

University of Technology, Sydney
Faculty of Engineering & Information Technology

**EARNED VALUE MANAGEMENT APPLIED TO AN
ENGINEERED-TO-ORDER MULTIPLE PROJECT
ENVIRONMENT**

by

David Lincoln Fox

Master of Engineering (Research)

Supervisor: Associate Professor David Eager

Co-Supervisor: Dr Klaus Niebecker

Co-Supervisor: Mary Walmsley

31st December 2012

CERTIFICATE OF ORIGINALITY

I certify that the work in this thesis titled “Earned Value Management Applied to an Engineered-To-Order Multiple Project Environment” has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of the requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text. I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Student:

David Lincoln Fox

Date: Monday, 31st December 2012

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Fostering the academic ability of students in the engineering profession requires many years of mentoring coupled to a wealth of personal experience in the profession. Associate Professor David Eager has played a significant role in shaping my abilities in this field of practice, support that is greatly appreciated. Through his guidance and the capacity to visualise links between practical problems and theory he has provided the basis for planning and delivering this research. The academic elements of this research were moulded to the practical problems through the many discussions held with co-supervisors Mary Walmsley and Dr Klaus Niebecker, each bringing their own industry and research knowledge and insights into play whenever required.

Mention must be made of the assistance provided through the Commonwealth Governments Research Training Scheme program and UTS for its practice-based research opportunities, both essential elements that made it feasible for me to pursue this research.

The body of the research is indebted to L&A Pressure Welding Pty Ltd (LAP) for access to live project information and its business systems. Further acknowledgment needs to be directed to having the opportunity to implement changes to the organisation to test research outcomes and then document the experiences, this process created a unique learning environment that benefited both LAP and me personally. The most sincere thanks is due to Louie and Anne Chouaifaity, the owners of LAP. Their trust in me with their company's direction has been exceptional. Their continual encouragement and support must be regarded as extraordinary generosity and will always be remembered.

The final support element for this research is associated with family, my wife Liz has shown extended patience in managing the family and household while I became centred on my research. My children; Mathew (11), Vanessa (8) and Joseph (5) displayed remarkable restraint during the writing of this thesis. My parents also played a significant role, my mother assisted in juggling commitments with the children and my father for committing large amounts of time to proof reading material, discussing concepts and extracting chapter content for summarising. To my family there is a need to express immense appreciation.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1	1
1 Introduction.....	1
1.1 Background.....	1
1.2 Literature.....	2
1.3 Research Context.....	5
1.4 Research Focus.....	6
1.5 Research Frame.....	8
1.6 Method.....	10
1.6.1 System Development.....	10
1.6.2 Project Data.....	11
1.6.3 Application Process.....	12
1.7 Outcomes.....	13
1.7.1 System and Business.....	13
1.7.2 EVM Application.....	13
1.8 Chapter Summary.....	14
CHAPTER 2	16
2 Literature Review	16
2.1 Small Medium Enterprise.....	16
2.2 Earned Value Management.....	18
2.2.1 History and Development.....	19
2.2.2 Private Industry Uptake.....	23
2.2.3 Schedule Analysis.....	24
2.2.4 Earned Duration (ED).....	27
2.2.5 Earned Schedule (ES).....	29
2.2.6 Planned Value Rate (PV Rate).....	32
2.2.7 Application.....	34
2.3 Project Modelling.....	38
2.3.1 Mathematical Modelling.....	40
2.3.2 Modelling and Management.....	43
2.3.3 The ‘S’ Curve.....	44
2.3.4 Indexes and Forecasting.....	46
2.3.5 Index Domains.....	47
2.3.6 Schedules Structure and Networks.....	48
2.3.7 The Scope of Modelling.....	49
2.4 Organisational Project Management.....	51
2.4.1 Project and Portfolio Management.....	51
2.4.2 Project Management Systems and the User.....	53
2.4.3 Managing Projects in Business.....	56
2.4.4 Structure and Processes.....	57
2.5 Chapter Summary.....	61
Chapter 3	65
3 Research Design	65
3.1 Outline.....	65
3.2 Management-Orientated Activities.....	66
3.2.1 Context.....	66
3.2.2 Objectives.....	66

3.2.3	Questions.....	67
3.3	EVM Method	68
3.3.1	Project Type.....	69
3.3.2	Objectives	70
3.3.3	Questions.....	70
3.4	Development.....	71
3.4.1	Project Management Systems.....	72
3.4.2	EVM Adaption.....	75
3.4.3	EVM Trials	76
3.4.4	EVM Validation.....	79
3.4.5	System Simplification.....	80
3.4.6	Forecasting Strategies	83
3.5	Chapter Summary	84
Chapter 4		87
4 Application and Data.....		87
4.1	Data Capture	87
4.2	Application Method	88
4.2.1	Project Work Book	89
4.2.2	Project Budget.....	89
4.2.3	Booked Hours	92
4.2.4	Material Costs	93
4.2.5	Schedule.....	97
4.2.6	Labour for the TPB	100
4.2.7	Time Phase Budget	103
4.3	Project Data Sets	108
4.4	Modelling Methods.....	112
4.4.1	Measurement Period (Frequency).....	112
4.4.2	Level of Detail (Granularity)	113
4.4.3	Performance Measures and Forecasting	113
4.4.4	Critical Path and Product Geometry	116
4.5	Chapter Summary	119
Chapter 5		121
5 Analysis and Results		121
5.1	Preliminary Notes	121
5.2	General Observations.....	123
5.3	Project T001 – Review and Analysis.....	126
5.3.1	T001 – Trial Details.....	126
5.3.2	T001 – Labour, EVM and SV_t Curves.....	127
5.3.3	T001 – IEAC _t Forecasting	129
5.3.4	T001 – EAC Forecasting	133
5.4	Project T002 – Review and Analysis.....	136
5.4.1	T002 – Trial Details.....	136
5.4.2	T002 – Labour, EVM and SV_t Curves.....	136
5.4.3	T002 – IEAC _t Forecasting	138
5.4.4	T002 – EAC Forecasting	139
5.5	Project T003 – Review and Analysis.....	141
5.5.1	T003 – Trial Details.....	141
5.5.2	T003 – Labour, EVM and SV_t Curves.....	142
5.5.3	T003 – IEAC _t Forecasting	144

5.5.4	T003 – EAC Forecasting	144
5.6	Project T004 – Review and Analysis.....	146
5.6.1	T004 – Trial Details	146
5.6.2	T004 – Labour, EVM and SV _t Curves.....	146
5.6.3	T004 – IEAC _t Forecasting	149
5.6.4	T004 – EAC Forecasting	149
5.7	Project T005 – Review and Analysis.....	151
5.7.1	T005 – Trial Details	151
5.7.2	T005 – Labour, EVM and SV _t Curves.....	151
5.7.3	T005 – IEAC _t Forecasting	154
5.7.4	T005 – EAC Forecasting	155
5.8	Project S001 / Labour Only – Review and Analysis	155
5.8.1	S001 and LO – Trial Details	155
5.8.2	S001 and LO – Labour, EVM and SV _t Curves.....	156
5.8.3	S001 and LO – IEAC _t Forecasting	160
5.8.4	S001 and LO – EAC Forecasting.....	162
5.9	Project S002 / Labour Only – Review and Analysis	164
5.9.1	S002 and LO – Trial Details	164
5.9.2	S002 and LO – Labour, EVM and SV _t Curves.....	164
5.9.3	S002 and LO – IEAC _t Forecasting	168
5.9.4	S002 and LO – EAC Forecasting.....	169
5.10	Project S006 / Labour Only – Review and Analysis	172
5.10.1	S006 and LO – Trial Details	172
5.10.2	S006 and LO – Labour, EVM and SV _t Curves.....	173
5.10.3	S006 and LO – IEAC _t Forecasting	175
5.10.4	S006 and LO – EAC Forecasting.....	177
5.11	Summary of Results.....	179
5.11.1	Tabulation of IEAC _# and EAC Outcomes	180
5.11.2	Discussion.....	182
5.12	Assessment of Research Questions.....	183
5.12.1	Management-Orientated Activities.....	183
5.12.2	EVM Method	185
5.13	Chapter Summary	194
Chapter 6		197
6 Conclusion		197
6.1	EVM Application.....	197
6.2	Project Management in Business	201
6.3	Research Value	204
6.3.1	Contribution and Strengths	204
6.3.2	Limitations and Weaknesses.....	205
6.4	Further Research	206
6.5	Chapter Summary	207
Bibliography		211
A. Appendix A – Project Schedules		215
A.1	Scheduling Method	216
A.1.1	Software and Application	216
A.2	Project T001 – Schedule, Task Level	217
A.3	Project T002 – Schedule, WP Level.....	222
A.4	Project T003 – Schedule, WP Level.....	223

A.5	Project T004 – Schedule, WP Level	224
A.6	Project T005 – Schedule, WP Level	226
A.7	Project ‘S’ – Schedule, Task Level.....	228
B.	Appendix B – Time Phase Budget.....	231
B.1	Typical Monthly TPB Sample and Calculations	232
C.	Appendix C – Photos	241
C.1	Pressure Vessel Configuration Comments.....	242
C.2	Project T001 – Photos.....	243
C.3	Project T002 – Photos.....	244
C.4	Project T003 – Photos.....	245
C.5	Project T004 – Photos.....	246
C.6	Project T005 – Photos.....	247
C.7	Project ‘S’ – Photos	248
D.	Appendix D – Fortnightly / Monthly Curves	249
D.1	Project T001 – Fortnightly / Monthly Curves	250
D.2	Project T002 – Fortnightly / Monthly Curves	253
D.3	Project T003 – Fortnightly / Monthly Curves	256
D.4	Project T004 – Fortnightly / Monthly Curves	259
D.5	Project T005 – Fortnightly / Monthly Curves	262
D.6	Project S001 – Fortnightly / Monthly Curves.....	265
D.7	Project S002 – Fortnightly / Monthly Curves.....	268
D.8	Project S006 – Fortnightly / Monthly Curves.....	271

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1 – Typical Horizontal Pressure Vessel.....	6
Figure 4.1 – Sample BAC user Interface.....	90
Figure 4.2 – Booked Hours Worksheet Sample.....	92
Figure 4.3 – Material Costs Worksheet.....	93
Figure 4.4 – Material Cost Cells from the BAC Groups.....	94
Figure 4.5 – Material Cost Cell Reporting.....	95
Figure 4.6 – Deliveries, Planned & Actual Dates.....	95
Figure 4.7 – Material Costs Processed for TPB EV Allocation.....	97
Figure 4.8 – Sample Project Schedule WBS.....	99
Figure 4.9 – TPB Labour WDC Sample.....	100
Figure 4.10 – Decompressing the TPB WDC for Task Allocation.....	101
Figure 4.11 – Re-Compressing the TPB WDC and Rolled up Cost.....	101
Figure 4.12 – Labour TPB, PV & EV Data Entry.....	103
Figure 4.13 – Sample TPB Cost Cell Structure.....	105
Figure 5.1 – T001 Weekly Project Hours (Ref CO-1).....	127
Figure 5.2 – T001 Weekly EVM & SV_t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	128
Figure 5.3 – T001 Weekly $IEAC_t$ Curves (Ref CO-3).....	130
Figure 5.4 – T001 Weekly $IEAC_{t,i,j,k}$ Curves (Ref CO-4).....	131
Figure 5.5 – T001 Weekly $IEAC_{t,IF}$ (Ref CO-5).....	132
Figure 5.6 – T001 Weekly EAC Curves (Ref CO-6).....	133
Figure 5.7 – T001 Weekly $EAC_{i,j,k}$ (Ref CO-7).....	134
Figure 5.8 – T001 Weekly EAC_{fw} (Ref CO-8).....	135
Figure 5.9 – T002 Weekly Project Hours Curves (Ref CO-1).....	137
Figure 5.10 – T002 Weekly EVM & SV_t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	138
Figure 5.11 – T002 Weekly $IEAC_t$ Curves (Ref CO-3).....	139
Figure 5.12 – T002 Weekly EAC Curves (Ref CO-6).....	140
Figure 5.13 – T003 Weekly Project Hours (Ref CO-1).....	142
Figure 5.14 – T003 Weekly EVM & SV_t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	143
Figure 5.15 – T003 Weekly $IEAC_t$ Curves (Ref CO-3).....	144
Figure 5.16 – T003 Weekly EAC Curves (Ref CO-6).....	145
Figure 5.17 – T004 Weekly Project Hours (Ref CO-1).....	147
Figure 5.18 – T004 Weekly EVM & SV_t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	148
Figure 5.19 – T004 Weekly $IEAC_t$ Curves (Ref CO-3).....	149
Figure 5.20 – T004 Weekly EAC Curves (Ref CO-6).....	150
Figure 5.21 – T005 Weekly Project Hours (Ref CO-1).....	152
Figure 5.22 – T005 Weekly EVM & SV_t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	153
Figure 5.23 – T005 Weekly $IEAC_t$ Curves (Ref CO-3).....	154
Figure 5.24 – T005 Weekly EAC Curves (Ref CO-6).....	155
Figure 5.25 – S001 Weekly Project Hours (Ref CO-1).....	157
Figure 5.26 – S001 Weekly EVM & SV_t Curve (Ref CO-2).....	158
Figure 5.27 – S001 Weekly (LO) EVM & SV_t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	159

Figure 5.28 – S001 Weekly IEAC _t Curves (Ref CO-3).....	161
Figure 5.29 – S001 (LO) IEAC _t Curves (Ref CO-3).....	161
Figure 5.30 – S001 Weekly EAC Curves (Ref CO-6).....	162
Figure 5.31 – S001 (LO) Weekly EAC Curves (Ref CO-6).....	163
Figure 5.32 – S002 Weekly Project Hours (Ref CO-1).....	165
Figure 5.33 – S002 Weekly EVM & SV _t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	166
Figure 5.34 – S002 (LO) Weekly EVM & SV _t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	167
Figure 5.35 – S002 Weekly IEAC _t Curve (Ref CO-3).....	168
Figure 5.36 – S002 (LO) IEAC _t Curve (Ref CO-3).....	169
Figure 5.37 – S002 Weekly EAC Curve (Ref CO-6).....	170
Figure 5.38 – S002 (LO) Weekly EAC Curve (Ref CO-6).....	171
Figure 5.39 – S006 Weekly Project Hours (Ref CO-1).....	173
Figure 5.40 – S006 Weekly EVM & SV _t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	174
Figure 5.41 – S006 (LO) Weekly EVM & SV _t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	175
Figure 5.42 – S006 Weekly IEAC _t Curves (Ref CO-3).....	176
Figure 5.43 – S006 (LO) Weekly IEAC _t Curves (Ref CO-3).....	177
Figure 5.44 – S006 Weekly EAC (Ref CO-6).....	178
Figure 5.45 – S006 (LO) Weekly EAC Curve (Ref CO-6).....	179
Figure D.1 – T001 Fortnightly / Monthly EVM and SV _t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	250
Figure D.2 – T001 Fortnightly / Monthly IEAC _t Curves (Ref CO-3).....	251
Figure D.3 – T001 Fortnightly / Monthly EAC Curves (Ref CO-6).....	252
Figure D.4 – T002 Fortnightly / Monthly EVM and SV _t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	253
Figure D.5 – T002 Fortnightly / Monthly IEAC _t Curves (Ref CO-3).....	254
Figure D.6 – T002 Fortnightly / Monthly EAC Curves (Ref CO-6).....	255
Figure D.7 – T003 Fortnightly / Monthly EVM and SV _t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	256
Figure D.8 – T003 Fortnightly / Monthly IEAC _t Curves (Ref CO-3).....	257
Figure D.9 – T003 Fortnightly / Monthly EAC Curves (Ref CO-6).....	258
Figure D.10 – T004 Fortnightly / Monthly EVM and SV _t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	259
Figure D.11 – T004 Fortnightly / Monthly IEAC _t Curves (Ref CO-3).....	260
Figure D.12 – T004 Fortnightly / Monthly EAC Curves (Ref CO-6).....	261
Figure D.13 – T005 Fortnightly / Monthly EVM and SV _t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	262
Figure D.14 – T005 Fortnightly / Monthly IEAC _t Curves (Ref CO-3).....	263
Figure D.15 – T005 Fortnightly / Monthly EAC Curves (Ref CO-6).....	264
Figure D.16 – S001 Fortnightly / Monthly EVM and SV _t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	265
Figure D.17 – S001 Fortnightly / Monthly IEAC _t Curves (Ref CO-3).....	266
Figure D.18 – S001 Fortnightly / Monthly EAC Curves (Ref CO-6).....	267
Figure D.19 – S002 Fortnightly / Monthly EVM and SV _t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	268
Figure D.20 – S002 Fortnightly / Monthly IEAC _t Curves (Ref CO-3).....	269
Figure D.21 – S002 Fortnightly / Monthly EAC Curves (Ref CO-6).....	270
Figure D.22 – S006 Fortnightly / Monthly EVM and SV _t Curves (Ref CO-2).....	271
Figure D.23 – S006 Fortnightly / Monthly IEAC _t Curves (Ref CO-3).....	272
Figure D.24 – S006 Fortnightly / Monthly EAC Curves (Ref CO-6).....	273

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1 – Descriptive Summary of the Project Workbook.....	81
Table 4.1 – Project Budget Structure.....	90
Table 4.2 – TPB WDC Value Allocation Details.....	102
Table 4.3 – TPB Cost Cell Descriptions.....	106
Table 4.4 – Project Data Set Summary.....	109
Table 4.5 – Variance and Index Performance Measures.....	115
Table 4.6 – Forecasting Formulas.....	116
Table 5.1 – Performance and Forecasting Plot Formulas.....	123
Table 5.2 – T001 Project Detail, Setup and Output Summary.....	126
Table 5.3 – T002 Project Detail, Setup and Output Summary.....	136
Table 5.4 – T003 Project Detail, Setup and Output Summary.....	141
Table 5.5 – T004 Project Detail, Setup and Output Summary.....	146
Table 5.6 – T005 Project Detail, Setup and Output Summary.....	151
Table 5.7 – S001 / LO Project Detail, Setup and Output Summary.....	156
Table 5.8 – S002 / LO Project Detail, Setup and Output Summary.....	164
Table 5.9 – S006 / LO Project Detail, Setup and Output Summary.....	172
Table 5.10 – Summary of Result.....	182
Table 5.11 – $H_{I(EVM)}$ Conditions of Application Acceptance and Value.....	189

NOMENCLATURE

The content of this Nomenclature has been broken into two parts, **Part A** covers the acronyms relating to general text while part **Part B** specifically deals with the terms associated with Earned Value Management.

Part A – General Text

ANSI	American National Standards Institute
AS	Australian Standards
AUD	Australian Dollar
DoD	(US) Department of Defense
DoE	(US) Department of Energy
EIA	Electronic Industries Alliance
EPCM	Engineering Procurement and Construction Management
ERP	Enterprise Resource Planning (software tool)
FI	Final Inspection
GFC	Global Financial Crisis (2008)
FAR	Federal Acquisition Regulation
Host	L&A Pressure Welding Pty Ltd
IPT	Independent Product Team
KPI	Key Performance Indicator
LAP	L&A Pressure Welding Pty Ltd
LNG	Liquefied Natural Gas
LPG	Liquid Petroleum Gas
MBWA	Management By Walking Around
NASA	(US) National Aeronautics and Space Administration
NDIA	(US) National Defence Industrial Association
N/A	Not Available
OMB	(US) Office of Management and Budget
OPM3	PMI's Organisational Project Management Maturity Model

PE	(LAP) Project Engineer
PMI	Project Management Institute
PMS	Project Management System
PPM	Project Portfolio Management
PWHT	Post Weld Heat Treatment
SME	Small to Medium Enterprise
US	United States of America
wrt	‘With Respect To’
~	Approximately

Part B1 – Earned Value Management

AC	Actual Cost
AD	Actual Duration
AT	Actual Time
BAC	Budget at Completion
CAP	Control Account Plan
CPI	Cost Performance Index
C/SCSC	Cost / Schedule Control Systems Criteria
CV	Cost Variance
EAC	Estimate at Completion
EAC _t	Estimate at Completion (time)
EAC _#	Estimate at Completion (general term)
ED	Estimated Duration or Earned Duration, as text suggests
EDAC	Estimate of Duration at Completion
ES	Earned Schedule measure
ETC	Estimate to Completion
ETC _t	Estimate to Completion (time)
EV	Earned Value

EVM	Earned Value Management
IEAC _t	Independent Estimate at Completion (time)
IEAC _#	Independent Estimate at Completion (general term)
IECD	Independent Estimate of the Completion Date
IED	Independent Estimate of (project) Duration
IEDAC	Independent Estimated of Duration at Completion
LB	Labour Budget
LO	Labour Only
LOE	Level of Effort
MR	Management Reserve
PB	Project Budget
PBB	Project Budget Base
PD	Planned Duration
PDWR	Planned Duration for Work Remaining
PERT	Project Evaluation and Review Technique
PF	Performance Factor
PMB	Performance Measurement Baseline
PT	Planned Time
PV	Planned Value
SAC	Schedule at Completion
SPI	Schedule Performance Index
SPI _t	Schedule Performance Index (time)
SPI _#	Schedule Performance Index (general term)
SV	Schedule Variance
SV _t	Schedule Variance (time based)
TCPI	To Complete Performance index
TEAC	Time Estimate at Completion
TPB	Time Phase Budget

TSD	Total Scheduled Days
TSPI	To complete Schedule Performance index
TV	Time Variance
VAC	Variance at Completion
VAC _t	Variance at Completion (time)
WBS	Work Breakdown Structure
WDC	Work Description Cell(s)
WP	Work Package

ABSTRACT

The supply of Engineered-to-Order pressure equipment in Australia has established a place in the global market. Local manufacturing requires innovation to maintain its position in this supply chain. Changes at the manufacturing level looked to project management to connect the end product's development and delivery with the end user's needs. Earned Value Management (EVM) offers project management a best practice in project control and its application to this niche market was considered worthy of investigation as a response to market changes.

EVM has a long history of application in large and complicated projects. This provided researchers with material to study application detail across the cost and time domains, resulting in well-established theories about performance outputs and forecasting. EVM implementation has also been the subject of research offering guidance to the user. An area of EVM that remains in the background is the application, implementation and benefits of the method in the smaller manufacturing sector. This research applies EVM to a project orientated organisation that designs and manufactures customised pressure equipment. The objective of this practice-based research is to address questions of EVM application, implementation and benefits when applied to a multiple project environment set within an operations context.

A series of twelve projects carried out by the host organisation were subject to EVM application. This provided data to assess the response of EVM to the short duration project and to explore various forecasting behaviours from both the cost and time domains under different reporting frequencies. The process of application was also used to establish qualitative information on implementation and organisational effects as a result of the methods presence.

Results indicated EVM is adaptable to the sampled manufacturing projects and tracking capabilities were positive on the few larger projects in the sample. Net benefit to the internal project management function is not represented by EVM tracking, when restricted to the short duration project. Forecasting of both cost and time was adversely affected by high material costs, but displayed stability after this project phase. Exclusion of materials

simplified application by reducing administration effort however it did exaggerate deviation of progress from the plan.

High project and organisational value is realised by access to EVM's data sources and structure. It was therefore concluded EVM methodology, coupled to organisational project management and business system theories can deliver substantial operational gains for the project orientated manufacturer.