.2	Rationale for the Study
1.3	The Significance of this Study25
1.4	Definition of Terms
1.5	The Structure of this Thesis
Chapt	er 2: Literature Review Of Organisational Commitment
And It	s Antecedents36
2.1	Introduction
2.2	The Definition of Organisational Commitment
2.3	Differentiation between Organisational, Work and Career/Professional
	Commitment 44

2.4	Antecedents of Organisational Commitment	48
2.5	The Association between Organisational Commitment and Job	
	Satisfaction	57
2.6	Causal Models of Organisational Commitment	59
2.7	Organisational Commitment in Nursing	62
2.8	The Use of Ward Commitment in this Study	64
2.9	Review of Commonly Used Instruments to Measure Organisation	nal
	Commitment	66
		71
2.10	Summary	/ 1
Chapt	Summaryer 3: Organisational Culture, Subculture, Leadership Stocks	tyle
Chapt	er 3: Organisational Culture, Subculture, Leadership S	tyle 73
Chapte And Je	er 3: Organisational Culture, Subculture, Leadership Stock ob Satisfaction	tyle 73 73
Chapte And Je	er 3: Organisational Culture, Subculture, Leadership Soob Satisfaction	tyle 73 73
Chapte And Jo 3.1 3.2	er 3: Organisational Culture, Subculture, Leadership Soob Satisfaction Introduction Definitions of Organisational Culture	tyle 73 73 74
3.1 3.2 3.3	er 3: Organisational Culture, Subculture, Leadership Stock Satisfaction	tyle 73 74 78 89
3.1 3.2 3.3 3.4	er 3: Organisational Culture, Subculture, Leadership Stob Satisfaction Introduction Definitions of Organisational Culture Conceptual Frameworks of Organisational Culture Functional Aspects of Organisational Culture	tyle 73 74 78 89 94
3.1 3.2 3.3 3.4 3.5	er 3: Organisational Culture, Subculture, Leadership Stob Satisfaction Introduction Definitions of Organisational Culture Conceptual Frameworks of Organisational Culture Functional Aspects of Organisational Culture Organisational Culture and Subcultures	tyle 73 74 78 89 94
3.1 3.2 3.3 3.4 3.5 3.6	er 3: Organisational Culture, Subculture, Leadership Stob Satisfaction Introduction Definitions of Organisational Culture Conceptual Frameworks of Organisational Culture Functional Aspects of Organisational Culture Organisational Culture and Subcultures Organisational Climate and Organisational Culture	tyle 73 74 78 94 94 99

3.10	Leadership and Nursing 120		
3.11	The Concept of Job Satisfaction		
3.12	Job Satisfaction and Nursing		
3.13	The Relationship between Organisational Culture and Leadership		
	Style		
3.14	Relationship between Organisational Culture and Job Satisfaction, and		
	between Leadership Style and Job Satisfaction140		
3.15	Relationship between Job Satisfaction and Organisational		
	Commitment		
3.16	Differences between the Hospital Groups		
3.17	Summary147		
Chapt	Chapter 4: The Empirical Research: Overview, Aims and		
Hypot	heses 149		
4.1	Introduction		
4.2	Overview of the Questionnaire Based Study150		
4.3	Aims of the study		
4.4	Research Hypotheses		
4.5	Summary		

Chapt	er 5: Research Methodology and Validity Issues 163	
5.1	Introduction	
5.2	Research Design	
5.3	Instruments for Survey Questionnaire	
5.4	Piloting of the Questionnaire	
5.5	Sampling and Data Collection	
5.6	Analysis of Data	
5.7	Validity Issues	
5.8	Summary	
Chapt	er 6: Results of the Study187	
6.1	Introduction	
6.2	Results of Questionnaire Survey	
6.3	Comparison of Hospital Groups	
6.4	Evaluation of Hypotheses in this Study	
6.5	Summary	
. Chapter 7: Interviews and Observations: Data Collection and		
Result	żs225	
7.1	Introduction	
7.2	Collection of Qualitative Data	
7.3	Data Analysis	

7.4	Results of Qualitative Analysis	.230
7.5	Summary	.239
Chapt	er 8: Discussion and Conclusion	240
8.1	Introduction	.240
8.2	Discussion	.240
8.3	Limitations of the Study	.248
8.4	Key Contribution of the Thesis	.249
8.5	Possible Future Direction for Research	.251
8.6	Conclusion	.253
References 255		
Apper	ndices	290

Acknowledgement

More people than I can possibly hope to thank here have contributed to the completion of this thesis.

I wish to express my special appreciation to my supervisor Professor Serge Mukhi. Without his inspiration, support and encouragement, this work would never have come to fruition. My very special thanks go to Dr. John Crawford, my co-supervisor, who served as my adviser and mentor. I am extremely grateful for his support and enthusiasm. He was always available whenever I needed him.

My thanks also go to Professor George Strauss, of the Institute of Industrial Relations, University of California, Berkeley, who gave me his time to discuss issues in relation to my thesis during my visit to Berkeley.

My appreciation also extends to Denise Mapley and Ginger Mudd, who generously took time and effort to proof read the manuscript. Also, I am grateful to my colleagues who have given me the encouragement during these years.

Finally, I owe a great deal of thanks to my family and friends for their support and patience during periods of frustration and flagging motivation, and for sharing my happiness when things were progressing well.

October 1997

Peter Lok

Sydney, Australia

Abstract

Despite the large number of studies that have examined the antecedents of organisational commitment, the investigation of the influence of organisational culture and subculture on commitment is noticeably absent. The aim of this thesis is to examine the effects of both organisational culture and subculture on organisational commitment. Other measures which have been shown to be related to either organisational commitment or organisational culture are also included in the study. These are leadership style, job satisfaction and demographic variables such as age, education, years in position and years of experience.

Recently, multivariate studies have examined the causal relationships between a variety of different variables and organisational commitment, and a number of these have concluded that the effects of these variables on organisational commitment were mainly mediated by job satisfaction. The data gathered in the present study is examined to determine if it is consistent with job satisfaction fulfilling such a mediating role between commitment and the other variables in the study. Also, a multi-dimensional measure of job satisfaction is employed in

the present study and the effects of the different job satisfaction components on commitment are investigated.

The subjects used in this study were nurses working in different hospital settings. A questionnaire survey was used which was complemented by semi-structured interviews. A total of 398 questionnaires were distributed to nurses in seven hospitals, from which 251 completed questionnaires were returned (63.5% response rate). The sample was obtained from three general public hospitals, two private hospitals and two psychiatric hospitals. Correlational and regression analyses were used to investigate the relationships between nurses' commitment to their wards and the other variables measured in the study. A causal model of commitment was developed using a multiple regression analysis in which the role of job satisfaction in mediating the causal link between commitment and the other variables was explored.

It was found that organisational subculture had a greater impact on commitment than organisational culture. Innovative and supportive subcultures had a positive effect on commitment and a bureaucratic subculture had a negative effect on commitment. The leadership style variable, consideration, also exerted a relatively strong influence on commitment when compared with other variables included in the study. The results of this study also revealed that

the job satisfaction dimensions with the strongest associations with commitment were the control, professionalism and interaction dimensions, which represent intrinsic factors of job satisfaction or those related to higher-order needs in Maslow's (1943) hierarchy. Age showed a direct positive influence on commitment. However, the level of education, years in position and years of clinical experience failed to showed any impact on commitment.

Thus, the results of this study are not in agreement with causal models (such as that proposed by Williams and Hazer 1986), in which the influence of various antecedents on commitment are totally mediated via their influence on job satisfaction. The effect of the culture and leadership style variables on commitment was found to be significantly reduced, but not totally eliminated, after statistically controlling for the job satisfaction variables.

Finally, in relation to the different hospital groups, the results showed that private hospitals had the strongest bureaucratic ward culture when compared to general public and psychiatric hospitals. The most innovative ward culture was found in general public hospitals and the most supportive ward culture was found in psychiatric hospitals. These findings were contrary to expected outcomes.

Key words: organisational culture, subculture, leadership style, job satisfaction, organisational commitment

Table of Figures

Figure 1:	Overview structure of this study	35
Figure 2:	Williams and Hazer model (1986)	60
Figure 3:	Price and Mueller model (1981a)	60
Figure 4:	Mckinsey's 7-s framework	79
Figure 5:	Johnson's cultural web	81
Figure 6:	Three level approach to organisational culture and its interaction	
	(Schein 1985a)	84
Figure 7:	Schneider's layers of organisational culture	
	(Schneider 1990, p.157)	85
Figure 8:	Ballantine diagram	204
Figure 9:	Path analytic model of commitment2	212

List of Tables

Table 1:	Definitions of organisational commitment
Table 2:	Antecedents of commitment discussed by Mathieu and Zajac (1990)
	and studies which have examined these antecedents
Table 3:	Organisational commitment studies with antecedents not listed by
	Mathieu and Zajac (1990)51
Table 4:	Antecedents used in nursing commitment studies63
Table 5:	Underlying dimensions of organisational commitment (from: Barge
	and Schlueter 1988, p. 129)67
Table 6:	Organisational culture definitions
Table 7:	Hofstede's four types of organisational culture (Pheysey 1993,
	p.24)92
Table 8:	Different approaches to leadership (Schermerhorn et al. 1994,
	p. 497)111
Table 9:	Factors influencing nurses' job satisfaction
Table 10:	Reliability estimates of instruments used in previous studies 166
Table 11:	Correlations with commitment and reliability estimates of variables
	obtained in pilotting the questionnaire
Table 12:	Demographic summary

Table 13:	Cronbach alpha reliability estimates, means and standard deviations
	of variables used in the study (n = 251)
Table 14:	Correlations with commitment
Table 15:	Correlations between the same categories of hospital and ward
	cultures
Table 16:	Correlations between ward and hospital culture variables, and
	leadership style variables
Table 17:	Correlations between job satisfaction and leadership style
	variables
Table 18:	Correlations between job satisfaction and ward and hospital
	culture 199
Table 19:	Multiple regression of commitment on different sets of independent
	variables (columns 1-8)201
Table 20:	Multiple regression of job satisfaction variables (JSINT, JSPROF
	and JSCONTRL) on remaining independent variables207
Table 21:	Direct and indirect effects on commitment
Table 22:	Anovas (univariate) with hospital group as independent
	variables
Table 23	Means for various hospital groups
Table 24	Paired differences on variables between general, psychiatric and
	private hospital categories

Table 25:	Open-ended interview questions	227
Table 26:	Extracts of positive and negative statements in relation to the six	
	pre-set themes	231
Table 27:	Simple content analysis of interview data	233

List of Appendices

1.	Typology of elements of organisational culture	.29
2.	Typology of publications on organisational culture	.294
3.	Questionnaire survey	.295
4	Correlations of variables	304