Liquidity and Efficiency during Unusual Market Conditions:

An Analysis of Short Selling Restrictions and Expiration-Day Procedures on the London Stock Exchange



University of Technology, Sydney

Matthew Clifton

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Discipline of Finance
Faculty of Business
University of Technology, Sydney
December 2010

Statement of Originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text. I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Production Note: Signature removed prior to publication.

Matthew Clifton

Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I thank my academic supervisor, Professor David Michayluk, for his consistently strong support and guidance throughout the preparation of this thesis. It has been a pleasure to work with Dave and learn from his diverse experiences.

This research has also benefited greatly from the thoughtful insights and feedback provided by Mike Aitken, Tony Hall, Tony He, Elvis Jarnecic, Mark Van Achter, and Terry Walter. To Mark Snape and Imon Palit; living and working with you in London was a formative and memorable life-experience. Thanks for sharing your passion for microstructure, but most of all thank you for your friendship. I am also indebted to Dan Armstrong, Tony Sio and the rest of the SMARTSTM team, and to Nick Bayley, Janet Cowan, Phil Crossley, Andy King, Laurence Moore, Nisha Patel, Tim Rowe, Tom Stenhouse, Linda Templeton and other staff of the London Stock Exchange (LSE) who helped me in my quest to learn what makes a great stock market – the answer is you.

I gratefully acknowledge research funding provided by the Capital Markets Cooperative Research Centre (CMCRC) and the University of Technology Sydney (UTS) Faculty of Business. A big thank you to Alex Frino who gave me the opportunity of a lifetime and to CMCRC staff (especially Pauline Bradley, Linda Gough and Will Renner) for their dedication and support. Thanks also to Kiril Alampieski, Basil Chelmsford, Daniel Chu, Elisa Di Marco, Adam Hotz, Nicolette Kost De Sevres, Amy Kwan, Richard Philip, John Wiley and other fellow research students who have shared this amazing adventure with me. I also thank the LSE, Securities Industry Research Centre of Asia-Pacific (SIRCA) and Reuters for providing the data used in this thesis.

A special thank you goes to my family, friends and beautiful fiancée who made this experience an enjoyable journey.

Preface

Some three years ago, I was fortunate enough to be awarded a PhD scholarship from the CMCRC; an innovative research centre based in Sydney, Australia. One of the primary goals of the CMCRC is to harness the expertise of an extensive network of academics and industry specialists to enhance current understanding of the key drivers of market efficiency and fairness. In pursuit of these objectives, I have had the privilege of conducting much of my research while working at the LSE as an active member of regulatory, monitoring, and surveillance teams.

Through working with the LSE I have gained enormous insight into many operational aspects of a large stock exchange. While at the LSE I was involved in the investigation of various market design features including short selling restrictions, tick-size changes, and expiration-day effects. In completing this work it was necessary to characterise liquidity and trading activity to provide insights into the costs and benefits of market changes. I also analysed participant behaviour with respect to various regulations defined by the UK financial regulator, the Financial Services Authority (FSA). I was responsible for developing requirements and algorithms for monitoring and compliance purposes in areas such as off-book trade reporting and market maker presence. I also investigated various forms of market manipulation including insider trading, marking the close and layering (or 'spoofing'). Working with the surveillance team to develop automated detection methods of market abuse in real-time has been a highlight. Witnessing identified cases being referred to the FSA for further investigation was very rewarding.

It was a great pleasure and a privilege to have had the opportunity to contribute towards enhancing the efficiency and integrity of the LSE market. Through this experience I have gained much respect for the sensitive nature of market surveillance and as such, in this thesis I only present a subset of my research endeavours; that which is considered suitable for public dissemination.

In addition to working at the LSE, I have also enjoyed immersing myself in the academic literature. This experience has served to broaden my understanding of the multitude of exciting research questions surrounding financial markets; many of which remain open and so many more that are yet to be conceived. The dramatic, dynamic and evolutionary nature of financial markets, combined with an abundance of readily accessible data makes ours a truly fascinating field of research.

During my doctoral candidature I have also been an active member of the CMCRC Market Quality team during my study leave return visits to Sydney. The Market Quality team comprises a group of fellow motivated research students, many of whom work abroad with stock exchanges and financial regulators, studying the ins and outs of different market designs all over the world.

Some of the work in this thesis has been presented as joint work. A study describing preliminary findings of the market impact of short selling restrictions co-authored with Mark Snape was among the first reports in the world to document the effects of emergency regulatory intervention into short sales and this work formed part of the LSE's response to the Committee of European Securities Regulators' (CESR) call for evidence on regulation of short selling¹. A more detailed study of the effects of the UK short selling ban is presented in Chapter 3 of this thesis; a version of which was presented as a working paper co-authored with Prof. David Michayluk at various academic conferences including the European Finance Association Annual Meeting and the Annual Conference of the Multinational Finance Society.

¹ CESR call for evidence on regulation of short selling (January 20, 2009), http://www.londonstock exchange.com/about-the-exchange/regulatory/response-cers-call-evidence-short-selling.pdf, last accessed November 28, 2010.

Table of Contents

State	ement of Originality	·Ì
Ackr	nowledgements	ii
Prefa	ace	iii
Tabl	e of Contents	. V
List	of Tables	. X
List	of Figures	xi
Abbi	reviations	Kii
Abst	ractx	o post o post o post o post
СНА	PTER 1 INTRODUCTION	kaza
1.1	Background and Motivation	peak
1.2	What is Market Design	. 1
1.3	Why Market Design Matters	. 3
1.4	Purpose and Contributions	. 3
1.5	Structure of this Thesis	. 7
СНА	PTER 2 MARKET OVERVIEW	. 8
2.1	Introduction	8

2.2	Overview of Market Structure	9
2.3	Trading Schedule	10
2.4	Execution Algorithms	11
2.5	Order Book Periods	13
2.5	5.1 Continuous Execution Periods	13
2.5	5.2 Auction Periods	13
2.6	Automated Execution Suspensions	14
2.7	Order Book Functionality	15
2.8	Tick Sizes	18
2.9	Market Maker Responsibilities	18
2.10	Exchange Fees	
	Trade Publication	
2.12	Clearing and Settlement	20
2.13	Rules and Regulation	20
СНА	APTER 3 SHORT SELLING RESTRICTIONS	22
3.1	Introduction	22
3.2	The 2008-9 Financial Crisis	25
3.3	Literature Review and Hypotheses Development	
3.3	Trading Activity in the Upstairs and Downstairs Markets	28
3.3	3.2 Stock Returns and Volatility	31

3.3.3	Spreads and Depths on the Limit Order Book	35
3.3.4	Order Flow	36
3.4 Dat	a and Method of Analysis	38
3.4.1	Data and Sample Periods	38
3.4.2	Sample stocks	39
3.4.3	Measures Examined	43
3.5 Res	rults	46
3.5.1	Trading Activity in the Upstairs and Downstairs Markets	46
3.5.2	Stock Returns and Volatility	50
3.5.3	Spreads and Depth on the Limit Order Book	53
3.5.4	Order Flow	61
3.6 Cor	nclusions	65
СНАРТЕ	R 4 EXPIRATION-DAY EFFECTS	68
4.1 Inti	roduction	68
4.2 Pre	vious Literature and Hypotheses Development	72
4.2.1	The Impact of Derivatives on Underlying Markets	72
4.2.2	Sources of Expiration-Day Effects	73
4.2.3	Prior Evidence of Expiration-Day Effects	77
4.2.4	Expiration-Day Effects in Different World Markets	77
4.2.5	Expiration-Day Effects of Different Derivative Types	80
4.2.6	Alternative Stock Market Procedures	82
4.2.7	Testable Hypotheses	87

4.3	Exp	iration-Day Stock Market Procedures	88
4.4	The	Data	98
4.5	Met	hodology	99
4	1.5.1	Trading Volume	. 102
4	1.5.2	Volatility	. 102
4	1.5.3	Price Reversals	. 103
۷	1.5.4	Transactions Costs	. 105
4.6	Res	ults	. 105
4	1.6.1	Trading Volume	. 105
4	1.6.2	Volatility	. 111
	4.6.3	Price Reversals	. 120
	1.6.4	Transactions Costs	. 122
4.7	Cor	iclusions	. 125
CH	IAPTE	R 5 EFFICIENCY OF EXPIRATION-DAY PROCEDURES	. 128
5.1	Intr	oduction	. 128
5.2	Pre	vious Literature and Hypotheses Development	. 130
5.3	The	Data	. 135
5.4	Met	thodology	. 137
4	5.4.1	Forecasting Model	
4	5.4.2	Entry Strategy	. 141
4	5.4.3	Exit Strategy.	. 143
4	5.4.4	Transactions Costs	. 145

5.4.5	Benchmark Comparisons and Risk Adjustments	146
5.5 Re	esults	. 146
5.5.1	Performance of Trading Strategies	. 146
5.5.2	Performance of a Selected Trading Strategy	. 150
5.5.3	Out-of-Sample Performance	. 153
5.6 C	onclusions	. 154
	ER 6 CONCLUSIONS	
6.1 C	onclusions	. 156
	ıture Work	
Referen	ces	. 160
Append	ix A London Stock Exchange Information Sources	. 170
Append	ix B Scatter Plots of Expiration-Day Return Candidate Predictors	. 171

List of Tables

Table 2.1	Trading Schedule
Table 2.2	Order Types
Table 3.1	List of Ban and Control Stocks
Table 3.2	Ban and Control Groups
Table 3.3	Trading Activity
Table 3.4	Stock Prices and Volatility
Table 3.5	Quoted Spreads and Order Book Depth
Table 3.6	Order Flow
Table 4.1	Trading Characteristics of FTSE 100 Stocks
Table 4.2	Specifications of FTSE 100 Index Futures and Option Contracts
Table 4.3	Expiration-Day Trading Volume
Table 4.4	Characteristics of Return Distributions before and after Expiration
Table 4.5	Expiration-Day Absolute Stock Returns
Table 4.6	Average Frequency and Magnitude of Expiration-Day Stock Price Reversals 121
Table 4.7	Average Bid-Ask Spreads on Expiration Days
Table 5.1	Regressions of Post-Expiration Returns on Trading Characteristics
Table 5.2	Estimated Transactions Costs
Table 5.3	Performance of Trading Strategies
Table 5.4	Performance of a Trading Strategy
Table 5.5	Out-of-Sample Performance of a Trading Strategy

List of Figures

Figure 1.1	Market Design and Market Quality	2
Figure 2.1	Limit Order Book Transparency	10
Figure 3.1	Timeline of Stock Prices and Major News Announcements	26
Figure 3.2	Trading Activity in the Upstairs Market	49
Figure 3.3	Daily Volatility	53
Figure 3.4	Quoted Spreads	
Figure 3.5	Depth of the Limit Order Book	57
Figure 4.1	FTSE 100 Index Expiry Auction Process	93
Figure 4.2	Intraday Trading Periods of Analysis	101
Figure 4.3	Expiration-Day Trading Volume	107
Figure 4.4	Characteristics of Return Distributions before and after Expiration	113
Figure 4.5	Expiration-Day Absolute Stock Returns.	117
Figure 4.6	Average Bid-Ask Spreads on Expiration Days	123
Figure 5.1	Stock Returns Pre- and Post-Expiration	139
Figure 5.2	Cumulative Trade Returns	153

Abbreviations

AESP Automatic Execution Suspension Period

BATS Europe (a pan-European alternative trading venue)
Chi-X Chi-X Europe (a pan-European alternative trading venue)

CSER Committee of European Securities Regulators

ECN Electronic Communication Network
EDSP Exchange Delivery Settlement Price

ETF Exchange Traded Fund

FTSE A share index of the most highly capitalised UK companies

FSA Financial Services Authority (UK financial regulator)

LIFFE London International Financial Futures and Options Exchange

LSE London Stock Exchange

MiFID Markets in Financial Instruments Directive

MTF Multilateral Trading Facility

NYSE New York Stock Exchange

PME Price Monitoring Extension

RIE Recognised Investment Exchange

RNS Regulatory News Service

S&P 500 A share index of the most highly capitalised US companies
SEC Securities and Exchange Commission (US financial regulator)

SETS Stock Exchange Electronic Trading System

SIRCA Securities Industry Research Centre of Asia-Pacific

UK United Kingdom

US United States of America

Abstract

While enhancing market quality has always been an important goal, this challenge has taken on even greater significance with increasing competition between securities markets both nationally and internationally. This thesis examines the influence of several key market design features on the market quality of the London Stock Exchange (LSE).

The first issue examined is the impact of regulatory changes to short selling constraints on liquidity and order flow during periods of extreme uncertainty. During the 2008-9 UK emergency temporary short selling ban, restricted stocks experienced lower trading activity, wider spreads, reduced order book depth, and more aggressive trading. The restrictions occurred at a time of extreme uncertainty when price volatility increased and there was more trading activity in the upstairs market. Our findings suggest that limit order trading may be less viable during turbulent times and should interest policymakers concerned with maintaining fair markets during crisis periods.

Second, this thesis examines trading conditions during another period of market strain; index derivatives expiration days. Previously unexamined, the LSE employs a unique intraday call auction procedure to minimise expiration-day effects on underlying stocks. Price and volume data is examined around the expiration of FTSE 100 index futures and option contracts to determine the efficacy of the UK approach. Evidence of significant increases in trading volume and abnormal stock returns in the underlying market on expiration days is found. However, the effects are short-lived and small relative to transactions costs, suggesting that use of an intraday call auction mechanism is effective in maintaining a fair and orderly market.

The third issue analysed in this thesis is whether current expiration-day procedures give rise to exploitable market efficiencies. Individual stock returns prior to expiration are found to help predict future prices in the short-term. This predictive ability is used to derive trading strategies which are tested under real-world conditions to search for systematic profitable trading opportunities. Although the model forecasts produce higher returns than a passive benchmark, the gains are small after allowing for transaction costs implying that LSE expiration-day procedures foster an efficient market.

This thesis has implications for economic efficiency and policy. Together, study of these distinctive market design features of the LSE and their respective impacts on liquidity and market efficiency contributes to an enhanced understanding of optimal market design. Our findings should interest academics and market operators concerned with maintaining fair and efficient markets, particularly during critical trading periods.