Uncovering Emotion in Adult Learning

Michelle Kathleen Mulvihill

Doctor of Philosophy

Faculty of Education

University of Technology Sydney
PO Box 123
Broadway NSW 2077
Australia

June, 2007
Declaration

Certificate of Authorship/Originality

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree, nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Candidate

Michelle K. Mulvihill

November 2006
Acknowledgements

I wish to acknowledge those people who provided me with assistance throughout the process of dreaming, reflecting and writing this thesis.

In particular, I would like to thank Professor David Boud, whose academic supervision engaged me in an extremely challenging and helpful process of reflection, as together we teased out the many different aspects of this inquiry. I also acknowledge the work of Dr Alex Nelson, who was part of my supervisory panel and who acted as individual mentor, academic accompanist and inspirer of my imagination.

I am grateful to the co-researchers, co-participants in the inquiry, who took part in responding to my invitation to reflect with me on the learning experiences we were part of together. Their candid and generous responses are gratefully noted.

Time spent with John Heron at the South Pacific Centre for Human Inquiry in Auckland, New Zealand, was affirming, validating and enlightening.

My best friend, Elizabeth Hume, constantly persuaded me to never give up. Her support and enduring encouragement of me during these years is gratefully noted. I also acknowledge her careful proofreading of the text.

My thanks to Maxine and Emma for their continued interest and constructive support, in different ways, throughout this process. I thank them especially for their reading of the final draft and their ongoing engagement with me throughout the process, which assisted me to bring this thesis to completion. The ongoing interest and reassurance of my family in reaching this goal is also acknowledged.

Grateful thanks to Pat Skinner for her expert assistance with proofreading and document formatting. Gemma and the printing team provided word-processing and printing help, at the very end.
# Table of Contents

Declaration i

Acknowledgments ii

Abstract ix

**Chapter 1: Framing the Inquiry**

Introduction 1
Nature and purpose of the inquiry/inquiry questions 3
Problem/challenge 4
Nature of groups and the role of the adult educator 6
Importance of this study 9
Limitations 11
Definitions 13
Why emotions are integral to adult learning 15
Understanding the meaning and experience of emotion in professional practice 15
Experience of emotion as engagement and connection 16
The connection between emotions and learning in adult education 18
Making sense of feelings and emotion in adult learning 20
Emotionality in adult learning 21
Limitations of traditional ways of constructing knowledge in adult education 22
Learning about emotionality through the arts 23
Map of this thesis 24
Welcome to The Festival of Emotion and Adult Learning 25
The Program 26
The format for each theatrical experience 29
Reflexive connections 31

**Chapter 2: Literature Review – Preparing the Ground** 32

**Part One: Creating Fertile Conditions** 32

Reflective practices 32
Inner work practices 36
Processes involved in exploring different ways of knowing 39
Understanding the meaning and experience of emotion in professional practice 43
Defining emotion
New awareness in the value of emotion
Summary of various kinds of literature used in the first part of this literature review
  In the area of reflective practices
  In the area of managing difficult emotions and Jungian philosophy
  In the area of adult education as group facilitation
  In the area of transformation, transformative learning and transformative education
  In the area of story-telling

Part Two: Clearing the Ground

Emotional dimensions are a foundation for learning
Fostering emotional reflection creates meaning
Emotion theory
Emotion, learning and neurological functioning
Critical postmodernism
Constructivist ideas about learning
Neurological research in brain functioning
Electro-chemical processes involved in the transmission of messages
Consciousness
How memory is stored and retrieved
Emotion in learning and memory
Key elements in emotionality
The significance of the self as learner and knower
Why emotionality in learning needs uncovering

Chapter 3: Research Methodology – Planting the Seed

Introduction
Selecting theoretical frameworks
Criticism of postmodern/poststructuralist approach
Narrative research and organic inquiry
Stories as an integral part of the research strategy
The five characteristics of organic inquiry
  Phase I: Sacred – preparing the ground
  Phase II: Personal – planting the seed
  Phase III: Chthonic – the roots emerge
  Phase IV: Relational – growing the tree
  Phase V: Transformative – harvesting the fruit
Paradigmatic assumptions
The pilot program 139
Setting the scene for learning 140
The learning group arrives 143
The program gets underway 144
Engaging in learning 145
Audience discussion/data analysis 147
Enthusiasm for the task 147
Anxiety 155
Empathy 161
Hope 170
Care and peer support 176

Story Two: The Meeting 181
Introduction 182
The creative action 184
Participant panel 191
Author’s review 194
My story 195
Audience discussion/data analysis 199
The expression of emotion 200
Suppressing emotions 203
The teacher and learner; suspending judgment of self and others 204
Naming the issue; gaining freedom; trying to get it right 206

Story Three: RunWay 213
Introduction 214
About this circus-story 214
Circus setting 215
The creative action 216
Act I: In the Head Accountant’s (Choreographer’s Office) 216
Act II: In the Boardroom at RunWay International 217
Act III: In Milo’s Office 219
Act IV: In Warren’s Office 220
Act V: In Milo’s and then Warren’s Office and then the Boardroom 221
Participant panel 224
Author’s review 229
Audience discussion/data analysis 233
Limiting, halting or changing the adult learning process/using the facilitator’s behaviour to
create a learning moment which can welcome emotion 233
Vulnerability in facilitation: holding onto distress emotions 238
Listening to one’s own intuition as warning signs and as affirmations 240
Using nurturing relationships and support systems to practise honest communication and engagement with emotions 243
Being present for another’s story without judgment 245
Using reflection and mindfulness to stay present and gain awareness of emotionality 247
Not taking it personally: the power of empathic listening 249

Story Four: DisAbility 251
Introduction 251
The creative action 252
The dialogue begins 254
Participant panel 263
Author’s review 266
Audience discussion/data analysis 272
Compassion as a change agent 273
Discrimination/shame/internalised oppression/stigma of disabilities 275
Shame in relation to fear 276
Society’s labelling/impact on self-image and on learning 277
Power – finding one’s true voice 279
Maintaining equanimity 281
Exploring one’s shadow 283
Summary 285

Chapter 6: Reflections and Reflexive Research – Transformative: Harvesting the Fruit 287
Critically reflective research 287
Unbending intent 287
Choosing the stories 290
Mirroring emotionality between researcher and research 291
Humiliation 292
Affirmation 293
Panic 293
Joy 294
Switching off emotionality 295
The postures for uncovering emotionality in learning 295
Relentless listening 296
Hospitality 298
Attunement 300
Waiting 301
Summary and implications 302

Appendices 304

Appendix 1: Letter to participants 304
Appendix 2: Consent form – student research 305
Appendix 3: Research form for participants to complete 306
Appendix 4: Letter to the workplace head of the organisation in which the fictionalised accounts of the stories in this inquiry took place 307
Appendix 5: Consent form – student research: head of organisation in which participants work 308

REFERENCES 309
Uncovering Emotion in Adult Learning

Abstract

The presence of emotion and feelings in adult learning is obvious and undeniable. Does emotion have an integral place or is it incidental or an obstacle?

This research looks at what might be learned about emotion when an adult learning facilitator uses sustained reflection on practices that use various ways of knowing to more deeply engage adult learners and practitioners with emotionality.

The inquiry looks at the question: If story is used to present, illuminate and reflect on adult learning experiences, where emotion is welcomed and honoured during the learning process, what can be revealed? The primary research question is: What can I come to know about the inner and outer processes of adult learning, by reflecting on moments in facilitated learning in which emotion is uncovered in the stories of participants and in the story of the adult practitioner?

Organic inquiry was chosen as a research methodology for this research because of its capacity to focus on stories as vehicles whereby both conscious and unconscious realms can be accessed. Arts-based research methodology was also used for this inquiry because it provided the dramatic setting, through the creation of semi-fictionalised stories, by which emotionality could be uncovered. These artistic forms of expression, used to reflect and examine the learning practices, extend the boundaries of how we come to know emotionality in adult learning.

Four adult learning scenarios are presented in the textual art forms of drama, film, storytelling and a circus presentation. The researcher’s reflection on each of these vignettes provides one of the filters through which the emotionality of the learning scenarios is further experienced and understood. Reflections from some of the participants who were involved in each scenario are also presented, so as to deepen the reflection. In keeping
with the methodology of organic inquiry, the reader is invited to engage with this research as co-researcher.

This thesis presents an alternative way of understanding emotion in adult learning, one that reflects the central role of emotion in our ways of knowing, particularly in non-formal learning. The thesis argues that personally significant and meaningful learning is fundamentally grounded in, and derives from, the adult’s emotional connection with the self and the broader social world.

The nub of this inquiry is to explore further what learning might happen, in different adult learning settings, when emotionality is uncovered, revealed and made known. A selection of postures, or behaviour and attitudes, are named which adult educators may wish to reflect on or adopt, in an effort to uncover emotionality in their own practice.

The thesis concludes that emotions and feelings can play an integral role in adult learning experiences.