INFORMAL AND POPULAR EDUCATION IN YOUTH AND COMMUNITY WORK

Seeking insights for Australian theory and practice from theories and practices in Germany and Singapore

Doctoral thesis
Rick Flowers
2005

University of Technology, Sydney
CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP / ORIGINALITY

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a
degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as
fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help I have received in
my research work and the preparation of the thesis has been acknowledged. In
addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in
the thesis.

Note: I take responsibility for all translations from texts in German language.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am grateful for the support of senior staff and colleagues at the Faculty of Education UTS. There are four colleagues to whom I owe special thanks.

I am grateful to Griff Foley who created my first academic appointment. He shaped my early reading, guided my early lines of enquiry, and created opportunities for future research and teaching. He was my first academic mentor. After my first research contract, Griff suggested that I seek out other colleagues who might mentor and encourage me.

I did and was fortunate to enjoy the support and mentoring of Mike Newman, Sue Knights and Jane Sampson. They inducted me into project management and course co-ordination roles. They allowed me to team-teach with them and thereby learn in the most immediate and effective way possible. Their praise and encouragement was important.

I am grateful to Griff and Mike for being my doctoral supervisors. I valued my sessions with Griff, especially at Wiley’s ocean pool. Mike pulled no punches and I hope that my writing in years to come will bear the fruits of his ‘tough love.’ He helped me pull threads together and persisted in not allowing my full-time job and family to overly distract me from the thesis.

My father inspired and shaped my enthusiasm for critical enquiry. He made sacrifices to send me as a foreign student to London for undergraduate study. My father-in-law enabled me to undertake Masters degree study in Germany. They laid the foundations for my thesis and current career. Antonia, Jesse and Natascha are my children and have grown up with my PhD hanging around the family’s neck. I am sorry that this caused me to spend less time with them. Franziska is my wife and I am lucky she has continued to encourage me. She is an academic and I am committed to support her work as much, if not more than, she has supported mine.

On a final note I will acknowledge my own steely patience and resolve to take a slow path to a PhD. I have had three children in the time it has taken to complete my thesis. I consciously spent time with them on long holidays, weekend trips and countless sporting activities and friends birthday parties, despite feeling guilty I had not completed the thesis. During my candidature I bought two ocean kayaks and used them! I am president of a large soccer club. We re-built our house. And last not least, I have built the Centre for Popular Education over the last six years and this meant I had less time for individual writing. I chose a career pathway that leads to slower individual advancement but created opportunities for collaborative work. I have been privileged to enjoy the respect and encouragement of Daniel Ng, Celina McEwen, Andrew Chodkiewicz and Tony Brown who have developed the Centre with me. I am thankful to Deb Hayes, Julieanne Hilbers, Derek Waddell, Tony Webb, Teri Merlyn and Lee Malone who have collaborated with me on PopEd projects and seemingly enjoyed it.
Section 1
INTRODUCTION, METHODOLOGY AND DEFINITIONS

1. Introduction
   Finding the research question
   Practice and rhetoric
   Interrogation and comparison
   The value of studying Germany and Singapore
   Defining the educational practice of youth and community workers

2. Research methodology
   Locating this study within a research orientation
   Locating this study within my academic and activist work
   Data collection and analysis
   Quality of my data and analysis

3. Different literatures
   History of education
   Youth and community work, community education and community development
   Political education, social action, workers' and liberation struggles
   Social pedagogy in Germany

4. Towards a definition of youth and community work

5. Defining informal education

6. Defining popular education
   The term 'popular education'
   Multiple traditions of popular education
   Working-class education in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries
   Progressive and radical education
   Adult education for democracy in the early twentieth century
   Freire and pedagogy for the oppressed
   Common features of popular education

Section 2
THEMES FROM AUSTRALIAN YOUTH AND COMMUNITY WORK

7. The Value of the Educational Practice of Youth and Community Workers
   Community work with the Ratbags
   The educational dimension of youth and community work
   Youth and community workers do not name and value the educational dimension of their practice
   The educational dimension is discussed in the literature
   Practitioners acknowledge the educational dimension when prompted

8. Informal and Popular Education in Youth and Community Work
   Education in youth and community work as opposed to learning in social action
   Popular education can be planned
   Planning popular education in local community action settings is more challenging than in social movements
What is effective informal and popular education?

9. **Analysing the Discourse of Youth and Community Workers**
   
   Rhetoric
   Claims about need
   Claims about whose interests they act in
   Claims about participatory methods
   Claims about community participation
   Claims about power
   Claims about informal education
   Claims about advocacy, friendship and solidarity
   Claims about dialogue
   The tension between educating and imposing
   Process as opposed to the content of learning

**Section 3**

**INSIGHTS FROM YOUTH AND COMMUNITY WORK IN GERMANY**

10. **The Nature of Youth and Community Work in Germany**
   Pedagogical tradition in German and European youth and community work
   The social pedagogical century
   Research about political education

11. **History of German Social Pedagogy: socialist versus community perspectives**
   Tönnies and ‘Gemeinschaft’ (community)
   Community (Gemeinschaft) and working class interests
   Socialist traditions of social pedagogy
   Conservative traditions of social pedagogy
   Natorp’s plea for community versus a class consciousness
   Building ‘Gemeinschaft’ (community) is about containing and controlling socialist activity

12. **Theories and Practices of Informal Education in**
   • **German Youth Work**
   Defining informal education in the context of German youth work
   Charitable traditions of informal education in German youth work
   An overview of informal education theories and practices in German youth work
   German National Youth Associations: Informal education for camaraderie and alternative communities
   Nohl and Mollenhauer’s place-based theories of informal education
   The 1968 student movement and anti-authoritarian informal education
   Informal education in youth work: part of a social movement or a profession?

13. **Critical – Emancipatory Perspectives in**
   • **German Youth and Community Work**
   Theoretical roots
   Focus on community action and political education
   The reformist nature of critical – emancipatory perspectives
   German research about the nature of critical-emancipatory education in the context of youth and community work
   Mündigkeit and Conscientization
14. **Instrumental Perspectives in German Youth and Community Work**
   A concern with what can rather than should be done
   Facilitating socialisation in the existing social order

15. **Historical - Materialist Perspectives in German Youth and Community Work**
   - Distinguishing Historical Materialism from Critical Theory
   - A Continuum of Historical-Materialist and Critical Theory Perspectives in Education
   - Debates between Historical-Materialist and Critical Theory Perspectives in Youth and Community Work
   - Who should youth and community workers work with – working classes or other ‘oppressed’ peoples?
   - Method and practice of historical materialist or anti-capitalist youth and community work
   - Doing political education with people who may not have initial interest

16. **Does Informal Education in Youth and Community Work**
   **Emancipate or Control Learners? Insights from German research**
   - Passive and active, closed and open education
   - Views that planned informal education cannot facilitate emancipatory learning
   - Emancipatory learning happens in community action, not in youth and community work programs
   - Informal learning vs informal education for community workers
   - The contradictory roles of youth and community workers in facilitating popular education

**Section 4**

**INSIGHTS FROM COMMUNITY WORK IN SINGAPORE**

17. **Overt or Subtle Ideological Dominance: cadres or community workers in Singapore**
   - Ambiguities
   - Electoral dominance of the People’s Action Party
   - Ideological hegemony
   - Ideological or neutral community work
   - Cadres or community workers acting as a bridge between the government and the people
   - Organising and informal education versus welfare work

18. **Communitarianism and Community Work in Singapore**
   - Non-liberal and communitarian ideology
   - Communitarianism, social capital and economic growth
   - Notions of community and nationhood in Singapore
   - Community work in Singapore: Public versus community interests
   - Community needs versus individual rights

19. **Community Work, Social Capital Building and Community Bonding in Singapore**
   - Community workers and their role in community bonding
   - Two interpretations of social capital
   - Lee Kuan Yew and social capital
   - Social capital in Singapore
   - A positive view of social capital in Singapore
   - A negative view of social capital in Singapore
   - Singapore’s success in building a communitarian type of social capital
20. Popular Education and Community Building in Singapore
Robust version of community capacity building
Possibilities for emancipatory learning: Unlearning versus learning dominant discourses
Civic versus civil society
Spaces to do popular education

21. Building Political Support and Communities for the People's Action Party
Political loyalty of community workers
Are community development and political party development mutually exclusive?
Historical perspectives on the importance the People's Action Party places on community development
Participatory community work can strengthen authoritarian rule
Community work for political socialisation

22. Petitionary vs Dialogical Democracy in Community Work and Informal Education in Singapore
How democratic is community work in Singapore?
Defining petitionary and dialogical political culture
Suppressing dialogical practices
Dissolving the boundaries between community work and political organising

23. Administrative versus Political and Educational Advocacy in Singapore
The importance accorded by community workers in Singapore and Australia alike to advocacy
Which ideologies shape advocacy practice?
Administrative advocacy and depoliticisation
Administrative versus political change
Advocate more than educate

24. Informal Education and Ideological Hegemony in Singapore
Participatory and engaging, but not emancipatory
Didactic versus dialogical, informal education
Thoughtful planning of informal education
Five major sites of informal education
The People's Action Party's use of informal education
Educating the public is more important than promoting welfare

Section 5
CONCLUSION

25. A Case Study
Case for a case study
About the Centre for Popular Education UTS
Making the decision to re-build the Centre
Theory behind the early practice of the Centre
Retaining the name 'Centre for Popular Education'
Applying ideas from German theorising in the Centre's work
Drawing on my research in Singapore
Broadening the theoretical base of the Centre's work
Bringing the strands together
26. Answering my Research Questions

Do youth and community workers practice informal education?
What is successful informal education practice in youth and community work?
Does the educational practice of youth and community workers serve to control learners?
Can the educational practice of youth and community workers emancipate learners?

LIST OF TABLES

Map of Research Orientations 17
Typology of Formal, Non-formal and Informal Education and Informal and Incidental Learning 42
Popular and Dominant/Traditional Approaches to Education 64
Forms of Informal Education Practice in Youth Work 118
What types of educational practice facilitate emancipation: Critical Theory on the continuum between Historical Materialism 120
Perspectives on Political Education 153
Distinguishing Formal Education from Learning in Community Action 163
General objectives for a critical-emancipatory education ‘program’ 139
A Continuum of Historical-Materialist and Critical Theory Perspectives in Education 148
Formal education, Learning in community action 163
Facilities in a typical community centre in Singapore 171
Community capacity building indicators 291
References 252
Appendix 1 References of four colleagues who mentored me 276
Appendix 2 Popular education in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries 280
Appendix 3 Progressive and radical education 282
Appendix 4 Adult education for democracy in the early twentieth century 285
Appendix 5 Freire and pedagogy of the oppressed 286
Appendix 6 Evaluation framework to define and reflect on the focus and type of community leadership development 290
ABSTRACT

This thesis is a comparative study of youth and community work in three countries. Using field work in Australia and Singapore, and a study of German literature I examine the way youth and community workers in these three countries theorise about their educational practice.

The following questions guide the research:

- Do youth and community workers practice informal education?
- What is successful informal education practice in youth and community work?
- Does the educational practice of youth and community workers serve to control its learners?
- Can the educational practice of youth and community workers emancipate learners?

The starting point for the research is an examination of informal and popular education in Australian youth and community work. I have practised, researched and taught youth and community work in Australia for almost twenty years. Drawing upon this experience and a series of interviews I describe and discuss the contradictions, ambiguities and different consciousnesses that characterise the way many Australian youth and community workers theorise about their practice.

I then seek insights for Australian theory and practice in German literature about youth and community work. German scholars have engaged in educational theorising about youth and community work dating back into the nineteenth century. I give an account of the history of this theorising and then analyse more recent debates between advocates of the critical-emancipatory, instrumental and historical-materialist perspectives.

In Singapore, youth and community work, if judged solely in terms of participation, is very successful, and I look for explanations for this success. Youth and community workers in Singapore are open about serving the interests of the state. Yet they use language and espouse goals similar to that of their Australian and German counterparts who, for the most part, claim to serve the interests of their communities. The study of this seeming paradox enables me to interrogate the claims of Australian youth and community workers that their practice is shaped by the needs of the people and that they seek to strengthen social wellbeing and cohesion.

I conclude my thesis by using the Centre for Popular Education at UTS as a case study and examine how the lessons learnt in the course of my study of Australian and Singaporean practice and German theory can be used to analyse and explain the Centre's development. I close the thesis by answering the four guiding research questions.