# The Determinants of Commercial Property Market Performance

#### **David M Higgins**

Bachelor of Science in Building Surveying, Leicester Polytechnic Master of Commerce (Land Economy), University of Western Sydney

> A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of Doctor of Philosophy of the University of Technology, Sydney December, 2000

#### **CERTIFICATE**

I certify that this thesis has not already been submitted for any degree and is not being submitted as part of candidature for any other degree.

I also certify that this thesis has been written by me and that any help that I have received in preparing this thesis, and all sources used, have been acknowledged in this thesis.

Production Note:
Signature removed prior to publication.

Signature of Candidate

#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

There are many people who have helped and guided me though my doctoral thesis at the University of Technology, Sydney. I would firstly like to thank Dr. Jacob Oluwoye, for his overall support and particularly his assistance with the continual challenges I faced with the doctoral research process. I also owe a special debt of gratitude to Professor Dennis Lenard who provided the impetus for the study and to Dr. Merv Fiedler for his encouragement and constructive advice.

In preparation of the doctoral thesis, I acknowledge the assistance given by Carey Martin for her expertise in proof reading.

I have been very fortunate to receive the R.L. Werner postgraduate scholarship from the University of Technology, Sydney. This financial support has made the doctorate achievable and I am truly grateful.

I also want to express my appreciation to the many Sydney property researchers who gave their time and provided property market information and data. I trust this doctoral thesis will assist in future research and make the property market puzzle easier to understand.

This work would not have been possible without my family and friends. To all, I thank you for your encouragement, patience and moral support. It has been immense and appreciated.

David Higgins

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES	Vii
LIST OF TABLES	ix
ABSTRACT	xii
Chapter ONE - INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Foundation for the research	1
1.2 Statement of the problem	3
1.3 Purpose and objectives	4
1.4 Research framework	6
1.4.1 Scope	7
1.4.2 Limitations	9
1.5 Contribution to knowledge	10
1.6 Structure of thesis	11
Chapter TWO - A REVIEW OF LITERATURE: PROPERTY FORECAST MODELS, DETERMINANTS AND FORECAST THEORY	14
2.1 Introduction	14
2.2 Fundamentals of forecasting	16
2.2.1 Forecasting steps	16
2.2.2 Forecasting techniques	21
2.2.3 Accuracy measurements	24
2.3 Property market data	26
2.3.1 Definition and classification	26
2.3.2 Adequacy and accuracy	29
2.4 Property market determinants	32
2.4.1 Property market structure	32
2.4.2 Conceptual model of property market determinants	34

2.5 Property market models and forecasts	39
2.5.1 Office models	40
2.5.2 Industrial models	47
2.5.3 Retail models	51
2.6 Summary	55
Chapter THREE - CURRENT STATUS OF PROPERTY FORECASTING: A STUDY OF PROPERTY ORGANISATIONS' APPROACH TO PROPERTY FORECASTING	57
3.1 Introduction	57
3.2 Research design	58
3.3 Survey results and discussion	59
3.3.1 Property organisations and range of forecasts	59
3.3.2 Property forecasting techniques	62
3.3.3 Selected property market determinants	64
3.3.4 Evaluation of property forecasts	68
3.4 Summary	70
Chapter FOUR - PROPERTY FORECASTING DESIGN: KEY ISSUES AND DEVELOPMENT OF THE PROPERTY FORECAST MODEL	71
4.1 Introduction	71
4.2 Issues in the application of a commercial property market model	72
4.3 Development of the property forecast model	
4.4 Summary	78
Chapter FIVE - THE PROPERTY FORECAST MODEL AN EVALUATION OF LONG -TERM FORECAST VALUES	79
5.1 Introduction	79
5,2 Data	80
5.3 Research Methodology	82

Table of contents

5.4 Results	84
5.5 Analysis of property forecast values	89
5.5.1 Accuracy of property forecast values	91
5.5.2 Accuracy of macroeconomic forecast values	98
5.6 Summary	102
Chapter SIX - ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION: THE PROPERTY FORECAST MODEL, DETERMINANTS AND THE AGENTS OF CHANGE	105
6.1 Introduction	105
6.2 Factors influencing macroeconomic forecasts	106
6.2.1 Economic shocks	106
6.2.2 Structural changes	107
6.2.3 Analysis of macroeconomic forecast error	109
6.3 The agents of change	110
6.3.1 Office market	112
6.3.2 Industrial market	113
6.3.3 Retail market	115
6.4 Structural market research	116
6.4.1 Macroeconomic influences	119
6.4.2 Microeconomic influences	120
6.5 Summary	121
Chapter SEVEN - STRUCTURAL MARKET RESEARCH: THE DETERMINANTS OF SPACE DEMAND AND EXPLANATION OF POLICY IMPLICATIONS	122
7.1 Introduction	122
7.2 Research design	123
7.3 Survey results and discussion of issues	124
7.3.1 Profile of the new space occupiers	126
7.3.2 Aspects of the new occupied space	132

Table of contents

7.4 New space demand - Degree of importance index	136
7.4.1 Macroeconomic influences	137
7.4.2 Microeconomic influences	140
7.5 Policy implications of structural market research	144
7.5.1 Property forecast determinants	144
7.5.2 Applications for structural market research	146
7.6 Summary	148
Chapter EIGHT - SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	151
8.1 Introduction	151
8.2 Summary of research	152
8.3 Conclusions	157
8.4 Recommendations	160
8.5 Areas for further research	162
REFERENCES	168

#### **APPENDICES A - Selected Commercial Property Markets**

- (i) Sydney prime CBD office market
- (ii) Sydney prime industrial market
- (iii) NSW regional shopping centres

#### **APPENDICES B - Questionnaires**

- (i) Australian property organisations
- (ii) New space occupiers

#### **APPENDICES C - Refereed Papers**

- (i) Current status of forecasting the performance of Australian commercial property markets
- (ii) The causes and patterns of new space demand in Australian commercial property markets
- (iii) Influences on Australian organisations' new space demand

### LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1	Flow chart of the research framework	6
Figure 1.2	Thesis outline	13
Figure 2.1	Steps in the forecasting process	17
Figure 2.2	Summary of forecasting techniques	21
Figure 2.3	Ex post and ex ante forecasting periods	24
Figure 2.4	Data flow and requirements of main property participants	27
Figure 2.5	Measures of commercial property performance	28
Figure 2.6	Composition of commercial property market databases	30
Figure 2.7	Commercial property market driving forces and adjustments	33
Figure 2.8	The relationship of space, capital and commercial property markets	34
Figure 2.9	Characteristics of a dynamic building cycle	37
Figure 2.10	Office market model flow chart	38
Figure 2.11	Commercial property model: space, property and capital market determinants	39
Figure 3.1	Property organisations' forecast techniques five-year forecasts	63
Figure 3.2	Property organisations' selection of principal property forecast determinants for the past five years	66
Figure 3.3	Property organisations' that amend/qualify economic forecast data	68
Figure 3.4	Property organisations' examination of competitors' forecasts	69
Figure 4.1	Model of office rent determinants	74
Figure 4.2	Model of industrial rent determinants	75
Figure 4.3	Model of retail rent determinants	76
Figure 4.4	Model of commercial property yield determinants	76
Figure 5.1	Comparison of property forecast model predicted to actual office rents	86

Figure 5.2	Comparison of property forecast model predicted to actual office yields	88
Figure 5.3	Office rent model forecasts: December 1994, 1995, 1996	92
Figure 5.4	Office yield model forecasts: December 1994, 1995, 1996	96
Figure 5.5	Gross domestic product forecasts: December 1994, 1995, 1996	100
Figure 5.6	90-day bank bill forecasts: December 1994, 1995, 1996	10
Figure 6.1	The changes in office space layout	112
Figure 6.2	Industrial property's and the retail supply chain	114
Figure 6.3	Influences on organisations' new space decision	118
Figure 7.1	Australian mergers and acquisitions	131
Figure 7.2	Scattergram of time searching by lease terms	135
Figure 7.3	Proposed commercial property forecast system	145
Figure 8.1	Proposed commercial property forecast system	159

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1	Summary of leading Australian property markets at December 1998	8
Table 2.1	Comparison of forecasting methods applying to commercial property markets	23
Table 2.2	Office rent models	42
Table 2.3	Office rental income models	44
Table 2.4	Office yield, capital and total return models	46
Table 2.5	Industrial rent and income models	48
Table 2.6	Industrial yield, capital and total return models	50
Table 2.7	Retail rent and income models	53
Table 2.8	Retail yield, capital and total return models	54
Table 3.1	Property forecast organisations and their industry categories	60
Table 3.2	Property organisations and the years forecasting	60
Table 3.3	Property organisations and the frequency of forecasts	61
Table 3.4	Property organisations and the range of property forecasts	61
Table 3.5	Range of property forecasts by time periods	62
Table 3.6	Property organisations' principal determinants for net effective rent forecasts	64
Table 3.7	Property organisations' principal determinants for equivalent yields forecasts	65
Table 3.8	Property organisations' source of economic projections	67
Table 4.1	Summary of considerations in property forecasting	72
Table 5.1	Gross domestic product forecasts as at December 1994	81
Table 5.2	Correlation of Australian and New South Wales macroeconomic activity: 1974-1994	82
Table 5.3	Test for data stationarity	84

List of tables

Table 5.4	Single equation regression model for commercial property rents	83
Table 5.5	Single equation regression model for commercial property yields	87
Table 5.6	Comparison of forecast to actual commercial property rents	91
Table 5.7	Computation of Theil's U value three year office rent forecast at December 1994	93
Table 5.8	Commercial property rent forecast model - forecast accuracy	94
Table 5.9	Comparison of forecast to actual commercial property yields	95
Table 5.10	Computation of Theil's U value three year office yield forecast at December 1994	97
Table 5.11	Commercial property yield forecast model - forecast accuracy	97
Table 5.12	Comparison of forecast to actual macroeconomic indicators	99
Table 5.13	Forecast accuracy of macroeconomic forecasts	101
Table 6.1	Unexpected economic shocks on the Australian economy	107
Table 6.2	Characteristics of Fordism and post-Fordism	108
Table 6.3	Accuracy of macroeconomic forecasts in year 1, year 2 and year 3	109
Table 6.4	Shopping centre demand generation themes	115
Table 6.5	Components of structured space demand research	117
Table 6.6	Political factors on organisations' space decisions	120
Table 7.1	Summary of survey respondents	125
Table 7.2	Profile of respondents by floor area	125
Table 7.3	Profile of respondents by industry category	126
Table 7.4	Organisations' structure by floor area	127
Table 7.5	Organisations' structure by industry category	127
Table 7.6	Organisations' operational structure	128
Table 7.7	Organisations' stage in the business cycle	130

List of tables xi

Table 7.8	Spaces demand by organisations' as part of a recent merger or acquisition	130
Table 7.9	Space demand by principal activity	132
Table 7.10	Space demand relative to distance from relocation or existing space	133
Table 7.11	Time spent searching for new space	133
Table 7.12	Length of new space leases (excluding renewals)	135
Table 7.13	Influence of macroeconomic categories on organisations' decision for new space	137
Table 7.14	Influence of macroeconomic factors on organisations' decision for new space	139
Table 7.15	Influence of microeconomic categories on organisations' decision for new space	141
Table 7.16	Influence of microeconomic factors on organisations' decision for new space	142
Table 7.17	Summary of the leading features of organisations' space demand	147
Table 7.18	Leading microeconomic influences on organisations' decision for new space	148

## The Determinants of Commercial Property Market Performance

#### **ABSTRACT**

The purpose of this thesis is to critically evaluate the determinants for modelling and forecasting long-term performance in office, industrial and retail property markets and to suggest ways to improve commercial property forecasting. The research examined the three-year forecast accuracy of the most prominent property forecast model and associated determinants, and investigated the factors influencing current commercial property decisions in the rapidly changing economic environment with the major advances in globalisation, technological innovation and financial deregulation.

Forecasts are essential when making major commercial property decisions and have led to considerable emphasis being placed on formal property forecast models to determine future long-term property performance. Both the literature review and a survey of Australian property forecast organisations showed that explicit property forecasting is a relatively new predictive tool within the property industry. In addition, there appear to be insufficient theoretical considerations to present econometric theory and long-term forecast accuracy.

The information search revealed the preference in published studies for the single equation property forecast model. Accordingly, a single equation model was constructed for rents and yields in three prominent Australian property markets: Sydney CBD prime office, Sydney metropolitan prime industrial and New South Wales regional shopping centres. The property model forecasts started at December 1994, 1995 and 1996 and the forecast input determinants were an average of leading published macroeconomic forecasts from those periods. The accuracy of the property forecast model was measured by how close the three-year semi-annual forecast values were to the actual values Mean Absolute Percentage Error test (MAPE) and to the forecast values of a simple forecast model (Theil U value test).

Abstract xiii

The results showed that half the property forecast values were inaccurate when related to actual values and there was no consistency in the underlying relationship. The majority of property forecast values were also less accurate than the forecast values from the naïve forecast model. Significantly, the overall random pattern of error showed no evidence that historical time-series length and key statistical tests determined the predictive capacity of the property forecast model. The accuracy of the property forecast model process should be established on the out-of-sample analysis.

The success of the property forecast model thus appeared to depend on the forecasts of the selected macroeconomic determinants. These were then tested for forecast accuracy and revealed a consistently large forecast error over the three-year forecast periods used in this study, illustrating their limited capacity to foresee structural economic change.

Such economic changes, connected to advances in the modern economy, are reshaping business organisations, the fundamentals of space demand and, significantly, commercial property market performance. A survey of the same three markets - Sydney CBD prime office, Sydney metropolitan prime industrial and New South Wales regional shopping centres, showed that demand for space is more than a function of the macro economy, with each market involving distinct organisational, space and decision-making considerations. Market determinants such as the dominance of multi nationals, the impact of mergers and acquisitions in the office market and the relatively short time (generally less than six months) organisations spend searching for new space are absent in current property forecast research.

One procedure to determine an organisation's approach and requirement for space is to measure and benchmark the range and importance of property decision influences. The space selection process indicates the significance of diverse microeconomic characteristics, and the distinct impact of new technology on office space demand. Elsewhere the macroeconomic factors displayed some similarities across the office, industrial and retail markets.

Abstract xiv

This thesis demonstrates that structural economic change, and the influences on space demand, are important determinants when forecasting long-term commercial property market performance. It recommends that these should be included in future long-term property forecast systems, ensuring that property forecast models and selected determinants are based on post-evaluation analysis. Furthermore, and in a different medium, it suggests that structured market research must be used to identify contemporary factors and circumstances influencing the commercial property landscape. The patterns that emerge in this process are central to the property decision process and far more comprehensive than those identified in previous property forecast literature.