

**Financial Exclusion and Australian Domestic General Insurance:
The impact of Financial Services Reforms**

Hugh Morris

Doctor of Philosophy in Finance and Economics

2012

CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP/ORIGINALITY

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Student

Production Note:

Signature removed prior to publication.

Acknowledgments

I acknowledge the advice and guidance I have received from my Supervisors, initially Professor Warren Hogan, and more recently Professor Jock Collins.

I further acknowledge the support I have received from my former colleagues at the School of Finance & Economics, UTS Faculty of Business and the editing and layout support I have received from Tanvi Meht

Table of Contents

Table of Contents.....	iii.
List of Tables.....	vi.
List of Figures.....	viii.
Thesis Abstract.....	1
Thesis Objective and Introduction.....	2
Thesis Structure and Methodology.....	2
Chapter One – The Dimensions of Financial Exclusion.....	10
Chapter Abstract.....	10
1.1. Chapter Objectives.....	11
1.2. Chapter Introduction.....	12
1.3.i. “Financial Exclusion” and “Social Exclusion”	12
1.3.ii. The Area of Impact of Financial Exclusion.....	16
1.3.iii. The manifestation of Financial Exclusion – Elements.....	16
1.3.iv. An additional dimension of Financial Exclusion.....	37
1.3.v. The Interaction between Financial Exclusionary Effects.....	42
1.4. Chapter Discussion.....	45
1.5. Chapter Conclusion.....	58
Chapter Two – Australian Domestic General Insurance: Financial Exclusionary Effects.....	49
Chapter Abstract.....	49
2.1. Chapter Objectives.....	49
2.2. Chapter Introduction.....	49
2.3. Methodology and Inquiries.....	51
2.4. Analysis – Introduction.....	60
2.4.i. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #1.....	61
2.4.ii. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #2.....	63
2.4.iii. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #3.....	65
2.4.iv. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #4.....	67
2.4.v. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #5.....	69
2.4.vi. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #6.....	70
2.4.vii. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #7.....	71
2.4.viii. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #8.....	73
2.4.ix. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #9.....	74
2.4.x. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #10.....	76
2.4.xi. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #11.....	78
2.4.xii. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #12.....	79
2.4.xiii. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #13.....	80
2.4.xiv. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #14.....	81
2.4.xv. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #15.....	83
2.4.xvi. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #16.....	84
2.5. Chapter Discussion.....	85
2.6. Chapter Conclusion.....	87

Chapter Three – Financial Exclusionary Effects	
Development of an Internal Contextual Constraint Profile	89
Chapter Abstract.....	89
3.1. Chapter Objectives.....	90
3.2. Chapter Introduction.....	90
3.3. Methodology and Inquiries.....	97
3.4. Analysis Introduction.....	104
3.4.i. Analysis – Insurance Contracts Act 1984 – Duty of Utmost Good Faith	104
3.4.ii. Analysis – Insurance Contracts Act 1984 – Reliance on Principle	111
3.4.iii. Analysis – Insurance Contracts Act 1984 – Judicial Relief.....	116
3.4.iv. Analysis – Insurance Contracts Act 1984 – Variation of “ <i>Standard Covers</i> ”	124
3.4.v. Analysis – Insurance Contracts Act 1984 – Reliance upon “ <i>Unusual Terms</i> ”	138
3.5. Chapter Discussion.....	143
3.6. Chapter Conclusion.....	146
Chapter Four – Financial Exclusionary Effects	
Development of an External Contextual Constraint Profile	149
Chapter Abstract.....	149
4.1. Chapter Objective.....	149
4.2. Chapter Introduction.....	150
4.3. Methodology and Inquiries.....	150
4.4. Analysis	152
4.4.i. Analysis – Racial Discrimination Act 1975 – Prohibition & Exemptions .	152
4.4.ii. Analysis – Sex Discrimination Act 1984 – Prohibition & Exemptions...	156
4.4.iii. Analysis – Disability Discrimination Act 1992 – Prohibition & Exemptions	163
4.4.iv. Analysis – Age Discrimination Act 2004 – Prohibition & Exemptions	175
4.4.v. Analysis – ASIC Act 2001 – Implied Warranties.....	185
4.4.vi. Analysis – Corporations Act 2001 Ch. 7 – Product Disclosure Statements	191
4.4.vii. Analysis – Corporations Act 2001 Ch. 7 – Alternative Dispute Resolution	200
4.4.viii. Analysis – Australian Consumer Law 2010 – Unfair Contract Terms..	205
4.5. Chapter Discussion.....	220
4.6. Chapter Conclusion.....	225
Chapter Five – Financial Services Reforms: Legislative Intent and	
Impact of Reforms upon Financial Exclusionary Effects	228
Chapter Abstract.....	228
5.1. Chapter Objective.....	229
5.2. Chapter Introduction.....	229
5.2.i. Background – Wallis Inquiry 1997.....	230
5.2.ii. Background – CLERP Program 1997 – 1999	232
5.2.iii. Background – Impediments to Action.....	234
5.3. Australian Financial Services Reform Legislation.....	235
5.4. Methodology and Analysis – Intent and Impact.....	244
5.5. Chapter Conclusion – Replication Impact.....	275

Chapter Six – Thesis Conclusion	248
Thesis Conclusion Abstract.....	248
6.1. Thesis Conclusion Objective.....	250
6.2. Thesis Conclusion Introduction.....	250
6.3. Chapter and Appendix Conclusion Summaries.....	251
6.4. Thesis General Conclusion.....	276
6.5. Thesis Contribution to Area of Knowledge.....	281
Bibliography	284
Appendix A Pilot Study – Application of Thesis Analytical Framework: External Jurisdiction: New Zealand	301
Pilot Study Abstract.....	301
A.1. Objectives and Introduction.....	301
A.2. Data and Methodology.....	302
A.3. Analysis.....	303
A.3.i. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #1.....	304
A.3.ii. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #2.....	306
A.3.iii. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #3.....	307
A.3.iv. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #4.....	308
A.3.v. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #5.....	310
A.3.vi. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #6.....	311
A.3.vii. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #7.....	313
A.3.viii. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #8.....	314
A.3.ix. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #9.....	315
A.3.x. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #10.....	317
A.3.xi. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #11.....	318
A.3.xii. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #12.....	319
A.3.xiii. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #13.....	320
A.3.xiv. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #14.....	322
A.3.xv. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #15.....	323
A.3.xvi. Analysis – Exclusionary Effect Element #16.....	324
A.4. Development of a Constraint Profile.....	326
A.4.i. Analysis – Internal and External Contextual Constraints.....	327
A.4.ii. Analysis – Reliance upon “ <i>Unusual Terms</i> ”.....	327
A.4.iii. Analysis – Anti Discrimination Legislation.....	329
A.4.iv. Analysis – Implied Warranties.....	332
A.4.v. Analysis – Alternative Dispute Resolution Processes.....	334
A.4.vi. Analysis – Restrictions on unfair Contract Terms.....	336
A.5. Pilot Study Conclusions.....	338

List of Tables

Table 1.1.	Retail Insureds – Impact of Statutory Charges	27
Table 2.1.	Distribution of Insurance Policy Class by Insurer	55
Table 2.2.	Exclusionary Effect Element #1 – Scope of Cover – Age	61
Table 2.3.	Exclusionary Effect Element #2 – Scope of Cover – Gender	63
Table 2.4.	Exclusionary Effect Element #3 – Scope of Cover – Occupation	65
Table 2.5.	Exclusionary Effect Element #4 – Scope of Cover – Domicile	67
Table 2.6.	Exclusionary Effect Element #5 – Scope of Cover – Personal Interests not insured – Proofs	69
Table 2.7.	Exclusionary Effect Element #6 – Scope of Cover – Perils or Activity	70
Table 2.8.	Exclusionary Effect Element #7 – Exclusion – Property not included under scope of cover	71
Table 2.9.	Exclusionary Effect Element #8 – Exclusion – Inherent Vice or Vermin	73
Table 2.10.	Exclusionary Effect Element #9 – Exclusion – Extraordinary Hazards – Adverse Selection	74
Table 2.11.	Exclusionary Effect Element #10 – Exclusion .– Moral & Morale Hazards – Non-Disclosure	76
Table 2.12.	Exclusionary Effect Element #11 – General Conditions – Non-compliance with claims reporting – Evidence requirements	78
Table 2.13.	Exclusionary Effect Element #12 – General Conditions – Non-compliance with assistance and recovery requirements	79
Table 2.14.	Exclusionary Effect Element #13 – General Conditions – Non-compliance with other policy specific Conditions	80
Table 2.15.	Exclusionary Effect Element #14 – Excess – Standard	81
Table 2.16.	Exclusionary Effect Element #15 – Excess – Risk Specific	83
Table 2.17.	Exclusionary Effect Element #16 – Excess – Insured or Driver Specific	84
Table 2.18.	Exclusionary Effect Element – Element Incidence Summary	85
Table 2.19.	Distribution of Exclusionary Effect Incidence across Insurer Policy Class	86
Table 3.4.	General Insurance Claims Data: August – December 1977	106
Table 3.5.	Australian Domestic General Insurance, New Business and Renewals, Claims and Rejected Claims: 1 July 2004 to 30 June 2005 Section 35 ICA (1984) Cth “ <i>Standard Covers</i> ”	126
Table 6.1.	Exclusionary Effects – Element Incidence Summary	258

Table A.1.	New Zealand Pilot Study Exclusionary Effect: Element #1 Age	304
Table A.2.	New Zealand Pilot Study Exclusionary Effect: Element #2 Gender	306
Table A.3.	New Zealand Pilot Study Exclusionary Effect Element #3 Occupation	307
Table A.4.	New Zealand Pilot Study Exclusionary Effect Element #4 Domicile	310
Table A.5.	New Zealand Pilot Study Exclusionary Effect Element #5 Personal Interest not Insured	311
Table A.6.	New Zealand Pilot Study Exclusionary Effect Element #6 Exclusion: Perils or Activity	347
Table A.7.	New Zealand Pilot Study Exclusionary Effect Element #7 Exclusion: Property not included under scope of cover	313
Table A.8.	New Zealand Pilot Study Exclusionary Effect Element #8 Exclusion: Inherent Vice or Vermin	314
Table A.9.	New Zealand Pilot Study Exclusionary Effect Element #9 Exclusion: Extraordinary Hazards – Adverse Selection	315
Table A.10.	New Zealand Pilot Study Exclusionary Effects Element # 10 Moral and Morale Hazard/Non-Disclosure	317
Table A.11.	New Zealand Pilot Study Exclusionary Effect Element #11 Non-compliance with claims reporting/evidence requirement	318
Table A.12.	New Zealand Pilot Study Exclusionary Effect Element #12 Non-compliance with assistance and recovery requirements	319
Table A.13.	New Zealand Pilot Study Exclusionary Effect Element #13 Non-compliance with other policy specific conditions	320
Table A.14.	New Zealand Pilot Study Exclusionary Effect Element #14 Excess: Standard	322
Table A.15.	New Zealand Pilot Study Exclusionary Effect Element #15 Excess: Risk Specific	323
Table A.16.	New Zealand Pilot Study Exclusionary Effect Element #15 Excess: Age	324
Table A.17.	New Zealand Pilot Study Exclusionary Effect Incidence Summary	325

List of Figures

Figure 1.1.	Thesis Analytical Framework	7
Figure 1.1.	Vicarious Financial Exclusionary Effect – Schematic	40
Figure 1.2	Vicarious Financial Exclusionary Effect – Sequential Process	43
Figure 1.3.	Examples of financial exclusionary effects: Travel Insurance	43
Figure 1.4.	Interaction between specific financial exclusionary effects	44
Figure 2.1.	Australian Financial Services Reform (FSR) Timeline – Policy Survey Period	52
Figure 2.2.	Contract Condition-Based Denial Financial Exclusionary Effects – Survey Questions	58
Figure 2.3.	General Insurance Contract Elements – Conventional General Insurance Policy	59
Figure 2.4.	Insurance Policy Elements – Prescribed Contracts “ <i>standard covers</i> ”	59
Figure 3.1.i.	Constraint Profile: Insurance Contract Structure	91
Figure 3.1.ii.	Constraint Profile: Race	91
Figure 3.1.iii.	Constraint Profile: Age	92
Figure 3.1.iv.	Constraint Profile: Disability	93
Figure 3.1.v.	Constraint Profile: Gender	94
Figure 3.1.vi.	Constraint Profile: Activity	95
Figure 3.1.vii.	Constraint Profile: Occupation	96
Figure 3.2.	Constraint Profile: Contextual Factor Analytical Framework	97
Figure 3.3.	Constraint Profile: Statute-Based Constraints	99
Figure 3.4.	Constraint Profile: Statutory Provisions	103
Figure 3.5.	Constraint Profile: Example	104
Figure 3.6.i.	Internal Context Constraint Profile: Contract Structure #1	111
Figure 3.6.ii.	Internal Context Constraint Profile: Contract Structure #2	116
Figure 3.6.iii.	Internal Context Constraint Profile: Contract Structure #3	124
Figure 3.6.iv.	Section 35(2) ICA (Cth) 1984 Derogation Effect	133
Figure 3.6.v.	Internal Context Constraint Profile: Contract Structure #4	138
Figure 3.6.vi.	Internal Context Constraint Profile: Contract Structure #5	143
Figure 3.7.	Internal Context Constraint Profile: Contract Structure # 1 - # 5	148
Figure 4.1.i.	External Context Constraint Profile: Statute: Racial Discrimination	156
Figure 4.1.ii.	External Context Constraint Profile: Statute: Sex Discrimination	163
Figure 4.1.iii.	External Context Constraint Profile: Statute: Disability Discrimination	175
Figure 4.1.iv.	External Context Constraint Profile: Statute: Age Discrimination	185
Figure 4.1.v.	External Context Constraint Profile: Statute: Consumer Warranties	191
Figure 4.1.vi.	External Context Constraint Profile: Statute: Insurer Product Disclosure	199
Figure 4.1.vii.	External Context Constraint Profile: Statute: ADR	205
Figure 4.1.viii.	External Context Constraint Profile: Statute: Australian Consumer Law	219
Figure 4.2.	External Context Constraint Profile: Summary	227
Figure 5.1.	Statutory Provisions: Extrinsic Sources - Legislative Intent	238
Figure 6.1.	Vicarious Financial Exclusionary Effect – Schematic	254
Figure 6.2.	Internal Context Constraint Profile	262
Figure 6.3.	External Context Constraint Profile	269
Figure A.1	Analysis – Internal and External Contextual Constraints	327

Financial Exclusion and Australian Domestic General Insurance The impact of Financial Services Reforms

Thesis Abstract

Consumer access to financial products and services may depend on a variety of factors. Recent evidence reveals that “Financial Exclusionary” effects may exert a particularly adverse impact on people's ability to access financial services and products. Specifically, this Study examines the extent to which recent financial services reforms in Australia have impacted upon those financial exclusionary effects which may preclude access to general insurance products in the domestic market.

Towards this aim, I first generated a profile of financial exclusionary effects applying to current Australian domestic general insurance products utilised by domestic insureds. The profile revealed that these effects occur widely across statute-prescribed insurance policies in the Australian domestic general insurance market. I then examined extent to which internal and external contextual factors arising from interaction with various statutory provisions constrained these effects. I discovered that potential constraints, primarily due to the preclusion of external statutory provisions from general insurance contracts, were minimal. This in turn, could be traced to the existence of insurance specific statutory remedies under the Australian federal insurance legislation designed to provide relief from harsh, oppressive, unconscionable, unjust, unfair, or inequitable insurer conduct.

Subsequently, I identified the general objectives of recent Australian financial services reform legislation from the perspective of potential impact upon financial exclusionary effects. I found that, through an attempt to address structural defects in the application of the reform legislation, the new legislation in fact replicated existing statutory descriptions of several domestic general insurance products which contained financial exclusionary effects, embedding these effects in the definitions central to the reform legislation. I consider the policy implications of my research findings, noting that remedial legislation may be necessary to address those issues identified.

I conclude my thesis with the outcome of a Pilot Study I developed and implemented in order to establish the extent to which my multi-part analytical framework was relevant in determining the financial exclusionary effect profile in domestic general insurance products available in the New Zealand general insurance market. I report on the outcome of these inquiries, which successfully established the probable financial exclusionary effect profile in financial products and services within that jurisdiction.