CAN CREATIVITY BE ACCOMMODATED IN THE COMPETENCY PARADIGM?
A MUSIC INDUSTRY CASE STUDY

by
Joy Sotheran

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences
at the University of Technology Sydney

2012
Can Creativity be Accommodated in the Competency Paradigm? A Music Industry Case Study.

Certificate of Authorship/Originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

______________________________
Joy Sotheran
Can Creativity be Accommodated in the Competency Paradigm? A Music Industry Case Study.

Acknowledgements

Thank you Paul Hager, Professor Emeritus, for remaining my Supervisor for so long. I have truly enjoyed your conversation, interest, encouragement and most of all your advice. You have been just the supervisor for me. You have responded with speed and rigour in reading all those drafts, and offered sound ideas to keep me going.

Thank you Timothy Brophy, Associate Professor of Music Education, University of Florida, for so generously sending me all the "in 'press" and published proceedings from the International Symposia on Assessment in Music Education. Thank you also for corresponding with me on particular papers of interest to my dissertation, and for obtaining permission from individual presenters for me to use those papers.

Thank you Andreas Lehmann-Wermser, Professor of Music Education, University of Bremen, for your kind assistance and advice on the Symposia on Assessment in Music Education.

Thank you performers, creators and teachers for generously giving your time and insights in six wonderful conversations on creativity that were critical to this work. Your names are not recorded here but I remember our conversations with delight.

Thank you Daniel Kaan, my husband, mentor and champion. Who else would speak to me of music, neural networks and any other detail of my work along the way? You have edited and proofed my final drafts, made great suggestions, prepared all of the formatting and presentation for my thesis – and spoiled me in every way. Please keep singing to me!

Thank you to all the faculty, library and administrative staff at UTS. Without exception you have always made me feel supported and so grateful to be a UTS student.

Thank you my wonderful friends and family, especially my daughters Jane, Cath and Anneke. You have never failed to cheer me on.

For last year’s words belong to last year’s language
And next year’s words await another voice
And to make an end is to make a beginning
TS Eliot.
Can Creativity be Accommodated in the Competency Paradigm? A Music Industry Case Study.

Table of Contents

List of Figures .................................................................................................................................................. viii
Abstract .............................................................................................................................................................. ix
1. Introduction: competence and creativity ......................................................................................................... 1
   1.1. The thesis .................................................................................................................................................. 1
   1.2. Why a case study? .................................................................................................................................. 1
   1.3. Why the research? .................................................................................................................................. 2
   1.4. Language used in the research .............................................................................................................. 3
   1.5. Project summary ...................................................................................................................................... 4
   1.6. Structure of the thesis ............................................................................................................................ 5
   1.6.1. Chapter One – Introduction ................................................................................................................ 5
   1.6.2. Chapter Two – The rise of the competency paradigm in Australia ...................................................... 5
   1.6.3. Chapter Three – Music genres and learning cultures ......................................................................... 6
   1.6.4. Chapter Four – Research methodology .............................................................................................. 6
   1.6.5. Chapter five – Accounts of creativity from the literature .................................................................... 6
   1.6.6. Chapter Six – The music industry and conversations on creativity .................................................... 7
   1.6.7. Chapter Seven – Musical creativity and competence ......................................................................... 7
   1.6.8. Chapter Eight – Research findings ....................................................................................................... 7
2. The competency paradigm in Australia: 1980–2005 ......................................................................................... 8
   2.1. Overview .................................................................................................................................................. 8
   2.2. Education in Australia ............................................................................................................................ 10
   2.2.1. A national profile for VET in Australia ............................................................................................... 14
   2.2.2. Competency Based Training ........................................................................................................... 16
   2.3. National Training Reform Agenda 1985–95 .......................................................................................... 18
   2.3.1. Convergence of industry and education ............................................................................................. 18
   2.3.2. The policy framework ....................................................................................................................... 26
   2.3.3. Overseeing implementation of the Training Reform Agenda ........................................................... 32
   2.4. The Australian Training Framework 1996–2005 .................................................................................... 37
   2.4.1. Abolition of ANTA 2005 .................................................................................................................. 38
   2.5. Conclusion ................................................................................................................................................ 39
3. Music genres and learning cultures .................................................................................................................. 40
   3.1. Distinguishing classical and popular music genres .................................................................................. 40
   3.2. Creativity questions .................................................................................................................................. 43
   3.3. Internal factors as a context for learning and creativity .......................................................................... 43
   3.4. External factors as a context for music learning ...................................................................................... 44
   3.5. Music education in Australia: the wider context of learning .................................................................. 46
   3.5.1. Dissonance between aspirations of excellence and competence ......................................................... 47
   3.5.2. Music in Higher Education – an inherited tradition of academic excellence .................................... 47
   3.5.3. Music education in schools ............................................................................................................... 56
   3.5.4. VET and music education and training .............................................................................................. 60
   3.5.5. Convergence in tertiary music education: why the urge to merge? .................................................... 66
   3.6. Assessing creativity: is it “a minefield”? .................................................................................................. 71
   3.6.1. Examples of different assessment contexts .......................................................................................... 73
   3.6.2. CBT and the decoupling of assessment from formal learning ............................................................ 76
   3.6.3. The AMEB: another competency based assessment system .............................................................. 77
   3.7. Conclusion ................................................................................................................................................ 80
   3.7.1. To what extent is creativity a gift, a behaviour, a competence, or a skill? ........................................... 81
   3.7.2. To what extent can creativity be learned? ........................................................................................... 81
Can Creativity be Accommodated in the Competency Paradigm? A Music Industry Case Study.

4. Research methodology

4.1. Research method and design overview

4.2. The Case study

4.3. Data sources

4.3.1. Intrinsic case study

4.3.2. Problems for the music industry case study

4.4. Ethical considerations

4.5. Two creativity studies for triangulation with the case study

4.5.1. Study one: the creativity literature enquiry

4.5.2. Study two: music industry creativity enquiry in conversations with practitioners

4.5.3. The case study: CBT creativity items and triangulation

4.5.4. Strengths and limitations of the methodology

5. Creativity: accounts from the literature

5.1. The creativity literature enquiry in context

5.2. Scope of literature enquiry

5.3. Analytical orientation of the literature review

5.3.1. Culture and creativity

5.3.2. Contested conceptions of music and categorisations of music cultures

5.4. Defining creativity

5.5. Assessing creativity

5.6. The creativity literature

5.6.1. Navigating creativity: romantic, pragmatic and other accounts

5.7. Questions guiding the literature analysis

5.8. Popular literature on creativity

5.8.1. The first wave: stepping outside the box with new thinking hats

5.8.2. The second wave: stepping outside academe to influence policy

5.8.3. The third wave: neuroscientists step out to explain the brain

5.9. The scholarly literature

5.9.1. Intelligence and creativity: highlighting assessment

5.9.2. Definitions and accounts of selected creativity theorists

5.9.3. Dimensions of creativity

5.9.4. Creativity, neuroscience and technology

5.9.5. Creativity, musicians and music scholars

5.10. Conclusion

5.10.1. To what extent can creativity be described and/or defined?

5.10.2. How is creativity apprehended, perceived and understood?

5.10.3. What factors are most likely to be associated in manifesting creativity?

5.10.4. To what extent is creativity a gift, a behaviour, a competence, or a skill?

5.10.5. To what extent can creativity be learned?

5.10.6. How can we know that it has been learned?

5.10.7. What is the significance of creativity for “productive practice / success” in the context of commercial music markets?

5.10.8. Finally

6. The music industry and conversations on creativity

6.1. Music

6.2. Music markets

6.3. Music industry

6.4. Conversations with music industry practitioners

6.4.1. Focus Questions

6.5. Disengagement with Units of Competency

Joy Sotheran: PhD Thesis
Can Creativity be Accommodated in the Competency Paradigm? A Music Industry Case Study.

6.6. Units of Competency selected for creativity

6.6.1. Create original music

6.6.2. Provide tuition for composition

6.6.3. Perform music as soloist

6.6.4. Provide instrumental/vocal tuition

6.6.5. Develop and practise improvisation

6.6.6. Perform improvisation for audience

6.6.7. Develop and implement sound production for a recording

6.6.8. Develop self as artist

6.7. Insights of contemporary music practitioners on creativity

6.7.1. Music industry practitioners define creativity

6.7.2. Types or modes of creativity

6.7.3. Negotiating boundaries of musical creativity

6.7.4. Personality and creativity

6.7.5. Music as a language: creativity and meaning

6.7.6. Teaching and learning creativity

6.7.7. Assessing creativity

6.7.8. Creativity related Units of Competency and the Training Package

6.8. Conclusion

6.8.1. To what extent can creativity be described and/or defined?

6.8.2. How is creativity apprehended, perceived and understood?

6.8.3. What factors are most likely to be associated in manifesting creativity?

6.8.4. To what extent is creativity a gift, a behaviour, a competence, or a skill?

6.8.5. To what extent can creativity be learned?

6.8.6. How can we know that it has been learned?

6.8.7. What is the significance of creativity for “productive practice / success” in the context of commercial music markets?

6.8.8. Finally

7. Musical creativity and competence: the case study

7.1. The Music Industry Training Package 01

7.2. Training Packages as conveyors of the Australian CBT system

7.3. Life cycle of Training Packages

7.3.1. Training Package implementation

7.4. Structure, reach and implications of Training Packages

7.4.1. Accredited courses

7.4.2. Concerns with Training Packages

7.4.3. Units of Competency

7.4.4. Structure of Units of Competency

7.5. Purposive sample of eight Units of Competency

7.6. Selection of the purposive sample of Units of Competency

7.6.1. Composition

7.6.2. Performance

7.6.3. Tuition

7.6.4. Improvisation

7.6.5. Sound production

7.6.6. Core creative skills

7.7. Levels and qualities of creativity in the sample

7.8. Convergence of Units of Competency with data sources

7.8.1. Create Original Music

7.8.2. Provide Tuition for Composition

7.8.3. Perform Music as a Soloist
Can Creativity be Accommodated in the Competency Paradigm? A Music Industry Case Study.

7.8.4. Provide Instrumental/Vocal Tuition ................................................................. 233
7.8.5. Develop and Practise Improvisation ............................................................... 235
7.8.6. Perform Improvisation for Audience ............................................................. 236
7.8.7. Develop and Implement Sound Production for a Recording ....................... 240
7.8.8. Develop Self as Artist ...................................................................................... 243
7.9. Findings from the case study investigation ....................................................... 245
7.9.1. The degree of creativity specified across the sample units........................... 245
7.9.2. The capacity of the competency approach to develop creative skills ............ 246
7.9.3. What changes might be considered to increase the capacity of any of the selected standards in developing creativity? ................................................................. 246
7.9.4. To what extent does data from the literature enquiry and industry conversations correlate with any aspects of the sampled Units of Competency? ................................................... 247
7.9.5. Is creativity more important in some areas than in others and if so in what way? 247
7.10. Conclusion ......................................................................................................... 248

8. Research findings .................................................................................................. 249
8.1. To what extent can creativity be described and/or defined? ............................. 249
8.2. How is creativity apprehended, perceived and understood? ............................ 250
8.3. What is the significance of creativity for "productive practice / success" in the context of commercial music markets? ................................................................. 251
8.4. What factors are most likely to be associated in manifesting creativity? ............ 251
8.5. To what extent is creativity a gift, a behaviour, a competence, or a skill? ........ 252
8.6. To what extent can creativity be learned? ......................................................... 253
8.7. Can we know when creativity has been learned? .............................................. 254
8.8. Conclusion .......................................................................................................... 257

Appendix A: Glossary .............................................................................................. 259

Appendix B: Industry conversations ........................................................................ 261
Conversation 1: Music Teacher in TAFE ................................................................. 261
Conversation 2: RTO Chief Executive Officer ......................................................... 271
Conversation 3: Performer / High School Music Teacher ....................................... 275
Conversation 4: Artists Manager ............................................................................. 280
Conversation 5: Composer ...................................................................................... 287
Conversation 6: Performer / University Academic ................................................ 298

Appendix C: Units of Competency .......................................................................... 311
Unit of Competency 1: CUSMCP05A: Create original music ................................. 311
Unit of Competency 2: CUSLRN03A: Provide tuition for composition .................. 317
Unit of Competency 3: CUSMPF15A: Perform music as a soloist .......................... 323
Unit of Competency 4: CUSLRN02A: Provide instrumental/vocal tuition ............. 328
Unit of Competency 5: CUSMPF10A: Develop and practice improvisation .......... 336
Unit of Competency 6: CUSMPF16A: Perform improvisation for audience .......... 340
Unit of Competency 7: CUSSOU17A: Develop and implement sound production for a recording ........................................................................................................ 344
Unit of Competency 8: CUSMGE02A: Develop self as artist ............................... 349

Appendix D: Participant consent forms ................................................................. 354
Letter to prospective participants .......................................................................... 354
List of questions for participants .......................................................................... 355
Participant consent form ....................................................................................... 357

Bibliography .......................................................................................................... 358

Joy Sotheran: PhD Thesis
List of Figures

Figure 1: Molino’s tripartite model.......................................................... 140
Can Creativity be Accommodated in the Competency Paradigm? A Music Industry Case Study.

Abstract

The primary question of this research is; can creativity be accommodated in the competency system? A number of enquiries underpin consideration of this question. Two enquiries give background to the study. Firstly, consideration is given to the genesis of the competency system in the Australia socio-political context. Secondly, musical creativity is considered from the wider educational perspective in which Vocational Education and Training is situated.

Thirdly, a literature enquiry investigates popular and scholarly domains to identify theories of creativity as a basis for better understanding creativity. Fourthly, conversations with six popular commercial music industry practitioners, working creative artists, artist managers and teachers in the popular commercial music industry, evoke direct experience and understanding of musical creativity in the context of the case study.

Finally, specific competency items are measured against the findings of the preceding enquiries, that delineate creativity, to test the suitability of Competency Based Training learning and assessment materials to deal with creativity. These Competency Based Training items form the case study.