

**Deleuzians of Patient Safety:
A Video Reflexive Ethnography of
End-of-Life Care**

Aileen Collier
Doctor of Philosophy
2013

This page is intentionally blank

Certificate of Authorship/Originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Candidate

This page is intentionally blank

Acknowledgements

I dedicate this thesis to participants, all of whom in the face of death showed great courage and determination to ensure others learn from their experiences.

I am indebted to many people and places for ‘providing a space for ‘the PhD’ to happen’. First, this research would not have been possible without the Australian Research Council PhD scholarship. The scholarship provided the means to undertake full-time research allowing me to immerse myself in the PhD ‘space’.

I am deeply grateful to my supervisors. Professor Rick Iedema (PhD supervisor), I thank you for your steady influence and patience, and for your faith in me. Most of all I appreciate your wisdom, intellectual rigour, generosity of spirit and friendship. You have provided ‘the space’ for my creativity to flourish. I also thank you for sharing ‘Broulee’; a special place and ‘a ‘space’ of healing as well as for writing to happen’!

Professor Ros Sorensen (Associate PhD supervisor), I value your ‘believing’ reassurance. Thank you for your friendship, your wisdom and for sharing my tears and my laughter. I appreciate your academic rigour and I thank you for your critique and edits of my numerous drafts.

Associate Professor Meera Agar, I would like to thank you for helping to ‘plant the seed’ that a PhD was possible and for the opportunities for professional growth and development you have provided. I also thank you for facilitating my access to the palliative care day hospital.

I would also like to recognise the numerous healthcare workers (professional and non-professional) who so openly welcomed me into the ‘space’ of the day hospital. Your dedication to the lives of patients and families is truly inspiring.

Dr. Jennifer Wiltshire, and the specialist palliative care team at the acute hospital, I would like to thank you for so generously sharing your ‘space’ with me. Most of all thank you for trusting in me even when you too were uncertain of where it would lead. I am in awe of the work that you do in the most challenging of circumstances.

It has been my privilege to get to know and collaborate with many other great people who became friends over the last few years. In particular, Professor Jane Phillips and

Professor Anne Wilkinson; I thank you for engaging with me intellectually, as well as for your encouragement and support of my transformation into the role of ‘academic’.

Thank you to my colleagues and friends in South West Sydney for providing a ‘space’ of PhD respite. Jane Hunt, Therese Smeal, Patricia Rebello, Jasminka Kikich, Rebecca Strutt, and Janeane Harlum – I am especially grateful for your constant care and concern. I always seem to turn up on ‘*cake day*’! I would also like to acknowledge the many people, too numerous to mention, who I have connected with and been touched by along my journey.

Thank you to my friends at the Centre for Health Communication past and present; in particular Katherine Carroll, Marie Manidis, Natalya Godbold, Suyin Hor, Kate Bower, Mary Wyer, Bryden Lenne, Nick Hopwood, Jenna Cave, Kate Britton, Verena Thomas, Sue-ellen Allen, Amy Whalen – or as I prefer to call you my ‘critical friends’. Our many conversations, intellectual debates and your critique of my research, along with your encouragement, humor, tea and cakes are unparalleled.

Kate Britton – thank you for introducing me to Deleuze and Guattari, and for critiquing my theoretical approach in this thesis. I also thank you for getting up early to catch the train to attend reflexive meetings and for your final proof reading. Verena Thomas, thank you for inspiring me with your filmmaking and for being so generous and patient in helping me on the journey towards ‘amateur film-maker’. Amy Whalen, thank you for assisting with final production of the DVD.

Kenny Ferguson, Jennifer Wiltshire, Janeane Harlum, Michael Barbato – thank you for being my clinical ‘role models’. Your practice and leadership are an inspiration to me.

I also wish to thank Janice Ellerton and Cath Finney Lamb – I value your friendship, wisdom, prayers and intellectual conversations. Thank you also Norman and Ruth Lenffer, Maurice and Simmy Coronel, Michael Krasny and Alice Austen for encouraging me through the scriptures, for ‘the banter’ and for upholding me in prayer.

I wish to express my deepest love and appreciation to my Mum and Dad for their unconditional support of me over many years and for providing ‘a space’ for me to pursue my dreams. Mum and Dad – thank you especially for instilling in me a work ethic, and an ethic of social justice that has provided me with tenacity and dedication towards meeting my goals.

Last, but certainly not least, to my dear husband John, who has suffered most. Thank you for *everything*. I would not have been able to do it without the special ‘space’ you have provided; a space that words alone are unable to convey.

This page is intentionally blank

Table of Contents

Certificate of Authorship/Originality	iii
Acknowledgements	v
List of video vignettes	xiii
Glossary of abbreviations	xv
Glossary of hospital roles and terms	xvii
Glossary of key terms	xix
Glossary of data sources	xxi
Abstract	xxiii
Chapter 1 Introduction	1
SECTION 1.1 INTRODUCTION	1
SECTION 1.2 BACKGROUND	2
SECTION 1.3 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK	5
SECTION 1.4 ETHICAL APPROACH	6
SECTION 1.5 RESEARCH APPROACHES-A SYNOPSIS	8
Research design	9
Field sites	9
Structure of the thesis	10
Chapter 2 Literature Review	13
SECTION 2.1 INTRODUCTION	13
SECTION 2.2 SOCIO-POLITICAL SETTING	14
The healthcare landscape	14
The hospice and palliative care movement	18
Bioethical context and the issue of autonomy	22
Advance care directives	24
Conclusion	24
SECTION 2.3 A 'GOOD DEATH'?	25
Patient perspectives of a 'good death'	27
Family perspectives of a 'good death'	29
Healthcare professionals perspectives of a 'good death'	30

	Portrayals of the ‘good death’ and ‘bad death’	32
SECTION 2.4	MEDICINE AND NURSING: THE CARING PROFESSIONS	34
	Nurses as advocates of end of life care	34
	Doctors and end-of-life care	36
	A multidisciplinary approach	36
	The art of nursing and medicine	38
	Compassionate care	39
	Empathy	40
	Death anxiety	42
	Emotional labour	44
SECTION 2.5	SPACE, PLACE AND SAFETY	45
	Hospital and home	45
	Home: beyond the dwelling place	46
	Patient safety	49
	Spirituality	52
	Space and Place	55
SECTION 2.6	CONCLUSION	56
Chapter 3	Researching Space: Theoretical perspectives	59
SECTION 3.1	INTRODUCTION	59
SECTION 3.2	POSITIONING THE RESEARCHER IN THE RESEARCH	59
	The research instrument-palliative care nurse: ‘insider’	60
	The research instrument-volunteer: ‘outsider’	62
	The research instrument-hospital nurse: ‘outsider’	62
	The research instrument-project co-ordinator: ‘outsider’	63
	The research instrument-patient’s wife	63
SECTION 3.3	THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES: DEFINING SPACE AND PLACE	64
	Deleuze and Guattari: Space and affect	64
	The ‘science’ behind the method	71
	Embracing mess	72
SECTION 3.4	METHODOLOGICAL APPROACHES	76
	Participatory action research	77
	The visual	78
	Video ethnography	79
	Participant video accounts	80
	Video reflexivity	81
	Indigenous research ethics framework	81
SECTION 3.5	CONCLUSION	84
Chapter 4	Methods	85
SECTION 4.1	INTRODUCTION	85
SECTION 4.2	FIELD SITES	85
	Locating the palliative care day hospital	86
	Locating the acute hospital	90
SECTION 4.3	EQUIPMENT AND PROCESS	93
	The camera	93

	The editing process	94
	Data storage	94
SECTION 4.4	DATA ANALYSIS	95
	Video reflexivity	97
SECTION 4.5	CONCLUSION	101
Chapter 5	Methodological Findings: Forming communities and building agency	103
SECTION 5.1	INTRODUCTION	103
SECTION 5.2	SELF-REFLEXIVITY: ESTABLISHING MYSELF IN THE FIELD	104
	The palliative care day hospital	104
	The acute hospital	109
SECTION 5.3	INTERPERSONAL REFLEXIVITY: FIELD EXAMPLES	112
	Negotiating consent	112
	Role conflict	116
	Footage dilemmas	118
	Exiting the palliative care day hospital	119
	Exiting the acute hospital	120
SECTION 5.4	COLLECTIVE REFLEXIVITY	120
	Video: A mechanism to recognise patient expertise	122
	Video: Making ‘hospital dying’ tangible (internal stakeholders)	125
	Video: Making ‘hospital dying’ tangible (external stakeholders)	130
	Video: The camera eye	132
	Video: A legacy	133
SECTION 5.5	CONCLUSION	134
Chapter 6	Safeties and Un-safeties	137
SECTION 6.1	INTRODUCTION	137
SECTION 6.2	RE-DEFINING PATIENT SAFETY	137
SECTION 6.3	NORMALISATION OF INATTENTIVENESS TO PATIENT SAFETY	141
SECTION 6.4	CONTRADICTIONS OF HEALTHCARE SAFETIES	161
SECTION 6.5	CONCLUSION	169
Chapter 7	Finding Patients and Families in Patient Safety	171
SECTION 7.1	INTRODUCTION	171
SECTION 7.2	PATIENT AND FAMILY EXPERTISE?	171
SECTION 7.3	THE SAFETY WORK OF PATIENTS AND FAMILIES	184
SECTION 7.4	CONCLUSION	198
Chapter 8	Becoming-safe Assemblages	199
SECTION 8.1	INTRODUCTION	199
SECTION 8.2	AFFECTIVE ATMOSPHERES	199

SECTION 8.3	DESIGNING BECOMING-SAFE ASSEMBLAGES	213
SECTION 8.4	THE BUILT ENVIRONMENT	222
SECTION 8.5	CONNECTIONS WITH ‘HOME’	227
SECTION 8.6	CONCLUSION	232
Chapter 9	Conclusion	233
SECTION 9.1	INTRODUCTION	233
SECTION 9.2	ADDRESSING THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS	234
SECTION 9.3	THESIS LIMITATIONS	249
SECTION 9.4	FUTURE RESEARCH	251
SECTION 9.5	CONCLUSION	252
References	255	
Appendix 1	Information sheet for patients & carers	297
Appendix 2	Information sheet for clinicians	301
Appendix 3	Anticipated semi-structured interview questions - patients and family	305
Appendix 4	Anticipated semi-structured interview questions - healthcare workers	307
Appendix 5	Video consent form for patients and carers	309
Appendix 6	Video consent form for participating clinicians	313
Appendix 7	External Stakeholders (Large Group Meetings)	317
Appendix 8	Video consent form for participating clinicians	319

List of video vignettes*

Introducing Esmereldo	138
Introducing Joe and Tara	141
Introducing June	162
Introducing Shane	172
Introducing Gloria	185
Introducing Len and Helen	193
Introducing Greg	200
Introducing Liz and Brian	214

* Video clips have restricted distribution and disclosure

This page is intentionally blank

Glossary of abbreviations

ANUM	Acting Nurse Unit Manager
CCU	Coronary Care Unit
CPR	Cardiopulmonary resuscitation
CT scan	Computed Tomography scan
CTC	Cancer Therapy Centre
DNR	Do Not Resuscitate
EDD	Expected Date of Discharge
EN	Enrolled Nurse
GP	General Practitioner
ICPS	International Classification for Patient Safety
ICU	Intensive Care Unit
IIMS	Incident Information and Management System
M&M	Morbidity and Mortality
MRSA	Methicillin-resistant Staphylococcus Aureus
NSW	New South Wales
NUM	Nurse Unit Manager
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PEG	Percutaneous Endoscopic Gastrostomy
RN	Registered Nurse
SUPPORT	Study to Understand Prognoses and Preferences for Outcomes and Risks of Treatment
WHO	World Health Organisation

This page is intentionally blank

Glossary of hospital roles and terms

Director of Nursing	The Director of Nursing is a registered nurse who oversees the nursing care of the acute hospital.
General Manager	The General Manager oversees the management of the acute hospital
Clinical Nurse Consultant	A senior nurse appointed to a particular speciality area with a minimum of five years post-graduate experience including experience in and approved post registration qualifications in the specialty field she/he is working in.
Specialist Palliative Care Team	The specialist palliative care team is a multidisciplinary team working in partnership with other healthcare workers to provide palliative care to patients and families in a range of settings.
Staff Specialist/Specialist	A senior level doctor who has attained a fellowship of a recognised Australasian specialist college and has spent at least five years in the practice of medicine
Social worker	A social worker is an allied health professional who provides counselling and support to patients and families as well as other practical assistance including coordination and participation in case conferences, discharge planning, and financial support.
Diversional Therapist	In this thesis a diversional therapist is an allied healthcare professional who coordinates and provides diversional therapy for individuals and groups in the palliative care in-patient unit, the palliative care day hospital and patients' homes. The diversional therapist facilitates leisure and recreational activities and programmes to support peoples' wellbeing.
Junior doctor	In this thesis, a junior doctor can refer to a registrar (A doctor who is training in a particular medical specialty, such as haematology) or a resident (The most junior doctor on the team, also known as a Resident Medical Officer)
Registered Nurse	A registered nurse refers to a nurse who has completed training and is registered with the nursing and midwifery board of Australia. A registered nurse is accountable for the provision of nursing care in a range of settings and delegates care to enrolled nurses and other healthcare workers.
Enrolled Nurse	An enrolled nurse is a nurse who has complete enrolled nurse training and provides nursing care in a range of settings. An enrolled nurse works under the direction and supervision of a registered nurse.

Nurse Unit Manager	The Nurse Unit Manager is the nurse in charge of managing the ward. A NUM is a registered nurse (RN) who oversees, co-ordinates, and directs the activities of nurses in a specific ward or unit of a hospital or community team, including outpatient departments. The NUM is also responsible for the business and management functions and processes of the ward or unit.
Senior nurse	In this thesis, a senior nurse refers to an experienced nurse with more than three years post-graduate clinical experience.
Grand Rounds	In this thesis, ‘grand rounds’ refers to a weekly presentation open to all healthcare professionals in the acute hospital. Specialist teams rotate responsibility to present a ‘case’ of interest or research findings pertaining to their specialty.

Glossary of key terms

Space	A dynamically produced and reproduced product of interconnection that is always unfinished where everything is connected to everything else in pre-discursive and practical ways.
Affect	The capacity of one body (human or otherwise) to affect or be affected by another incorporating pre or transpersonal intensities that exceeds any single human subjectivity.
Multiplicities	The simultaneous enactment of objects when those objects are said to be the same and where different realities co-exist in independent locations without interfering with one another.
Assemblage	Non-static collections of heterogenous human and non-human affective entities. In this thesis, the term assemblage is used instead of space to foreground multiplicities.
Becoming	The dynamic unfolding of 'being' that is always immanent and moved or activated in relation to the collective body.
Nomadic Subject	A subject that is open to becoming-other, resisting fixed identity, order and categorisation.
Body with Organs (Body Singular)	A clearly bounded individual or fixed enclosed unit in which organs are enveloped in a container of skin and the body is a set of physiological processes as in the medical-technical view
Body without Organs (Body Multiple)	A body (human or otherwise) that can mean different things at the same time and emerges from the physical and social world.
Territorialisation	'Normalisation' of social structures that produces order and categorisation.
De-territorialisation	Denotes escape from predetermined patterns of order and categorisation.
Lines of flight	Creative potentials that lead to de-territorialisation
Adverse Events	In this thesis, adverse events refer to events defined by patients and families as harmful as well as by healthcare workers and clinical governance departments.
Becoming-harm	Collectives of human and non-human affective entities that predispose patients, families and healthcare workers to harm.
Clinical technical assemblages	Assemblages that are privileged towards technical medical procedures and are focused towards the needs of healthcare workers and the hospital rather than patients and families.

Affective Atmospheres	Atmospheres that emanate from but exceed the assembling of bodies affecting and being affected.
Becoming-safe assemblages	Collectives of human and non-human affective entities that predispose patients, families and healthcare workers to safety and make healing possible.
Healthcare Safeties	The combined safety of healthcare workers, patients and families leading to safety that is co-produced.

Glossary of data sources

FI	Field Interview
EFN	Ethnographic Field Note
PC	Phone Call
RD	Reflective Diary
SSI	Semi-Structured Interview
VRM #1	Video Reflexive Meeting (small group-internal)
VRM #2	Video Reflexive Meeting (one-on-one)
VRM #3	Video Reflexive Meeting (large group-external)

This page is intentionally blank

Abstract

This thesis explores healthcare space(s) towards the end of life. It critically examines the links between the places/spaces where dying people find themselves, and how spaces enable or constrain their agency and contribute to the quality of the care they receive. There is a dearth of research that is concerned specifically with end of life care space(s) and patient safety. This thesis addresses this gap. It draws on several theoretical approaches. Principally concerned with the concept ‘space’, the theoretical lens of the research is inspired by French philosophers Deleuze and Guattari.

This thesis differs from previous studies by positioning dying people centrally in the research. Using an indigenous ethics research framework of relationship and reciprocity, the study challenges current positioning of dying patients as vulnerable research subjects. In so doing, it searches out alternatives to conventional methods in order to give recognition to agency. Comprising a written dissertation and a video component, this thesis integrates the visual with the written text providing a platform for the reader to process it somaesthetically.¹

This research study found that the field of patient safety does not presently address the care quality and safety needs of dying people. Habitual care patterns expose dying patients and their families to harm along with those healthcare workers caring for them. Visual methods provide a disruptive innovation that challenges these normative and habitual rhythms of inattentiveness to healthcare (un)safeties. This thesis finds that safety and ‘healing’ reside within dynamic assemblages arising from bodies affecting and being affected by others. When healthcare workers ‘learn to be affected’ and thus become attuned to the implications of safety and dying, healthcare safeties become possible. Healthcare safeties are contingent on weaves of commitment netting in relationships of trust by bringing together healthcare worker expertise and the expertise of patients and their families to *co-produce* safety. This thesis contends that rather than a place where interventions happen, healthcare settings *are* clinical interventions. Lastly, researcher stances and research methods are, therefore, not to be formed separately from the healthcare setting but to be articulated through and in the setting,

1 A term coined by Shusterman to represent a philosophy that takes account of the body: “denotes not mere physical body but the lived, sentient, intentional, body that involves mental, social, and cultural dimensions” (Shusterman 2011, p315).

and become a part of it. This methodological conclusion indicates that we as researchers need to move away from our conventional and habitual patterns maintained by disciplinary status and constraint, in order to become part of open-ended, collaborative communities unfolding research and lived change together.