

**SINGAPOREANS AND THEIR PAST:
THE DYNAMICS OF HISTORICAL CONSCIOUSNESS
AND HISTORYMAKING**

STEPHANIE LEE-LING HO

PhD

2008

CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP/ORIGINALITY

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Production Note:

Signature removed prior to publication.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This thesis has been three and a half years in the making. I am most grateful to the many people who have helped me throughout this journey, without whom, its completion would not have been possible. First, I would like to thank my supervisor, Associate Professor Paula Hamilton, for sharing my enthusiasm for public and popular history, and for her insightful comments and critique of my work. I am also grateful for her support in other aspects of my life that have given much confidence to complete this project. My co-supervisor, Associate Professor Paul Ashton, has also been of tremendous help in suggesting ideas and providing resources.

Although I have been based in Sydney for the duration of the PhD, my family and friends in Singapore have been invaluable in supporting me in this effort. I am indebted to my parents and family who have been a constant source of encouragement and who have gone all out to help me in any way they can. I am grateful also for my Singapore friends, too many to name individually, for their help with the surveys, and in locating suitable participants as well as their concern and support. I am appreciative of the generosity of the many other Singaporeans who have willingly participated in the surveys and interviews and shared with me their personal histories and opinions about the past. This thesis would not have existed without them. In particular I would like to recognise the kind people on the Singapore Heritage email list who kept me updated on the latest developments in history and heritage in Singapore, and who have been forthcoming in responding to my calls for assistance.

I am also grateful to the staff at the National Heritage Board (NHB) who have also been forthcoming in sharing information and resources for this project. In particular, I would like to thank Philip Chua and Tan Tee Hin of the Strategic Technology Office, Tan Boon Hui of the National Museum of Singapore and Walter Lim of Corporate Communications. I am also grateful to the librarians of the National University of Singapore (NUS) and the National Institute of Education

(NIE) for allowing me the use of to their libraries during my research trips back to Singapore.

Lastly, I would like to thank my friends in Sydney who have supported me with much good cheer, especially Carolina, Lisa and Pauline. My biggest thanks go to Jane for her help in technical editing and emotional support. Most importantly, I am grateful to Jaime, who has been my editor, critic and all-round pillar of support.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page no.
List of images	vi
List of graphs	viii
Abstract	ix
Introduction	1
Chapter One: The Singapore Context	15
History	17
Geography	27
Issues	29
A Singaporean history and identity	30
Developing an Asian identity	34
Singapore as a global city	37
Singaporeans as active citizens	39
Conclusion	42
Chapter Two: Surveying Historical Consciousness	44
Field of study	45
National surveys of historical consciousness	45
Young people, education and historical consciousness	50
Forms and dynamics of public memory	53
Studies of historical consciousness in Singapore	56
Development of this study	62
The Singapore pilot study	63
Stage 1: Email questions	64
Stages 2 and 3	66
I Participation in historical activities	70
II Trustworthiness of sources	73
III Connectedness to the past	76
IV Important pasts	78
Conclusion	80

Chapter Three: Family History	82
Family history in the English-speaking world	83
Asian family history traditions	86
The Malay tradition	86
The Indian tradition	89
The Chinese tradition	90
Becoming Singaporean, becoming modern	93
Family history activities today	98
Reviving lineage connections	99
Compiling the family book	102
Journey to the Straits: The Shepherdson story	102
Chew Boon Lay: A family traces its history	104
Family history online	106
Conclusion	111
Chapter Four: Personal History	113
The Traditional Memoir	115
The memoirs of Lee Kuan Yew	117
Historical blogs	127
Good Morning Yesterday	131
Yesterday.sg	139
Conclusion	143
Chapter Five: Conservation of Historic Buildings and Sites	146
Historic conservation in Singapore	148
Case studies	159
Chinatown Revitalisation Project	160
Demolition of the National Library	169
Campaign to save the Butterfly House	176
Conclusion	183

Chapter Six: History Film and Television	186
Film as history	187
Singapore history in film and television	189
Government sponsored films	196
The Singapore Story: Overcoming the Odds (1998)	196
The History of Singapore Documentary (2005)	206
Independent films	213
The Old Man and the River (2003)	213
Zahari's 17 Years (2006)	217
Conclusion	223
Chapter Seven: National Myths and Heroes	225
Myths as national history	226
Singapore's National Myths	228
S. Rajaratnam: The man and the myths	232
The <i>Samsui</i> Women: Working women and popular heroes	241
Conclusion	258
Conclusion	261
Appendices	267
Appendix I: Email Survey Questionnaire	267
Appendix II: Consolidated Findings of Email survey	268
Appendix III: Focus Group Interview Guide	272
Appendix IV: Questionnaire for Young Singaporeans	273
Appendix V: Questionnaire for Adult Singaporeans	279
Bibliography	288

LIST OF IMAGES

		Page no.
Image 1	Sago Lane in Singapore's Chinatown, 1969	1
Image 2	Singapore's financial district, 1990s	1
Image 3	Singapore in Southeast Asia	26
Image 4	Book cover – Lee Kuan Yew's memoirs	117
Image 5	Screenshot of Mr Lam's blog home page	131
Image 6	Composite of extracts related to the Beauty World entry on <i>Good Morning Yesterday</i>	134
Image 7	Screenshot of <i>Yesterday.sg</i>	139
Image 8	Raffles' Town Plan drawn by Lt. Jackson, 1828.	160
Image 9	Photograph of the bustling street life in Chinatown in the 1960s by Yip Cheong Fun	161
Image 10	Artist's impressions of the Singapore Tourism Board's Chinatown revitalisation plan.	163
Image 11	Screenshot of Alex Au's photo essay – <i>The real Chinatown</i>	167
Image 12	Photograph of 'Food street' in the 'revitalised' Chinatown	168
Image 13	Photograph of the National Library in Stamford Road taken in 1971	169
Image 14	Screen shot of the Save 23 Amber Road website.	176
Image 15	One of the HARP Posters available at their website	182
Image 16	The History carousel	196
Image 17	<i>The Singapore Story</i> thinking guide (lower secondary level)	204
Image 18	Press photo of a re-enactment from <i>The History of Singapore</i> documentary	210
Image 19	Film shots from the film taken from <i>The Old Man and the River</i> DVD	214
Image 20	Screenshot of <i>Zahari's 17 Years</i> on Google Video	218

Image 21	Official photograph of S. Rajaratnam	232
Image 22	Building site/ <i>Samsui</i> women, Oil Painting, Liu Kang, 1951	243
Image 23	Photographs of <i>Samsui</i> women at worksite, Yip Cheong Fun	243
Image 24	Screenshot from opening credits of <i>Samsui women</i> (TV Series)	247
Image 25	Screenshots from <i>Samsui</i> filmlet	248
Image 26	Screenshot from <i>Xi Mei Por</i> short film depicting a <i>Samsui</i> woman collecting used cardboard in the market.	250
Image 27	Screenshot from <i>Ah Guai Por</i> short film depicting a <i>Samsui</i> woman in her flat.	250
Image 28	Screenshot, Sim Chiyin's photo essay on the <i>Samsui</i> women	251
Image 29	' <i>Samsui</i> chick' T-shirt by Local Brand	252
Image 30	<i>Samsui</i> women diorama in the Singapore History Museum.	254
Image 31	Book cover, <i>Samsui Girl</i>	254
Image 32	Photograph of participant from 'Laying the bricks' activity	255
Image 33	Screenshot of Soup Restaurant website	256
Image 34	Sculpture outside the Chinatown heritage centre,	257
Image 35	Photograph of a reconstruction in the Chinatown Heritage Centre of <i>Samsui</i> women living quarters	257
Image 36	<i>Samsui</i> -themed products at the Chinese heritage centre: T-shirts, bookmarks and sauce holders.	258

LIST OF GRAPHS

		Page no.
Graph 1	Participation in activities related to the past – US & Singapore	70
Graph 2	Participation in activities related to the past – young Singaporeans & adult Singaporeans	71
Graph 3	Trustworthiness of sources – USA & Singapore	73
Graph 4	Trustworthiness of sources – young & adult Singaporeans	74
Graph 5	Connectedness to the past – USA & Singapore	76
Graph 6	Connectedness to the past – young & adult Singaporeans	77
Graph 7	Most important pasts – USA	78
Graph 8	Pasts important to Singaporeans	78
Graph 9	Important pasts – young and adult Singaporeans	79

ABSTRACT

National surveys conducted in America, Australia and Canada since the mid 1990s suggest that 'a sense of history' is an essential part of everyday life. The surveys found that contrary to popular perceptions of historical apathy, people in these countries valued the past and are actively engaged in historical activities as part of their daily lives. These studies substantiate claims that historical consciousness, broadly understood as the relationship between people and their past, is ubiquitous and universal – everyone has some sense of the past. Yet, as this thesis will show, the specific ways people understand the past and the activities they engage in are not universal, but rather culturally and contextually bound; there are different 'senses' of history or types of historical consciousnesses.

This thesis investigates historical consciousness in Singapore and how shifts in the Singaporean 'sense of history' are inextricably linked to its culture and context. I posit that historical consciousness in Singapore is moving away from traditional Asian forms of relating to the past – such as through the maintenance of rituals and celebration of festivals – towards a more critical form of historical consciousness that is less tradition-bound and one in which history can be discussed, critiqued and actively created by ordinary people. Yet Singaporeans continue to retain some links to traditional forms of history-making and reveal an endless capacity for adaptation that characterises Singapore society. In addition, a national or 'Singaporean' sense of historical consciousness has begun to emerge. My analysis suggests that ordinary Singaporeans are becoming more actively engaged in producing or 'making' not only their own history but national history in the public realm despite an environment where the government has traditionally dominated almost all aspects of public history. Through exploring history-making efforts in five specific areas – personal history, family history, history film and television, conservation of historic buildings and sites, and national myth and heroes – this thesis demonstrates that public history is a complex process of contestation and negotiation between different histories and history-makers. Singapore citizens are however better positioned to play a larger role in public history aided by technologies of the 21st century and gradually liberalised political environment. As history-makers they are

able to expand the public understanding of history by offering alternative or oppositional histories to the dominant ones, and through their practices, they are paving the way for more democratic means of history-making.