Successful Transition to Mobile Government (m-Government) An Adaptive Framework

A thesis submitted by Shadi Al-khamayseh
in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree
Doctor of Philosophy in Computer Systems

Faculty of Engineering and Information Technology

March 2009
Certificate of Authorship/Originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Shadi Al-khamayseh
Acknowledgements

First of all, it is difficult to overstate my gratitude to my supervisor Associate Professor Elaine Lawrence at the University of Technology, Sydney (UTS) for her continuous and invaluable support at all stages of my research. Elaine has provided advice, encouragement and guidance, which has resulted in recognised achievements. We have shared a very positive working relationship. Thanks also to Dr Wayne Brooks, my co-supervisor, for reading my chapters and providing valuable feedback to make it a success.

Gratitude also goes the participating experts who did more than could have been expected from them in order to help me collect the background material for this thesis. I am also indebted to my many colleagues (academics and PhD. students) who during my PhD candidature had to listen to me talking about the same topic and even reading some of the chapters. I am especially grateful (alphabetically) to Dr Agnieszka Zmijewska, Dr Julia Prior, Dr Tarek El-kiki, and Thomas Given-Wilson PhD.

Very special thanks to my loving, caring and supportive family who has missed me a lot during my research abroad. They raised me, supported me, taught me, and loved me. To them I dedicate this thesis.
Publications supporting this research

The following publications published in peer-reviewed conferences are directly related to this research:


Abstract

Over the past decade Governments all over the world have been moving towards providing services to their citizens via the web, with varying degrees of success. These e-Government initiatives have been the subject of extensive research. This research is concerned with the transitioning from e-Government to mobile government (m-Government). Mobile government implementation is still in its very early stages – indeed a perfect m-Government Framework/model has not yet been created. This research aims to contribute to the field by developing a successful m-Government framework as a basis for a transition methodology, either from e-Government to m-Government or directly to m-Government.

Transitioning from e-Government to m-Government requires researching the integration process between e-Government and m-Government. It also requires investigation of all the pressures, obstacles that hinder the transition process and m-Government success factors. Such obstacles and success factors differ between nations, such as a nation's technological and information infrastructure, mobile device penetration and acceptance, public and social pressures, and security. Finally an m-Government initiative must be developed followed by an m-Government strategy.

Mobile devices have the potential to become ideal access devices because they are small, light, personal, convenient, and many people carry them all the time, everywhere. Mobile devices have a number of connectivity options, and their own display and input capabilities. They are already widely used around the world.
Mobile Government, despite its potential, has not reached anticipated adoption levels. While there may be many reasons for this, limited previous research has focused on only a few topics, mainly technology and consumers. The main aim of this study is to discover what is necessary to improve the adoption and implementation of mobile government systems. Specific objectives that were proposed to help achieve this aim included: a) identifying all the factors that may influence adoption and implementation of mobile services, b) integrating such factors and relations between them in a framework, and c) providing specific recommendations and guidelines in all the various perspectives.

Case studies were the methodology employed to fulfil these objectives. A qualitative approach was found to be most suitable to this study, and open-ended Web surveys, as well as various kinds of interviews, including email, face-to-face, and phone, were used to obtain detailed, in-depth information from industry and user participants.

The main contribution of this study is the adaptive theoretical framework that explains the specific factors that influence the adoption, diffusion and implementation of mobile government systems. It provides interesting findings on each of the identified factors, and at the same time integrates such investigations as one coherent whole that forms a framework of success factors for mobile government systems.

Some of the discovered factors have never before been proposed. Others have been proposed in fragmented explanations that focused on several influences only. Yet other factors have been proposed before, but this study offered more
accurate or understandable interpretations or names for them. In addition, this study integrated all the factors in a framework, pointing out the important contexts and conditions that need to be understood and fulfilled.

Another contribution can be found in the multitude of specific guidelines and recommendations that have been discovered in the participants’ data. This study additionally devoted much attention to studying international mobile governments. The proposed framework with its well explained success factors can be used by traditional or electronic governments to improve their current work processes through the new mobile and wireless technologies.
Table of Contents

CHAPTER 1 ........................................................................................................... 1
  1. INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................. 1
    1.1. Mobile Government Defined............................................................................. 1
    1.2. Research Questions ........................................................................................ 4
    1.3. Research Purpose ........................................................................................... 5
    1.4. Research importance: significance and implications ........................................ 6
    1.5. Research motivation ....................................................................................... 7
    1.6. Research Scope ............................................................................................ 8
    1.7. Research overview ....................................................................................... 9
    1.8. Thesis Outline............................................................................................... 9

CHAPTER 2 ......................................................................................................... 14
  2. LITERATURE REVIEW ...................................................................................... 14
    2.1. Introduction ..................................................................................................... 14
    2.2. m-Government Defined .................................................................................. 17
    2.3. m-Government Drivers .................................................................................. 17
    2.4. Why should governments adopt m-Government? .......................................... 19
    2.5. m-Government vs. e-Government .................................................................. 22
    2.6. m-Government development requirements .................................................. 23
      2.6.1. m-Government vision ................................................................................ 24
      2.6.2. m-Government mission ............................................................................. 25
      2.6.3. m-Government objectives ....................................................................... 26
      2.6.4. m-Government Goals .............................................................................. 27
      2.6.5. Successful m-Government strategy ........................................................ 29
      2.6.6. m-Government plans .............................................................................. 30
      2.6.7. m-Government success factors ................................................................ 31
2.7. Discussion of the Success factors: ................................................................. 33
2.7.1. Infrastructure ......................................................................................... 33
2.7.2. Coherent and Adaptive m-Government framework .................................. 34
2.7.3. e-Government ....................................................................................... 35
2.7.4. Access .................................................................................................. 35
2.7.5. Acceptance ............................................................................................ 35
2.7.6. Perceived availability of resources ....................................................... 36
2.7.7. Deregulation of telecommunications sector .......................................... 37
2.7.8. Privacy and security ............................................................................. 37
2.7.9. Cost ................................................................................................ ...... 39
2.7.10. Strategy ............................................................................................... 40
2.7.11. IT literacy and m-Government awareness ........................................... 41
2.7.12. Standards and Data exchange protocols ............................................. 42
2.7.13. User needs and preference applications .............................................. 42
2.7.14. Quality and user friendly applications ............................................... 43
2.7.15. Partnership with private sector ............................................................ 43
2.7.16. High mobile penetration ..................................................................... 44
2.8. m-Government benefits .......................................................................... 46
2.9. m-Government cost .................................................................................. 48
2.10. The problem ........................................................................................... 49
2.11. Conclusion ............................................................................................. 51

CHAPTER 3 ........................................................................................................... 53

3. METHODOLOGY ............................................................................................ 53
3.1. Introduction ............................................................................................... 53
3.2. Research Design ....................................................................................... 55
3.3. Research Purpose ..................................................................................... 59
3.4. Epistemology ............................................................................................ 62
3.4.1. Constructionism as the Epistemology ................................................. 63
3.5. Theoretical Perspectives: Symbolic Interactionism .................................. 66
3.6. Research methodology: Case Studies ............................................................ 69
  3.6.1. Case study quality & rigour ........................................................................ 72
3.7. Research Approach: Qualitative Research ..................................................... 75
  3.7.1. Qualitative Research Components .......................................................... 79
3.8. Chapter Review ............................................................................................. 80
  3.8.1. Where to now?.......................................................................................... 80

CHAPTER 4 ....................................................................................................... 81

4. DATA COLLECTION......................................................................................... 81
  4.1. Introduction .................................................................................................. 82
  4.2. Data Collection Methods ........................................................................... 82
    4.2.1. Literature review ................................................................................... 83
    4.2.2. Web-based Surveys ............................................................................. 86
      4.2.2.1. Web-surveys Sampling ................................................................ 88
      4.2.2.2. Web-surveys Questions ................................................................ 90
      4.2.2.3. Web-surveys Design ................................................................... 92
      4.2.2.4. Conducting the survey .................................................................. 94
    4.2.3. Interview Case Study ........................................................................... 96
      4.2.3.1. Nature of Interviews ...................................................................... 97
      4.2.3.2. Interview Case Study Sampling: site and subjects selection .......... 99
  4.3. Case studies .................................................................................................. 106
    4.3.1. Australian Case studies ....................................................................... 106
      4.3.1.1. Government department selection ............................................. 107
    4.3.2. Jordan Case study ............................................................................... 108
    4.3.3. United Arab Emirates Case study ...................................................... 111
  4.4. Data Management ...................................................................................... 112
  4.5. Ethics Approval .......................................................................................... 114
  4.6. Review of Chapter ...................................................................................... 115
    4.6.1. Where to now?...................................................................................... 115

CHAPTER 5 ....................................................................................................... 116
5. DATA ANALYSIS ................................................................. 116
  5.1. Introduction ................................................................. 116
  5.2. Qualitative Analysis Fundamentals ................................. 120
  5.3. Analysis strategy .......................................................... 121
    5.3.1. Analytic tools .......................................................... 123
    5.3.2. Coding the Data ....................................................... 125
  5.4. Coding Phases .............................................................. 126
    5.4.1. Substantive coding .................................................... 128
    5.4.1.1. Open coding ......................................................... 128
    5.4.2. Theoretical Coding ................................................. 131
  5.5. Computerisation: NVivo 7 & 8 ....................................... 131
  5.6. Review of Chapter ....................................................... 134
    5.6.1. Where to now? ......................................................... 134

CHAPTER 6 .............................................................................. 135

6. M-GOVERNMENT FUNDAMENTALS .................................... 135
  6.1. Introduction ................................................................. 135
  6.2. Survey responses and analysis ........................................ 136
    6.2.1. Derived Definition Based on Survey of Experts ............... 143
  6.3. m-Government Definition: Literature review refinement ........ 143
  6.4. m-Government definition: Final and refined ....................... 146
  6.5. The e-Government requirement ....................................... 148
    6.5.1. The Online Survey Discussion .................................... 149
    6.5.2. Literature review Refinement ..................................... 153
  6.6. Chapter Review ............................................................ 155
    6.6.1. Where to now? ......................................................... 156

CHAPTER 7 .............................................................................. 159

7. AUSTRALIAN CASE STUDIES: STATE OF QUEENSLAND ......... 159
7.1. First Queensland Council Case Study (QLDCC1) ............................................ 160
  7.1.1. Introduction ................................................................................................ 160
  7.1.2. The council’s current use of WIRED Internet ........................................ 161
  7.1.3. The council’s current use of MOBILE and WIRELESS Internet .......... 161
  7.1.4. Government to Employee (G2E) mGov Projects ................................ 164
  7.1.5. Drivers ..................................................................................................... 166
  7.1.6. Solutions .................................................................................................. 168
  7.1.7. Mobile Government Constituents ............................................................. 175
      7.1.7.1. Government to Citizen (G2C) ......................................................... 175
      7.1.7.2. Government to Employee (G2E) .................................................... 177
  7.1.8. Providers .................................................................................................. 179
  7.1.9. Conclusion ............................................................................................... 182

7.2. Second Queensland Council Case Study (QLDCC2) ................................... 184
  7.2.1. Introduction ............................................................................................... 184
  7.2.2. The council’s current use of WIRED Internet ........................................ 184
  7.2.3. The council’s current use of MOBILE and WIRELESS Internet .......... 185
  7.2.4. Drivers ..................................................................................................... 187
  7.2.5. Business Case ............................................................................................ 188
  7.2.6. Solutions .................................................................................................. 191
  7.2.7. Mobile Government Constituents ............................................................. 197
      7.2.7.1. Government to Citizen (G2C) ......................................................... 198
      7.2.7.2. Government to Employee (G2E) .................................................... 201
  7.2.8. Providers .................................................................................................. 203
  7.2.9. Security ..................................................................................................... 206
  7.2.10. Government Role ..................................................................................... 211
  7.2.11. Benefits .................................................................................................. 212
  7.2.12. Conclusion ............................................................................................... 213

7.3. Chapter Conclusion ....................................................................................... 216

CHAPTER 8 ........................................................................................................... 219

8. AUSTRALIAN CASE STUDIES: STATE OF NEW SOUTH WALES ................ 219
8.1. First New South Wales Council Case Study (NSWCC1) ........................................ 220
  8.1.1. Introduction ........................................................................................................... 220
  8.1.2. The council’s current use of WIRED Internet ...................................................... 220
  8.1.3. The council’s current use of MOBILE and WIRELESS Internet ......................... 221
  8.1.4. Government to Employee (G2E) m-Government Projects .................................... 221
  8.1.5. Drivers .................................................................................................................. 222
  8.1.6. Solutions ............................................................................................................... 223
  8.1.7. Security ................................................................................................................. 228
  8.1.8. Mobile Government Constituents ........................................................................... 229
     8.1.8.1. Government to Citizen (G2C) ........................................................................ 230
     8.1.8.2. Government to Employee (G2E) ................................................................. 231
  8.1.9. Providers ............................................................................................................... 235
  8.1.10. Benefits .............................................................................................................. 240
  8.1.11. Government Role ................................................................................................. 241
  8.1.12. Decision to go mobile .......................................................................................... 242
  8.1.13. Conclusion ......................................................................................................... 243

8.2. New South Wales Case Study 2 .............................................................................. 246
  8.2.1. Introduction ........................................................................................................... 246
  8.2.2. The current use of WIRED Internet ..................................................................... 247
  8.2.3. The current use of MOBILE and WIRELESS Internet .................................... 248
  8.2.4. Devices ................................................................................................................. 251
  8.2.5. Mobile Government Constituents ...................................................................... 252
     8.2.5.1. Government to Citizen (G2C) ..................................................................... 253
     8.2.5.2. Government to Employee (G2E) ................................................................. 253
  8.2.6. Benefits ............................................................................................................... 257
  8.2.7. Mobile Government System and Solutions ....................................................... 261
  8.2.8. Conclusion ......................................................................................................... 268
     8.2.8.1. Where to now? .......................................................................................... 270

8.3. New South Wales Case Study 3 .............................................................................. 271
  8.3.1. Introduction ........................................................................................................... 271
  8.3.2. The current use of WIRED Internet ..................................................................... 272
  8.3.3. The current use of MOBILE and WIRELESS Internet .................................... 273
  8.3.4. Mobile Government Constituents ...................................................................... 277
8.3.4.1. Government to Citizen (G2C) ................................................................. 278
8.3.4.2. Government to Employee (G2E) ........................................................... 279
8.3.5. Benefits ...................................................................................................... 280
8.3.6. Providers .................................................................................................... 282
8.3.7. Mobile Government System and Solutions .............................................. 285
8.3.8. Conclusion .................................................................................................. 287

8.4. Chapter Conclusion ......................................................................................... 288
8.4.1. Where to now? ............................................................................................. 292

CHAPTER 9 ....................................................................................................... 293

9. INTERNATIONAL CASE STUDIES: JORDAN & UNITED ARAB EMIRATES .... 293

9.1. Case study of Jordan ....................................................................................... 294
9.1.1. Introduction .................................................................................................. 294
9.1.2. The current use of WIRED Internet ............................................................. 295
9.1.3. The current use of MOBILE and WIRELESS Internet ......................... 296
9.1.4. m-Government vs e-Government ............................................................... 298
9.1.5. m-Government team .................................................................................. 300
9.1.6. m-Government Stakeholders ..................................................................... 302
9.1.7. Marketing m-Government services ............................................................. 304
9.1.8. Characteristics of m-Government services ............................................... 305
9.1.9. Security of m-Government services .......................................................... 306
9.1.10. m-Government Vision & Mission ............................................................. 307
9.1.11. Where to now? .......................................................................................... 309

9.2. United Arab Emirates (UAE) Case study ..................................................... 310
9.2.1. Introduction ................................................................................................ 310
9.2.2. The current use of WIRED Internet ........................................................... 311
9.2.3. The current use of MOBILE and WIRELESS Internet ......................... 313
9.2.4. m-Government Vs e-Government ............................................................. 314
9.2.5. Developing m-Government ..................................................................... 317
9.2.6. m-Government Stakeholders ................................................................. 318
9.2.7. An m-Government platform.......................................................... 319
9.2.8. m-Government portal........................................................................ 320
9.2.9. Characteristics of m-Government services ........................................ 320
9.2.10. Conclusion...................................................................................... 321
  9.2.10.1. Where to now? ........................................................................... 322

CHAPTER 10 ...................................................................................... 324

10. M-GOVERNMENT ADAPTIVE FRAMEWORK ........................................ 324
  10.1. Introduction...................................................................................... 325
  10.2. The Devised Mobile Government Framework Discussion .................. 337
  10.3. International case studies findings ..................................................... 385
  10.4. Chapter Conclusion........................................................................... 392
  10.5. Thesis conclusion............................................................................. 394

REFERENCES .................................................................................... 401
List of Figures

Figure 1: World cellular connections ................................................................. 20
Figure 2: Worldwide mobile subscribers............................................................ 20
Figure 3: Decentralised m-government communication model............................ 25
Figure 4: California state e-Government portal.................................................... 27
Figure 5: Kushchu and Borucki’s Enhanced Response Model .......................... 29
Figure 6: Citizen’s interaction with m-Government in Malta................................. 46
Figure 7: Qualitative research pyramid model.................................................... 54
Figure 8: Right to left research design ............................................................... 57
Figure 9: Left to right research design ............................................................... 58
Figure 10: Research design ................................................................................. 59
Figure 11: Researcher’s conduct of Constructionism ......................................... 64
Figure 12: Multiple sources of evidence ............................................................. 73
Figure 13: Screen shot of the welcome screen of the first launched mGov web-survey.. 87
Figure 14: Screenshot of mGov definition survey .............................................. 91
Figure 15: Screenshot I - open-ended mGov survey ........................................... 91
Figure 16: Screenshot II - open-ended mGov survey ........................................... 91
Figure 17: Screenshot III - open-ended mGov survey ........................................ 92
Figure 18: Data collection strategy ..................................................................... 96
Figure 19: Screen shot of code supporting the need for e-Government .............. 127
Figure 20: An example of a category code with all the relevant text that has been coded into it displayed on the right-hand ................................................................. 132
Figure 21: Location of respondents to the e-Government requirement survey ........ 149
Figure 22: Percentages of participants supporting findings ........................................... 153
Figure 23: e-Government relevance to m-Government ............................................... 155
Figure 24: Map of Australia showing Queensland ......................................................... 160
Figure 25: Use of MMS technology to report problems .............................................. 164
Figure 26: m-Government centralised platform .......................................................... 173
Figure 27: m-Government applications/solutions development cycle ...................... 175
Figure 28: QLDCC2 mobile library ............................................................................... 187
Figure 29: mobileASL project ...................................................................................... 260
Figure 30: Map of Telstra's NextG network coverage ............................................... 267
Figure 31: Location and map of Jordan .......................................................................... 294
Figure 32: Location and map of UAE ........................................................................... 310
Figure 33: The adaptive m-Government framework ..................................................... 336
Figure 34: Task-Technology Fit (TTF) theory .............................................................. 364
Figure 35: Unified Theory of Acceptance and Use of Technology ............................. 373
Figure 36: Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) ......................................................... 376
List of Tables

Table 1: m-Government Drivers ................................................................. 18
Table 2: Worldwide wireless Internet usage and projections ...................... 20
Table 3: e-Government vs. m-Government .................................................. 22
Table 4: m-Government success factors ....................................................... 32
Table 5: Qualitative research criteria this research meets .......................... 79
Table 6: Jordan SMS gateway services ......................................................... 111
Table 7: UAE early SMS services ................................................................. 112
Table 8: m-Government emerged definition keywords ............................... 147
Table 9: e-Government relevance to m-Government .................................... 154
Table 10: Community age structure in QLDCC1 ......................................... 167
Table 11: Mobile government success factors - QLDCC1 Case Study ........... 183
Table 12: Mobile government success factors - QLDCC2 Case Study ............ 214
Table 13: Mobile government success factors - QLDCC1 & QLDCC2 Case Studies .... 216
Table 14: Mobile government success factors - NSWCC1 Case Study .......... 243
Table 15: A service comparison pre- and post m-Government ..................... 258
Table 16: Wireless networks used in different mobile governments ................ 264
Table 17: NextG and 3G comparison ......................................................... 266
Table 18: Mobile government success factors - NSWCC2 case study ............ 268
Table 19: Old immunisation solution compared to the mobile one ................ 274
Table 20 NSWCC3 age structure ............................................................... 278
Table 21 NSWCC3 Internet use ................................................................. 278
Table 22: Connectivity benefits ................................................................. 281
Table 23: Mobile government success factors – NSWCC3 Case Study ..............................287
Table 24: m_Government success categories/factors from NSW case studies .............288
Table 25 Facts about Jordan.............................................................................................295
Table 26: SMS services in Jordan....................................................................................297
Table 27: Mobile government success factors - Jordan case study............................308
Table 28: Facts about United Arab Emirates (UAE) .......................................................311
Table 29: Pull SMS services in UAEstate02 .................................................................314
Table 30: Mobile government success factors - Jordan case study .........................321
Table 31: m-Government Success factor identified in the literature review chapter ....325
Table 32: m-Government Success perspectives and factors identified through this research by Australian Interviewees..............................................................326
Table 33: m-Government 'Drivers' perspective and its success factors.........................338
Table 34: m-Government 'Business Case' perspective and its success factors ..........340
Table 35: Costs of Mobile Services ................................................................................341
Table 36: m-Government Solutions perspective and its success factors ....................342
Table 37: m-Government 'Security' perspective and its success factors ....................352
Table 38: m-Government 'Devices' perspective and its success factors .....................358
Table 39: m-Government 'Providers' perspective and its success factors ..................360
Table 40: m-Government 'Government Role' perspective and its success factors ....365
Table 41: m-Government 'Employees' perspective and its success factors ...............370
Table 42: m-Government 'Citizens' perspective and its success factors .................377
Table 43: m-Government 'Benefits' perspective and its success factors .................380
Table 44: m-Government Success perspectives and factors identified through this research by International Interviewees .......................................................385