
The Evaluation of Human Collaboration and its Supporting Technologies

A thesis submitted for the degree of
Master of Engineering

Roy Soliman

May 2005





Statement of Originality

The work contained in this thesis, other than that specifically attributed to another source, is that of the author(s). It is recognised that, should this declaration be found to be false, disciplinary action could be taken.

Roy Soliman

Faculty of Engineering
University of Technology, Sydney

Submitted: May 2005

Dedication

To my darling wife –
beautiful to the eyes, heart, and mind.

Acknowledgements

- Jesus Christ, in whom life finds meaning and fulfilment, thank you for your unceasing love. Thank you, thank you, thank you!!!
- To my darling wife, Jacqui, thanks for your love, support, and encouragement. I love you so much.
- With great thanks to Professor Robin Braun and Associate Professor Simeon Simoff for your continual support, encouragement, and guidance. I really appreciate you both.
- With love and thanks to my family: Danty, Magda, Mora, & Amy and Greg, Ingrid, Mikey, Heidi, Robbie & Jac – you guys are legends!
- To Marty, the world is truly your oyster! Thanks for your unwavering confidence.
- Thanks to the “outstanding” Mike Wünnington, Andrew Brainwood, and Glenn Donsworth for your prayers, support, and encouragement.
- Thanks to Tim O’Neil – your listening ears and wise advice are well appreciated.
- Thanks to my colleagues Anthony Kadi, Venkatesh Mahadevan, and Shmuel Markovits. It was good to share this journey with you.
- To the team at CSIRO/CeNTIE, especially Dr David Moreland and Dr Dean Economou, thanks for your support and providing the opportunity to carry out this work.

Preface

In the compelling movie “Dead Poet’s Society”, John Keating (played by Robin Williams) encourages his regimented students to make their lives extraordinary, to find their own voice – to “Seize the day”. In one scene, he commandingly stands on the desk and says, “I stand upon my desk to remind myself that we must constantly look at things in a different way. You see, the world looks very different up here” [124]. This research does not involve people standing on desks (although we did occasionally to see our city skyline), but it does involve a fresh look at the world of collaboration and its evaluation.

Table of Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>iv</i>
<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>vi</i>
<i>Abstract</i>	<i>vii</i>
Chapter 1. Introduction	1
1.1 Setting the Scene	2
1.2 Research Background	3
1.2.1 CSCW.....	3
1.3 Primary Problem	4
1.4 Scenarios	4
1.5 Original Contributions	5
1.6 Scope	6
1.7 Ethical Implications for Humans, Animals, and the Physical Environment	6
1.8 Project Background	6
1.9 Convention	7
1.10 Publications	8
Chapter 2. Eight Essential Ingredients Of Collaboration	9
2.1 Introduction	10
2.2 Collaboration Contexts, Approaches, and Implementations	11
2.3 Literature Overview	29
2.4 Definitions of Collaboration	31
2.5 Models for Understanding Collaboration	32
2.6 The Eight Essential Ingredients of Collaboration	43
2.6.1 Introduction.....	43
2.6.2 People.....	43
2.6.3 Shared space.....	45
2.6.4 Time	48
2.6.5 A common objective.....	50
2.6.6 Focus on the objective.....	52
2.6.7 Common language.....	53
2.6.8 Knowledge in the area of the objective	54

2.6.9	Interaction	56
2.7	Benefits of the Eight Essential Ingredients.....	58
2.8	Different Scenarios and the Eight Essential Ingredients.....	59
2.9	Understanding Other Research through the Essential Ingredients.....	60
2.10	Conclusion	64
<i>Chapter 3. The Evaluation of Collaboration.....</i>		<i>66</i>
3.1	Introduction	67
3.2	A Layered View of Collaboration	68
3.3	Evaluation Using the Layered View of Collaboration	69
3.4	Categorising Evaluations Using the Layered View.....	71
3.4.1	The evaluation matrix.....	71
3.4.2	The matrix unfolded.....	74
3.4.3	Evaluation overview	76
3.4.4	Data collection.....	78
3.5	Ingredient Based Evaluation	80
3.6	Conclusions.....	87
<i>Chapter 4. A pilot study.....</i>		<i>89</i>
4.1	Introduction	90
4.2	Pilot Study Design	90
4.2.1	Hardware	90
4.2.2	Software.....	91
4.2.3	Participants.....	92
4.2.4	Room layout.....	93
4.3	Applying the Measure	94
4.3.1	Group 1	94
4.3.2	Group 2	97
4.4	Discussion.....	101
4.4.1	Group 1	101
4.4.2	Group 2	102
4.5	Reflecting to Improve	104
4.6	Reflecting on the Measure	106
4.7	Conclusion	107

<i>Chapter 5. Conclusions</i>	<i>108</i>
5.1 Summary	109
5.2 Primary Problem	110
5.3 Scenarios	110
5.4 Contributions	113
5.5 Future Research	114
<i>Chapter 6. Bibliography</i>	<i>117</i>
<i>Appendix A. Brainteasers.....</i>	<i>129</i>
<i>Appendix B. Analysis of Pilot Studies</i>	<i>133</i>
<i>Appendix C. Ethics Approval</i>	<i>135</i>
<i>Appendix D. The Open Systems Interconnect Model</i>	<i>138</i>
<i>Appendix E. Project Background.....</i>	<i>139</i>
<i>Appendix F. Eye Contact.....</i>	<i>144</i>
<i>Appendix G. CTS 2005 Paper.....</i>	<i>146</i>

List of Figures

Figure 1: Collaboration technologies summary.....	29
Figure 2: Structure of an individual, mediated action.....	40
Figure 3: Basic structure of an activity.....	41
Figure 4: Depiction of the relationship between work and time.....	49
Figure 5: Collaborative relationship & friendship.....	51
Figure 6: Conceptual depiction of a large overlap of relevant knowledge between participants.....	54
Figure 7: Conceptual depiction of a small overlap of relevant knowledge between participants.....	55
Figure 8: Hypothetical graphs demonstrating the need for balanced talk time and number of interactions.....	57
Figure 10: A layered approach to collaboration.....	68
Figure 11: The comparison of one layer to another for the evaluation of collaboration.....	70
Figure 12: Evaluating each layer on the basis of effectiveness, efficiency, and/or satisfaction.....	71
Figure 13: Conceptual depiction of D.....	87
Figure 14: Logical systems configuration.....	92
Figure 15: Hypothetical graphs of bandwidth vs. collaborative measure.....	113
Figure 16: Hypothetical graphs of collaboration measure / cost of bandwidth vs. bandwidth.....	113
Figure 17: Brainteasers – Introductory page.....	129
Figure 18: Brainteasers – Question 1.....	129
Figure 19: Brainteasers – Question 2.....	130
Figure 20: Brainteasers – Question 3.....	130
Figure 21: Brainteasers – Question 4.....	131
Figure 22: Brainteasers – Question 5.....	131
Figure 23: Brainteasers – Question 5 (cont'd).....	132
Figure 24: The Open Systems Interconnect (OSI) model.....	138
Figure 25: Fiduciary break down of the telecollaboration project.....	139
Figure 26: Distance of the eyes from the camera-monitor plane.....	145

List of Tables

Table 1: Work modes and attitudes	27
Table 2: Functions and their descriptions	38
Table 3: Modes and functions [95]	38
Table 4: Components and associated processes of coordination [88]	42
Table 5: Changes in an ingredient represent changes in the ‘recipe’	59
Table 6: Decision making and the eight essential ingredients	60
Table 7: Planning and the eight essential ingredients	61
Table 8: Idea generation and the eight essential ingredients	63
Table 9: The evaluation matrix	72
Table 10: The matrix unfolded	74
Table 11: Summary of the evaluations	76
Table 12: Data collection	79
Table 13: Assessing shared space for Group 1	94
Table 14: Assessing shared space for Group 2	98
Table 15: CeNTIE business systems	142

Abstract

The various research on collaboration extends to text-based chat, audio-conferencing, video-conferencing, forums, code inspections, 3D virtual worlds, tangible interfaces, the automation of link establishment and disestablishment, group decision support systems, and brainstorming. Moreover, this list is by no means exhaustive!

The eight essential ingredients are formulated to draw together these disparate contexts, approaches, and implementations by describing the constants and commonalities of collaboration. The ingredients, then, which are common to all collaboration sessions regardless of the underlying technology are: people; a shared space; time; a common objective; focus on the objective; common language; knowledge in the area of the objective; and interaction. There may be other aspects which affect collaboration, but these ultimately will be expressed in either one, or a combination of these ingredients.

Additionally, there is little consensus on the evaluation of collaboration and its supporting technologies. It seems that many researchers focus on their application without much thought on its accompanying evaluation method or how their evaluation fits with other approaches. The various approaches to evaluation fit into a layered understanding of collaboration, through the comparison of one layer's affects on another and/or through the examination of effectiveness, efficiency, and satisfaction of a particular layer. Furthermore, the analysis of various approaches are placed in a matrix, which can lead to the identification of 'gaps' in the evaluation research field and help to identify where an evaluation approach fits in.

In addition, a new method of evaluation is introduced on the basis of the eight essential ingredients, thus rendering it applicable to any collaboration session. Its technological independence and numerical results provide it with strong potential for improving collaboration and its supporting technologies.

To demonstrate the operation of the measure, a pilot study was conducted. The measure was found to be useful, but potentially quite expensive to implement. The expense, however, can be reduced through the automation of some of the aspects of the measure.