Bankruptcy Probability: A Theoretical and Empirical Examination

A thesis presented

by

Maurice Peat

to

The School of Finance and Economics

in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

University of Technology, Sydney 2001

© 2001 by Maurice J. Peat All rights reserved.

Certificate

I certify that this thesis has not already been submitted for any degree and is not being submitted as part of candidature for any other degree.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me and that any help that I have received in preparing this thesis, and all sources used, have been acknowledged in this thesis.

Production Note: Signature removed prior to publication.

Acknowledgments

Thanks to Max Stevenson my long suffering Supervisor.

Especial thanks to Cheryl, Alexandra and Liam for the support they have and continue to offer me in my endeavors.

Contents

Abstract 1					
1	1 Introduction				
	1.1	Resea	arch Method		
	1.2	Orgai	nisation of thesis		
2 Review of Bankruptcy Probability Literature					
	2.1	Explanatory Models of Financial Distress 1			
		2.1.1	Gambler's Ruin Approach 12		
		2.1.2	Firms with access to External Capital 16		
		2.1.3	Stability Analysis		
		2.1.4	Option theory approach to bankruptcy 25		
		2.1.5	Optimising firms in a uncertain environment		
	2.2	Empir	Empirical Regularities 33		
	2.3	Classi	fication Studies		
	2.4	Summ	ary		
	2.A	Apper	ndix: Financial Ratio Components 49		
3	The	eoretic	al Framework 50		
	3.1	Dynan	nic Programming 54		
	3.2	Model	of a Firm Facing a Risk of Bankruptcy 60		
		3.2.1	Choice of Objective		

Contents

		3.2.2	Earnings uncertainty in the model	61
		3.2.3	Definition of variables and constraints	62
		3.2.4	The full model	68
	3.3	Analy	sis of the Firm's Policy Regimes	69
		3.3.1	Optimality conditions	69
		3.3.2	Policy regimes	71
	3.4	Summ	nary	87
4	Em	pirica	ll Validation of Model Results	93
	4.1	Deriva	ation of Testable Hypotheses	94
		4.1.1	Control Variables	94
		4.1.2	Probability Expressions	97
		4.1.3	Variables for Statistical Testing	. 101
	4.2	Devel	opment of a Test Statistic	. 105
		4.2.1	Hazard functions	. 106
		4.2.2	Explanatory variables and the form of the hazard function	. 108
		4.2.3	Estimation	. 109
5	Res	sults		. 112
	5.1	Data a	and Sample Properties	. 113
		5.1.1	Data	. 113
		5.1.2	Censoring and Time Variation	. 115
	5.2	Tests 1	for Differences in Univariate Means	. 117
	5.3	Cox R	Regression Results	. 119
	5.4	Summ	nary	. 123
6	Со	nclusio	on	. 126
-			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	

vi

6.1	Extensions 1	129
Refere	ences1	.32

List of Tables

2.1	Scott Imperfect Access Model - Variables
2.2	Structure of a Profit and Loss Statement
2.3	A simple Balance Sheet Structure
2.4	Ratio Groupings - Beaver (1966) 35
2.5	Ratio Groupings -Pinches, Mingo and Caruthers (1973) 36
2.6	Classification Results - Beaver (1966) 40
2.7	Logit Results - Zavgren (1985) 44
3.8	Five unique Failure Probability Expressions
3.9	Variables in Failure Probability Formula
3.10	Summary Results from Prior Studies
3.11	Variables in Gambler's Ruin and Scott Probability Formula
4.12	Regime Specific Values of Control Variables
4.13	Failure Probabilities by Regime
4.14	Component Variables from Failure Probabilities
4.15	Proxy Variables from Financial Statements
4.16	Summary of Hypotheses to be Tested
5.17	Hypotheses to be Validated 112
5.18	Summary of Hypotheses for Proxy Variables
5.19	Summary of Results Hypotheses Tests - Full Variable Set

Contents

5.20	Summary of Results Hypotheses Tests - Reduced Variable Set 123
5.21	Results of Hypotheses Testing 124
6.22	Five Unique Failure Probability Expressions
6.23	Variables in Failure Probability Formula
6.24	Proxy Variables from Financial Statements
6.25	Results of Hypotheses Testing

List of Figures

2.1	Bifurcation set of a Cusp Catastrophe 22
4.2	Bankruptcy Probability - Left Tail
5.3	Sample properties of Continuing and Delisted Firms
5.4	Results of t-tests for Difference in Group Means
5.5	Results of Cox Regression - All Variables
5.6	Correlation Matrix - Proxy Variables used in Cox Regression 122
5.7	Cox Regression Results - Reduced Variable Set

Abstract

Early Bankruptcy classification models were developed to demonstrate the usefulness of information contained in financial statements. The majority of classification models developed have used a pool of financial ratios combined with statistical variable selection techniques to maximise the accuracy of the classifier being employed. Rather than follow an "ad hoc" variable selection process, this thesis seeks to provide an economic basis for the selection of variables for inclusion in bankruptcy models, which are based on accounting information. An implicit assumption underlying this work is that the probability of default is endogenous. That is, the decisions of a firm's management have a direct impact on the probability of bankruptcy. These decisions and their resultant effects can be identified through analysis of financial statements.

A model of a firm facing an uncertain environment with the possibility of bankruptcy is developed and analysed. In the model, a firm is created with given initial equity. These funds can be invested in productive resources or held as cash balances. The productive resources are used to earn random earnings in any period. If earnings are positive, they can be used to pay dividends to shareholders, invest in new productive resources, repay outstanding debt or increase the firm's cash balance. The firm is able to borrow and repay funds up to a credit limit. When the cash position of the firm falls to zero the firm is bankrupt. The firm attempts to maximise the stream of dividends paid to shareholders during its life. The solutions of the model and the associated bankruptcy probability expressions are derived by application of the dynamic programming algorithm.

Abstract

The variables which differentiate the possible model solutions and those identified in the derived bankruptcy probability expressions, are 'proxied' by variables constructed from financial statement data. This data is derived from Annual Reports filed with the Australian Stock Exchange between 1966 and 1994. These proxy variables are used in the empirical validation of bankruptcy probability expressions derived from the model.

The random nature of the time horizon in the model for a single firm provides the rationale for the use of duration or hazard-based statistical methods in the validation of the derived bankruptcy probability expressions. The Cox (1972) proportional hazards model is used to estimate the coefficients and standard errors that are required for the validation of the derived bankruptcy probability expressions.

Results of the validation exercise confirm that the variables included in the empirical hazard formulation behave in a way that is consistent with the solutions of the model of the firm. Thus, the bankruptcy probability expressions derived from the model of the firm developed in this thesis provide a guide for the conduct of empirical investigations of the probability of corporate failure.