Explaining Reasons for Stress, Burnout and Self-Efficacy in Direct Care Staff in Supported Aged Care Accommodation Services

Irene P. Walker
MBA, MMgt, RN, RM, Geront. Cert.

A thesis submitted in fulfilment of the degree
Doctor of Nursing
Of the
University of Technology Sydney Australia

Faculty of Health
2014
CERTIFICATE OF AUTHORSHIP / ORIGINALITY

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged with the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used within the body of the thesis have been acknowledged.

Signature of Candidate

_______________________
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION TO THE PROFESSIONAL DOCTORATE PORTFOLIO**

1.1. Background to the Study ................................................................. 2
1.2. My Professional Position In Relation To the Study Topic ............... 8
1.3. Study Focus ..................................................................................... 10
1.4. Portfolio Framework and Chapter Contents ................................... 11
1.5. Chapter Summary ............................................................................ 13

**CHAPTER 2 THE POLICY CONTEXT OF SUPPORTED AGED CARE ACCOMMODATION SERVICES IN AUSTRALIA**

2.1. Introduction ....................................................................................... 14
2.2. Impact of a Changing Demographic Profile ..................................... 15
2.3. Profile of Supported Aged Care Accommodation Services ............... 18
2.4. Funding Supported Aged Care Accommodation Services ............... 22
2.5. Policy Context for Supported Aged Care Accommodation Service Reforms. 25
2.6. Historical Development of Supported Aged Care Accommodation Service Policy Reforms ................................................................. 29
  2.6.1. 1960-1986 Pre-Reform Era Nursing Home Growth ................... 29
  2.6.2. 1987-1996 Aged Care Reform Strategy Era .............................. 36
  2.6.3. 1997-2012 Aged Care Structural Reform Era ............................ 38
2.7. Impact of the Reform Process on the Supported Aged Care Accommodation Service Sector ................................................................. 45
2.8. The Reforms and Supported Aged Care Accommodation Services ...... 48
2.9. The Future of Supported Aged Care Accommodation Policy Reforms .......................... 61
2.10. Chapter Summary ........................................................................... 64

**CHAPTER 3 LITERATURE REVIEW – STRESS IN SUPPORTED AGED CARE ACCOMMODATION DIRECT CARE STAFF**

3.1. Introduction ....................................................................................... 66
3.2. Context of the Review ....................................................................... 67
3.3. Structure of the Review ..................................................................... 69
  3.3.1. Search Strategy ......................................................................... 70
3.4. Literature Findings ........................................................................... 73
  3.4.1. Incidence of Stress In Nursing .................................................... 73
  3.4.2. Incidence of Stress In Supported Aged Care Accommodation Service Direct Care Staff ................................................................. 76
  3.4.3. Symptoms and Outcomes of Direct Care Staff Stress ............... 77
3.4.4. Protection From Distress ................................................................. 83
  3.4.4.1. Hardiness ................................................................................. 83
  3.4.4.2. Morale ..................................................................................... 84
  3.4.4.3. Self-Efficacy for Nursing Work ............................................... 86
3.4.5. Measuring Stress ........................................................................... 87
  3.4.5.1. Emotional Work, e.g. Death and Dying ..................................... 92
  3.4.5.2. Conflict with Doctors ............................................................... 94
  3.4.5.3. Inadequate Emotional Preparation .......................................... 95
  3.4.5.4. Problems relating to peers ....................................................... 97
  3.4.5.5. Problems Relating to Supervisors ............................................. 97
  3.4.5.6. Workload ................................................................................ 99
  3.4.5.7. Uncertainty Concerning Treatment .......................................... 103
  3.4.5.8. Situations with Older People and Their Families ..................... 104
  3.4.5.9. Discrimination in the Workplace ............................................. 107
3.4.6. Other Stressors Related to the Job .............................................. 110
  3.4.6.1. Work-Home Life Imbalance .................................................... 110
  3.4.6.2. Inequitable and Inadequate Job Remuneration ....................... 111
  3.4.6.3. Declining Number of Qualified Nurses .................................... 114
  3.4.6.4. Lack of Autonomy and Control in the Workplace ................. 115
  3.4.6.5. Little Opportunity to Provide Quality Nursing Care ............... 117
  3.4.6.6. Low Level of Organizational Support .................................... 118
  3.4.6.7. Low Job Satisfaction ............................................................... 121
3.4.7. Summary of Workplace Stress .................................................. 123
3.5. Chapter Summary ........................................................................... 128

CHAPTER 4 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK ............................................. 130
4.1. Introduction ....................................................................................... 130
4.2. The Stress Concept ......................................................................... 131
  4.2.1. Stress Models ............................................................................ 132
    4.2.1.1. The General Adaptation Syndrome (G.A.S) ........................... 134
    4.2.1.2. The Transactional Model of Stress ....................................... 137
    4.2.1.3. Cognitive Appraisal .............................................................. 139
    4.2.1.4. Coping and Coping Resources ........................................... 141
    4.2.1.5. Stressors ............................................................................ 142
  4.3. The Burnout Concept ................................................................... 144
4.4. The Self-Efficacy Concept ................................................................. 149
4.5. Chapter Summary ............................................................................... 152

CHAPTER 5 STUDY METHODS ................................................................. 154
5.1. Introduction .......................................................................................... 154
5.2. Study Aims and Research Questions ................................................... 154
5.3. Research Design ................................................................................... 155
5.4. Study Setting ......................................................................................... 155
5.4.1. Supported Aged Care Accommodation Services ..................... 156
5.4.1.1. Inclusion Criteria ....................................................................... 156
5.4.1.2. Exclusion Criteria ....................................................................... 156
5.4.1.3. Recruitment Procedures .............................................................. 157
5.4.2. Study Population – Direct Care Staff ......................................... 159
5.4.2.1. Inclusion Criteria ....................................................................... 159
5.4.2.2. Exclusion Criteria ....................................................................... 159
5.4.2.3. Recruitment Procedures .............................................................. 159
5.5. Ethical Considerations .......................................................................... 161
5.6. Study Measures .................................................................................... 162
5.6.1. The Expanded Nurse Stress Scale .............................................. 163
5.6.2. Maslach Burnout Inventory - Human Services Survey (MBI-HSS) .. 166
5.6.3. The General Self-Efficacy (GSE) Scale ....................................... 167
5.6.4. Demographic Questions ............................................................... 168
5.6.5. Single Open-Ended Survey Question ........................................... 169
5.7. Piloting the Questionnaire Pack .......................................................... 169
5.8. Data Collection Procedures ................................................................. 170
5.8.1. Questionnaire Pack ...................................................................... 170
5.9. Data Preparation and Analyses ............................................................ 174
5.9.1. Data Preparation ........................................................................... 174
5.9.2. Single Open-Ended Survey Item Analysis ................................... 174
5.9.3. Inaccurate and Missing Data ......................................................... 175
5.9.4. Pre-Analyses Procedures ............................................................... 178
5.10. Data Analysis Techniques ................................................................... 180
5.10.1. Statistical Analyses ....................................................................... 180
5.10.2. Leximancer Techniques – Analysis of a Single Open-Ended Survey Item Data 181
5.10.3. Non-Computer Assisted Content Analyses ................................ 184
5.11. Chapter Summary ............................................................................... 186
CHAPTER 6 – STUDY RESULTS ................................................................................ 188

6.1. Introduction .................................................................................................. 188

6.2. Research Questions ...................................................................................... 188

6.3. Questionnaire Response Rate ...................................................................... 189

6.4. Respondent Demographic Profile ................................................................. 190

6.5. Levels of Stress, Burnout and Self-Efficacy .................................................. 194

   6.5.1. The Expanded Nurse Stress Scale (ENSS) ........................................ 194
   6.5.2. Maslach Burnout Inventory (MBI) .................................................. 199
   6.5.3. General Self-Efficacy Scale (GSE) .................................................... 200

6.6. Relationships Among the Variables of Stress, Burnout and Self-Efficacy .. 202

6.7. Relationships Between Direct Care Staff Stress, Burnout, Self-Efficacy and
     Their Demographic Characteristics ............................................................ 203

   6.7.1. Age .................................................................................................. 203
   6.7.2. Employment Status .......................................................................... 204
   6.7.3. Employment Position ....................................................................... 205
   6.7.4. Years of Experience in the Care of Older People ............................. 207
   6.7.5. Nursing or other Health-Related Qualifications .............................. 207
   6.7.6. Hours of Work in Study Site ............................................................ 208
   6.7.7. Shifts Worked .................................................................................. 209
   6.7.8. Work in Other Supported Aged Care Accommodation Services .... 210
   6.7.9. Hours Worked in Other Supported Aged care Accommodation
          Services........................................................................................... 210
   6.7.10. Primary Language Spoken at Home.............................................. 210
   6.7.11. Cultural Background ...................................................................... 211
   6.7.12. Proficiency in Verbal English ......................................................... 214
   6.7.13. Proficiency in Written English ....................................................... 214

6.8. Summary of ENSS, MBI and GSE Results ...................................................... 217

   6.8.1. Factors Associated with Direct Care Staff Stress ............................ 217
   6.8.2. Associations Between Direct Care Staff, Burnout and Self-Efficacy218
   6.8.3. Stress, Burnout, Self-Efficacy and Demographic Variables ............ 220
   6.8.4. Burnout ........................................................................................... 221
   6.8.5. Self-Efficacy in Supported Aged Care Work .................................... 222

6.9. Results of The Open-Ended Survey Question Responses ............................ 222

   6.9.1. Theme 1: Perceptions of Stress Arising From Interactions with
          Families ................................................................................................ 226
       6.9.1.1. Meeting the Requests of Families .............................................. 226
       6.9.1.2. Meeting the Needs of Families from Different Cultural Backgrounds
                   ................................................................................................. 228
       6.9.1.3. Direct Care Staff Interactions with Families ............................. 229
       6.9.1.4. Direct Care Staff Responses to Family Emotional Distress ........ 229
6.9.1.5. Acknowledging Families’ Concerns about Care Services ........................................ 232
6.9.1.6. Meeting the Care Expectations of Families .......................................................... 234
6.9.1.7. Insufficient Time to Provide Care ........................................................................ 236
6.9.1.8. Perceptions of Families Mistrust Towards Direct Care Staff .............................. 237
6.9.1.9. Family Requests of Specific Care Practices .......................................................... 238
6.9.1.10. Direct Care Staff Perceptions of Not Being Respected and Valued .................. 239

6.9.2. Theme 2: Work-Related Stress ................................................................................. 241
6.9.2.1. Perceptions of Discrimination .............................................................................. 241
6.9.2.2. Workforce Issues .................................................................................................. 242
6.9.2.3. Emotional Issues Related to the Workplace ....................................................... 246
6.9.2.4. Strategies Used to Minimize Experiences of Stress ........................................... 248

6.9.3. Theme 3: Stress Arising From Interactions with Older People .............................. 252
6.9.3.1. Respondents’ Perceptions of the Behaviors of Older People .............................. 252
6.9.3.2. Respondents’ Perceptions of Death and Dying ................................................... 252

6.10. Summary of the Open-Ended Survey Question Narrative Themes ......................... 253
6.11. Chapter Summary ..................................................................................................... 254

CHAPTER 7 – DISCUSSION OF STUDY FINDINGS ..................................................... 256
7.1. Introduction .................................................................................................................. 256
7.2. Situating the Study ..................................................................................................... 257
7.3. Key Findings: Stress, Burnout and Self-Efficacy ....................................................... 258
7.3.1. Family Care Requests ............................................................................................ 260
7.3.2. Family and Direct Care Staff Interactions ............................................................. 264
7.3.3. Time Pressures and Other Workforce Issues ......................................................... 273
7.3.3.1. Heavy Workload ............................................................................................... 273
7.3.3.2. Management Support ....................................................................................... 275
7.3.3.3. Peer and Health Professional Support .............................................................. 276
7.3.3.4. Cultural and Language Issues .......................................................................... 278
7.3.3.5. Knowledge and Skills for Supported Aged Care work ..................................... 279
7.3.4. Responses of Older People .................................................................................... 283
7.4. Reducing Stress and Burnout Though Developing Self-Efficacy ............................. 285
7.5. Contribution to Supported Aged Care Accommodation Knowledge ...................... 289
7.6. Study Strengths and Limitations ................................................................................ 291
7.6.1. Study Strengths ..................................................................................................... 291
7.6.2. Study Limitations .................................................................................................. 293
7.7. Recommendations for Further Research in the Field ...................... 298
7.8. Chapter Summary ........................................................................... 298

CHAPTER 8 – CONCLUSION .................................................................. 302

8.1. Contribution to Supported Care Knowledge ........................................ 302
   8.1.1. Reforms .................................................................................... 304
   8.1.2. Stressful Environment ............................................................ 305
   8.1.3. Leadership .............................................................................. 306
   8.1.4. Collaboration ......................................................................... 307
   8.1.5. Quality ................................................................................... 308

8.2. Chapter Summary ........................................................................... 310

REFERENCES ....................................................................................... 312
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1  Supported Aged Care Accommodation Services ........................................20
Table 2  Reform Eras and Major Reform Strategies .................................................33
Table 3  Government Reviews and Reports .............................................................34
Table 4  NICE (2006) Levels of Evidence ...............................................................72
Table 5  Expanded Nurse Stress Scale .................................................................89
Table 6  Intrinsic and Extrinsic Nurse Stress Factors .............................................91
Table 7  General Adaptation Syndrome ...............................................................136
Table 8  Stressor Classification Categories ............................................................142
Table 9  Stressors and Predictors of Burnout .........................................................147
Table 10  Respondent Questionnaire Packs .........................................................188
Table 11  Study Sample (n = 162) Demographic Profile .......................................192
Table 12  Study Respondent Age and Employment details .....................................193
Table 13  Stress (ENSS) Total and Sub-Scale Scores ..............................................194
Table 14  Stress (ENSS) and Q 15: Residents’ Families Making Unreasonable Demands ...............................................................198
Table 15  Maslach Burnout Inventory (MBI) Sub-Scale Scores ................................199
Table 16  Maslach Burnout Inventory (MBI) Sub-Score Categorisation .................199
Table 17  General Self-Efficacy (GSE) Item Frequencies .....................................201
Table 18  Correlations: Stress (ENSS), Burnout (MBI) and General Self-Efficacy (GSE) ...............................................................202
Table 19  Stress (ENSS), Burnout (MBI) and General Self-Efficacy (GSE) and Age Group ...............................................................204
Table 20  Stress (ENSS), Burnout (MBI) and General Self-Efficacy (GSE) and Employment ...............................................................205
Table 21  Relationship Between Staff Role and Stress (ENSS) and Q34: Dealing with the Residents’ Families ...............................................................205
Table 22  Stress (ENSS), Burnout (MBI) and General Self-Efficacy (GSE) and Staff Qualifications ................................................................. 208

Table 23  Relationship Between Study Respondents Qualifications and Stress (ENSS) Q34: Dealing with Residents’ Families ......................... 208

Table 24  Distribution of Number of Rostered Shifts ................................................. 209

Table 25  Stress (ENSS), Burnout (MBI) and General Self-Efficacy (GSE) and Primary Language Spoken at Home ........................................ 210

Table 26  Primary Cultural Background .................................................................. 212

Table 27  Stress (ENSS), Burnout (MBI) and General Self-Efficacy (GSE) and Cultural Background .......................................................... 213

Table 28  Stress (ENSS), Burnout (MBI) and General Self-Efficacy (GSE) and Proficiency in Verbal English ....................................................... 214

Table 29  Stress (ENSS), Burnout (MBI) and General Self-Efficacy (GSE) and Written English Proficiency ....................................................... 215

Table 30  Summary of Associations: Stress (ENSS Sub-Scales) and Stress (ENSS) Total Scores, Burnout (MBI EE; DP; PA) and Self-Efficacy (GSE) ............................................................................. 219

Table 31  Summary of Associations: MBI (EE, DP, PA), GSE and Stress (ENSS total scores), Burnout (MBI EE, DP, PA) and Self-Efficacy (GSE) ............................................................................. 220

Table 32  Stress Associated with Residents’ Families ................................................. 225
LIST OF FIGURES

CHAPTER 2

Figure 1 Interrelationships of Current Health Reports .............................................. 26
Figure 2 Integration of Government Health Policies to Build a New Paradigm ......................... 28

CHAPTER 4

Figure 3 Response Based Approach to Stress (addition of INTERACTION) .... 130
Figure 4 Principal Neuroendocrine Pathways that Mediate the Response to Stress ................................................. 135
Figure 5 Five Stages of Burnout ........................................................................ 146
Figure 6 Self-Efficacy Model (Shortbridge-Baggett & Vander Bijl, (1996)..... 150

CHAPTER 6

Figure 7 Age Distribution of Study Participants ...................................................... 190
Figure 8 Skewness in the Stress (ENSS) Conflict with Physician Sub-scale .... 196
Figure 9 Skewness in the Stress (ENSS) Discrimination Sub-scales ............. 196
Figure 10 Skewness in Maslach Burnout Inventory (MBI) Depersonalization Sub-scale .............................................. 200
Figure 11 Leximancer Concept Map ...................................................................... 224
APPENDICES

Appendix A  Research Ethics Approval  
Appendix B  Information Sheet Faculty Management  
Appendix C  Institutional Consent Form Facility Managers  
Appendix D  Letter of Invitation Care Staff  
Appendix E  Information Sheet Care Staff  
Appendix F  MBI Human Services Survey  
Appendix G  MBI Human Services Survey Access  
Appendix H  General Self-Efficacy Scale Questionnaire  
Appendix I  Questionnaire Pack for Staff  
Appendix J  Demographic Survey  
Appendix K  Expanded Nurse Stress Scale  
Appendix L  Expanded Nurse Stress Scale Individual Items  
Appendix M  List of Acronyms
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My grateful thanks are extended to my husband for his unwavering support and encouragement over the previous six years including his eternal and uncritical tolerance as he not only walked beside me in this journey, he also ensured that my (if not his own) nutritional and hydration status was maintained. To my daughters Tanya and her family and Yvette who were also understanding if I was not able to visit or join with them on some occasions.

I wish to extend my sincere thanks to my supervisors, Professor Lynnette Chenoweth and Professor Andrew Cashin who supported and guided me through this long research process and who endured my periods of procrastination that I may have had over some minutiae. To Dr. Georgina Luscombe, for without her statistical expertise and her inspiration I don’t believe I would have survived the analysis process, and to my long known friend Jan for her computer technological and word processing assistance and support.

My grateful thanks are extended to the managers and the direct care staff of the supported aged care accommodation services who collaborated with me in this study. I also wish to extend special thanks to the direct care staff of Gladstone House, especially Deepika, Juliet, Lisa and Pauline, whose support enabled me the time to devote to this work.
ABSTRACT

The workplace environment can be a source of stress for many direct care staff who work in supported aged care accommodation services. Depression, fatigue, burnout, and heart disease are a few of the many health consequences of chronic work-related stress for these staff. This study aimed to better understand the stress phenomenon occurring in a sample of direct care staff working in the Australian supported aged care accommodation service sector. The relationship between direct care staff stress, burnout and self-efficacy for aged care work was investigated. The study was undertaken between 2007 and 2012 and conducted in 20 purposefully selected supported aged care accommodation services located in a Sydney Metropolitan regional area. Each supported service had comparable management structures, staff numbers, staff mix, older people demographics and held current Government accreditation status. A sample of 162 consenting direct care staff (registered nurses, assistant nurses, personal carers and recreational staff) completed a demographic questionnaire; the Expanded Nurse Stress Scale (ENSS); the Maslach Burnout Inventory (MBI); and General Self-efficacy Scale (GSE). Qualitative data (written narratives) were obtained from a single open-ended survey item inviting respondents to write about stressful experiences they may have encountered when interacting with the families of older people.

Descriptive statistics examined the frequency of data distributions, means, standard deviations and confidence intervals for normally distributed data and median and inter quartile ranges for skewed data. Parametric tests (t-tests) were used for normally distributed variables and non-parametric tests (Spearman Rho and Kruskal Wallis) were used for non-normally distributed variables. Correlational statistics (Pearson’s correlation and Spearman’s correlation) were used to determine possible relationships between the variables of the ENSS, MBI and GSE and variables of direct care staff demographics. Thematic analyses were conducted for the written narrative responses to the single open-ended survey item on stress associated with the families of older people living in supported aged care accommodation services.
The study findings confirmed high levels of stress of direct care staff was correlated with their work and with their interactions with families of older people. Strong associations were found between stress, burnout and self-efficacy for work, which were confirmed in the open-ended survey item responses. Having higher self-efficacy and valuing one’s work were identified as buffers for stress and burnout. Given the study findings, it behoves all stakeholders to enter into collaborative discussions that support and provide a healthy and satisfying work environment for all direct care staff.