

**Thinking Art Post-aesthetically: Beyond Expression,
Experience and Consciousness**

Ian Andrews

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements of the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences
University of Technology Sydney
2011

CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP/ORIGINALITY

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Student

Acknowledgements

I offer the greatest thanks to Professor Norie Neumark, my original primary supervisor, for essential guidance and support, and to Dr Martin Harrison, my secondary supervisor, who kindly took over as primary supervisor in the later stages, and who rigorously challenged my ideas at the deepest level.

I owe a deep gratitude to my parents who patiently proofread this dissertation, and Annelies Larsson for invaluable assistance with English translation of German texts. I am thankful for various conversations with friends and colleges: Sophia Learner, Greg Shapley, Garry Bradbury, Sarah Last, Michael Graeve, Margie Borschke, Mark Titmarsh, Ruark Lewis, Geoffrey Barnard, John Hopkins, Billy Gruner, Daniel Mafe, Justin Clemens and Adam Nash. I thank Barbara Bolt and Francisco López for their kind responses to my questions. This project would have been much more difficult without www.beyng.com, a wonderful Heidegger resource.

My greatest thanks and love goes to Tamara Larsson, to whom this work is dedicated, and to the loving memory of John Blades who sadly passed away in 2011.

Table of Contents

Abbreviations	vii
List Of Plates	xii
Abstract.....	xiii
Introduction.....	1
0.1 Thinking Art	1
0.2 Scope: Art and Philosophy.....	3
0.3 Post-aesthetic Philosophy	4
0.4 Heidegger: Twisting Free from Aesthetics	4
0.5 John Cage and the Flux	5
0.6 Aims.....	6
0.7 Chapter Breakdown.....	7
0.7.1 Aesthetics	7
0.7.2 Conceptual Art and Post-aesthetic Theory.....	7
0.7.3 Heidegger and the Work of Art	8
0.7.4 Sound, Phenomenology, and Concrete Knowledge	10
0.7.5 From Sound to Language	11
0.8 Overview	12
1. Untangling Aesthetics	15
1.1 Aesthetics	16
1.2 Kantian Aesthetics and After	18
1.3 Symbol and Allegory	20
1.4 Significant Form.....	22
1.5 Modernist Criticism	23
1.6 Self-criticism and Genius.....	25
1.7 Presentness and Theatre	27
2. After Aesthetics: Conceptual Art and Post-aesthetics.....	30
2.1 Art & Language and Joseph Kosuth	31
2.2 Art's Autonomy	33
2.3 Re-thinking Autonomy	35
2.4 Representationalism	37
2.5 Theory Wars	39
2.6 The Primacy of Intention	41
2.7 Post-aesthetic Theory	43
2.8 Political Aesthetics.....	45
2.9 Twisting Free from Aesthetics	47

3. Heidegger's History of Western Ontology and Aesthetics	49
3.1 Truth as Unconcealment	51
3.2 The History of Aesthetics	54
3.3 Form and Matter	56
3.4 The Beautiful	58
3.5 Representational Thinking	60
3.6 Objectification	62
4. Lived Experience, Machination, and the Retrieval of <i>Technē</i>	66
4.1 Lived Experience	67
4.2 <i>Erlebnis</i> in Early Heidegger	68
4.3 The Death of Art	71
4.4 Will-to-Will	74
4.5 Machination	76
4.6 Heidegger's Retrieval of <i>Technē</i>	79
4.7 <i>Physis</i> and Wonder	80
4.8 <i>Technē</i> and Machination	82
4.9 <i>Poiēsis</i>	83
5. Art as Knowing and Letting	86
5.1 Estrangement	88
5.2 World and Earth	91
5.3 Works of Earth	94
5.4 Knowing, Willing, Letting	98
5.5 Resoluteness	99
5.6 Non-willing Thinking	102
5.7 Displacing Aesthetics	103
6. Sound, Materiality, and Phenomenology	107
6.1 Music and Sound Art	108
6.2 Sound-in-Itself	110
6.3 Sound and Vision	112
6.4 Acousmatic Listening	114
6.5 Phenomenology	116
6.6 The Phenomenological Reduction	118
6.7 Reduced Listening and the Eidetic Reduction	119
6.8 From Sound Object to Musical Object	121
6.9 Phenomenology's Latent Aesthetics	123

7. Experimental Art: Chance and Indeterminacy	129
7.1 Chance	130
7.2 Indeterminacy	134
7.3 Silence and Non-intentionality.....	135
7.4 The Irrelevant Process	137
7.5 The Reception of Chance.....	139
7.6 Processes and Systems.....	141
7.7 Toposonics.....	147
8. Experience, Flux, and Repetition	150
8.1 Without Why.....	151
8.2 Cage, Fluxus, and the Flux	153
8.3 Ontological Innocence	155
8.4 The Horizon-structure of Experience	157
8.5 Repetition	159
8.6 Experience and Concrete Knowing.....	162
8.7 The Temporal Experience of the Event	166
8.8 Contextured Experience	167
8.9 The Logic of Identity.....	171
9. Against Expression: Poethics	173
9.1 Expressivity and Expressionism.....	174
9.2 Non-intentionality and Responsibility.....	177
9.3 The Essential Drift of Poethics	179
9.4 Meaning-Intention	181
9.5 <i>Vouloir Dire</i>	184
9.6 The Limits of Meaning.....	186
10. Conceptual Art as Poetry	190
10.1 Poetry as Conceptual Art.....	191
10.2 Transparency and Opacity of the Word	192
10.3 Materiality and Concrete Poetry.....	193
10.4 A Science of the Trivial.....	195
10.5 Syntactical Excess	198
10.6 Conceptual Writing.....	200
10.7 <i>Between</i> Word and Thing.....	202
10.8 Word and Image	204
10.9 Work as Keeping Vigilance.....	206
Conclusion	213

Appendix 1.....	221
Appendix 2.....	223
Notes	224
Bibliography	245

List of Abbreviations

Heidegger's Works

- AED* *Aus der Erfahrung des Denkens 1910-1976* [GA 13] (Frankfurt Am Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 2002).
- B* *Besinnung* [GA 66] (Frankfurt Am Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 1997).
- BPP* *The Basic Problems of Phenomenology*, trans. Albert Hofstadter (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1988).
- BQP* *Basic Questions of Philosophy: Selected "Problems" of "logic,"* trans. Richard Rojewicz and André Schuwer (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1994).
- BT* *Being and Time*, trans. John Macquarrie and Edward Robinson (Oxford: Blackwell, 1962).
- BW* *Basic Writings: From Being and Time (1927) to The Task of Thinking (1964)*, edited, with general introduction and introductions to each selection by David Farrell Krell (San Francisco: Harper San Francisco, c1993).
- BzP* *Beiträge zur Philosophie (Vom Ereignis)* [GA 65] (Frankfurt Am Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 1989).
- CP* *Contributions to Philosophy: (from Enowning)*, trans. Parvis Emad and Kenneth Maly (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1999).
- DOT* *Discourse on Thinking: A Translation of Gelassenheit*, trans. John M. Anderson and E. Hans Freund (New York: Harper & Row, 1969).
- EGT* *Early Greek Thinking*, trans. David Farrell Krell & Frank A. Capuzzi (San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1984).
- EM* *Einführung in die Metaphysik* [GA 40] 6th Edition (Tübingen: Max Niemeyer Verlag, 1998).
- EP* *The End of Philosophy*, trans. Joan Stambaugh (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003).
- EPF* *Einführung in die phänomenologische Forschung*, [GA 17] ed. Friedrich-Wilhelm von Herrmann (Frankfurt am Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 1994).
- FCM* *The Fundamental Concepts of Metaphysics: World, Finitude, Solitude*, trans. William McNeill and Nicholas Walker (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1995).

- FS* *Four Seminars*, trans. Andrew Mitchell and Francois Raffoul (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2003).
- GP* *Die Grundprobleme der Phänomenologie* [GA 24] (Frankfurt am Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 1975).
- GdP* *Grundfragen der Philosophie: Ausgewählt "Probleme" der "Logik,"* [GA 45] (Frankfurt Am Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 1984).
- GM* *Die Grundbegriffe der Metaphysik: Welt, Enlichkeit, Einsamkeit,* [GA 29/30], ed. Friedrich-Wilhelm von Herrmann (Frankfurt Am Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 1983).
- HH* *Hölderlin's Hymnen "Germanien" und "Der Rhein"* [GA 39] (Frankfurt am Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 1980).
- HW* *Holzwege,* [GA 5] (Frankfurt am Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 1977)
"Der Ursprung des Kunstwerkes," (1935-1936), pp. 1-74. "Die Zeit des Weltbildes," (1938) pp. 75-113.
- IM* *An Introduction to Metaphysics*, trans. Gregory Fried & Richard Polt (New York; London: Yale University Press, 2000).
- IPR* *Introduction to Phenomenological Research*, trans. Daniel O. Dahlstrom (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2005)
- M* *Mindfulness*, trans. Parvis Emad and Kenneth Maly (London: Continuum, 2006).
- N* *Nietzsche: vol. I: The Will to Power as Art*, trans. David Farrell Krell (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1979).
- NI* *Nietzsche I,* [GA 6.1 Vol. I] (Frankfurt am Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 1996). "Der Wille zur Macht als Kunst" (1936-37).
- NII* *Nietzsche II,* [GA 6.2 Vol. II] (Frankfurt am Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 1996).
"Der Metaphysik als Geschichte des Seins" (1941).
- OBT* *Off the Beaten Track*, trans. Julian Young and Kenneth Haynes (Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002).
- OWL* *On the Way to Language*, trans. Peter D. Hertz (San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1982).
- PAA* *Phänomenologie der Anschauung und des Ausdrucks: Theorie der philosophischen Begriffsbildung,* [GA 59] (Frankfurt am Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 1993).

- PIE* *Phenomenology of Intuition and Expression: Theory of Philosophical Concept Formation*, trans. Tracy Colony (London: Continuum, 2010).
- PR* *The Principle of Reason*, trans. Reginald Lilly (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1991).
- PS* *Plato's Sophist*, trans. Richard Rojcewicz and André Schuwer (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2003).
- P:S* *Platon: Sophistes*, [GA 19] (Frankfurt am Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 1992).
- QCT* *The Question Concerning Technology, and Other Essays*, trans. William Lovitt (New York: Garland Pub., 1977).
- SvG* *Der Satz vom Grund*, [GA 10] 9th Edition (Stuttgart: Klett-Cotta, 2006).
- SZ* *Sein und Zeit*, [GA 2] (Tübingen: Max Niemeyer, 1957).
- TDP* *Towards the Definition of Philosophy: With a Transcript of the Lecture Course "On the Nature of the University and Academic Study"*, trans. Ted Sadler (New Brunswick, NJ: Athlone Press, 2000).
- US* *Unterwegs zur Sprache*, [GA12] (Pfullingen: Günther Neske, 1975).
- VA* *Vorträge und Aufsätze*, [GA 7] 10th Edition (Stuttgart: Klett-Cotta, 2004).
 "Die Frage nach der Technik," (1949), pp. 9-40. "Wissenschaft un Besinnung," (1954), pp. 41-66. "Überwindung der Metaphysik," (1936-1946), pp. 67-95.
- WCT* *What is Called Thinking?* trans. J. Glenn Gray (New York: Harper Colophon Books, 1954).
- WHD* *Was Heisst Denken?* [GA 8] 5th Edition (Tübingen: Max Niemeyer Verlag, 1977).
- ZBP* *Zur Bestimmung der Philosophie*, [GA 56/57] (Frankfurt am Main: Vittorio Klostermann, 1987).
- ZS* *Zollikon Seminars: Protocols, Conversations, Letters*, trans. Franz Mayr, Richard Askay (Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 2001).

Husserl's Works

- CM* *Cartesian Meditations: An Introduction to Phenomenology*, trans. Dorion Cairns (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic, 1995).
- EJ* *Experience and Judgment: Investigations in a Genealogy of Logic*, trans. James S.

Churchill and Karl Ameriks, ed. Ludwig Landgrebe (Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1973).

Ideas I *Ideas: General Introduction to Pure Phenomenology I (Ideas I)*, trans. W. R. Boyce Gibson (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1969).

LI *Logical Investigations*, Vol. 1, trans. J. N. Findlay (London: Routledge, 2001).

LI 2 *Logical Investigations*, Vol. 2, trans. J. N. Findlay (London: Routledge, 2001).

PICM *Phantasy, Image Consciousness, and Memory, 1898-1925*, trans. John B. Brough, (Dordrecht: Springer, 2005).

PIT *The Phenomenology of Internal Time-Consciousness*, trans. Calvin O. Schrag, ed. Martin Heidegger (Bloomington & London: Indiana University Press, 1964).

Gadamer's Works

PH *Philosophical Hermeneutics*, trans. David E. Linge (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1976).

TM *Truth and Method*, Second Revised Edition, trans. Joel Weinsheimer and Donald G. Marshall (London; New York: Continuum, 2004).

Kant's Works

CPR *Immanuel Kant's Critique of Pure Reason*, trans. J. M. D. Meiklejohn (London: G. Bell and Sons, 1924).

CoJ *The Critique of Judgement*, trans. James Creed Meredith (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1952).

Derrida's Works

Diss *Dissemination*, trans. Barbara Johnson (London: Athlone, 1981).

LInc *Limited Inc*, trans. Samuel Weber & Jeffrey Mehlman (Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1988).

MC "My Chances/ Mes Chances: A Rendezvous with Some Epicurean Stereophonies." In *Taking Chances: Derrida, Psychoanalysis, and Literature*, edited by Jo-

seph Smith and William Kerrigan, 1-32. (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1984).

OG *Of Grammatology*, trans. Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1976).

Pos *Positions*, trans. Alan Bass (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1981).

SP *Speech and Phenomena, and Other Essays on Husserl's Theory of Signs*, trans. David B. Allison (Evanston: Northwestern University Press, 1973).

TP *The Truth in Painting*, trans. Geoff Bennington, & Ian McLeod (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987).

List of Plates

1. Joseph Kosuth, *One and Three Chairs*, 1965-69, (ARTstor). 32
2. Mel Ramsden, *Secret Painting*, 1967-68, (image courtesy of vapourtrails). 32
3. Antony Gormley, *Asian Field*, 2003, (image courtesy of Geigenot). 96
4. Santiago Sierra, *3000 Holes of 180 x 50 x 50 cm each*, 2002, (Image courtesy of José Antonio Méndez Acosta) 96
5. Hans Haacke, *Condensation Cube*, 1963/2008, (image courtesy of Andrew Russeth).
..... 144
6. Hans Haacke, *News*, 1969/2008, RSS newsfeed, paper, and printer, San Francisco
Museum of Modern Art (SFMOMA, ARTstor). 144
7. Sol LeWitt, *Pyramid*, 2005, John Kaldor Family Collection. 145
8. Bernd and Hilla Becher, *Blast Furnaces, Germany, France, Luxembourg, United States*,
(1970-84, printed 1989) John Kaldor Family Collection..... 146
9. Joseph Kosuth, *Neon (Self-Defined)*, 1965 (image courtesy of Larry Qualls Archive,
ARTstor).. 209
10. Marcel Broodthaers, *Panneau A*, 1974-75, photographs, drawings and watercolours,
(image courtesy of Larry Qualls Archive, ARTstor)..... 210
11. Ian Andrews, pages from *Caprice Lulu America*, 2011..... 210
12. J. G. Ballard, collage from the 1950s (image removed). 211
13. Bill Seaman, *Passage Sets/One Pulls Pivots at the Tip of the Tongue*, 1994-95. Interac-
tive audio-visual installation, exhibited at the Guggenheim Museum, Fall 1996. Im-
age: Larry Qualls. 212
14. Sandra Selig, *Surface of Change* 2007, cut book pages, acrylic, 15 parts, each 35 x 25
cm (image courtesy of the artist and Milani Gallery). 212

Abstract

This dissertation asks: in what way can the practice of art, and the encounter with the work of art, constitute the site for a form of philosophical thinking? The work draws on ‘post-aesthetic’ theory, and, in particular, the philosophy of Martin Heidegger and Jacques Derrida to ask: to what extent would this thinking, or modality of knowing, consist of a material or poetic thinking, and how, if it not simply irrational, would it differ from logical discourse? Art is typically thought either in terms of the aesthetic attitude—incorporating subjectivist notions of expression taste and lived experience—or, alternatively, as a logical enterprise, where the work is seen as a carrier of a message incorporating an analytical-political critique. This project seeks to develop a third way that rejects a fusion or neutralisation of this opposition. Central to this argument is the necessity of displacing not only what Heidegger calls ‘representational thinking’ (*Vorstellung*), but also its metaphysical counter-part: lived-experience (*Erlebnis*). Interrogating the fields of both art and philosophy, this dissertation enquires as to how certain practices of art might engage in what might be art’s specific way of thinking, and consider the production and reception of art as a modality of knowing which displaces the modernist metaphysical notions of expression, intention, experience (*Erlebnis*), and aesthetic pleasure. At the same time it examines the theoretical documents and practices of (i), conceptual art, and (ii) John Cage and Fluxus, in order to open the possibility for a non-aesthetic, and non-conceptual, encounter with the work of art, that does not jettison materiality and thinking. In accordance with Heidegger’s thinking on art, This study finds that the non-intentionality of Cage and Fluxus constitutes a radical abstention from aesthetic judgment in making art, and that it offers a way of thinking beyond the closure of the strict volitional model of Conceptual Art. Yet this work puts into question a certain ontological naivety in Cage’s conception of the listening experience as an aesthetic attuning of the faculties. This dissertation proposes that the encounter with the contemporary work of art involves a complex interplay between pre-structured experience and language, rather than what would normally be conceived as sensual-emotional pleasure in form, direct contact with experiential flux, or the receipt of a message that is the explicit product of an artist’s intention.