

Policy Coalitions in the Global Greenhouse:

Contestation and Collaboration in
Global Climate Change Public Policy



Thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy, 2009

Faculty of the Arts and Social Sciences

University of Technology, Sydney

Ian M McGregor

BA (Hons) University of Strathclyde, MSc (London Business School)

Abstract

It is more than 20 years since 1985, when world climate and atmospheric scientists first issued an authoritative warning of the danger of global warming. In 1988, scientists, environmentalists and politicians from 48 countries endorsed the Toronto Declaration to address global warming that called for a twenty percent worldwide reduction in CO₂ emissions by the year 2005 leading to an eventual fifty percent reduction. Contestation and collaboration in the global climate change public policy process, involving a wide range of actors, has continued since then.

Two organisations were founded in 1989 by non-state actors on opposite sides of the climate policy debate. These were the Global Climate Coalition (GCC), which was established by a range of US business interests, and Climate Action Network (CAN) established by a range of environmental and scientific non-governmental organisations. The thesis documents, analyses and compares how each organisation was formed, organised and developed. It reviews how GCC and CAN enabled more effective national and transnational advocacy and how they fostered opposing policy coalitions on climate policy. The respective approaches are assessed, evaluated and contrasted as each sought to gain support for their opposing policy positions in the global climate change policy process.

The research uses a neo-Gramscian theoretical perspective and develops and applies an analytical framework focused on policy coalitions of state and non-state actors to investigate the role that non-state actors played in the global climate policy process. GCC and CAN played major roles within opposing policy coalitions that became particularly important in shaping the outcome of the global and national climate policy processes. The thesis focuses on the role of GCC and CAN and their associated policy coalitions in influencing the framing, developing, implementation and review of global climate policy. It examines the global climate change policy process through this analytical lens of contestation between policy coalitions from the creation of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change in 1988 to the first Meeting of the Parties of the ratified Kyoto Protocol in 2005.

The thesis assesses the analytical framework and concludes by identifying critical issues that the current global public policy processes have encountered in developing and implementing effective global climate change public policy.

For Marilena and Andrew and all the other members of the future generations for whom we need to bequeath a healthy planet.

Certificate of Authorship/Originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Candidate

Ian McGregor

Acknowledgements

At a recent seminar, the presenter used a roller-coaster ride to illustrate the process of completing a PhD thesis with lots of ups and downs and steep learning curves. The only people who have been with me on the whole ride are my family, who have been supportive in many ways. I would particularly acknowledge my partner, Kate, who has not only helped me on the journey but also read and help with editing some chapters of the thesis.

My PhD research commenced at the UTS Institute for Sustainable Futures (ISF) in 2002 and was initially focused on Indicators of Ecologically Sustainable Development. In that period, I was greatly assisted in becoming familiar with Academic Research by my supervisor, Cynthia Mitchell and my co-supervisor, Juliet Willetts. My fellow ISF research students, Chris Reidy, Chris Reardon, Dick Clarke, Kumi Abeysuriya, Suzanne Grob, Simon Fane, Michelle Zeibots and others all helped get the roller-coaster ride started. My initial research concluded that there were well established Indicators of Ecologically Sustainable Development, however, that those that indicated our current development path was unsustainable were largely being ignored. This re-directed my PhD research into the area of Political Economy which was outside ISF's expertise so I had to find a new supervisor and faculty and research question within UTS.

Fortunately, I found James Goodman as a supervisor interested in my new research area in the School of Social and Political Change in the Faculty of Arts and Social Science at UTS. I would like to particularly thank James for the support, encouragement, advice and interest given by him during this Doctoral Research Sydney. His good humour, patience, dedication and thoughtful critique have been invaluable to me. I would also like to particularly thank Jeremy Walker who was Acting Supervisor while James was on leave in the second half of 2009.

There are many colleagues, fellow research students and others who have helped me on the roller-coaster ride and I would also like to acknowledge their support. In

particular during the final year, we formed a group of three PhD students who read and critiqued each other's work and the support in that group of Melissa Edwards and Marie dela Rama have been invaluable. I would also like to acknowledge the support of Paul Baer of Ecoequity in acting as a sounding board on a whole range of climate change issues.

I also sincerely thank the interview participants who gave their time and thoughts generously for no immediate return. Their experiences and insights helped shape the direction of my thinking and their preparedness to participate informed and encouraged my research. I should also particularly acknowledge the UNFCCC Secretariat, particularly the NGO Liaison Office and its Library for the assistance they made available. The illustration on the cover page of the thesis is from a flyer for a Carbon Trading Seminar organised in September 2009 by the Australian Financial Markets Association.

Contents

Abstract	i
Certificate Of Authorship/Originality	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
List of Figures	ix
List of Tables.....	x
Relevant Publications.....	xi
Acronyms	xiii
Chapter 1 – Introduction.....	1
Introduction.....	1
Global Governance and Global Public Policy	1
Global Environmental Change.....	3
Global Climate Change	5
The Problem of Global Warming.....	13
The Global Public Policy Response to Climate Change	17
Research Questions	23
Overview of the Study	25
Chapter 2 – Theoretical Frameworks and Methodology	27
Introduction.....	27
Global Governance.....	29
International Regimes	42
Theories of International Regimes	51
Theoretical Framework	63

Global Climate Change Public Policy - Framework for Analysis	65
Global Public Policy-Making Processes	77
Research Design and Methodology	82
Chapter 3 – Organisational Characteristics of CAN and GCC.....	87
Introduction.....	87
CAN and GCC - Formation and Initial Objectives	92
Comparison of Organisational Norms and Values.....	105
Membership of the Network NGOs – CAN and GCC.....	114
Organisational Management and Leadership.....	126
Conclusion: CAN, GCC and Policy Coalitions	139
Chapter 4: Policy Coalitions and the UNFCCC.....	144
Introduction.....	144
Agenda Setting.....	146
Global Public Policy Development.....	154
Policy Coalitions and Developing the UNFCCC.....	164
Assessment of the UNFCCC.....	171
Ratification, Implementation and Review.....	175
Conclusion: Fields of Contestation and the UNFCCC	180
Chapter 5 – Policy Coalitions and the Kyoto Protocol.....	187
Introduction.....	187
Emergence of the Ecological Modernisation Policy Coalition	188
Global Public Policy Development.....	191
US National Climate Change Policy Development	199

Policy Coalitions and Developing the Kyoto Protocol	206
Assessment of the Kyoto Protocol	216
Developing the Details of Global Climate Change Policy	221
Ratification of the Kyoto Protocol	226
The Effectiveness of the Kyoto Protocol	239
Conclusion: Fields of Contestation and the Kyoto Protocol.....	243
Chapter 6 - Conclusion	254
Introduction	254
Hegemony and Counter-Hegemony in the Global Polity	255
CAN, GCC and the Global Climate Policy Process	258
Hegemony, Counter-Hegemony and Global Climate Change Public Policy	260
Failure to Develop Effective Global Climate Change Policy	264
Developing Effective Global Climate Change Policy	272
Global Climate Change Public Policy Process and Policy Coalitions.....	273
Policy Coalitions Model and Fields of Contestation	279
Strengths and Weaknesses of the Theoretical Framework	283
The Implications and Limitations of the Research	285
Questions and Directions for Further Research	287
Bibliography	288
Appendix 1: List of Interviewees	316
Appendix 2: Groups and Individuals Associated with Exxon Mobil's Disinformation Campaign	318
Appendix 3: GCC's Action Agenda for the 21 st Century from GCC's website	321
Appendix 4: 1996 IPCC letter to the GCC and the Climate Council.....	324

Appendix 5: CAN Regional Offices 2006	327
Appendix 6: CAN –Executive Summary of Agreed Position before COP6 in 2000..	332
Appendix 7: 14 Influential US Conservative Think Tanks.....	333

List of Figures

Figure 1: Major Actors in the Global Climate Change Policy Domain.....	9
Figure 2: Global warming and the safe-climate zone	14
Figure 3: Developing Countries' Dilemma.....	19
Figure 4: The Advocacy Coalition Framework	68
Figure 5: Policy contestation between advocacy coalitions:initial stages	70
Figure 6: Overview of Contestation between Policy Coalitions on Climate Policy	72
Figure 7: The International Environmental Policy-Making Process.....	78
Figure 8: Major Fields of Policy Contestation within the Global Climate Change Public Policy Process	80
Figure 9: IPCC Report Process	151
Figure 10: The System of Institutions of the UNFCCC following COP1	193
Figure 11: Anti-Kyoto press advertising prior to US signing in 1997 primarily funded by the members of the Global Climate Coalition.....	204
Figure 12: George and Abdullah.....	238

List of Tables

Table 1: Six types of global governance	37
Table 2: Typology of Regimes.....	48
Table 3: Market Enabling and Regulatory Regimes	49
Table 4: Table 4: Six Major Fields of Policy Contestation within the Global Climate Change Public Policy Process	81

Relevant Publications

Some of the research reported in this thesis was originally published elsewhere. I have listed relevant research publications arising from my PhD research below.

Refereed Publications

McGregor, I. 2008, 'Warming as usual - Radical change to international political economy required to address climate change', *Contemporary Issues For Heterodox Economics: Proceedings Refereed Papers Seventh Australian Society of Heterodox Economists Conference 2008*, Sydney, Australia, 8-9 December 2008

McGregor, I. 2008, Organising to Influence the Global Politics of Climate Change. *Australian and New Zealand Academy of Management (ANZAM) – Refereed Conference Proceedings*, Auckland, New Zealand, November 2008

McGregor, I. 2007, Limiting Global Greenhouse Gas Emissions - An Urgent and Overdue Ecological Economics Measure on Climate Change. *2007 ANZSEE Conference "Re-inventing Sustainability: A climate for change", ANZ Society of Ecological Economics – Refereed Conference Proceedings*, Noosa, Australia, July 2007

McGregor, I. 2006, Power, profits and the planet - fossil fuel corporations putting profits before planet - promoting burning as usual! *Essays in Heterodox Economics: Proceedings of Fifth Australian Society of Heterodox Economists Conference, Society of Heterodox Economists*, Sydney, Australia, December 2006

McGregor, I. 2006, Corporate Capitalism: A barrier to be overcome to enable Ecologically and Socially Sustainable Development. *Portal: A Journal of Multidisciplinary International Studies*, 3 (1), 1-26.

McGregor, I. 2004, An integral ecology of commerce to avoid dystopia. *Australian and New Zealand Academy of Management (ANZAM) – Refereed Conference Proceedings*, Dunedin, New Zealand, December 2004

McGregor, I. 2003, Is Australia progressing towards ecologically sustainable development. *Environmental Health*, 3, 31-45.

Conference Papers – Abstract Refereed

McGregor, I. 2008, Contention, Civil Society and Climate Change. *International Institute of Sociology Meeting*, Budapest, Hungary, June 2008

McGregor, I. 2008, Climate Change - A Major Failure of Environmental Management. *Invited presentation at Environmental Management: Workshop - More of the Same or Time for Change?*, Cottbus, Germany, January 2008

McGregor, I. 2008, Warming as Usual - Radical Change to International Political Economy Required to Address Climate Change. *Union for Radical Political Economics at Allied Social Science Association Conference*, New Orleans, Louisiana, January 2008

McGregor, I. 2006, Globalisation and Global Warming: role of two Non-Governmental Organisation Coalitions in development of international public policy. *International Sociological Association World Congress*, Durban, South Africa, July 2006

Acronyms

ACF	Advocacy Coalition Framework
AGBM	Ad Hoc Group on the Berlin Mandate
AGGG	Advisory Group on Greenhouse Gases
AOSIS	Alliance of Small Island States
API	American Petroleum Institute (a BINGO)
BINGO	Business and Industry Non-Government Organisation
BTU	British Thermal Unit
CAN	Climate Action Network
CANA	Climate Action Network Australia
CANLA	Climate Action Network Latin America
CANSA	Climate Action Network South Asia
CANSEA	Climate Action Network South East Asia
CIEL	Center for International Environmental Law
CO ₂	Carbon Dioxide
CNE	Climate Network Europe
COP	Conference of the Parties to the UNFCCC
EDF	Environmental Defense Fund (a US ENGO)
ENGO	Environmental Non-Government Organisation
EPA	Environmental Protection Agency (US Government Agency)
EU	European Union (includes what historically was the EC- European Community)
FOE	Friends of the Earth
FIELD	Foundation for International Environmental Law and Development
G8	Group of eight most major economies in the world
G77	Group of Developing Countries (now more than 77)
GCC	Global Climate Coalition
GDRs	Greenhouse Development Rights
GHGs	Greenhouse Gas(es)
GNP	Gross National Product
ICCR	Interfaith Commission on Corporate Responsibility
ICSU	International Council of Scientific Unions

IETA	International Emissions Trading Association
INC	International Negotiating Committee (on Climate Change)
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
IR	International Relations
MOP	Meeting of the Parties to the Kyoto Protocol
NASA	National Aeronautics and Space Administration
NRDC	Natural Resources Defense Council (a US ENGO)
NGO	Non-Government Organisation
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (major developed economies)
OPEC	Organisation of Petroleum Exporting Countries
SEI	Stockholm Environment Institute
SWCC	Second World Climate Conference
UK	United Kingdom
UN	United Nations
UNCED	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
UNEP	United Nations Environment Program
UNFCCC	UN Framework Convention on Climate Change
US	United States of America
USCAN	US Climate Action Network
WBCSD	World Business Council for Sustainable Development
WEF	World Economic Forum
WMO	World Meteorological Organisation
WWF	World Wide Fund for Nature also known as World Wildlife Fund (an international ENGO)