

UNIVERSITY OF TECHNOLOGY, SYDNEY

UTS Business School

Assessing Transformational Leadership
Components as Drivers in Learning
Organisations

In fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
in
Management

Mohammad Al-Qawabah

Bachelor's Degree in Mechanical Engineering (Jordan University of Science &
Technology), Master of Science in Transformational Management (University of
Buckingham)

February 2012

CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP/ORIGINALITY

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Student

Production Note:

Signature removed prior to publication.

Acknowledgements

This research thesis was like a journey, through which the researcher has interacted with many institutions and a large number of people, without whom this research study and this thesis would not have seen the light. I wish to firstly express my sincere thanks to the Faculty of Business, University of Technology, Sydney for giving me the opportunity to conduct this Ph.D. study. The first person I want to express my sincere and great appreciation to is my principal supervisor, Dr Fawzy Soliman to whom I am especially grateful and extremely thankful for helping me every step of the way during this research study, and most importantly for showing interest in this research topic and accepting to supervise my research study at the UTS. Dr. Fawzy Soliman's guidance, sharing of knowledge, support and encouragement throughout the processes of developing this research were very much appreciated. Dr. Fawzy Soliman worked hard to overcome the challenges involved in conducting this research study. I am extremely and sincerely indebted to him for his efforts and help.

Secondly, I am extremely grateful to all the staff of the Management Discipline Group MDG at the UTS Business School for support and assistance throughout this research study. In particular my thanks are due to the leader of the MDG Dr Antoine Hermens (head of the MDG) and to Professor Suzanne Benn for continuous support encouragement. I really appreciate their efforts, guidance, and not withholding any of their expertise to help me build my research ability with other research students. I extremely appreciate the valuable advice they gave me during the early stages of this research study. I am also grateful to my co-supervisor Dr. Bruce Perrott.

Thirdly, I am very thankful to all the five participating organisations in this research, especially their chief executive officers for accepting my request to conduct a research in their organisations and facilitating my work, the interview part in particular, for which they offered their respective premises. I thank all the participants for being very helpful and generous with their time. Without these organisations and the participants, I would not have been able to accomplish and explore this research study. I am truly indebted and feel sincere gratitude to all of them.

I want also to express my special thanks to my dear family. Special thanks go to my Mother and Father for their care, love and sincere wishes for me to successfully finish my thesis. Special thanks also go to my brothers and sisters: Aiman, Ahmad, Rasheed, Rasha, Ruba, Rula and Omar. I thank them for the love, care, emotional support, and above all patiently listening when I would generally speak about my research.

Last but not least, I would thank all my dear friends in Australia and Jordan for their help and emotional support. Your words of encouragement were of more help to me than you can imagine.

February, 2012

Mohammad Al-Qawabah

Sydney, Australia

Table of Contents

| | |
|--|----|
| Chapter 1: Research Introduction and Rationale..... | 1 |
| 1.1: Research Background | 3 |
| 1.2: Research Aim and Questions | 5 |
| 1.3: Research Significance | 7 |
| Chapter 2: Literature Review | 9 |
| 2.1: The Learning Organisation | 9 |
| 2.1.1: Introduction | 9 |
| 2.1.2: What is Organisational Learning (OL)? | 10 |
| 2.1.3: What is Learning Organisation (LO)?..... | 12 |
| 2.1.4: What are the differences between Organisational Learning and Learning Organisation? | 13 |
| 2.1.5: Conceptual Models of the Learning Organization | 17 |
| 2.1.5.1: Garvin Model of Learning Organisation (1993)..... | 17 |
| 2.1.5.2: Pedler et al Model of Learning Organisation (1991)..... | 19 |
| 2.1.5.3: Senge's Model of Learning Organisation (1990) | 21 |
| 2.1.5.4: Soliman's Model of Transformational Leaders for Innovation..... | 24 |
| 2.1.6: Adopting a Learning Organisation Model for this Research | 25 |
| 2.1.7: Concluding summary..... | 26 |
| 2.2: Transformational Leadership Theory | 27 |
| 2.2.1: Leadership Definitions | 27 |
| 2.2.2: The Development of Leadership Theories | 29 |
| 2.2.3: Transformational Leadership | 38 |
| 2.2.3.1: The Transformational Leadership Model Developed by Rafferty and Griffin (2004)..... | 41 |
| 2.2.3.2: The Transformational Leadership Model Developed by Podsakoff, MacKenzie, Moorman, and Fetter (1990) | 43 |
| 2.2.3.3: The Transformational Leadership Model Developed by Bass (1985, 1990) | 44 |
| 2.2.4: Adopting a Transformational Leadership Model for this Research..... | 49 |
| 2.2.5: Critical Commendatory | 51 |
| 2.2.6: Measures of Transformational Leadership..... | 60 |
| 2.3: Concluding summary | 66 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Chapter 3: Research Methodology | 67 |
| 3.1: Research approach | 68 |
| 3.2: Research Philosophical Perspective..... | 69 |
| 3.3: Research Methodology | 71 |
| 3.4: Research Design, Sampling Frames and Participants..... | 74 |
| 3.4.1: Research Design | 74 |
| 3.4.2: Sampling Frames | 74 |
| 3.4.3: Research Participants..... | 76 |
| 3.5: Data collection Methods | 76 |
| 3.5.1: Data Collection Methods for Research Sub-question One | 77 |
| 3.5.2: Identifying participating organizations | 85 |
| 3.5.2.1: Stage I: Identifying the Fifty Most Profitable Organizations in Jordan | 89 |
| 3.5.2.2: Stage II: Exploring the presence of the Hard Components Related to the Five Disciplines of Learning Organizations Across the Fifty Most Profitable Organizations..... | 92 |
| 3.5.2.3: Stage III: Investigate the Press and Newspapers to Identify Learning Organizations not Included in the 50 Most Profitable Organizations | 100 |
| 3.5.2.4: Stage IV: Explore the Presence of the Soft Components Related to the Five Disciplines of Learning Organizations in the Potential Learning Organizations in Jordan:..... | 98 |
| 3.5.3: Data Collection Methods for Research sub-questions two & three: | 101 |
| 3.5.4: Data Collection Methods for Research question Two: | 103 |
| 3.6: Addressing potential difficulties:..... | 104 |
| 3.7: Data collection: | 106 |
| 3.8: Data analysis | 108 |
| 3.9: Research Limitations: | 110 |
| 3.10: Ethical Dimension:..... | 111 |
| Chapter 4: Results and Analysis..... | 114 |
| 4.1: Results of Sub-Questions no. Two and Three, and Question Two in Each Case Study..... | 117 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 4.1.1: Learning Organisation A: Results and Case Analysis | 119 |
| 4.1.1.1: Learning Organisation A Characteristics:..... | 119 |
| 4.1.1.2: Learning Organisation Disciplines within Organisation A: | 122 |
| 4.1.1.3: Leadership within Learning Organisation A: | 126 |
| 4.1.1.4: Transformational Leadership Components within Learning Organisation A and their Relation to the Disciplines of Learning Organisations..... | 127 |
| 4.1.1.5: Results Related to Research Question Two:..... | 140 |
| 4.1.2: Learning Organisation B: Results and Case Analysis..... | 143 |
| 4.1.2.1: Characteristics of Learning Organisation B: | 143 |
| 4.1.2.2: Learning Organisation Disciplines within Organisation B: | 144 |
| 4.1.2.3: Leadership in Learning Organisation B:..... | 147 |
| 4.1.2.4: Transformational Leadership Components in Learning Organisation B and their Relation to the Disciplines of Learning Organisation | 148 |
| 4.1.2.5: Results related to research question two:..... | 157 |
| 4.1.3: Learning Organisation C: Results and Case Analysis..... | 159 |
| 4.1.3.1: Learning Organisation C: Characteristics..... | 160 |
| 4.1.3.2: Learning Organisation Disciplines within Organisation C: | 161 |
| 4.1.3.3: Leadership in Learning Organisation C..... | 164 |
| 4.1.3.4: Transformational Leadership Components in Learning Organisation C and their Relation to the Disciplines of Learning Organisation | 165 |
| 4.1.3.5: Result Related to Research Question Two..... | 179 |
| 4.1.4: Learning Organisation D: Results and Case Analysis | 176 |
| 4.1.4.1: Learning Organisation D Characteristics:..... | 176 |
| 4.1.4.2: Learning Organisation Disciplines within Organisation D: | 177 |
| 4.1.4.3 Leadership in Learning Organisation D:..... | 180 |
| 4.1.4.4 Transformational Leadership Components in Learning Organisation D and their Relation to the Disciplines of Learning Organisation: | 181 |
| 4.1.4.5: Results Related to Research Question Two:..... | 187 |
| 4.1.5: Learning Organisation E: Results and Case Analysis..... | 189 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 4.1.5.1: Learning Organisation E Characteristics: | 190 |
| 4.1.5.2 Learning Organisation Disciplines within Organisation E: | 190 |
| 4.1.5.3: Leadership in Learning Organisation E: | 193 |
| 4.1.5.4 Transformational leadership Components in Learning Organisation E and their Relation to the Disciplines of Learning Organisation: | 200 |
| 4.1.5.5: Results Related to Research Question Two:..... | 201 |
| 4.2 Cross-Case Analysis..... | 204 |
| 4.2.1 Cross-Case Analysis in Relation to Research Sub-question Two | 205 |
| 4.2.2 Cross-case Analysis Regarding Research Sub-Question Three: | 214 |
| 4.2.3 Cross-Case Analysis in Relation to Research Question Two: .. | 217 |
| 4.3: Cross Checking Research Findings of Research Question Two with the Data Gathered from the Cases: | 225 |
| 4.4: Chapter conclusion: | 230 |
| Chapter 5: Discussion and Conclusions | 234 |
| 5.1 Relationship between Components of transformational leadership and Disciplines of learning organisations:..... | 234 |
| 5.2 Suggestions to Transformational Leadership: | 241 |
| 5.3 The Effects of Some Characteristic Variables on the Findings of this Research: | 244 |
| 5.3.1 The Effect of the Organisation Size, Age and Field of Work:.. | 245 |
| 5.3.2 The Effect of Gender Composition in Organisations:..... | 246 |
| 5.4 The Effect of Context:..... | 248 |
| 5.5 Research Limitations: | 252 |
| 5.6 Key Contribution of the Research: | 254 |
| 5.7 Direction for Future Research:..... | 256 |
| 5.8 Conclusions:..... | 259 |
| References:..... | 261 |
| Annex 1.Date and duration of interviews..... | 271 |

List of Tables

| | |
|--|-----|
| Table (1): Behavioural Indicators of Transformational Leadership(Bass & Avolio 1993)..... | 47 |
| Table (2): Formulaic illustrations of participative and directive leadership that are transformational (Bass & Avolio 1993; Bass & Riggio 2006). | 53 |
| Table (3): Moral Elements of Transformational Leadership (Bass & Riggio 2006)..... | 56 |
| Table (4): Sample Items Form the MLQ (5X) (Bass & Riggio 2006)..... | 65 |
| Table (5): Practical definitions, the hard components and the soft qualities that characterized each of the five disciplines..... | 80 |
| Table (6): The Fifty most profitable organizations in Jordan broken by sector..... | 89 |
| Table (7): Hard components related to the five disciplines of learning organizations..... | 89 |
| Table (8): The sources of data associated with identifying the hard components of learning organizations and the number of organizations resulted..... | 94 |
| Table (9): Classification of the 15 organizations resulted after stage three. | 99 |
| Table (10): Soft components related to the five disciplines of learning organizations..... | 99 |
| Table (11): Time interval of interviews within the five organizations. | 107 |
| Table (12): Summary of organisation A case study results | 139 |
| Table (13): Summary of organisation B case study results..... | 157 |
| Table (14): Summary of organisation C case study results..... | 173 |
| Table (15): Summary of organisation D case study results | 187 |
| Table (16): Summary of organisation E case study results..... | 201 |
| Table (17): Summary of findings from individual cases regarding research sub-question two:..... | 206 |
| Table (18): The components of transformational leadership (TL) that affect each of the five disciplines of learning organisation (LO) according to cases:..... | 211 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Table (19): Summary of the collective findings from the five cases regarding research sub-question three (the discipline most associated with each TL component):..... | 215 |
| Table (20): Summary of findings in relation to research question two from each of the five research cases: | 218 |
| Table (21): Identified thematic topics (coloured) within cases findings... | 219 |
| Table (22): Ideas with similar themes (that have the same colour) grouped to form larger thematic concepts | 220 |

List of Diagrams

| | |
|---|-----|
| Diagram (1) Graphical Illustration of the Research Procedures | 104 |
| Diagram (2): Research Theoretical Framework..... | 113 |

Abstract

Transformational leadership is highly recognised for bringing change to organisations and for its significant positive effects on employee satisfaction and development, developing self-management teams and organisational effectiveness, and contributing to innovation and creativity. Yet there has been relatively little research on how transformational leadership actually works. It has been well established that a continuously evolving organisation is one that can truly learn. However, little is known about the role of knowledge and learning in promoting change. Consequently, one of the major management challenges is to understand management's role in organisational change and business success.

It has been found that the reaction of learning organisations in response to external environment not only positively impacts the performance of the organisation but also enhances job satisfaction and performance among employees. Despite the critical importance of transformational leaders in leading and developing organisations and the significance of transforming organisations into learning organisations, the area of research that covers the role of leaders in developing an organisation that can truly learn (learning organisation) has not been covered to a significant degree.

This research study investigates the effect of the transformational leadership components developed by Bass (1990, 1985) on the disciplines of Learning Organisations developed by Senge (1990). It investigates proposals for transformational leadership to better lead Learning Organisations. To this end, 37 semi-structured and unstructured interviews were conducted in five learning organisations in Jordan. This research is qualitative in nature and utilises an interpretative approach in studying and analysing the five cases studied.

In general, research findings confirmed the few previous findings indicating that transformational leadership has a significant positive effect on Learning Organisations. However, this research investigates the specific effect of each of the components of transformational leadership on the five disciplines of Learning Organisations. Research findings suggest that Idealised Influence has a positive impact on the development of Shared Vision, Intellectual Stimulation has a positive impact on the development of the Mental Model, and Individualised Consideration has a positive effect on developing Personal Mastery. Additionally, findings suggest two points that ought to be considered by transformational leadership to effectively lead Learning Organisations: 1) transformational leadership should be a culture; and 2) transformational leadership should be governed by integrity and ethics. The research also identifies the effect of some variables such as size, age, field of work and gender composition on the findings of this research.

The research also explores the implications of its findings on leaders in organizational life and makes recommendations for future studies. Findings are to be limited to Jordan. However, the finding suggesting that transformational leadership should be governed by integrity and ethics can be applied to a much wider setting.

Key Words:

Learning Organisation, Shared Vision, Mental Models, System Thinking, Team Learning, Personal Mastery, Transformational Leadership, Idealised Influence, Inspirational Motivation, Intellectual Stimulation, Individualised Consideration, Organisational Culture, Ethics and Integrity in Organisations.