DOORS

To

Action and Reflection

Examining some of the impacts and outcomes of what happens when a leader attempts to shift focus from action to deep reflection

A Thesis submitted in fulfillment
Of the requirements
For the Degree of
Doctor of Education

University of Technology, Sydney
2014

by
Eugene Fernandez
Certificate of Original Authorship

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Student:

Date: 31.3.2014
DOORS to Action and Reflection

Acknowledgments

This dissertation has been a journey of discovery about others and myself. The path opened Doors to further understanding and insight about leadership and the many other hats I wear.

One of my greatest discoveries along this journey was the support, friendship and love I received along the way from my family, friends and colleagues who walked with me shining a light along the path and opening doors to facilitate my understanding.

To Elyssebeth Leigh my academic supervisor, thank you for your guidance, mentoring and unwavering support during the long journey. Your generosity of spirit, breadth of understanding and passion for learning infused and rekindled the fire of learning within me.

To my loving partner in all aspects of my life, Wendy and my daughters Isabella and Gabriella– Thank you for being there all along the journey, for your willingness to accommodate and compensate for a father and partner who was transfixed on a journey. Your enduring and selfless love sustained and enriched me. I look forward with joy to share all of life’s future moments with you.

To my parents who are getting both older and wiser and my brothers and sisters I look forward to spending quality time with you. To Wayne the technical genius and guru, thanks for all of your support.

Thank you to my friends and colleagues, who have been great listeners and questioners– Abi O’Neill, Maurizio Floris, Wesley Toms, Jim Brodie, Tom Ristoski, Carol Burton, Alastair Rylatt.

And finally to the participants at Feedsmoore and all the Leaders I work with, thank you for working to create a Better World.
And a man said speak to us of self-knowledge.

And he answered saying:

Your hearts know in silence the secrets of the days and nights.

But your ears thirst for the sound of your heart’s knowledge.

You would know in words that which you have always known in thought.

You would touch with your fingers the naked body of your dreams.

And it is well you should.

The hidden well-spring of your soul must needs rise and run murmuring to the sea;

And the treasure of your infinite depths would be revealed to your eyes.

But let there be no scales to weigh your unknown treasure;

And seek not the depths of your knowledge with staff or sounding line.

For self is a sea boundless and measureless.

Say not, “I have found the truth,” but rather, “I have found a truth.”

Say not, “I have found the path of the soul.”

Say rather, “I have met the soul walking upon my path.”

For the soul walks upon all paths.

The soul walks not upon a line neither does it grow like a reed.

The soul unfolds itself, like a lotus of countless petals.

(Gibran 1998, p.65)
Abstract

In today’s busy and complex world, leaders can become mired in action and activity driven by a strong desire to achieve. Increasingly this drive for action and achievement coupled with the pace of life can preclude–or severely limit–time for reflection, which, in turn, can impact adversely on the quality of decisions made and on the lives of people at work.

I have been involved for over a decade in designing and facilitating training programs to improve reflection and leadership skills. Much has been written about the practices of reflection and leadership, and reflection as a practice of leadership, with a wide community of researchers and practitioners using different lenses and traditions. As a leadership consultant, I came to realise that while there is much written and taught about the topics, leaders seem to practise associated reflection skills to a limited extent once they leave the boundaries of the training program.

I also noticed, eventually, that in my professional and personal life, my own behaviour was enacting those very behaviours that I was encouraging leaders to change, bringing to mind the phrase, ‘You teach best what you most need to learn’ (Bach 1977). As I became aware of my own habits I also realised there is limited research chronicling the iterative journey of the practitioner attempting to model and learn from the practice of reflection as a leader, whilst simultaneously enabling such a process for other leaders.

This doctoral research is, therefore, essentially a self-study of my own learning about being a leader and a reflective practitioner, within the context of designing and facilitating programs to improve leadership via reflective practice for senior managers in corporate organizations. In essence, it reports how I have approached the task of emulating and representing what I encourage others to do as leaders and reflective practitioners. To explicate the objective of analyzing my own reflective practice I decided to explore two research questions: ‘How can I as a leader shift my focus from action to deep reflection?’ and ‘What are the impacts and outcomes of my endeavors to make such a shift?’ and as the research unfolded I found myself also
addressing a third question – 'How do I undertake to role model and represent what I encourage others to do as leaders and reflective practitioners?'

Specifically, the research chronicles and documents learning and insights gained from designing and facilitating two leadership development programs, based on action research with senior managers within Feedsmoore (a pseudonym) a global food business. The research draws on my learning and insights associated with implementing programs as a program director within a top ranking business school.

The research methodology is primarily autoethnography and action research supported by relevant literature and interspersed with a genre that I created and titled, called 'Pictoems'. These are pictures combined with poems capturing moments in time, providing opportunities to reflect metaphorically and symbolically on issues explored through my work on the research questions, as well as upon my awareness of life's essence.

As a direct consequence of the research, a model evolved over time framing the practice of reflection within a broader more holistic cosmology. I have called this the 'DOOR' model, with its name being a mnemonic, for the metaphoric and literal means of 'opening' doorways to understanding. The model draws on—and in a way, renames—the more familiar action learning/action research approach to exploring and documenting resolution of complex problems. The 'D' in DOOR stands for 'Design', the First 'O' stands for 'Operate', the second 'O' stands for 'Observe' and the 'R' stands for 'Reflect'.

As I worked at understanding my research question through the journey of the Doctorate, another model emerged which I have called the Four Frames of Learning. The Four Frames are a means to locate an organisation's readiness and maturity for introducing deeper learning and change processes.

Each of the eight chapters in the thesis applies the mnemonic of the DOOR to facilitate reporting of my evolving process of learning about being both a leader and a reflective practitioner in modern organizations and in my own life.
Table of Contents

DOORS To Action and Reflection ................................................................. i
Certificate of Original Authorship ........................................................... ii
Acknowledgments .................................................................................... iii
Abstract ..................................................................................................... v
Table of Contents ..................................................................................... vii
List of Figures ........................................................................................... xiv
List of Tables ............................................................................................. xvi

Chapter 1..................................................................................................... 1

DOOR to Enquiry ....................................................................................... 1
Door to Enquiry ........................................................................................ 2
Design of the Thesis .................................................................................. 2
  DOORS to Thesis Chapters ................................................................... 3
  DOORS and the Interplay within the Octagon ...................................... 4
Operating on the research......................................................................... 7
  Research Rationale................................................................................ 7
  Who and What...................................................................................... 9
  Background and History of the Enquiry ............................................. 10
  Overview of this Doctoral Enquiry ..................................................... 13
  Shifting Focus...................................................................................... 13
  Reflection and Deep Reflection.......................................................... 14
  DOOR Framework............................................................................... 15
  Four Frames of Learning ................................................................... 16
  Leadership............................................................................................ 16

Conclusion to DOOR to Enquiry............................................................... 18
Chapter 2 ...................................................................................................................................................... 19

DOOR to Methodology .............................................................................................................................. 19

Design of Methodology Chapter ............................................................................................................. 19
  Theoretical Underpinnings and Frames ................................................................................................. 19

Rational for Selection of Methodologies ............................................................................................... 23

Naturalistic, Interpretive, Constructivist and Critical Approaches to Research ........................................... 23
  Naturalistic Approaches ......................................................................................................................... 23
  Interpretive Approaches ......................................................................................................................... 24
  Constructivist Approaches ................................................................................................................... 24
  Critical Theory .................................................................................................................................... 26
  Non-Dualism ......................................................................................................................................... 26
  Postmodernism and Poststructuralism .................................................................................................. 27

Summarising Design of Methodology ..................................................................................................... 29

Operating on the Literature ..................................................................................................................... 30
  Autoethnography ................................................................................................................................. 30
  Definitions of Autoethnography: ........................................................................................................... 31
  Autoethnography as Social Practice ...................................................................................................... 34
  Autoethnographic methods .................................................................................................................. 35

Action Research and Action Learning .................................................................................................... 36
  What is Action Research and Action Learning? .................................................................................. 37
  Action research: .................................................................................................................................... 42

Observations and Reflections on the Methodology .................................................................................. 42

Chapter 3 .................................................................................................................................................... 44

DOOR to DOORS ....................................................................................................................................... 44

Design of DOOR to Doors Chapter ......................................................................................................... 44

DOOR and Cyclical Cosmologies ........................................................................................................... 46

DOOR to Reflection .................................................................................................................................. 51

History of the DOOR model .................................................................................................................... 58

Door and other Models Associated with Learning .................................................................................. 60
Four Frames of Learning ............................................................................................................. 62
Frame 1 – The Gatekeepers ........................................................................................................ 66
   Knowledge is Propositional and Disciplinary ................................................................. 66
Frame 2 – The Technical Rationalists .................................................................................... 67
   Knowledge is Procedural and Technical ........................................................................... 67
Frame 3 – The Developers ..................................................................................................... 70
   Knowledge is Personal, Experiential and learned through action ................................. 70
Frame 4 – The Integrators ..................................................................................................... 73
   Knowledge is Transdisciplinary, Critical, Socially Constructed and Integral ............... 73
     • Transdisciplinary, Critical, Socially Constructed and Integral ................................... 76
   Frame 4 Identifiers ........................................................................................................... 77
In Conclusion ......................................................................................................................... 78

Chapter 4 .................................................................................................................................. 79

DOOR To Work– The Feedsmoore Case .............................................................................. 79

(External of External) ............................................................................................................ 79

Design of Chapter 4 ............................................................................................................... 80

Design and Development of the Leading Talent Programs ............................................... 81
   The Business School and my Role as Program Director ................................................. 81
   The Client Organisation - Feedsmoore ............................................................................. 85
   Structure ........................................................................................................................... 85
   Context for the Leading Talent Program ........................................................................ 86
   Employee Engagement ................................................................................................... 86

The Leading Talent Program (LTP) ..................................................................................... 91
   Contracting with the Client ............................................................................................... 92

Operationalising the Design of the Leading Talent Program/s ........................................... 94
   The Leading Talent Approach ......................................................................................... 94
   Inputs ............................................................................................................................... 95
   Process ......................................................................................................................... 96
   Outputs ......................................................................................................................... 96
   Outcomes ....................................................................................................................... 96
Rollout of Leading Talent Program........................................................................................................ 98
Program Benefits and Objectives .................................................................................................................. 99
Learning Objectives....................................................................................................................................... 100
Structure of LTP............................................................................................................................................... 101
The Residential Modules............................................................................................................................... 103
The People Involved ....................................................................................................................................... 104
The Action Research Projects ....................................................................................................................... 106
Selection of Action Research Projects ........................................................................................................... 107
The Action Research Project Topics ............................................................................................................. 109
LTP 1.............................................................................................................................................................. 109
LTP 2 Under the overarching theme of innovation - Three projects were selected ........................................... 109
LTP Program 1 and 2 Timeline ....................................................................................................................... 109
Observations and Reflections......................................................................................................................... 112

Chapter 5....................................................................................................................................................... 114

DOOR To Work–The Feedsmoore Case.......................................................................................................... 114

(Internal of External)................................................................................................................................. 114

Design of Chapter 5....................................................................................................................................... 114

The Nature of Business Schools and Executive Education ........................................................................... 117
Causal Layered Analysis................................................................................................................................. 117

My role as a Program Director...................................................................................................................... 125

Program Directing the Two Leading Talent Programs............................................................................... 129
The Nature of Contracting.............................................................................................................................. 130
Discussions with the Steering Committee.................................................................................................... 136
Meetings with Feedsmoore Executive........................................................................................................ 141

Observations and Reflections......................................................................................................................... 145

Chapter 6....................................................................................................................................................... 148

DOOR To Work– The Feedsmoore Case.......................................................................................................... 148

(External of Internal)..................................................................................................................................... 148
## Design of Chapter 6

148

### Setting the Scene

149

- The Opening Slideshow
- The Opening Tribal Ceremony
- Program 2 Further insights on setting the scene
- Programmed Knowledge to elicit disjuncture and demonstrate P+Q/R in Action.
- OD Manager
- Coaching Director (Colleague)

### Multiple Hats

160

- The Facilitator Hat
- Program Manager and Process Consultant Hats
- The Counseling Hat
- The Set Advisor Hat
- Group Need for Task Structure

### Action Research Project Teams and Associated Issues

174

- The AR project – ‘How does Feedsmoore build a culture of effective follow-through and commitment’?
- The AR project – What is Feedsmoore’s Employee Value Proposition (EVP) for the Future?
- The AR Project - “Embedding of Metrics and Measures – The Cascading of OGSM”

### LTP Conditions and reactions

182

- The Energy Worm
- Leading Talent Program 2
- Structural Changes at Feedsmoore and Impact on the LTP

### Evaluation of the two LTPs

193

- Qualitative Evaluation
- Reactionary (Level 1)
- Demonstration of Learning (Level 2) and Behavioural Evaluation (level 3)
- ‘Results’ (Level 4) the measure of business outcomes
- Final Act
Observations and Reflections ................................................................. 205
Moving from Frame 1 Simplicity to Frame 4 Complexity ........................ 207

Chapter 7 .............................................................................................. 209

DOOR to SELF ...................................................................................... 209

Design of DOOR to Self ................................................................. 209

Who am I? ........................................................................................... 209

Who am I with Regards to Work ...................................................... 213

‘Operating’ on the Self ....................................................................... 214

How have I come to understand myself? ........................................... 214

The DOOR Model and Autoethnography ........................................... 216

The DOOR and the Activist Learning Style ....................................... 216

Pictoems .............................................................................................. 217

Use of Instruments and psychometrics .......................................... 224

The Gallup Strengths Finder ............................................................. 225

The Myers Briggs Type Indicator (MBTI) ......................................... 225

The Herrmann Brain Dominance Instrument (HBDI) ....................... 229

The Change Style Indicator ............................................................... 229

The Firo B Instrument ........................................................................ 230

The California Psychological Inventory 260 (CPI 260) .................... 232

Observation and Reflection .............................................................. 233

What did the Leading Talent Program bring to me? ....................... 233

Understanding and Working with Organisations ............................ 233

Designing and Implementing Learning Solutions ............................. 234

Personal Leadership ........................................................................... 234

Where am I Now? .............................................................................. 235

Video - On Creating a Better World .................................................. 235

The Leadership Circle Profile ........................................................... 238

A Values Inventory ............................................................................ 240

Chapter 8 ............................................................................................ 244

DOOR to The Future ........................................................................... 244
Design of the DOOR to The Future ................................................................. 244

Operating on the DOOR to The Future ...................................................... 244
  Impact of the DOOR to Enquiry ................................................................. 244
  Impact of the DOOR to Research Methodologies .................................. 246
  Impact of DOOR to DOOR ........................................................................... 248
  Impact of the DOOR model ...................................................................... 250
  Impact of Four Frames of Learning ......................................................... 252
  Impact of DOOR to Work—Chapters 4, 5 and 6 ..................................... 253

In Conclusion ................................................................................................. 261

Bibliography ................................................................................................. 266

Appendix ......................................................................................................... 1
  Appendix A—Included within memory stick ............................................. 1
  Appendix B .................................................................................................... 1
List of Figures

Figure 1.1 DOOR Model Mapped to Eight Chapters of the Thesis ........................................ 1

Figure 2.1 Crotty’s arrangement of research components ...................................................... 20

Figure 2.2 Epistemological and Methodological Research Frames ........................................ 21

Figure 2.3 Methods and Techniques ...................................................................................... 22

Figure 3.1 DOOR Cycle Linked to Yin/Yang Symbol. (Fernandez 2009b) ......................... 45

Figure 3.2 Iterative DNA DOOR Spiral (Fernandez 2009d) .................................................. 46

Figure 3.3 Longest Straight Road in Australia .................................................................... 47

Figure 3.4 Quote from Ulysses ............................................................................................. 58

Figure 3.5 DOOR Circumplex Comparative Analysis. (Fernandez 2009a) ..................... 60

Figure 3.6 Hierarchically Nested Frames of Learning (Fernandez 2012b) ....................... 63

Figure 3.7 Four Frames of Learning (Fernandez 2012a) ...................................................... 65

Figure 4.1 Ratio of Engaged to Disengaged Employees ....................................................... 87

Figure 4.2 The Cereal Box - Key Links to the LTP ............................................................. 95

Figure 4.3 Lominger Competency Integration Chart ......................................................... 97

Figure 4.4 Structure of LTP ............................................................................................... 102

Figure 4.5 The Leading Talent Process ............................................................................. 103

Figure 4.6 LTP 1 Timeline ............................................................................................... 110

Figure 4.7 LTP 2 Timeline ............................................................................................... 110
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Relationship of Paid to Discretionary Time for LTP 1 and 2</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>Causal Layered Analysis</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>Frames 3 and 4</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Pictoem Evolution’s Pride</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>Assembly of the Clans Announcement</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>DOOR Cycles within AR Sets and Functional Team</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>The Energy Worm LTP 1</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>Gersik’s Mid-Point Transition Model</td>
<td>184</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6</td>
<td>The Energy Worm LTP 2</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>Quantitative Evaluation Scores for LTP 1 and 2 Modules 1 to 3</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>Quantitative Evaluation Scores for LTP 1 and 2 Last Modules 4 and 5</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.9</td>
<td>Overall Quantitative Evaluation Scores for LTP1 and LTP 2</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.10</td>
<td>Lominger Competencies Pre and Post Scores for LTP 1</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.11</td>
<td>Lominger Competencies increase by Percentage for LTP 1</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.12</td>
<td>Lominger Competencies Pre and Post Scores for LTP 2</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.13</td>
<td>Lominger Competencies Increase by Percentage for LTP 2</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.14</td>
<td>Dinner Invitation Pictoem</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.15</td>
<td>Concluding Email from Feedsmoore’s Training Manager</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.16</td>
<td>Cynefin Framework</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Awareness and awakening</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 7.2 MBTI Preferences ................................................................. 226
Figure 7.3 MBTI Facets ........................................................................ 227
Figure 7.4 The HBDI Model ................................................................. 229
Figure 7.5 Video On Creating a Better World ..................................... 235
Figure 7.6 Eugene's Leadership Circle Profile ................................... 239
Figure 7.7 World Views ..................................................................... 241
Figure 7.8 Values Map ....................................................................... 242

List of Tables

Table 4.1 Learning Objectives for LTP ............................................... 100
Table 4.2 Committee and Team Involvement .................................... 104
Table 4.3 Action Research Project Topics and Sponsors .................... 109
Table 4.4 Activities and Committees Involved ................................... 111