Enterprise Strategy Requirements Engineering Framework:
Towards Completeness of System Requirements

Abdul Razzaq Babar
BSc, MCom, ME

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy in Software Engineering

Faculty of Engineering and Information Technology
University of Technology Sydney, Australia

July 2013
Abstract

Empirical evidence shows that the success of a project depends on the completeness of system requirements. Although requirements engineering literature demonstrates how important strategic business goals are for the development of requirements models, it does not examine their effect on the completeness of system requirements.

The objective of this research is to propose and test a framework that shows the influence of strategic business requirements on the completeness of system requirements. The framework integrates strategic business requirements with the functional requirements, non-functional requirements and completeness of system requirements to measure their direct and indirect influence.

This framework (the Enterprise Strategic Requirements Engineering Framework) has been evaluated and validated by two studies. In the first study, business analysts collected lists of requirements from system stakeholders. In the second study, business analysts assessed those lists in terms of their completeness. More than 100 business analysts with varying degrees of experience participated in these studies. Structured equation models were used to analyse the data in order to show the effects of strategic business requirements on the completeness of system requirements. The results support the proposed framework and show that it is a true representation of the relationship between strategic business requirements, functional requirements, non-functional requirements and the completeness of requirements lists.

This thesis contributes to the field of requirements engineering in various ways. It highlights the importance of collecting a list of strategic business requirements and it demonstrates why this should be treated as an individual list, rather than simply a sub-set of a list of non-functional requirements. The results also show that strategic business requirements influence both non-functional and functional requirements, as well as the completeness of system requirements. Finally, the research found that business analysts
play a critical role in capturing requirements. The results show that novices did not approach many stakeholders and did not consider any business strategy requirements, whereas more experienced business analysts collected requirements from many stakeholders, including senior management, where strategic business requirements were available.

This framework will be extremely valuable in giving support to the many approaches that highlight the importance of strategy. It clarifies the importance of collecting strategic business requirements and it will be valuable for the education of requirements engineers, business analysts and others who perform the task of collecting requirements.
Declaration of Originality

I certify that this thesis does not incorporate without acknowledgement any material previously submitted for a degree or diploma in any university; and that to the best of my knowledge and belief it does not contain any material previously published or written by another person except where due reference is made in the text.

Signed: ____________________ On: _____/___/_____
Acknowledgements

First, I would like to acknowledge the University of the Technology Sydney, Australia for funding my PhD research. I am grateful to Professor Jie Lu (head of school) for having believed in my potentials as a researcher and vigorously supported me throughout my candidature. I would like to thank Associate Dean (research) Professor Mary-Anne Williams for the thoughtful advice at various stages of my candidature. I am grateful to A/Professor Mao Lin Huang for his support to complete my research.

I have been privileged to have Dr. Bernard Wong, as my supervisor. I would like to express my sincere gratitude to Dr. Bernard Wong for providing me the opportunity to work with him on this research project. His highly valuable guidance, support, encouragement and constructive feedback helped me to complete this research project.

A special thanks goes to my parents, whose encouragement, career experience and wisdom have been invaluable to me. Other thanks go to friends and family members, too numerous to list here. Finally, I owe the most to my wife Nighat, who has patiently and steadfastly supported me all the way.
Contents

Abstract .................................................................................................................................. i
Declaration of Originality ................................................................................................... iii
Acknowledgements .............................................................................................................. iv
Contents ................................................................................................................................ v
List of Figures ...................................................................................................................... ix
List of Tables ........................................................................................................................ x
List of Abbreviations .......................................................................................................... xi

Chapter 1: Introduction ...................................................................................................... 1
  1.1 Motivation .................................................................................................................... 1
  1.2 Background .................................................................................................................. 2
  1.3 Aims and Objectives .................................................................................................... 3
  1.4 Contributions ................................................................................................................ 4
  1.5 Thesis Structure ............................................................................................................ 5

Chapter 2: Literature Review ............................................................................................. 7
  2.1 Software Project Failure ............................................................................................... 7
    2.1.1 Poor Requirements Gathering ............................................................................... 8
    2.1.2 Role of Business Analysts ............................................................................. 8
    2.1.3 Complete Requirements Specification and Project Success ............................... 10
  2.2 Requirements Engineering ......................................................................................... 11
    2.2.1 Functional Requirements Models ....................................................................... 11
    2.2.2 Non-Functional Requirements Models ............................................................... 12
    2.2.3 Strategic Business Requirements ........................................................................ 14
      2.2.3.1 The Concept of Business Strategy ................................................................. 15
    2.2.4 Types of Requirements ....................................................................................... 17
  2.3 Other Approaches ....................................................................................................... 18
    2.3.1 Lack of Empirical Evidence ................................................................................ 18
  2.4 Summary of the Literature Review ............................................................................ 21

Chapter 3: Proposed Framework ..................................................................................... 23
  3.1 Development of ESRE Framework ............................................................................ 26
    3.1.1 Strategic Business Requirements Affect Completeness of Requirements .......... 26
    3.1.2 Strategic Business Requirements Affect Functional Requirements ................... 26
    3.1.3 Strategic Business Requirements Affect Non-functional Requirements ............. 27
    3.1.4 Functional and Non-functional Requirements Affect Completeness of Requirements ...................................................................................................................... 27
    3.1.5 Completeness of Requirements Affects Project Success ..................................... 27
  3.2 Summary .................................................................................................................... 30

Chapter 4: Methodology .................................................................................................... 31
6.6.1 Exploratory Factor Analysis ................................................................. 89
6.6.2 Confirmatory Factor Analysis ............................................................... 92
  6.6.2.1 Correlation Model of the Four Variables .............................................. 93
  6.6.2.2 Level of Association Between the Variables ........................................ 97
  6.6.2.3 Correlation Models of Novices and Experts’ Data ................................. 99
6.6.3 Re-specification of the Correlation Model .............................................. 104
6.6.4 Comparing the SEMs of Novices’ and Experts’ Data ............................... 107
6.6.5 Multi-group Analysis to Test the Framework .......................................... 113
  6.6.5.1 General Procedure ............................................................................. 114
6.7 Testing the Framework Without Strategic Business Requirements ......... 117
  6.7.1 Novices’ Sample .................................................................................. 118
  6.7.2 Experts’ Sample .................................................................................... 118
6.8 Summary of Study 2 .................................................................................. 119

Chapter 7: Discussion ..................................................................................... 122
  7.1 Importance of Strategic Business Requirements ......................................... 123
  7.2 Strategic Business Requirements and Their Importance Beyond Non-functional
     Requirements ................................................................................................. 123
  7.3 Strategic Business Requirements and Completeness of System Requirements ... 127
  7.4 Behaviour of Business Analysts when Collecting Strategic Business
     Requirements ............................................................................................... 128
  7.5 Behaviour of the Business Analysts when Approaching Stakeholders .......... 129
  7.6 Performance of the Stakeholders ............................................................... 129
  7.7 Novices and Experts .................................................................................. 130
  7.8 Summary .................................................................................................. 130

Chapter 8: Conclusion and Future Work ...................................................... 132
  8.1 Contribution of this Research ................................................................... 135
    8.1.1 Demonstrates Importance of Strategic Business Requirements ............. 135
    8.1.2 Demonstrates how Strategic Business Requirements Affect Functional and
           Non-functional Requirements ................................................................. 135
    8.1.3 Demonstrates that Strategic Business Requirements Affect Completeness of
           System Requirements ............................................................................. 136
    8.1.4 Demonstrates that Strategic Business Requirements should be a Separate Set
           of Requirements ........................................................................................ 136
    8.1.5 Introduces Framework as a Guide to Completeness of System Requirements. 137
    8.1.6 Introduces Elements of Requirements Engineering that must be Taught to
           Novice Business Analysts ........................................................................ 137
    8.1.7 Introduces Theoretical Underpinning to Support Existing Requirements
           Engineering Approaches ........................................................................... 137
    8.1.8 Provides Empirical Evidence on the Evaluation of the Framework ............ 138
    8.1.9 Introduces Framework as Important Foundation to BABOK and Education
           for Collection of Requirements .................................................................. 138
    8.1.10 Validates Approach for the Framework ................................................ 138
  8.2 Research Limitations ................................................................................. 139
    8.2.1 Application of the Framework to Organisation of One Size .................... 139
    8.2.2 Framework’s Applicability to Different Industries .................................. 139
    8.2.3 Focus on Particular Organisational Roles for Requirements .................. 139
8.2.4 Measuring the Effect of Completeness of System Requirements on Project Success.............................................................................................................. 140
8.3 Future Research........................................................................................................ 140
  8.3.1 Is the Framework Applicable to Various Organisation Sizes? .......................... 140
  8.3.2 Can the Framework be Mapped to the Requirements Models? ....................... 141
  8.3.3 Can a Software Tool be Developed to Assess the Completeness of System Requirements and Project Success? ................................................................. 141
  8.3.4 Is the Framework Suitable for Use in a Real-life Requirements Engineering Project? ............................................................................................................. 141
  8.3.5 Does the System Developed with the ESRE Framework Satisfy the Organisation? ........................................................................................................... 142
  8.3.6 Does this Framework Demonstrate Quantifiable Return on Investment? Is the Level of Return on Investment Compelling to Industry Stakeholders? ..... 142
  8.3.7 Do the existing requirements engineering approaches need a taxonomy of strategic business requirements. ................................................................. 142

References ......................................................................................................................... 143
List of Figures

Figure 1: ESRE Framework........................................................................................................ 29
Figure 2: ESRE Framework with Questions............................................................................ 34
Figure 3: ESRE Framework Testing Approach ........................................................................ 40
Figure 4: Performance of Group-A Stakeholders .................................................................. 65
Figure 5: Performance of Group-B Stakeholders................................................................. 68
Figure 6: Performance of the Stakeholders ......................................................................... 69
Figure 7: Main Stages of the Research Process .................................................................... 72
Figure 8: The Correlation Model of the Four Variables ..................................................... 96
Figure 9: Novices’ Correlation Model (Left) and Experts’ Correlation Model (Right) .... 100
Figure 10: Correlation Models (from Left to Right) of Novices, Junior, Middle and Senior Business Analysts’ Data ......................................................................................... 102
Figure 11: Relating Experience to the Level of Association Between Strategic Business Requirements and Non-functional Requirements ............................................. 103
Figure 12: Results of Testing the Framework with the Combined Set of Data .................. 105
Figure 13: SEM for Novices’ Data (Left) and SEM for Experts’ Data (Right) ................. 109
Figure 14: Subjects’ Experience and Level of Effect of the Three Types of Requirements on the Completeness of System Requirements ........................................ 111
Figure 15: Level of Influence Against the Experience of the Subjects................................. 112
Figure 16: ESRE Framework ............................................................................................... 122
Figure 17: Existing Requirements Engineering View ......................................................... 124
Figure 18: Direct Effects ...................................................................................................... 125
Figure 19: Proposed Framework of this Research ............................................................... 127
List of Tables

Table 1: Summary of RE Approaches ................................................................. 20
Table 2: Two Groups of Stakeholders ............................................................... 51
Table 3: Business Analysts and their Experience ............................................ 52
Table 4: Composition of the Two Groups of Subjects ..................................... 53
Table 5: Statistics of Requirements from Group-A ........................................... 55
Table 6: Statistics of Requirements from Group-B .......................................... 55
Table 7: Details of the Collected Requirements Lists ....................................... 57
Table 8: Stakeholder Meeting Frequency ......................................................... 58
Table 9: Requirements List 1 ............................................................................ 60
Table 10: Requirements List 2 .......................................................................... 61
Table 11: List of Variables and Associated Items ............................................. 76
Table 12: Subjects’ Demographics ................................................................. 80
Table 13: MVA ............................................................................................... 84
Table 14: Expectation Maximisation Technique and 12 Items ....................... 85
Table 15: Normality Results with Skewness and Kurtosis ............................... 86
Table 16: Total Variance Explained ............................................................... 91
Table 17: Pattern Matrix of 12 Items .............................................................. 92
Table 18: Comparing the Fitness Results ......................................................... 107
Table 19: Multi-group Testing for Framework Structure .................................. 115
Table 20: Model Statistics without Strategic Requirements ......................... 119
Table 21: Study 2 Questions and Answers ..................................................... 119
List of Abbreviations

CEO  chief executive officer
CFI  comparative fit index
CIO  chief information officer
EA   enterprise architect
ESRE enterprise strategy requirements engineering
GFI  goodness of fit index
IEEE Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers
IT   information technology
MCAR missing completely at random
MVA  missing value analysis
R&D  research and development
RMSEA root mean square error of approximation
SEM  structural equation model
SRMR standardised root mean square residual
UTS  University of Technology Sydney