

More than telling stories:  
Learning practice in HIV&AIDS work in sub Saharan Africa

Diane Marshall

Dissertation submitted to the  
Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences  
University of Technology, Sydney  
in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of  
Doctor of Philosophy in Education

January 2015

## **Certificate of Authorship/Originality**

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

Research work and the preparation of the thesis itself have been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Candidate

---

## Acknowledgements

This thesis is the product of my passion to make a difference in the world working alongside those living on the margins. For more than half my life I have lived, laughed and cried with friends and colleagues from diverse cultural backgrounds and walks of life. Some of my richest times of learning HIV&AIDS work have been in the most unlikely places: sitting together under mango and baobab trees, on long road trips to remote villages, and during home visits and gatherings in rustic church and community buildings. Together we have dreamed, ached, disagreed and prayed in these “out of the way” places where real people are changing the world. Their stories may never be heard by more than a few, yet these creative and hardworking people at the grassroots are bringing enduring hope and transformation to individuals, families and communities living with HIV&AIDS. Such shared relational experiences learning HIV&AIDS work became the foundation for my investigation of learning practice.

On my journey of learning I found fellow travellers who believed in my quest. I want to thank my primary supervisor David Boud for his patience, many stimulating conversations and guidance through this process over seven years. I have particularly appreciated his flexibility around my full-time work commitments and his willingness to explore workplace learning in less familiar settings. I also want to thank my co-supervisor Nick Hopwood, with his amazing ability to weave times together in airports around busy travel schedules, always injecting energy and enthusiasm. His thought provoking questions were invaluable, particularly as I pulled together the findings and conclusions.

I want to acknowledge the wisdom of colleagues who have turned what they learned into appropriate and effective HIV&AIDS responses, and challenged me to do the same. I cannot name you, but you will recognize your wise words here. My deep gratitude goes to those who have participated in this research with their stories and even their lives. In May 2011, Thabisa, a vibrant young woman of faith passionately dedicated to making a difference in the lives of those infected and affected by HIV&AIDS, slipped into eternity. Her commitment to the poorest of the poor will be long remembered.

I am also mindful of many individuals around the world who have supported and contributed financially to the HIV&AIDS projects describe here, including those dedicated to skill and capacity building. You have enabled me along with program managers and staff to keep learning in order to improve services provided through faith-based programs in sub Saharan countries.

Finally this thesis would have remained a dream without the encouragement and untiring support of my life partner and colleague Phillip, and our family: Josh, Giuls and their boys; Bek, Matt and their girls; and Luke and Bek. May we keep on learning together, not for ourselves but to bring hope and joy to many.

# Thesis Outline

Certificate of Authorship/Originality .....	ii
Acknowledgements .....	iii
Thesis Outline .....	v
List of diagrams and tables .....	viii
Abstract .....	ix
1. Chapter 1: Introduction .....	1
1.1. My interests and central concerns of this thesis .....	1
1.2. My research questions .....	3
1.3. My research methodology and sites .....	3
1.4. Terminology and how core terms are used .....	5
1.4.1. Practice .....	5
1.4.2. Learning .....	7
1.4.3. HIV&AIDS .....	8
1.4.4. Faith-based organizations .....	12
1.5. Locating my research in the literature .....	15
1.6. Organization of my thesis .....	19
2. Chapter 2: A theoretical framework of practice .....	22
2.1. HIV&AIDS work, learning and social practice .....	23
2.2. The practice turn in contemporary theory .....	24
2.3. Streams in practice theory .....	26
2.4. “The social”, hanging together and HIV&AIDS work .....	31
2.5. Features of practice: .....	36
2.5.1. Embodied .....	37
2.5.2. Relational .....	39
2.5.3. Materially mediated .....	42
2.5.4. Situated and contextual .....	43
2.5.5. Prefigured and emergent .....	47
2.6. Adapting Schatzki’s and Kemmis’ frameworks for empirical research .....	49
3. Chapter 3: A theoretical framework of learning .....	54
3.1. Context, learning and the learning society .....	55
3.2. Development and the learning organization .....	61
3.3. Learning and the workplace .....	66
3.4. Situated learning .....	73
3.5. Learning understood through a practice lens.....	76
4. Chapter 4: The practice of learning .....	83
4.1. Features of learning .....	83
4.1.1. Learning is embodied, not centralized in the mind .....	85
4.1.2. Learning is relational .....	86
4.1.3. Learning is materially mediated .....	89
4.1.4. Learning is situated and contextual .....	92
4.1.5. Learning is prefigured and emergent .....	94
4.2. Developing a framework for empirical research of learning as practice .....	97
5. Chapter 5: Research design: Philosophical foundations .....	105
5.1. Uncovering practices for empirical research .....	107
5.2. The shaping of HIV&AIDS related research .....	108
5.3. Through an interpretive lens .....	114
5.3.1. Understanding interpreted through experience in a particular time and place .....	115
5.3.2. Understanding constructed .....	116
5.3.3. Understanding communicated .....	117
5.3.4. Limitations using an interpretive lens .....	118
5.4. Narrative methodology .....	119
5.4.1. Narrative as sense-making .....	122

5.4.2.	Narrative as culturally, socially and historically shaped .....	122
5.4.3.	Narrative as relational .....	124
5.4.4.	Strengths of narrative inquiry .....	125
5.4.5.	Maximising narrative inquiry .....	126
5.5.	Summary of narrative methodology .....	127
6.	Chapter 6: Research design: Three dimensional narrative inquiry .....	129
6.1.	Aligning methodology, research design and motivation .....	130
6.2.	Clandinin and Connelly's (2000) three dimensional narrative inquiry .....	132
6.3.	Data generation and analysis .....	133
6.4.	Co-producing narrative .....	137
6.4.1.	Representation .....	138
6.4.2.	Problematizing anonymity .....	144
6.4.3.	Voice, authority and power .....	146
6.5.	From co-creating narrative to a practice framework of learning .....	148
7.	Chapter 7: How learning activities happen: Doings, sayings and relatings .....	150
7.1.	Uncovering practices of learning in this empirical research .....	150
7.1.1.	Distinguishing between activity and practice .....	151
7.1.2.	Telling stories of learning activities .....	152
7.2.	"Involving yourself" seeking and giving advice .....	154
7.2.1.	Relating with material things .....	155
7.2.2.	Engaging bodily .....	155
7.2.3.	Situated in complexity and dependent on listening .....	156
7.2.4.	Integrating past-present-future .....	157
7.3.	Modelling and mentoring .....	160
7.3.1.	Engaging relationally .....	160
7.3.2.	Entwining with material objects and arrangements .....	162
7.3.3.	Integrating with "nets of practice" .....	164
7.4.	"Having a go" through trial and error .....	166
7.4.1.	Coming to know .....	166
7.4.2.	The meeting space of mind and body .....	167
7.4.3.	Creating learning spaces .....	169
7.5.	Summary: How learning activities happen .....	171
8.	Chapter 8: How learning is organized .....	173
8.1.	Permeating values .....	174
8.2.	What matters: "Walking the talk" .....	181
8.2.1.	Aligning acceptable purpose and ends with learning activities .....	181
8.2.2.	Integrity: Doing the "right" thing .....	183
8.3.	Rules, directives and guidelines .....	184
8.3.1.	Formal instruction .....	186
8.3.2.	Silent rules .....	188
8.4.	Making skills and experience count .....	190
8.4.1.	Relationships and tradition .....	190
8.4.2.	Mutually influencing and modifying .....	193
8.5.	Summary: How learning is organized .....	195
9.	Chapter 9: What makes learning possible .....	197
9.1.	Hanging together with other practices: Shared purpose, intentionality and interdependence in common space .....	199
9.2.	Bundling with material things: bodies, spaces and relational distance .....	204
9.2.1.	Learning bodily .....	204
9.2.2.	Space for learning .....	206
9.2.3.	Meaning, values and relational distance .....	208
9.3.	Situated and contextualized to the way things were, are and will be around here .....	211
9.3.1.	Acting on "the way things are around here" .....	212
9.3.2.	Acting on past-present-future .....	214
9.4.	Learning and change .....	216
9.4.1.	Learning persisting yet transformed through rhythms and cycles .....	217

9.4.2. Learning emerging in unanticipated and unpredictable ways .....	219
9.4.3. Learning subsiding .....	224
9.5. Summary: What makes learning possible .....	225
10. Chapter 10: Conclusion .....	227
10.1. Revisiting research questions and issues explored in this thesis .....	229
10.2. Contributions and implications .....	235
10.3. Reflecting .....	239
My experience in narrative inquiry .....	239
My journey as an HIV&AIDS practitioner-researcher .....	241
Limitations of this research .....	243
10.4. Future directions for research .....	244
10.5. Closing statement .....	246
Appendices .....	248
Appendix A: Abbreviations .....	249
Appendix B: Overview of "HOPE" .....	250
Appendix C: Introducing the storyteller-practitioners .....	252
Appendix D: Information, consent and approval .....	263
Consent participation information	
FBO consent	
Participant consent	
Ethics approval	
Appendix E: Data generation guidelines, document review and data analysis .....	269
Semi-structured interview and focus group guidelines	
Document review	
Data analysis process	
Reference List .....	278

## List of diagrams and tables

Diagram 1: My adapted framework of practice, drawing on Schatzki and Kemmis .....	(Chapter 2, p.49)
Diagram 2: A continuum of ways in which knowledge is conceptualized .....	(Chapter 3, p.79)
Diagram 3: Common research assumptions about learning .....	(Chapter 3, p.81)
Diagram 4: Conceptualizing the practice of learning: A framework for empirical research .....	(Chapter 4, p.98)
Diagram 5: Uncovering practice through narrative inquiry .....	(Chapter 5, p.108)
Diagram 6: A narrative-practice inquiry approach to discovering how learning occurs .....	(Chapter 6, p.131)
Diagram 7: My iterative data generation process .....	(Chapter 6, p.136)
Diagram 8: Learning HIV prevention: Modelling materials from other programs .....	(Chapter 7, p.165)
Diagram 9: The practice of learning in faith-based HIV&AIDS programs in sub Saharan Africa .....	(Chapter 10, p.229)
Table 1: Characteristics of learning organizations from a development perspective .....	(Chapter 3, p.62)
Table 2: Methodological, empirical and professional contributions .....	(Chapter 10, p.235)
Table 3: Methods and scope of data .....	(Appendix E.b. p.274)
Table 4: Narrative-practice research: An iterative process melding narrative inquiry and practice frameworks .....	(Appendix E.c. p.277)

## Abstract

This thesis is an empirical study of how HIV&AIDS program managers and staff in faith-based programs in community settings in sub Saharan Africa learn in the context of challenging and changing work conditions. An integrated narrative-practice inquiry approach in the interpretive tradition is used to co-create narratives of the experiences of program managers and staff learning HIV&AIDS prevention, home-based care of people living with HIV&AIDS, and the support and care for orphans and vulnerable children. These are generated using a two-stage process over two years, involving interviews, focus groups, document analysis and observing practitioners in their workplace.

Drawing on practice theory and the work of Schatzki and Kemmis, this research empirically demonstrates key features of learning practice: embodied, relational, materially mediated, situated and contextual, and prefigured and emergent. Learning is activity and action. Whilst “involving yourself” seeking and giving advice, modelling and mentoring, and “having a go” through trial and error are primary learning activities, learning HIV&AIDS work is shown as more than an aggregation of these. Learning activities are dynamically organized and shaped around “walking the talk”, rules, and making skills and experience count. The integrated and value-permeated nature of learning is highlighted. Relationships of space, purpose and intentionality between learning and other practices are explored along with relationships between learning and material objects. In addition, contextualization to the past, present and future are addressed.

Workplace learning in sub Saharan contexts is shown here to be always integrated through the interconnectedness of people, learning activities, relationships, other practices and material objects. In addition values including ethics, morals and matters of faith – under-theorized in learning and practice literature – are shown to permeate and shape learning practice.

Commonly assumed learning dichotomies are found to be inseparable and mutually constituted rather than distinct forms of learning. Learning is shown to emerge in unanticipated and unpredictable ways, persisting yet transformed through rhythms and cycles, and going beyond

metaphors of acquisition and participation. This has particular implications for practitioners learning to transition from HIV&AIDS exceptionalism to the integration of HIV&AIDS into normal health services.