# **ARE YOU ONE OF US?**

# AN EXPLORATION OF DISCURSIVE IDENTITY FORMATION IN THE SALVATION ARMY

A thesis submitted to

The University of Technology, Sydney,
as partial fulfilment of
the degree Doctor of Education

**Terrence Grey** 

May 2011

#### **CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP/ORIGINALITY**

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signed

## **Acknowledgements**

The production of a doctoral thesis represents the culmination of a long and challenging journey. Countless hours spent reading, researching, thinking, writing all come at a cost to life and relationships particularly for a part time student.

This journey has not been taken alone but with the support of family and friends. I want to thank most sincerely my wife Lyn who while undertaking her own Doctoral studies supported me through her encouragement and insights. In her I also found a fellow student/learner willing to discuss ideas, challenge hypothesise, point out blind spots and suggest ways forward. In a similar vein I also acknowledge my good friend Dr. Dean Smith who endured with grace so many conversations concerning Foucault and offered helpful suggestions concerning my 'reading' of the Salvation Army officer discourse.

To Professor David Boud my primary supervisor, I express my sincere thanks for his direction, sage like advice and professional insights. Thank you for guiding me on the journey. Under your direction I have learnt much.

Finally to the officers, cadets (who are now officers), and ex-officers who were so willing to assist me in this research through accepting my invitation to be participants, I express my sincere thanks for your honesty and trust.

## **Contents**

Contents	3
Glossary - Organisationally Specific Terms	5
Abstract	6
ADSITACI	
Chapter 1 Introduction and Organisational Context – The Salvation Army	ع
The Objective of this Study	9
The Contemporary Organisational Context	
Organisational Culture	
Thesis Outline	16
Chapter 2 Theorisation I - Discourse	19
Discourse	
A Foucauldian Perspective	23
Bio-power	29
Discipline	31
Summary	34
Chapter 3 Theorisation II – Identity the Narration of Self	36
Narrative Identity Formation	38
Resistance of Subjects	43
Discursively Produced Individuality	44
Summary	46
Chapter 4 Methodology	48
Introduction	
Positioning of the Self as Researcher	51
Research Design	
Interviewing	59
Officer Cohort	59
Past Officers (resignations)	
Cadet Cohort	
Prior Formation of Cadets	
Ethical Considerations	
Conducting Interviews	
Research Analysis	
Limitations of Research	
Summary	72
Chapter 5 Officer – The Divine Appointment	
Call	
Function or Status	
Higher Calling	
Summary	92
Chapter 6 Officer – The Regimes of Truth	
Relative Discursive Positioning of Non-Officer	
Costliness	96
Hard Work	
Loyalty, obedience, commitment, conformity	
Power and Authority	106

Models of Officer	110
Summary	115
Chapter 7 Officer – Resistances and Power/Knowledge	116
Organisational Response to Resistance	
Confession	
Surveillance	
Structural Affects of Discourse	
Power/Knowledge creates individuality	
The Divine Will in the Officer Discourse	
Summary	
Chapter 8 The Generation of a Salvation Army Officer Identity	140
The Origins of Officer	
The Elements of Officer Identity	
Discursive Technologies	
Resistance	
Domains of silence	
Annandia	400
Appendices	160

# **Glossary - Organisationally Specific Terms**

Articles of War  Soldier's covenant document signed upon being accepted as soldier of The Salvation Army.  Australia Eastern Territory  The international Salvation Army is divided into geographical Territories and Commands. In Australia there are two such Territories.  Cadet / Novice These two terms appear interchangeably and represent someone who is accepted by the organisation for training to become a Salvation Army officer (normally residential two years full time).  Candidate An individual (lay Salvationist) who has been accepted by the organisation in the period prior to actually commencing training to become a Salvation Army officer  Corps Equivalent to a local parish (church)  Corps Officer (CO) Equivalent of a local parish minister  An officer responsible for organisational operations within an assigned geographical area (a Division). A middle management position.  Division A Territory is further divided into geographical divisions for which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Field (the) Work place context, normally in a corps (parish)  Officer appointed to be responsible for a local corps (parish)  Officer and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Official minutes  Cadet / Novice The international Army is divided into geographical divisions for which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Field (the)  Work place context, normally in a corps (parish)  Officer appointed to be responsible for a local corps (parish)  Corps Officer)  O&R  'Orders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated with a local Corps (ie parish)	Applicant	An individual (lay Salvationist) who commences the application process to become an officer.	
Australia Eastern Territory  Territory  Cadet / Novice  These two terms appear interchangeably and represent someone who is accepted by the organisation for training to become a Salvation Army officer (normally residential two years full time).  Candidate  An individual (lay Salvationist) who has been accepted by the organisation in the period prior to actually commencing training to become a Salvation Army officer  Corps  Equivalent to a local parish (church)  Corps Officer (CO)  Divisional Commander (DC)  Division  An officer responsible for organisational operations within an assigned geographical area (a Division). A middle management position.  Division  A Territory is further divided into geographical divisions for which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Field (the)  Field Officer (interchangeable with Corps Officer)  O&R  Official minutes  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Official minutes  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated	Articles of War	Soldier's covenant document signed upon being accepted	
Territory geographical Territories and Commands. In Australia there are two such Territories.  Cadet / Novice These two terms appear interchangeably and represent someone who is accepted by the organisation for training to become a Salvation Army officer (normally residential two years full time).  Candidate An individual (lay Salvationist) who has been accepted by the organisation in the period prior to actually commencing training to become a Salvation Army officer  Corps Equivalent to a local parish (church)  Corps Officer (CO) Equivalent of a local parish minister  An officer responsible for organisational operations within an assigned geographical area (a Division). A middle management position.  Division A Territory is further divided into geographical divisions for which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Field (the) Work place context, normally in a corps (parish)  Field Officer (parish)  Officer appointed to be responsible for a local corps (parish)  Officer and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Official minutes Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated	Australia Fastora	•	
Cadet / Novice  These two terms appear interchangeably and represent someone who is accepted by the organisation for training to become a Salvation Army officer (normally residential two years full time).  Candidate  An individual (lay Salvationist) who has been accepted by the organisation in the period prior to actually commencing training to become a Salvation Army officer  Corps  Equivalent to a local parish (church)  Corps Officer (CO)  Divisional Commander  (DC)  An officer responsible for organisational operations within an assigned geographical area (a Division). A middle management position.  Division  A Territory is further divided into geographical divisions for which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Field (the)  Field Officer  (interchangeable with Corps Officer)  O&R  Official minutes  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated		,	
someone who is accepted by the organisation for training to become a Salvation Army officer (normally residential two years full time).  Candidate  An individual (lay Salvationist) who has been accepted by the organisation in the period prior to actually commencing training to become a Salvation Army officer  Corps  Equivalent to a local parish (church)  Equivalent of a local parish minister  An officer responsible for organisational operations within an assigned geographical area (a Division). A middle management position.  Division  A Territory is further divided into geographical divisions for which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Field (the)  Work place context, normally in a corps (parish)  Officer appointed to be responsible for a local corps (parish)  Corps Officer)  O&R  'Orders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated	,	are two such Territories.	
to become a Salvation Army officer (normally residential two years full time).  Candidate  An individual (lay Salvationist) who has been accepted by the organisation in the period prior to actually commencing training to become a Salvation Army officer  Corps  Equivalent to a local parish (church)  Equivalent of a local parish minister  Divisional Commander (DC)  Divisional Commander (DC)  An officer responsible for organisational operations within an assigned geographical area (a Division). A middle management position.  A Territory is further divided into geographical divisions for which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Field (the)  Work place context, normally in a corps (parish)  Field Officer (parish)  Officer appointed to be responsible for a local corps (parish)  Corps Officer)  O&R  'Orders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated	Cadet / Novice	These two terms appear interchangeably and represent	
two years full time).  Candidate  An individual (lay Salvationist) who has been accepted by the organisation in the period prior to actually commencing training to become a Salvation Army officer  Corps  Equivalent to a local parish (church)  Equivalent of a local parish minister  Divisional Commander (DC)  Division  An officer responsible for organisational operations within an assigned geographical area (a Division). A middle management position.  Division  A Territory is further divided into geographical divisions for which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Field (the)  Work place context, normally in a corps (parish)  Field Officer (interchangeable with Corps Officer)  O&R  'Orders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Official minutes  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated			
Candidate An individual (lay Salvationist) who has been accepted by the organisation in the period prior to actually commencing training to become a Salvation Army officer  Corps Corps Equivalent to a local parish (church)  Corps Officer (CO) Divisional Commander (DC) An officer responsible for organisational operations within an assigned geographical area (a Division). A middle management position.  Division A Territory is further divided into geographical divisions for which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Field (the) Work place context, normally in a corps (parish)  Field Officer (interchangeable with Corps Officer)  O&R 'Orders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Official minutes  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated		to become a Salvation Army officer (normally residential	
the organisation in the period prior to actually commencing training to become a Salvation Army officer  Corps  Equivalent to a local parish (church)  Equivalent of a local parish minister  Divisional Commander (DC)  Division  An officer responsible for organisational operations within an assigned geographical area (a Division). A middle management position.  A Territory is further divided into geographical divisions for which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Field (the)  Field Officer  (interchangeable with Corps Officer)  O&R  Officer appointed to be responsible for a local corps (parish)  Orders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Official minutes  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated		two years full time).	
the organisation in the period prior to actually commencing training to become a Salvation Army officer  Corps	Candidate	An individual (lay Salvationist) who has been accepted by	
training to become a Salvation Army officer  Corps  Equivalent to a local parish (church)  Equivalent of a local parish minister  Divisional Commander (DC)  Division  An officer responsible for organisational operations within an assigned geographical area (a Division). A middle management position.  Division  A Territory is further divided into geographical divisions for which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Field (the)  Work place context, normally in a corps (parish)  Field Officer (interchangeable with Corps Officer)  O&R  'Orders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Official minutes  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated			
Corps Officer (CO)  Equivalent to a local parish (church)  Equivalent of a local parish minister  Divisional Commander (DC)  Division  Division  A Territory is further divided into geographical divisions for which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Field (the)  Field Officer (interchangeable with Corps Officer)  O&R  Official minutes  Equivalent to a local parish (church)  Equivalent to a local parish minister  An officer responsible for organisational operations within an assigned geographical area (a Division). A middle management position.  A Territory is further divided into geographical divisions for which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Work place context, normally in a corps (parish)  Officer appointed to be responsible for a local corps (parish)  Corps Officer)  O&R  Orders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated			
Corps Officer (CO)	Corps		
Divisional Commander (DC)  An officer responsible for organisational operations within an assigned geographical area (a Division). A middle management position.  Division  A Territory is further divided into geographical divisions for which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Field (the)  Work place context, normally in a corps (parish)  Officer appointed to be responsible for a local corps (parish)  Corps Officer)  O&R  'Orders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Official minutes  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated			
(DC)  an assigned geographical area (a Division). A middle management position.  Division  A Territory is further divided into geographical divisions for which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Field (the)  Work place context, normally in a corps (parish)  Officer appointed to be responsible for a local corps (parish)  Corps Officer)  O&R  'Orders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Official minutes  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated			
management position.  Division  A Territory is further divided into geographical divisions for which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Work place context, normally in a corps (parish)  Field Officer (interchangeable with Corps Officer)  O&R  Officer appointed to be responsible for a local corps (parish)  (parish)  Orders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Official minutes  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated			
Division  A Territory is further divided into geographical divisions for which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Field (the)  Work place context, normally in a corps (parish)  Officer appointed to be responsible for a local corps (parish)  Corps Officer)  O&R  Orders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Official minutes  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated	()	, , ,	
which the Divisional Commander is responsible  Field (the)  Field Officer (interchangeable with Corps Officer)  O&R  'Orders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Official minutes  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated	Division		
Field Officer (interchangeable with Corps Officer)  O&R (Orders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Official minutes (Internationally)  Soldier / Salvationist Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated			
Field Officer (interchangeable with Corps Officer)  O&R (Orders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Official minutes (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated	Field (the)	Work place context, normally in a corps (parish)	
(interchangeable with Corps Officer)  O&R  Official minutes  Corps Official minutes  Official minutes  Corders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated			
Corps Officer)  O&R  'Orders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Official minutes  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated	(interchangeable with	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
O&R  'Orders and Regulations' – official instructions regarding policy and practice (internationally)  Official minutes  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated		,	
policy and practice (internationally)  Official minutes  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated		'Orders and Regulations' - official instructions regarding	
Official minutes  Territorial official instructions regarding policy and practice (locally)  Soldier / Salvationist  Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated			
(locally) Soldier / Salvationist Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated	Official minutes		
	Soldier / Salvationist	Lay member of The Salvation Army normally associated	
Territory A geographical region, in this research it encompasses	Territory		
NSW, ACT and QLD.	-	NSW, ACT and QLD.	
Territorial Commander	Territorial Commander	Territorial Commander (CEO of the Territorial organisation	
(TC) – responsible to the General in London)	(TC)	,	
Training Officer An officer appointed to the College generally responsible			
for the practical aspects of cadet training. They also			
function as formation officers and assessors.			

#### **Abstract**

Within any organisation individuals are presented with particular identity positions which they take up in the process of becoming organisational members. Often such identities are taken for granted, assumed to be naturally occurring and therefore not open to contestation or negotiation. This thesis focuses upon the formation of professional identity within a particular organisation — The Salvation Army. Through applying Foucauldian discourse analysis and narrative identity formation, I seek to deconstruct the object: a Salvation Army officer professional identity, and to illuminate the ways it is co-created through discourse. To achieve this I map the discursive terrain that produces 'officer' through disrupting the normalised, the natural, the invisible, the unspeakable, and the silent assumptions that govern officer identity thus giving insight into current practice.

The data generated in this study was produced through undertaking in-depth interviews with three cohorts: six cadets (novice officers of varying prior organisational experience) in their second (and final) year of training, four experienced officers (of greater than ten years organisational experience) and two past officers who had resigned from officership. Organisational documents (both contemporary and historical) were also exegeted in an effort to show how the organisational historical archive has its material effects upon the contemporary experience of participants and thus how discourse produces and works to maintain a particular kind of object named Salvation Army officer.

Analysis of the data revealed that the Salvation Army officer is an object produced by socio/historical forces sustained by the circulation of power/knowledge in contemporary organisational discourses. The discourse seeks its own stability through the very objects it creates – Salvation Army officers. Subjectivity is the result of technologies of power which circulate via discourse and through discursive practices. Through technologies of discipline, self and performance, officer subjectivities are co-created primarily by means of surveillance, assessment and confession.

This study has revealed that through the twin conceptions of divine call and the divinely authorised organisation, the officer life is marked by a narrative of costliness, sacrifice, loss, and radical availability, and an identity that embraces the discursively produced attributes of loyalty, obedience, commitment and conformity. Individual identity within the prescribed limits is formed in the crucible of resistance to the circulation of

#### power/knowledge.

Through applying a Foucauldian approach to discourse analysis I deconstruct and disrupt the 'invisible and pervasive necessity' that discursively defines the object Salvation Army officer. I show that there is no overarching 'realist' necessity for the object 'officer' to be any particular way, save for the historical particularity that acts to produce it in the contemporary world.