The Roles Played by Unions in the Provision of Continuing Education in the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region

By

Wong Chi Mei, M.Ed.

As Partial Fulfilment of the Doctor of Education Degree

In

The University of Technology, Sydney

2012
Statement of Original Authorship

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signed: _______________________

Wong Chi Mei
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr Liam Morgan, for his patience and expertise in helping me during the final stages of my writing, which was critical to the completion of the dissertation. Also, I would like to thank my second supervisor, Dr Tony Brown, for his guidance and support throughout the project. My heartfelt thanks also go to the colleagues who have given me all their support. Also, I would like to thank my family for their support during my studies.
Preface

With the advent of knowledge-based economic structures, globalization and the rapid growth in computer-based technologies, the traditional Chinese philosophy of one skill lasting for one’s whole working life is no longer effective. A high quality workforce is a strong basis for economic growth, so upgrading the quality of the workforce is a policy priority for all policy makers. In his 2007 policy address, Hong Kong’s Chief Executive, Donald Tsang, stated,

Employment is an issue that has to be tackled by setting long-term strategies. Hong Kong’s economic growth model has changed. The need for training and self-improvement is not just confined to low-skilled, low educated and middle-aged workers. We need to turn our training policy into a long-term social investment. (Tsang, 2007, p. 32)

However, although the Hong Kong Government highlighted this problem, it did not put forward the policies and measures to deal with it.

For most people, Continuing Education is the traditional pathway to knowledge and skills recognition after leaving the formal education system. In this era of the knowledge-based economy, where every employee has to keep up with the demand for ever-changing skills and knowledge, continuing study is one of the ways to sustain a place in the labour market and enhance employability.

In facing the poor level of investment in Continuing Education provided by the Hong Kong Government, the unions, as the protector of the interests of Hong Kong workers, has a proven track-record of making a major contribution. The research presented in this thesis examines the background, the reasons and the framework within which Hong Kong’s unions have played their role in meeting employees’ training needs, assisting working adults to achieve their development through Continuing Education.
List of Abbreviations

CE: Continuing Education
CEF: Continuing Education Fund
ERB: Employees Retraining Board
FLU: The Federation of Hong Kong and Kowloon Labour Unions
FTU: Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions
HKSAR: Hong Kong Special Administrative Region
HKTUC: Hong Kong and Kowloon Trade Union Council
ITAC: Industrial Training Advisory Committee of Qualification Framwork
TUC: Trade Union Congress of United Kingdom
VET: Vocational Education and Training
VTC: Hong Kong Vocational Training Council
YPET: Youth Pre-employment Programme
YWETS: Youth Work Experience and Training Scheme
Table of Contents

The Roles Played by Unions in the Provision of Continuing Education in the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region ................................................................. i
Statement of Original Authorship ............................................................................... ii
Acknowledgements .................................................................................................. iii
Preface ......................................................................................................................... iv
List of Abbreviations .................................................................................................. v
Table of Contents ...................................................................................................... vi
List of Figures ........................................................................................................... xi
List of Tables ............................................................................................................. xi
Abstract ...................................................................................................................... xii

Chapter 1 The Problem and Its Background ............................................................ 1
1.1 Statement of problem and the significance of this research .............................. 1
1.2 Introduction: research background .................................................................. 1
   1.2.1 Knowledge-based society and education .............................................. 2
   1.2.2 Skills mismatch and Vocational Education and Training (VET) ...... 2
   1.2.3 Needs of Continuing Education in Hong Kong ............................... 6
   1.2.4 Hong Kong unions .......................................................................... 8
   1.2.5 Existing training service provided by Hong Kong unions ............. 13
   1.2.6 Government policy on Continuing Education (CE) ...................... 17
   1.2.7 Conclusion ................................................................................... 23
1.3 Objectives of the study ...................................................................................... 26
   1.3.1 What is the research about? .............................................................. 26
      1.3.1.1 Gap between training needs of general workforce and the training opportunities provided ....................................................... 26
      1.3.1.2 Strategic role played by unions in narrowing the gap between workers’ needs and the provision of VET .......................... 26
      1.3.1.3 Worker unions’ role as direct course provider ......................... 27
      1.3.1.4 Worker unions’ role in policy formulation ............................... 28
      1.3.1.5 Conclusion ................................................................................ 28
   1.3.2 Research questions ............................................................................. 29
   1.3.3 Importance of study ........................................................................ 30
   1.3.4 Scope and delimitation of study ....................................................... 30

Chapter 2 Review of Related Literature .................................................................. 32
2.1 Workers’ education: technical-professional and raising of class-consciousness .............................................................................................................. 32
2.2 Post-Fordism – challenges faced by workers in the 21st century .................. 41
6.2.2.3 Updating knowledge and practical skills ........................................ 124
6.2.2.4 Recognized qualifications .............................................................. 126

6.2.3 Unions’ role and actions in meeting employees’ needs .................. 129
  6.2.3.1 Background and special relationship between tutors, students and centre .......................................................... 129
  6.2.3.2 Flexible arrangement and competitive fee .................................. 131
  6.2.3.3 Psychological and institutional barrier to further study ............ 133
  6.2.3.4 Effective promotion channels and information dissemination .. 136
  6.2.3.5 Immediate reflection of market needs ....................................... 137

6.2.4 Future trends in training to be offered by unions ......................... 138
  6.2.4.1 Rise in adult learners seeking award-bearing courses and qualifications ................................................................. 139
  6.2.4.2 New opportunity provided by Qualification Framework .......... 141
  6.2.4.3 Maintaining the success of Adult Learning Programmes ..... 141

6.3 Analysis of role played by unions in Continuing Education ............ 142
6.4 Conclusion ............................................................................................ 150

Chapter 7 Student Focus Group Analysis .............................................. 152

7.1 Profile of students .............................................................................. 154
7.2 Analysis of discussion in student focus group .................................... 157
    7.2.1 Training offered by employers .................................................. 157
    7.2.2 Reasons for taking part-time study and reasons for choosing union centre as part-time course provider .......................... 160
        7.2.2.1 Reasons for studying ......................................................... 160
            7.2.2.1.1 Reasons for study: leisure, relaxation and networking .... 161
            7.2.2.1.2 Reasons for study: enhancement of work related skill and knowledge ......................................................... 167
            7.2.2.1.3 Summary ........................................................................ 171
        7.2.2.2 Reasons to choose union training centre as part-time study course providers? .............................................................. 171
            7.2.2.2.1 Flexible entry requirement ............................................. 172
            7.2.2.2.2 Low cost, convenience of study location and study time. 172
            7.2.2.2.3 Role of tutors and the case ........................................... 174
            7.2.2.2.4 Variety of courses attracting working adults to study ..... 175
            7.2.2.2.5 Intensive courses covering short time frame ............... 176
            7.2.2.2.6 Logical sequencing of courses to ensure easier progression to higher levels ......................................................... 178
            7.2.2.2.7 Union centres’ reputation as course provider .......... 179
            7.2.2.2.8 Summary ........................................................................ 180
    7.2.3 Interviewees’ expectations of union in connection with training .... 182
Chapter 8 Analysis of Eight Interviews ................................................................. 192
8.1 Profile of interviewees .................................................................................. 193
8.2 Analysis of discussion .................................................................................. 197
  8.2.1 History and government policy affecting unions in providing
        Continuing Education ............................................................................... 197
  8.2.2 Reasons why unions were able to attract working adults to their
        Continuing Education service ................................................................ 201
    8.2.2.1 History and government policy .................................................. 201
    8.2.2.2 Strong network and good promotion channel ............................. 203
    8.2.2.3 Employees’ confidence in their own unions ............................... 204
    8.2.2.4 Value-added training service meeting employee demand .......... 206
    8.2.2.5 Helping workers overcome barriers to study .............................. 209
  8.2.3 Opportunities and threats faced by unions ............................................. 211
    8.2.3.1 Opportunities .......................................................................... 212
    8.2.3.2 Threats ...................................................................................... 217
  8.2.4 Recommendation on future work of unions .......................................... 222
    8.2.4.1 Maintaining traditional programmes ....................................... 223
    8.2.4.2 Developing programmes under the QF context ........................ 225
    8.2.4.3 Working with local and overseas universities to offer
            award-bearing training .................................................................... 226
    8.2.4.4 Continuing and extending training related to Mainland China .... 227
    8.2.4.5 Putting effort into helping the government formulate proper
            policies to upgrade Hong Kong’s labour quality ............................ 227
  8.3 Conclusion .................................................................................................... 228

Chapter 9 Summary of Findings ........................................................................... 232
  9.1 Background and history of Hong Kong unions in context of Continuing
      Education .................................................................................................. 232
  9.2 Employees’ reasons for participating in Continuing Education .................. 234
  9.3 Union efforts to encourage participation in Continuing Education ............ 236
  9.4 Interviews and focus groups’ expectations of future directions .................. 239
    9.4.1 Strengths ....................................................................................... 239
    9.4.2 Weaknesses ................................................................................... 240
    9.4.3 Opportunities .................................................................................. 240
    9.4.4 Threats ............................................................................................ 241
  9.5 Conclusion .................................................................................................... 242

Chapter 10 Recommendations and Conclusion .................................................... 244
  10.1 Recommendations relating to courses provided by unions ...................... 244
10.1.1 Continued provision of traditional programmes (non-accredited related courses) .......................... 245
10.1.2 Continue to offer “interest courses” .................................................... 247
10.1.3 Offering courses with QF recognition .............................................. 247
10.1.4 Offer of programmes with non-degree certificate and diploma qualifications .......................................................... 251
10.1.5 Offer study programmes to help employees work in Mainland China . 254
10.1.6 Offer courses subsidized by Government, such as ERB courses ......... 255
10.1.7 Continued participation in policy-making related to employees’ training .................................................................................................. 257
10.1.8 Summary ......................................................................................... 257
10.2 Conclusion .......................................................................................... 258

Appendices ............................................................................................................... 263

Appendix 1: Interpretation of framework ............................................................... 263
Appendix 2: Summary of unique role played by Hong Kong unions in Continuing Education ......................................................................................... 267
Appendix 3: Interview Questions ............................................................................. 269

References .................................................................................................................... 273
List of Figures

Figure 1.1 Employed persons by change in job requirement experienced in the past three years................................................................. 5
Figure 10.1 Percentage distribution of employed persons by occupation in Hong Kong, 2nd Quarter 2010 ....................................................... 252
Figure 10.2 Percentage distribution of employed persons by industry in Hong Kong, 2nd Quarter 2010 ........................................................................ 253

List of Tables

Table 1.1 Challenges / problems faced by employees, by occupation (N=1,000)....... 4
Table 2.1: Courses offered by FTU by clusters of subjects in 2010 ......................... 64
Table 4.1: Reasons for participation in CE, by prompted vs. non-prompted response (%) .................................................................................. 89
Table 4.2: Academic level pursued by participants in CE ......................................... 91
Table 4.3: Reasons for choosing a particular CE institutions .................................. 93
Table 4.4: Major barriers to participation in CE in Hong Kong ............................. 95
Table 6.1: Hong Kong union training centre situation analysed by CMs using SWOT .................................................................................... 144
Table 7.1: Hong Kong union training centre situation analysed by a focus group of course participants using SWOT ........................................ 183
Table 8.1: Hong Kong union training centre situation analysed by individual interviewees using SWOT ...................................................... 220
Table 9.1 Framework of role played by Hong Kong union in CE .......................... 243
Abstract

This thesis develops the argument that unions in Hong Kong have an important role to play in narrowing the gap between employees’ educational needs and the provision of courses. The thesis demonstrates that the special history and the unique features of Hong Kong unions produced opportunities for them to offer education services to employees. The study confirms that the unions’ education services meet employees’ needs for Continuing Education.

Hong Kong unions’ provision of educational services is the result of their need to differentiate themselves from other unions in a competitive environment as well as of union members demanding those services in the absence of the Hong Kong Government providing them. The unions’ lack of a legal right to engage in collective bargaining led to the fragmentation of the union movement, with different unions guided by different ideals, and in turn to unions having to provide a range of services, including education services, to attract members and to consolidate their power. In addition, union members demanded that the unions provide educational services since the Hong Kong Government (both before and after 1997, when China assumed sovereignty over Hong Kong) failed to develop proper Continuing Education policies, which in turn led to employees getting the opportunity to study in union training centres.

A survey of the demand for Continuing Education by HKU SPACE (Hong Kong University, School of Professional and Continuing Education, 2001) shows that 8% of participants in Continuing Education in Hong Kong studied with the biggest union group, the FTU. This demonstrates that the unions play an important role in the provision of Continuing Education.

The research demonstrates that the unique background of Hong Kong unions, their flexible education arrangements and low course fees, and the close relationship between union members and unions, motivate employees to study and help them overcome barriers to study. Unions are not only concerned with employees’ day-to-day
work-related knowledge but also with “holistic” life and health issues. The ideal of regarding Continuing Education as a labour right supports the unions’ policy to invest their resources in helping employees to study.

The thesis argues that Hong Kong unions have an important role to play in narrowing the gap between employees’ educational needs and the actual provision of courses. The thesis demonstrates that the special history and the unique features of Hong Kong unions produced opportunities for unions to offer education services to employees. The study confirms that the unions’ education services meet employees’ needs for Continuing Education.

Seven recommendations are made which are intended to assist unions in narrowing the gap between the educational needs of employees and the provision of education services in the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region.