

**VIRTUAL MARKETS: THE APPLICATION OF
AGENT-BASED MODELING TO MARKETING SCIENCE**

by

Roger A. Parker

Submitted to the School of Marketing, Faculty of Business in fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

at the

UNIVERSITY OF TECHNOLOGY SYDNEY

September 2010

© 2010 Roger A. Parker. All rights reserved.

Permission is herewith granted the University of Technology Sydney to circulate and to have copied for non-commercial purposes at its discretion, the above title upon the request of individuals and institutions.

Certification of Authorship and Originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of the requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text. I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Production Note:

Signature removed prior to publication.

Author: _____

Roger A. Parker, UTS ID # 

26 September 2010

Dedication

To Anita. Without her love and encouragement, this dissertation would not exist. And, quite literally, neither would I.

Abstract

Advances in any science ultimately depend on the creation of instruments that can create observations from which theories can be hypothesized and tested. This dissertation proposes that significant advances in marketing science can be realized with the engagement of the advanced computational science technique of agent-based modeling. To support this proposition, the methodology is examined from first principles to concrete implementation. The ontological and epistemological bases for agent-based modeling are developed, and the evolutionary science paradigm as it applies to marketing (for which the method is most useful), is reinforced with extensive analysis of evolved universal human behaviors, especially behavior relevant to marketing. The concept of the narrative framework is then posited. The primary property of the framework is the central role of choice as an expression of value and resource allocation. This framework then explicates the notion of virtual market, and an appropriate definition of agent derived. The computing requirements and skills needed to actually building a virtual market are also proscribed. Then a detailed, operational example of a virtual market is laid out. Called AirVM, it portrays the dynamics of the market for passenger air travel by simulating the product definition and ticket purchasing process for every passenger travelling on every regularly scheduled commercial flight in the world over a week time period – over 40,000,000 passengers flying on thousands of flights, offered by hundreds of carriers. The synthetic populations of passengers (customers) and airlines (sellers) have empirically-derived distributions of salient properties, called incidence distributions, which are described in detail with empirical data to support their formulation and parameter estimation. The computing logic and samples of the interface are presented, and the system critiqued using appropriate agent-based modeling criteria. The major contributions of the research are the verification of the ontological suitability of agent-based modeling to marketing science, the empirical confirmation of the evolutionary basis for marketing behavior, the conceptual structure for construction of agent-based models in market research, and the proscription of how to construct a virtual market, illustrated with a detailed example. There are also several contributions to the airline passenger industry that emerge from the work. Finally, the dissertation contributes another example of the application of the technique to the burgeoning literature on agent-based modeling.

Acknowledgements

Of central importance in the conduct of this research are my supervisors from the UTS Faculty of Business. Paul Wang has had to suffer with the seemingly interminable delays as I worked at a full time job and meandered down myriad pathways leading to this final work. He is to be commended for his patience. Siggi Gudergan, who came late this particular party, has shown interest in the work since the beginning, and I am very pleased that he was able to formally participate. Louise Young, who has now moved on from UTS, was of invaluable assistance early on in the development of the concepts that are developed here. The other individual at UTS who deserves special recognition is Jordan Louviere, who first introduced me to Discrete Choice Modeling and had a foundational impact on the results of this effort.

The work reported in this thesis is, in part, the result of a research project into passenger behavior that I was responsible for while I was engaged as the Senior Marketing Scientist for the Marketing Department of Boeing Commercial Airplanes in 2002. I was privileged to assemble a research team of top class individual from around the world to work on better understanding why passengers bought airplane tickets. Many advances were made in our understanding of airline passenger behavior that are now being adopted by the broader airline community, and many of the contributions generated by that team contribute to and are discussed in this work. Cheri Jones, my manager at the outset at Boeing, had the foresight and courage to let me assemble and support the team. Richard Lonsdale (who taught me about airlines), Fred Ervin and Zhengjie (John) Zhang (who were programming masters) were my close Boeing colleagues during the entire adventure of the next six years.

Among those prominent in the effort were Jordan Louviere, who taught me choice theory, Richard Carson, then Chair of the Department of Economics at University of California San Diego, and Joel Watson, also at UCSD, who tutored me in economics and worked with me on the passenger OD demand model, and David Bunch, at University of California, Irvine, who estimated the first passenger itinerary choice model. From the University of Warsaw, Poland, the team from their Institute of Computational Mathematics led by Marek Niezgodka and with the help of Wojciech Wislicki, Jan Radomski, Kristoff Nowinski, and Andrzej Slodownik worked to developed advanced concepts of airline network analysis. DeAnn Julius, then on the

Monetary Advisory Board of the Bank of England and now the Chairwoman of the Royal Institute of Foreign Affairs in London, helped me understand the problems and difficulties of the modern airline industry, and how technology could be brought to bear on those problems. Moshe Ben-Akiva from MIT and his student Joan Walker, now at the University of California at Berkeley, contributed to the mixed logit model that is now the pag choice model described here. Frank Koppelman, from Northwestern, and Laurie Garrow at Georgia Tech, and her student Dan Illiescu, worked with me on many aspects of the application of discrete choice modeling to the airline industry. Dan, in particular, developed his PhD dissertation on the ticket cancellation model discussed here based on my recommendations regarding approach and data.

Finally, I owe my two friends and business associates, Nick Lanyon in London and David Perroud of M1nd-Set SA in Geneva, a continuing debt of gratitude for the forbearance and encouragement during the process of writing the thesis itself over the last two years. They have contributed much in wisdom and experience, even though they would not admit it.

A final comment on the personal point of reference from which this analysis is created. I maintain, as explained in the body of the work, that all analyses are conditional on a reference narrative which sets the framework for the motivation, method and logic of the work. Most doctoral theses are scholarly examinations of topic of interest to their creator, often crafted as launching pads for their careers in the field of their choice. And they serve that purpose admirably, establishing the worth of the individual in the context of his or her reference narrative and that of others who share similar narratives. This is not exactly the case for me. Rather, this effort is a milestone in what has already been a rather long journey. As I write this I am in my mid-sixties, and have been working with computers and mathematical models of social phenomena for over four decades. I have been engaged in the development of models of such disparate subjects as consumer movement patterns in shopping districts, recreational area utilization, racial desegregation of public schools, vehicle reliability inspection programs, and (obviously) global air passenger demand. I have developed and implemented literally hundreds of consumer survey research designs and analyses. This long experience colors the approach and reasoning supporting this work, and it is my hope the reader finds that those hues enhance its value beyond simple research and reporting of results.

Virtual Markets: The Application of Agent-Based Modeling to Marketing Science

Table of Contents

Chapter 1: Overview	1
1.1: Introduction	1
1.2: Agent-Based Modeling and the Current Marketing Science Toolset	2
1.3: The Program for this Research	4
1.4: Contributions to the Literature of this Research	7
1.5: Organization of the Dissertation	9
1.6: Perspective	14
Chapter 2: Agent-Based Models and Marketing Science	16
2.1: Introduction	16
2.2: Modeling and Simulation	17
2.3: Reductive and Structural Models	21
2.4: A Definition of Agent-Based Modeling	23
2.5: The Epistemological Basis of Agent-Based Models	28
2.6: Evolutionary Science	31
2.7: Biological Evolution as a Paradigm for Marketing Science	37
2.8: The Evolution of Human Behavior	41
2.9: Universal Characteristics of Marketing Behavior	49
2.10: Summary	54
Chapter 3: The Narrative Framework	56
3.1: Introduction	56
3.2: The Central Role of Narrative in Human Understanding	58
3.3: A Formal Narrative Construct - Definition and Properties	61
3.4: Comparison of the Narrative Framework with Brown's Human Universals	72
3.5: Comparison of the Narrative Framework and Cialdini's Marketing Behaviors	80
3.6: A Sampling of Rational Choice Protocols	83
3.7: A Sampling of Heuristic Choice Protocols	90
3.8: A Sampling of Social Network Choice Protocols	96
3.9: A Sampling of Bias in Choice	100
3.10: Conclusion	103
Chapter 4: Virtual Markets	105
4.1: A Working Definition of Agent for Use in Virtual Markets	105
4.2: Virtual Markets Defined	108
4.3: Synthetic Populations and Incidence Distributions	111
4.4: Computing Concepts for Virtual Markets	113

4.5: Practical Issues in Building Virtual Markets	121
4.6: Summary	125
Chapter 5: The Airline Passenger Virtual Market - AirVM	126
5.1: Introduction	126
5.2: A Brief Exploration of the World's Airline Passenger Market	128
5.3: Passengers Buying Tickets and Airlines Selling Them	132
5.4: The Narratives of the Agents in AirVM	139
5.5: An Overview of the Simulation Logic	148
Chapter 6: AirVM Synthetic Population and Incidence	
Distributions	156
6.1: The Incident Distributions	156
6.2: The Estimation of Origin-Destination (OD) Demand	157
6.3: The Pag Itinerary Choice Protocol Model	162
6.4: The Population Distribution of Ideal Departure and Arrival Times	170
6.5: The Distribution of Ticketing Group Size	173
6.6: The Stochastic Process of Ticketing Instance	177
6.7: The Ticket Cancellation Stochastic Process	182
6.8: The Pag Willingness-to-Pay Model	186
6.9: The Structure of the Arasag State Vector	189
6.10: The Dsag State Vector	196
6.11: The Generation of Itineraries	199
6.12: Summary	204
Chapter 7: The AirVM Virtual Market Computer Program	205
7.1: AirVM Computing Architecture.	205
7.2: Perspective and Portrayal: The User Operation of AirVM	233
7.3: The Customers of AirVM	244
7.4: The Validation and Calibration of AirVM	248
7.5: Overall Critique of AirVM	251
Chapter 8: Conclusions and Contributions	258
8.1: Conclusions from the Research	258
8.2: Contributions to the Literature	262
8.3: A Closing Word	267
Appendices	269
A: Agent-Based Models and Computational Science: The Perspective of Paul Humphreys	270
B: A Simple Agent-Based Model: The Genetic Algorithm	277
C: Detailed Discussion of Marketing-Related Human Universals.	279
D: The Evolution of Behavior: The Example of Altruism	286
E: Shermer's Discussion on the Evolution of Ethics	295
F: The Narrative Conceptualization of Walter Fisher.	298
G: The Let's-Make-A-Deal Bias.	302
H: Available Agent-Based Modeling Packages	307
I: A Simple Word-of-Mouth Virtual Market.	310

J: Glossary of AirVM Terms	320
K: Estimating the Parameters of the Pag Choice Protocol Model.	325
L: The Estimation of OD Demand	331
M: Using AirVM to Impute Observed Origin-Destination Demand	342
N: The Random Number Generators Used in AirVM	348
Bibliography	357

List of Figures

Figure 2.1: The Ethnology of Mathematical Modeling and Simulation	20
Figure 3.1: Schematic Conceptualization of an Atomic Narrative	62
Figure 3.2: Discrete and Continuous Outcome Sets	63
Figure 3.3: Molecular Narratives and Plans	64
Figure 3.4: The Time Structure of Narratives	65
Figure 3.5: Multiple Narratives Invoked over Real Time	66
Figure 3.6: Gigarenzer’s Taxonomy of Rationality	92
Figure 4.1: The General Structure of an Agent	106
Figure 4.2: Messages and Message Queues	116
Figure 4.3: Multiple Objects Using the Same Queue	117
Figure 5.1: A Simple Airline Network Description	133
Figure 5.2: The Airline Network in Three Dimensions	134
Figure 5.3: The Abstract Definition of the Passenger Agent (Pag)	144
Figure 5.4: The Abstract Definition of the Airline Revenue and Scheduling Agent (Arasag).	146
Figure 5.5: The Abstract Definition of the Distribution System Agent (Dsag).	147
Figure 5.6: General AirVM Logic Flow	152
Figure 5.7: The AirVM Message Flow	154
Figure 6.1: Distribution of OD Market Size	159
Figure 6.2: Daily Ticket Sales, MIA>SEA Market	161
Figure 6.3: Day-of-Week Variation, MIA>SEA	162
Figure 6.4: Histogram of MIA>SEA Demand	163
Figure 6.5: Ideal Time Disutility Curve	167
Figure 6.6: Mixed Normal Representation of Ideal Time-of-Day	171
Figure 6.7: Percent of Weekly Travel by Day of Week	172
Figure 6.8: Travel Group Size Distributions	176
Figure 6.9: The Ticketing Stochastic Processes	181
Figure 6.10: Sample Willingness-to-Pay Curve.	188
Figure 6.11: Example of an Empirical Distribution Function (EDF)	191
Figure 6.12: Fare EDF for LAX>NRT Market. Nov 2007	192
Figure 6.13: Fare EDF with Fare Class Bounds and Nominal Fare Levels	193
Figure 7.1: AirVM Logic Program Logic Flowchart	223
Figure 7.2: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Splash Screen at Launch	233
Figure 7.3: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: AirVM Control Panel after Scenario Selection	234
Figure 7.4: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Scenario Selection	235
Figure 7.5: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Fare Edit Dialog Box	235
Figure 7.6: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Simulation Execution Control, Initial State	236

Figure 7.7: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Simulation Execution Control, In-Process	237
Figure 7.8: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Flight Monitor Selection Dialog Box	238
Figure 7.9: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Flight Monitor	239
Figure 7.10: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Market Monitor Selection Dialog Box	240
Figure 7.11: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Market Monitor	241
Figure 7.12: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Revenue Analysis Display	242
Figure 7.13: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Flight Fare Class Ticketing Detail	242
Figure 7.14: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Market Share Analysis Display	243
Figure 7.15: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Benefit/Cost Display	243
Figure 7.16: AirVM V.0.0.3568.16041: Scenario Comparison Display	244
Figure 7.17: Monte Carlo Simulation of Flight Revenue Distribution	253
Figure 7.18: Actual vs. Simulated Ticketing Curves	254
Figure 7.19: Actual vs. Simulated Market Share	255
Figure E.1: Shermer’s Bio-Cultural Pyramid	295
Figure G.1: Let’s Make A Deal Game Simulation	302
Figure I.1: The von Neumann Neighborhood	310
Figure I.2: Main Control Screen for WOM Simulation	311
Figure I.3: Sample WOM Simulation	312
Figure I.4: WOM Simulation Status Graph	314
Figure I.5: Histogram of Forgot/Not Aware	315
Figure I.6: Number Purchased, Low Probability Simulation	316
Figure I.7: WOM Simulation with Lower Purchase Probability	317
Figure I.8: Trifurcation of Purchased Frequency	318
Figure J.1: SideStep Web Survey Page	330

List of Tables

Table 3.1: The Culture Family of Human Universals	73
Table 3.2: The Language Family of Human Universals	74
Table 3.3: The Analysis Family of Human Universals	75
Table 3.4: The Recognition of Mind Family of Human Universals	77
Table 3.5: The Tools Family of Human Universals	78
Table 3.6: The Group Association Family of Human Universals	79
Table 3.7: The Trade and Economics Family of Human Universals	80
Table 3.8: The Ethics, Morals, Art and Metaphysics Family of Human Universals .	81
Table 6.1: Ideal Time of Day Mixed Normal Parameter Estimates	173
Table 6.2: Group Size	175
Table 6.3: Estimated Cancellation Model	185
Table 6.4: Fare Class Nominal Fare Multipliers from EDF	194
Table 6.5: Summary Statistics for Typical Seed Scenario	203
Table D.1: Total vs. Subgroup Population Altruism Survival Parameters	289
Table H.1: Available Software Packages for Agent-Based Modeling	307
Table I.1: Macro Statistics for WOM Simulation	315
Table J.1: Glossary of AirVM Terms	320
Table K.1: Sample Estimation Results for Pag Itinerary Choice Model	327
Table L.1: Trip Generation Model for a Sample City	339
Table L.2: Trip Distribution Model Regression Results	340
Table L.3: Regression of Fare Against Trend, Month Seasonality, and Lag	341