

Women writing design scholarship: reconfiguring academic work in design

Teena Clerke

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences
University of Technology, Sydney

2012

Certificate of authorship/originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Student

Acknowledgments

Many people have helped me to think through and write this thesis, some of whom are now friends and colleagues, while others include anonymous reviewers, participants in conference audiences, and complete strangers who dared to ask what my research was about. Special thanks are due to a particular number of these people.

Firstly, I would like to thank my supervisors Alison Lee and Louise McWhinnie, and also Elaine Swan. Alison, for her empathetic guidance and support throughout the years of our collaboration, and for continuing to have faith in me, and this research, even when I did not. Her pedagogical commitment to doctoral scholarship in general, and my scholarly emergence in particular, has been exemplary. Her generosity as a mentor and colleague is unparalleled in my academic and professional careers. Thank you for keeping me going. Louise, for her experience and valuable contribution that affirms my own experiences, for generously going with the flow, and for seeing me through to completion when Alison was unable. Elaine, who graciously stepped in to ask exactly the right questions at precisely the right moments. Her editing expertise and guidance helped me write what needed to be read, rather than what I needed to say, and to identify the 'da das' in the work. Finally, Mindy Laube's editorial expertise ensured the thesis was readable.

My participation in a doctoral writing group guided me through the first years of living with the uncertainty of not knowing, and my fellow women writers provided warmth, friendship and support. I would like to thank group members Ishbel Murray, Lorraine West, Maria Harissi and Kate Bower, and our facilitator, Cynthia Nelson, who was always able to identify what we needed to move our work forward. Simultaneously, my inclusion in a doctoral cohort in 2006 enabled me to weather the first year. In particular I would like to thank Ros Carter, with whom I have studied since 2003, and who has borne the brunt of my frustrations for far too long; and Paul Donovan, Eugene Metanoa, Adrian Kelly, Richard McDermott, Steve Murphy, Michelle Mellick, Chris Evans, Leanne King and Marion Burford, for the stimulating conversations and great variety of educational research they have produced. Without the support of my fellow doctoral students, this project would have been far more lonely, and far less productive and joyful than it actually was.

Kate Bower has been an unexpected friend, travel companion, colleague, collaborator, foil for my more fanciful digressions, and a surprisingly effective life coach, despite my seniority. I

would like to thank her for her support at critical times, including helping me see when my eyes were closed, helping me hear when I was not listening, and helping me write when writing was difficult. In particular, I appreciate her attempts to get me to read feminist theory at the beginning, patiently listening when I talked and talked in circles and sharing the challenge of critical conference audiences. I would also like to thank Elysebeth Leigh and Kate Collier, who had faith in me early on and proved to be extraordinarily insightful ‘gatekeepers’; the women who went before me: Mary Johnsson and Donna Rooney, who offered guidance, and Lorraine West, emotional support; Ishbel Murray helpfully pointed out my tendency to respond to conversation with ‘no, but’, and was there at the end in more ways than one; Sally Denshire helped me articulate a compelling research rationale in my second year; Barbara Kamler showed me how to write ‘tiny texts’; Marie Manidis, who was always willing to listen and swap stories, and for her lovely maps; Jeanti St Clair and Lara Moroko graciously provided critical reading early on; and Katherine Moline helped make our writing group nourishing, fun and productive towards the end. Thanks also to Carl Rhodes who shared his time to discuss ghostwriting and creative methodological approaches to research writing.

Warm thanks are due to the design academics, sixteen women and three men, who generously shared their time to contribute their accounts to my research. Thanks also to the students in first year typography at UTS in 2011 whose work and hands appear in Chapter 4, and the design students, past and present, who have indulged my need to talk about research *and* gender, sometimes at the same time, in design. And the countless academics whose exchanges on the PhD Design Research list enabled me to publicly think aloud, which helped move the work forward, even when I did not see it moving; and anonymous reviewers, conference participants and UTS research students who responded to the iterative development of the research.

I would also like to acknowledge the doctoral internship I received from FASS that supported this work from 2008 to 2010. The internship introduced me to academic colleagues and students in education and media studies, enabled my participation in a vibrant research community, and funded two presentations at international conferences in 2008 and 2009. In particular, I would like to thank Alison Lee, Kitty Te Riele, Nicky Solomon, David Boud, Clive Chappell and Alastair Pennycook for their contributions to building a vibrant and friendly research student culture in education, and the many doctoral students I encountered along the way, from whom I have learned enormously.

Finally, I would like to thank my family, Maddie, Ruby, and particularly, Ian Farquhar. Their patience and support throughout the doctorate and the three years prior has sustained me through this project. Their collective relief that it is finally over will enable me now to move on.

Publications and presentations during candidature

Book chapters

Bower, K., Clerke, T. & Lee, A. 2009, 'Endangered practices. Writing feminist research', in J. Higgs, D. Horsfall & S. Grace (eds), *Writing qualitative research on practice*, Sense Publishers, Rotterdam, pp. 127–38.

Refereed journal articles

Clerke, T. 2010, 'Gender and discipline: publication practices in Design', *Journal of Writing for Creative Practice*, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 64–78.

Clerke, T. 2009, 'Exhibition review, New Views 2: Conversations and Dialogues in Graphic Design: An International Symposium Defining Graphic Design for the Future', *Visual Communication*, vol. 8, no. 1, pp. 117–22.

Clerke, T. 2009, 'Ghostwriting + Shadowwriting: constructing research texts that speak to women's lived experience', *Crossroads: An interdisciplinary journal for the study of history, philosophy, religion and classics, Special Issue from the 2008 Rhizomes Conference*, vol. 3, no. 2, pp. 30–9.

Refereed conference papers

Clerke, T. 2010, 'Desire and tactics: women and Design education', *Paper 89, Conference Proceedings of ConnectEd, 2nd International Conference in Design Education, Sydney, 28 June 28 – 1 July*.

Clerke, T. 2009, 'Gender and discipline: design publication practices', *Conference Proceedings of Art.Media.Design | Writing Intersections Conference & Workshop*, Faculty of Design, Swinburne University of Technology, Prahan, pp. 282–93.

Clerke, T. 2008, 'Re-assessing assessment practices in design to support students' long term learning', *EAD07 Conference Proceedings: Dancing with Disorder: Design, Discourse, Disaster, European Art Design*, eds T. T. Balcioglu, Ö. Çağlar Tombus & D. Irkda, Izmir University of Economics, Izmir, Turkey, <<http://fadf.ieu.edu.tr/ead07>>.

Conference papers

- Clerke, T. 2012, 'Re:framing visual communication design methods as translation: analyzing qualitative interview data', paper submitted to *DRS 2012 Bangkok*, Bangkok, 1–4 July.
- Clerke, T. 2010, 'Women and conversation: shaping Design at one Australian university', paper presented at *Connecting..., 2nd International DoctoRALnet Forum*, Sydney, 10 April.
- Bower, K. & Clerke, T. 2009, 'Contemporary academic women: what's feminism got to do with it?', paper presented to the *Gender and Education Conference*, London, 25–27 March.
- Bower, K. & Clerke, T. 2009, 'Contemporary academic women: what's feminism got to do with it?', paper presented to the *Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences Post-graduate Student Research Conference*, Sydney, 24–25 July.
- Clerke, T. 2009, 'Women (un)becoming: design(er) academics', paper presented to the *Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences Post-graduate Student Research Conference*, Sydney, 24–25 July.
- Bower, K., Clerke, T., Harissi, M., Murray, I. & West, L. 2009, 'Writing Groups', workshop presented at the *Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences Post-graduate Student Research Conference*, Sydney, 24–25 July.
- Moline, K. & Clerke, T. 2008, 'A reconceptualisation of health policy from the perspective of strategic design', paper presented at the *UNESCO Observatory Community, Health and the Arts 'Vital Arts – Vibrant Communities' Conference*, Melbourne, 8 September.
- Clerke, T. 2008, 'Troubling practices: women design(er) academics', paper presented at the *UTS Multidisciplinary Research Student Conference*, Sydney, 11 August.
- Clerke, T. 2008, 'Practices in (collaboration with and resistance to practices) becoming academic', paper presented to the *Faculty of Education Research Students' Conference*, Sydney, 30 May.
- Bower, K & Clerke, T. 2008, 'Ghostwriting: contesting power through research', paper presented at *Rhizomes IV: Power Violence Language Conference*, Brisbane, 14 February.
- Clerke, T. 2007, 'Collective memory work: a collaborative method of enquiry', paper presented at the *UTS Multidisciplinary Research Student Conference*, Sydney, 9 August.
- Clerke, T. 2007, 'Women in design: stories in the field', paper presented at *NSW IER Annual Research Conference*, Ryde, 1 June.
- Clerke, T. 2006, 'Against type: women in the academy and typography in design education', paper presented at the *UTS Multidisciplinary Research Student Conference*, Sydney, 30 July.

Clerke, T. 2006, 'Through the gender lens: visualising possibilities for the typographic curriculum', poster presented at *NSW IER Annual Research Conference*, Sydney, 24 August.

Dedication

I dedicate this thesis with love and gratitude to Alison Lee, without whom my capacity to live productively with the uncertainty of not knowing would not have been possible. The thesis was examined in the shadow of Alison's passing in September 2012. She is missed daily, yet lives on through this work. The thesis is also dedicated to my family, Ian, Maddie and Ruby Farquhar, whose love, tolerance, trust and patience I have tested these past six years.

Preface

This thesis breaks with the presentation guidelines for a doctoral thesis established by the Graduate School, University of Technology, Sydney in the following way. The images and diagrams that appear in the thesis are to be read in conjunction with the text, rather than as illustrations of the text. Thus, they are not itemised as a list of 'figures'.

Table of Contents

Certificate of authorship/originality	ii
Acknowledgments.....	iii
Publications and presentations during candidature.....	vi
Dedication	ix
Preface.....	x
Abstract	xiv
Chapter 1. Women working in design in the university.....	1
Introduction	1
Key concepts and terms	4
Design, designer, design academic	4
Design scholarship	6
Women writing	7
Writing design scholarship.....	8
Thesis aims and research questions.....	8
Setting the scene.....	9
Locating women in design in the university.....	10
Representing women in the design literature and discourse	14
Feminist Design literature.....	17
Design scholarship and writing	20
Questions raised	23
Research approach.....	23
Gender	24
Doing gender.....	25
Summary, contribution and thesis outline.....	27
Thesis contribution	28
Thesis outline	29
Chapter 2. Placing women in design scholarship at the University of Technology, Sydney, 1960–2008	31
Introduction	31
Rewriting the past: design scholarship in New South Wales, 1960s–1990s	35
Historical background, 1960–1975	36
Sydney College of the Arts, 1975–1987	42
The University of Technology, Sydney 1988–1992	47
Experiencing design scholarship	49
Maintaining and reproducing gendering.....	53
Representing.....	53
Locating.....	60
Conclusion	62

Chapter 3. Generating accounts of women in design scholarship: research methodology and methods	64
Introduction	64
Feminist and poststructuralist research methodology	65
Institutional discourses	65
Place stories in the contact zone	67
Rewriting as a feminist methodological strategy.....	69
Tactics	71
Experience is local, while texts travel	72
Local neighbourhood	74
Reconfiguring rewriting through design	77
Research methods: generating women’s place stories.....	79
Description of the research study.....	80
Research methods and data analysis.....	86
Conclusion	94
Chapter 4. Reassessing legacy in design scholarship	96
Introduction	96
Adjunct Professor Jenny Toyne Wilson	98
Introducing Jenny	99
Being academic.....	100
Digital technologies	101
Teaching and learning.....	104
Experiencing gendering	107
Dialogical and collaborative pedagogy.....	110
‘Breaking it down’ and ‘show and tell’	112
A pedagogy of visual thinking	115
Embedding and extending Jenny’s design scholarship	122
Conclusion	127
Chapter 5. Collectively rewriting design scholarship	131
Introduction	131
Workshop flow	132
Data analysis in ‘zine format	134
Episode 1. Corridor conversations	134
Episode 2. Staff meetings.....	153
Episode 3. Scholarly conferences.....	160
Conclusion	165

Chapter 6. Beyond the local neighbourhood.....	171
Introduction	171
Ten women design academics	172
Jan.....	172
Anna.....	175
Marilyn.....	177
Siân.....	178
Pia and Isabel.....	180
Veronica.....	183
Rachel.....	185
Maxine.....	187
Donna.....	189
Negotiating gendering: uneven playing fields.....	190
Negotiating boundaries.....	193
Subjectivity: ‘I’m not really an academic, but...’	193
Writing genres: ‘bringing ideas into publications that people actually read’	197
Community: ‘giving people options’	199
Knowledge production: ‘going on holiday in your head’	204
Conclusion	207
Chapter 7. Rewriting design scholarship for the future	210
Trails and accretion of women’s design scholarship.....	211
Embedding and legacy-making	212
Generational succession	214
Scholarship tactics	216
Multi-modal border work	217
Extra-local gendering and place gendering.....	218
Rewriting scholarship through design for the future.....	221
Epilogue.....	225
Reference list	226
Appendix 1. Adjunct Professor Jenny Toynbee Wilson.....	244
Appendix 2. Paper submitted to DRS 2012 conference	250

Abstract

This thesis proposes *design scholarship* as a term that strategically positions women as central to academic work in (visual communication) design. My use of this term represents a feminist rewriting of the historically gendered relations between design and writing in the university since the increase in women's participation in design scholarship in the mid-1980s. The term disrupts gender divisions in academic work and reconfigures the representation of qualitative research as the visual interplay between words, images and design elements.

The term design scholarship responds to the question of how are women placed in academic work in design in universities by countering the gendered narratives and restorative histories through which women are represented in the design literature and discourse. The research is future-oriented, and explores possibilities as well as constraints, to ask, what options do women take up in the gendered university, and with what effects and what possibilities?

The thesis has four methodological components. First, it documents the historical emergence of design scholarship from the perspective of women design academics. It therefore represents the first empirical study about women who work in design in universities. Second, theoretically derived tools analyse the experiences of a small number of women to identify patterns and draw conclusions about the cumulative effect of their work on the trajectory of design scholarship. The analysis offers new terms to describe how women negotiate their scholarly work in design. Third, it contributes a new feminist analytical framing with which to analyse gendering in the university. Finally, it contributes a new methodological approach to analysing qualitative research data and representing this analysis through design methods.

The research involved interviews with fifteen women design academics working in nine universities in Australia, the United Kingdom and Europe. The data was transcribed, analysed and visually represented in different ways throughout the thesis. Despite the gendered conditions under which they work, it is argued that women are active, legitimate subjects who actively shape knowledge production in design, the effects of which are disseminated to non-design and non-academic audiences. What this research seeks to produce is an assemblage of accounts and engagements with the scholarly project of design by women that challenges the existing design literature and discourse and reconfigures design scholarship for the future.