The Information System of Mobile Knowledge Workers: An Activity Theory perspective of information sources and interaction

Ву

Michael Er

This thesis is submitted by Michael Er in fulfilment of the requirements for the award of the degree Doctor of Philosophy in Computer Science Faculty of Engineering and Information Technology University of Technology, Sydney

August, 2010

Certificate of Authorship / Originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Production Note:
Signature removed prior to publication.

Michael Er

Acknowledgements

I would firstly like to thank my supervisors who showed great patience in providing me with guidance in my research. The production of my research and this document would not have been possible without the supervision team of Associate Professor Elaine Lawrence, Professor Robert Kay, Dr Bruce McCabe and Dr Jim Underwood, who provided ongoing supportive advice and feedback.

In particular I would like to articulate my appreciation to Robert Kay who not only supervised me through the entire PhD journey but also my Masters thesis. To Bruce McCabe, thanks must be given for his understanding and support initially as a fellow PhD student and secondly as an advisor associated with much of the technical aspects of my research. Thanks to Jim Underwood who assisted me early in my research with Activity Theory. I would like to especially acknowledge Elaine Lawrence for her tireless efforts associated with the writing up of my research despite my at times inert attitude and her trial with cancer.

Thankyou to the many interviewees who volunteered to participate in my research and particularly within these groups my initial points of contact that not only provided their input to data but assisted by initiating further interviews.

I would also like to acknowledge Sue Felix who assisted with the editing of this document.

Finally, thanks to my family for their unconditional love and support which they provided throughout my time in the PhD program. I would like to dedicate my work to my family, particularly my parents Dr Dominic Er and Eleanor Er, my children Alexander, Madeleine and Josephine, and my very loving, patient and understanding wife Natalie.

Abstract

Mobile technology has the potential to connect the mobile knowledge worker (MKW) to information sources which will support their decision making. Many researchers in the fields of innovation adoption and human computer interaction advocate that the development of support technology (such as mobile technology) should be initiated with an understanding of the end user that is based on current work practices, in order to support acceptance and adoption.

The object of this research is to describe the existing information system used by mobile knowledge workers (MKWs).

The assessment of the existing information system of MKWs under examination in this research goes beyond the identification of data and the technical means of data supply. A holistic view of the information system is applied to take into consideration both the existing sources of information which assist in decision making and the interaction and/or access made by the user (MKW) with such systems.

An interpretive philosophical approach was taken via an empirical study of mobile workers in three different contexts. The empirical research resulted in the development of three case studies: Doctors working on ward rounds, Reporters working in the field and construction site workers operating on building sites. The case studies were executed in two rounds, the first round being focussed on the Doctors and Reporters, and the second being a main case study which examined the work practices of construction site workers. Consideration of these MKWs was developed using semi-structured interviews and interpreted through the lens of Activity Theory.

The resulting framework adapted from Activity Theory identifies technical, social and environmental factors which influence the way mobile knowledge workers interact with information sources. Of particular note is the identification of a previously overlooked information source which sits outside the organisation: that of the Contributor. Another significant finding is the preference for information provided by Collaborators over information supplied by information tools. The information provided by Collaborators was preferred as it was subject to the application of Collaborators' knowledge to the situational context.

Publications Supporting this Research

The following publications list peer reviewed papers which are directly related to my research:

Er, M., Lawrence, E., & Kay, R. 2010, 'Information Systems and Activity Theory: A Case Study of Doctors and Mobile Knowledge Work', ITNG New Generations, Las Vegas, USA, November 2007 in *Seventh International Conference on Information Technology*, ed Shahram Latifi, IEEE Computer Society, USA, pp.603-607.

Er, M. 2008, 'Technology Adoption and the Mobile Worker: The Case of the Field Journalist', CollaborateCom, White Plains, USA, November 2007 in *CollaborateCom 2007*, ed Dr. Jonathan Grudin, Dr. Wendy Kellogg, IEEE, Piscataway, USA, pp. 442-446.

Er, M. 2007, 'Developing Mobile Technology for Construction Sites', Australian Universities Building Education Association Annual Conference, Melbourne, Australia, July 2007 in *Australasian Universities Building Conference Association* 2007, ed Kenley, R., AUBEA, Hawthorn, Australia, pp. 140-149.

Er, M. & Underwood, J. 2006, 'Innovation for the mobile workforce: An active theory model', Transformational Tools for the 21st Century, Rockhampton, Australia, October 2006 in *Transformational Tools for the 21st Century*, ed Hasan, H; Wymark, G; Findlay, J, Knowledge Creation Press, Sydney, Australia, pp. 59-63.

Er, M. & Kay, R.J. 2005, 'Mobile technology adoption for mobile information systems: an activity theory perspective', International Conference on Mobile Business, Sydney, Aust, July 2005 in *Proceedings of International Conference on Mobile Business (ICMB'05)*, ed Brooks, W; Lawrence, E; Steele, R; Chan, E., IEEE, Piscataway, New Jersey USA, pp. 322-325.

Er, M. & Kay, R.J. 2005, 'Towards an activity theory perspective on mobile information systems', Australasian Conference on Information Systems, Sydney, Aust, November 2005 in *Proceedings of the 16th Australasian Conference on Information Systems (ACIS 2005)*, ed Campbell, B; Underwood, J; Bunker, D, FIT-UTS, Sydney, Aust, pp. 1-7.



Table of Contents

Chapter 1 Introduction	1
1.1 Research Overview	1
1.2 Scope of Study	2
1.3 Research Question	2
1.4 Research Objectives	3
1.5 Methodology	3
1.6 Research Impact and Significance	3
1.7 Thesis Structure	4
1.8 Conclusion	7
Chapter 2 – Literature Review: MKW and Mobile Technology Adoption	8
2.1 Introduction	8
2.2 The Mobile Knowledge Worker	9
2.3 Assisting Mobile Knowledge Work with Information Access	11
2.4 Adoption Challenged	14
2.4.1 Investment in Mobile Technology Development	15
2.4.2 Mobile Phones and Success	17
2.5 Reflection on Limited Adoption of Mobile Technology	18
2.5.1 Technology Adoption Model (TAM)	27
2.5.2 Diffusion of Innovation Theory	29
2.6 Reflection on the Role of Social Influence on Adoption	32
2.6.1 Management Driven Innovation	35
2.7 Unanticipated Variations – Clues for Developing Useful Technology Through HCI	<i>37</i>
2.7.1 Understanding Users	
2.8 Reflection on Mobile Knowledge Work – What Do They Want?	
2.8.1 Components of the Information System	
2.8.2 Mapping the Mobile Information System	
2.9 Conclusion	
Chapter 3 - Literature Review: Activity Theory	51
3.1 Introduction	51
3.2. What is Activity Theory?	51
3.3 Subject – Object and Activity	52
3.4 Tools and Mediation	54
3.5 Community of Practice and Divisions of Labour	56
3.6 Contradictions	58
3.7 Internalisation and Externalisation	60
3.8 Using Activity Theory	
Chapter 4 - Methodology	65
4.1 Introduction	65
4.2 Methodology Options	65
4.2.1 Quantitative Research	66
4.2.2 Qualitative Research	66
4.2.1 Selection of the Qualitative Interpretive Approach	68

4.3 Research Design – Interpretive Case Studies	(69	
4.3.1 Data Collection - Semi-structured Interviews		73	
4.3.2 Sampling	••	77	
4.4 Analysis	••	79	
4.5 Research Process - Case Studies	(81	
4.5.1 Selection of Case Study Subjects	(81	
4.6 Conclusion			
Chapter 5 – Results: Pilot Case Studies			84
5.1 Introduction			
5.2 PART 1: Doctors Ward Round System	8	86	
5.2.1 Background to the Work of Doctors	?	86	
5.2.2 Findings			
5.2.2.1 Mediating Influences			
5.2.2.2 Case Notes		89	
5.2.2.3 Patients		92	
5.2.2.4 Ancillary Hospital and Ward Support		93	
5.2.2.5 Collaboration with Other Doctors		93	
5.2.2.6 Trust and Collaboration	••	96	
5.2.2.7 Nursing Staff			
5.2.3 Analysis and Discussion			
5.2.3.1 An Activity-based View of the Mobile Work of Doctors			
5.2.3.2 Representing Activity	. 1	03	
5.2.3.3 Emergent Theme - Urgency	. 1	04	
5.3 PART 2: Reporters and Fieldwork			
5.3.1 Introduction and Background to the Work of Reporters	. 1	07	
5.3.2 Findings	. 1	10	
5.3.2.1 Operating in the Office			
5.3.2.2 Research and Preparation	. 1	11	
5.3.2.3 Eliciting Information - Interviews	. 1	13	
5.3.2.4 Writing and Editing Stories	. 1	14	
5.3.2.5 Collaboration in the Office	. 1	16	
5.3.3 Mobile Work of Reporters	. 1	18	
5.3.3.1 Introduction and Background	. 1	18	
5.3.3.2 Eliciting Information in the Field	. 1	19	
5.3.3.3 Information Tools	. 1	21	
A. Preparation and Research	. 1	21	
B. Mobile Phones and Office Contact	. 1	22	
C. Information and the Environment	. 1	23	
D. Collaborating with Other Reporters			
E. Individual Experience and Knowledge	. 1	25	
5.3.3.4 Reporting from the Field – Urgency and Information	. 1	26	
5.3.4 Filing Stories from the Field	. 1	29	
5.3.4.1 The Copytakers	. 1	30	
5.3.4.2 The Laptop			
5.3.4.3 Preference for Copytaker System	. 1	36	

	5.3.4.4 Vignette 1 – The Luddite	138	
	5.3.4.5 Vignette 2 – Sports Reporter		
	5.4 PART 3: Discussion of Combined Pilot Case Studies		
	5.4.1 Differences Between Case Studies	143	
	5.4.2 Common Themes	144	
	5.4.3 Emergent Themes: Environments and Activity	148	
	Physical Environment	.149	
	Social Environment	.151	
	5.5 Summary	.153	
Chap	ter 6 - Main Case Study: Mobile Knowledge Workers on Construction Pr	ojects	156
	6.1 Introduction to Chapter	. 156	
	6.2 Introduction to the Construction Case Study	.158	
	6.3 Background to Construction Sites and Information	.162	
	6.4 Findings - Construction Site 1 (Site 1)	.166	
	6.4.1 Construction Site Workers and Mobile Work – Site 1	.166	
	6.4.2 Tools - Site 1	.167	
	Plans 167		
	Other Paper-based Documentation	.169	
	Digital Information	. 172	
	6.4.3 Collaboration and Communication	.173	
	6.4.4 The Environmental Context	. 176	
	6.5 Findings - Construction Site 2 (Site 2)	. 179	
	6.5.1 Construction Site Workers and Mobile Work – Site 2	. 182	
	6.5.2 Tools – Site 2	. 185	
	Plans 186		
	6.5.3 Collaborators and Decision Making	. 190	
	6.5.4 Environmental Conditions on Construction Site 2	. 194	
	6.6 Information Sources and Access for the MKW: Reviewing the Construction Industry Case Study	. 197	
	6.6.1 Foreman and Information Tools		
	6.6.2 Foreman and Collaboration	. 200	
	6.6.3 The Foreman and the Environment	. 203	
	6.7 Reviewing the MKW Model	. 206	
	6.7.1 Emergent Themes from Construction	.209	
	6.8 The evolution of the Activity Framework: A view from the MKW	.213	
	6.9 Summary		
7. Sui	mmary and Conclusion		. 220
	7.1 Beginnings of My Research	. 220	
	7.2 My Research	. 221	
	7.3 Main Findings	. 222	
	7.4 Implications for Practice		
	7.5 Contribution to Activity Theory		
	7.6 Weaknesses		
	7.7 Future Research	. 231	
8. Re	ferences		. 234
0 1 5	nandiy		247

9.1 Appendix A: Ethics: Consent Authority	. 247
9.2 Appendix B: Sample Questions	. 248
9.3 Appendix C: Analysis of data: A sample report produced using	
NVivo	.249